# Ethnic Barriers to Civil Resistance

*Guide to Coding Rules, Replication Files, and Supplementary Tables*

Ches Thurber

Northern Illinois University

cthurber@niu.edu

*July 2018*

## Overview of Online Appendix

This online appendix provides additional information on the data, methods, and results for the article "Ethnic Barriers to Civil Resistance" published in the *Journal of Global Security Studies.* The complete supplementary materials consist of four files:

- *EBCR_Appendix.pdf*: This informational document.
- *EthnicGroupsinContenion.csv*: A data file with the EGC dataset.
- *EBCR_Replication_Data.csv*: A data file for replicating all analyses conducted in the main article as well as this appendix.
- *EBCR_ReplicationScript.R*: An R script that reproduces all analyses in both the article and the appendix. Both data files above are used by the script.

In the sections that follow, I will first introduce the Ethnic Groups in Contention (EGC) dataset, including detailed descriptions of its variables as well as the sources and procedures used in creating the dataset. I then provide additional information about the variables used in the full replication dataset. Finally, I provide a set of nine supplemental tables. For clarity, Tables 1-4 correspond to the tables of the same numbers in the article itself, with cubic polynomials for time included in tables 3 and 4. Table 5-9 provide additional descriptive statistics, tests, and robustness checks as referenced in the main article. All tables are reproduced in the replication script.

## The Ethnic Groups in Contention (EGC) Dataset

The EGC dataset links violent and nonviolent campaigns in the NAVCO 2.0 dataset to ethnic groups in the EPR dataset using an approach similar to that employed by in the ACD2EPR dataset (Wucherpfennig et al. 2012). My process begins with the set of unique campaigns in the NAVCO 2.0 dataset using the onset year of each campaign (cyear = 0). Thus, while it is possible that the ethnic participation of a campaign may change over time, for this dataset, I seek only to code the participation in year one.

The dataset includes at least one row for each campaign and rows are added when I find that more than one EPR ethnic group participated in the first year of the campaign. Thus, the final dataset yields one row for each ethnic group that participated in the initial year of a NAVCO2 campaign.

The dataset includes the following columns, the first 11 of which come directly from NAVCO 2.0. The remaining seven are original to the EGC dataset (though drawing upon conventions and measures developed by others):

| | |
|---|---|
| NAVCO2ID: | Unique campaign ID from NAVCO 2.0 dataset |
| CAMPAIGN: | Campaign name from NAVCO |
| YEAR: | Onset year of campaign from NAVCO |
| LOCATION: | Country of campaign from NAVCO |
| LCCODE: | COW code for location from NAVCO |
| TARGET: | State targeted by campaign from NAVCO |
| TCCODE: | COW code for target from NAVCO |
| CAMP_GOAL: | Campaign goal from NAVCO |
| PRIM_METHOD: | Violent/nonviolent in first year from NAVCO |
| NAVCO1: | Violent/nonviolent in NAVCO1 |
| CDIVERS_ETHNIC: | Campaign ethnically diverse? from NAVCO |
| EPR_GROUP: | EPR Ethnic group participating in campaign |
| EPR_ID: | EPR numeric group ID |

| | |
|---|---|
| PARTICIPATION: | Group participation in campaign |
| INITIATION: | Group initiation of campaign |
| MOVEMENT: | Other group participation in campaign |
| CLAIM: | Ethnic claim made |
| RULE: | Rule used |
| SOURCES: | Sources consulted |
| NOTES: | Notes |

## Descriptions of Original Measures

Consistent with many prior studies seeking to assess the ethnic nature of a conflict, we code the relationship between ethnic groups and NAVCO campaigns along 2 dimensions: participation and claims (See, for example, Denny and Walter 2014; Wucherpfennig et al., 2012).

