15B-create_main_figure_captions

Replication of BG analyses using both original and new data. The left panel shows county-level analyses; the right panel shows agency-level analyses. The BG estimates correspond to their models and can be matched back to their Table 2 results. The BG results suggest a statistically significant negative impact of lagged total military aid on five out of seven crime outcomes (total crime rate, robbery, assault, larceny, and vehicle theft). However, our county-level replication results suggest a statistically significant negative impact of lagged total military aid on only two crime outcomes (robbery and burglary). Most importantly, our agency-level replication results suggest no statistically significant impact of lagged total military aid on any crime outcomes. For BG, total crime rate: β = -59.29, P < 0.001, and 95% CI = [-87.1, -31.48]; homicide: β = -0.06, P = 0.506, and 95% CI = [-0.25, 0.12]; robbery: β = -6.1, P < 0.001, and 95% CI = [-8.26, -3.95]; assault: β = -5.31, P = 0.03, and 95% CI = [-9.96, -0.65]; burglary: β = -8.75, P = 0.109, and 95% CI = [-19.26, 1.76]; larceny: β = -27.43, P < 0.001, and 95% CI = [-41.73, -13.13]; and vehicle theft: β = -11.64, P < 0.001, and 95% CI = [-17.2, -6.08]. For our county-level replication, total crime rate: β = -20.81, P = 0.092, and 95% CI = [-44.57, 2.94]; homicide: β = 0.02, P = 0.617, and 95% CI = [-0.05, 0.09]; robbery: β = -0.65, P = 0.005, and 95% CI = [-1.08, -0.22]; assault: β = -1.78, P = 0.241, and 95% CI = [-4.72, 1.16]; burglary: β = -6.9, P = 0.019, and 95% CI = [-12.46, -1.34]; larceny: β = -10.06, P = 0.174, and 95% CI = [-24.37, 4.25]; and vehicle theft: β = -1.16, P = 0.124, and 95% CI = [-2.61, 0.29]. For our agency-level replication, total crime rate: β = 7.91, P = 0.639, and 95% CI = [-24.92, 40.73]; homicide: β = -0.07, P = 0.594, and 95% CI = [-0.33, 0.19]; robbery: β = 0.44, P = 0.516, and 95% CI = [-0.88, 1.77]; assault: β = -1.63, P = 0.468, and 95% CI = [-5.99, 2.73]; burglary: β = -7.6, P = 0.066, and 95% CI = [-15.52, 0.33]; larceny: β = 8.06, P = 0.457, and 95% CI = [-13.02, 29.14]; and vehicle theft: β = -0.93, P = 0.387, and 95% CI = [-3.02, 1.16]. The Replication regressions are run on County data with 15,683 observations from 2010-2014 and Agency data with 45,331 observations from 2010-2015. The BG County data is from 2006-2012 and has 17,822 observations. All regression specifications control for percent in poverty, logged median household income, unemployment, logged population, share male, share Black, share aged 15-19, share aged 20-24, share aged 25-34, and agency/county and year fixed effects. We removed outliers from the agency-level database that had total crime rates of over one million.\

Replication of HPBM analyses using both original and new data. The left panel shows county-level analyses; the right panel shows agency-level analyses. The HPBM estimates correspond to their models and can be matched back to their Table 8 results. The HPBM results suggest statistically significant negative impacts of lagged military aid items and value on three of four crime outcomes (robbery, assault, and vehicle theft). However, our county-level replication results suggest statistically significant negative impacts of lagged military aid items and value only on robbery, and only of aid value on vehicle theft. Moreover, our agency-level replication results generally suggest no statistically significant impacts of lagged military aid items and value on any crime outcomes, except for the impact of aid value on robbery. For HPBM and aid items, homicide: β = -0.22, P = 0.466, and 95% CI = [-0.81, 0.37]; robbery: β = -15.39, P < 0.001, and 95% CI = [-21.73, -9.06]; assault: β = -145.8, P < 0.001, and 95% CI = [-211.6, -79.99]; and vehicle theft: β = -114.51, P < 0.001, and 95% CI = [-143.76, -85.25]. For HPBM and aid value, homicide: β = 0.35, P = 0.216, and 95% CI = [-0.2, 0.9]; robbery: β = -6.23, P = 0.03, and 95% CI = [-11.85, -0.62]; assault: β = -110.35, P = 0.009, and 95% CI = [-192.97, -27.73]; and vehicle theft: β = -55.94, P = 0.001, and 95% CI = [-90.37, -21.5]. For our county-level replication and aid items, homicide: β = -0.32, P = 0.54, and 95% CI = [-1.35, 0.71]; robbery: β = -5.63, P = 0.04, and 95% CI = [-11, -0.25]; assault: β = -4.44, P = 0.683, and 95% CI = [-25.74, 16.86]; and vehicle theft: β = 2.19, P = 0.789, and 95% CI = [-13.87, 18.26]. For our county-level replication and aid value, homicide: β = 0.11, P = 0.529, and 95% CI = [-0.22, 0.44]; robbery: β = -4.37, P < 0.001, and 95% CI = [-6.38, -2.36]; assault: β = -2.63, P = 0.419, and 95% CI = [-9, 3.74]; and vehicle theft: β = -8.07, P = 0.003, and 95% CI = [-13.42, -2.71]. For our agency-level replication and aid items, homicide: β = -1, P = 0.397, and 95% CI = [-3.33, 1.32]; robbery: β = 0.7, P = 0.912, and 95% CI = [-11.79, 13.2]; assault:

β = -4.4, P = 0.812, and 95% CI = [-40.63, 31.82]; and vehicle theft: β = 0.2, P = 0.987, and 95% CI = [-24.67, 25.07]. For our agency-level replication and aid value, homicide: β = -0.01, P = 0.982, and 95% CI = [-0.62, 0.61]; robbery: β = -3.81, P = 0.016, and 95% CI = [-6.89, -0.72]; assault: β = 0.53, P = 0.898, and 95% CI = [-7.55, 8.61]; and vehicle theft: β = -3.89, P = 0.3, and 95% CI = [-11.24, 3.46]. The Replication regressions are run on County data with 15,460 observations from 2010-2014 and Agency data with 45,055 observations from 2010-2015. The HPBM County data is from 2000-2013 and has 36,671 observations. All regression specifications control for lagged arrest rates, economic controls, and agency/county and year fixed effects. We removed outliers from the agency-level database that had total crime rates of over one million.