- PARTICIPATION measures whether members of an ethnic group are observably participating in a campaign. It parallels the concept of recruitment put forth by Wucherpfennig et al. (2012, p. 95), who code from which ethnic groups, if any, a particular rebel organization recruits fighters. I similarly set no specific numeric threshold of participation (an impossibility due to data limitations), but require that a significant enough number of an ethnic groups members participate such that their participation is observed and noted in the secondary literature (note that this conceptualization differs from earlier definitions of recruitment in the EPR series such as Cederman et al (2010, p. 101) where recruitment requires that fighters be recruited exclusively along ethnic lines). My PARTICIPATION coding requires that at least one group be identified as participating in a campaign. When campaigns include members from multiple ethnic groups, each ethnic group is identified. Structurally, PARTICIPATION is coded as 1 for every row in the EGC dataset as I create one row for each ethnic group for which there is evidence of observed participation in the campaign.

- INITIATION codes which ethnic group initiated the campaign. Thus, if multiple groups participated in a campaign in the first year, but the campaign was initiated by one group while the others subsequently joined, this measure codes the first group as 1. If members of multiple groups

participated from the beginning, the one which represents a plurality of participants is coded as 1. There must be and can only be one group coded as 1 for INITIATION for each campaign.

- MOVEMENT indicates the degree to which participation is occurring alongside other groups. The MOVEMENT variable can therefore take values from 0 to 4 as follows:

  0 = no observed participation (when PARTICIPATION = 0)

  1 = group is the only one to participate (in a multi-ethnic country)

  2 = at least one other group participates, and at least 1 group does not

  3 = all groups in country participate

  4 = ethnicity is irrelevant in the country

- CLAIM measures if the campaign states explicit political, economic, or social goals that are specific to that ethnic group. Again, I parallel ACD2EPR, which similarly codes whether a given rebel organization publicly announces that it is operating on behalf of the relevant ethnic group, that is, whether it pursues an objective that is directly linked to the groups fate. (Wucherpfennig et al. 2012, p. 95).

## Sources

In making coding determinations, I draw heavily upon the following sources which are then referenced in the SOURCES column:

- Nonviolent and Violent Campaigns and Outcomes dataset:
  `http://www.du.edu/korbel/sie/research/chenow_navco_data.html`
  - NAVCO 2.0 for campaign years and binary measure of ethnic diversity (NAVCO2)
  - NAVCO 1.1 Web Appendix for synopses of conflicts (WCRWWA)
- The Geographical Research on War, Unified Platform : `https://growup.ethz.ch`
  - Ethnic Power Relations Data on groups and access to power (EPR)
  - ACD2EPR Data on group participation and ethnic claims in armed conflict (ACD2EPR)
- The Swarthmore Global Nonviolent Action Database (SGNAD):
  `http://nvdatabase.swarthmore.edu`
- Additional country-specific sources as needed (Author, Year)

## Rules

The following specific rules were used in translating measures from prior datasets to this data collection effort. The rule used in making a coding determination is indicated in the RULE column. Rules 1-3 allow coding determinations to be made primarily upon measures that already exist in the NAVCO 2.0 and EPR datasets. Rules 4 and 5 require more significant research, often from case-specific literature.

- RULE 1: If EPR identifies a country as being ethnically homogenous with only one group:
  - Assign that one group as the EPR_GROUP and enter its corresponding EPR_ID.
  - Assign PARTICIPATION and INITIATION as 1 and MOVEMENT as a level of 4
  - Assign CLAIM as 0 as this is not possible if ethnicity is irrelevant.
- RULE 2: If NAVCO 2.0s cdivers_ethnic variable = 0:
  - Identify the single ethnic group involved in campaign using NAVCO 1.1 Appendix document, ACD2EPR dataset, EPRs GROWup portal, and/or secondary sources if necessary. Enter its EPR_GROUP and EPR_ID.
  - Assign PARTICIPATION, INITIATION, and MOVEMENT as 1.
  - Identify whether the campaign involved, from the outset, making an exclusive claim to fight on behalf of an ethnic group. (definition from ACD2EPR). Enter 1 for CLAIM if an ethnic claim is made, enter 0 if not.
  - If additional research provides convincing evidence of the participation of additional ethnic groups, despite the NAVCO 2.0 coding, follow Rules 3, 4, or 5, as appropriate.
- RULE 3: If cdivers_ethnic = 1 AND there are only 2 EPR Groups in the country:
  - Create a second row with the identical campaign variables (NAVCO_ID through CDIVERS_ETHNIC)
  - Enter EPR_GROUP and EPR_ID for each group in a unique row.
  - Assign PARTICIPATION as 1 and MOVEMENT as 3 for each.
  - Consult additional sources to determine which group constituted a plurality of participants at the initiation of the campaign. Code INITIATION as 1 for that group and as 0 for the other.
  - Assign a CLAIM value for each group using the procedures described above.

- RULE 4: If cdivers_ethnic = 1 AND there are multiple ERP Groups; OR cdivers_ethnic = NA:
  - Consult sources to determine which ethnic groups participated in campaign. Create new rows for each ethnic group participating in the campaign and enter the relevant EPR group information
  - Assign a PARTICIPATION as 1 for each group
  - Assign a MOVEMENT as 1, 2, or 3 for all groups using the definitions above.
  - Assign values for INITIATION and CLAIM using procedures described above.
- RULE 5: If sources provide insufficient evidence to make group by group determinations of participation, but there are statements to the effect of universal participation:
  - Create rows, enter EPR group info, and assign PARTICIPATION as 1 for all EPR groups in the country
  - Assign MOVEMENT as 3
  - Attempt to assign INITIATION and CLAIM using the procedures described above.

## Final Data

The original NAVCO 2.0 dataset included 251 original onsets. EGC includes 416 unique rows. Of these, 34 constitute missing data. 26 of these are cases of anti-colonial rebellion for which EPR data is not available as EPR begins at independence and does not include the populations of an empires colonial holdings. Six additional observations are lost because these campaigns originated in a year before EPR has group-level data in that country (an artifact of EPRs lagged coding scheme). These campaigns occur in East Germany in 1953, Bosnia in 1991, Georgia in 1989, Rwanda in 1961, Morocco in 1975, and East Timor in 1974. The other two cases are a 2003 nonviolent uprising in the Maldives, which is not included in EPR due to its small population size, and the 1947 Taiwanese revolt, for which EPR has no group that adequately corresponds to Taiwanese identity. Of these 34 missing cases, 13 were primarily nonviolent in their first year, while 21 were primarily violent.

Of the remaining 382 rows in the EGC dataset, 217 represent unique campaigns (the original 251 minus the 34 missing) and 165 are rows added to represent multiple ethnic groups participating in the same campaign. Among these, there are 5 observations of ethnic groups participating in two campaigns in the same year: Whites, Afrovenezuelans, and Indigenous peoples in Venezuela in 1958; Hungarians in Hungary in 1956; and Slovaks in the Czech Republic in 1989.

The following is a breakdown of how many cases were decided on the basis of each of the previously discussed 5 coding rules. Because the rules are applied on a campaign by campaign basis, they total 217:

- Rule 1 (Ethnicity Irrelevant): 23
- Rule 2 (NAVCO 2 codes as not diverse): 91
- Rule 3 (diverse, only 2 groups in country): 9
- Rule 4 (diverse, group by group evidence): 83
- Rule 5: (statements of universal participation): 11

## Replication Data

The replication data file (*EBCR_Replication_Data.csv*) is based on ethnic group-year units of analysis from the 2014 version of the Ethnic Power Relations (EPR) dataset (Vogt et al. 2015). Variables from the Ethnic Groups in Contention (EGC) Dataset are merged in along with covariates from other sources that are used in the analysis. The replication file includes 37691 observations of 38 variables. An R script that reproduces the *EBCR_Replication_Data.csv* file directly from original data sources can be obtained from the author. A description of each variable, along with its original source, is listed below:

- X : denotes row order
- GW_COUNTRY_ID : Gleditsch and Ward Country ID. *Source:* Gleditsch, Kristian S. and Michael D. Ward. 1999. "Interstate System Membership: A Revised List of the Independent States since 1816." *International Interactions* 25.
- COUNTRY : Country name, also based on Gleditsch and Ward (1999) Conventions.
- YEAR : The year, from 1946 or country's first *full* year of independence until 2006. Ends with end of NAVCO 2.0 coverage.
- EPR_ID : EPR's numeric code for the ethnic group, specific to the state of residence. *Source:* Vogt, Manuel, Nils-Christian Bormann, Seraina Regger, Lars-Erik Cederman, Philipp Hunziker, and Luc Girardin. 2015. "Integrating Data on Ethnicity, Geography, and Conflict: The Ethnic Power Relations Data Set Family." *Journal of Conflict Resolution* 59(7): 1327-1342.
- EPR_GROUP : EPR's name for each ethnic group. *Source:* EPR 2014.
- PARTICIPATION : Whether group participated in onset of a NAVCO 2.0 campaign in that year. See EGC dataset description above for additional details. *Source:* EGC dataset.
- INITIATION : Whether group was the initiating group of a NAVCO 2.0 campaign in that year. See EGC dataset description above for additional details.*Source:* EGC dataset.
- CLAIM : Whether group made an ethnic claim while participating in the onset of a NAVCO 2.0 campaign in that year. See EGC dataset description above for additional details.*Source:* EGC dataset.
- SOLO : Whether group participated in the onset of a campaign on its own, with no other groups participating. Calculated based on EGC's MOVEMENT variable. *Source:* EGC dataset.

- RC_GOAL : Whether group participated in the onset of a campaign where the goal was regime change. Calculated based on NAVCO's camp_goals variable. *Source:* Erica Chenoweth and Orion A. Lewis. 2013. Nonviolent and Violent Campaigns and Outcomes Dataset, v. 2.0. University of Denver.

- TERR_GOAL : Whether group participated in the onset of a campaign where the goal was territorial. Calculated based on NAVCO's camp_goals variable. *Source:* NAVCO 2.0

- NV_ONSET : Whether group participated in the onset of a campaign whose primary method was nonviolent. Takes value of 1 when PARTICIPATION = 1 and NAVCO's prim_method = 1. *Source:* EGC and NAVCO 2.0.

- V_ONSET : Whether group participated in the onset of a campaign whose primary method was violent. Takes value of 1 when PARTICIPATION = 1 and NAVCO's prim_method = 0. *Source:* EGC and NAVCO 2.0.

- MN_ONSET : A multinomial variable designating a group's participation in the onset of a campaign by strategy: 0 = no participation in campaign onset, 1 = participation in a nonviolent onset, 2 = participation in a violent onset, 3 = participation in onset of separate violent and nonviolent campaigns in same year

- INIT_NV_ONSET : Whether group was the initiating group in the onset of a campaign whose primary method was nonviolent. Takes value of 1 when INITIATION = 1 and NAVCO's prim_method = 1. *Source:* EGC and NAVCO 2.0.

- INIT_V_ONSET : Whether group was the initiating group in the onset of a campaign whose primary method was violent. Takes value of 1 when INITIATION = 1 and NAVCO's prim_method = 0. *Source:* EGC and NAVCO 2.0.

- INIT_MN_ONSET : A multinomial variable designating a group's role as initiator in the onset of a campaign by strategy: 0 = no initiation of campaign , 1 = initiator in a nonviolent onset, 2 = initiator in a violent onset, 3 = initiator in onset of separate violent and nonviolent campaigns in same year. This is the dependent variable in the base model.

- RC_MN_ONSET : A multinomial variable designating a group's role as initiator in the onset of a *regime-change-seeking* campaign by strategy. Takes value of NA when TERR_GOAL = 1,

otherwise takes value of INIT_MN_ONSET. (i.e. drops cases as missing when group participates in a campaign with a territorial goal).

- NVYEARS : Years since group last participated in a nonviolent campaign. Counted from *end* of campaign in which group is coded as having participated in the onset.
- VYEARS : Years since group last participated in a violent campaign. Counted from *end* of campaign in which group is coded as having participated in the onset.
- PASTNV : Number of previous nonviolent campaign onsets in country. Calculated from NAVCO 2.0 data.
- PASTV : Number of previous violent campaign onsets in country. Calculated from NAVCO 2.0 data.
- EPR_GROUPSIZE : Size of ethnic group as a percentage of country's total population. *Source:* EPR (groupsize)
- EPR_STATUS : EPR's codings of ethnic group access to state-level executive power. *Source:* EPR (statusname)
- EPR_ORDINAL : EPR's ordinal scale of EPR_STATUS. *Source:* EPR (status_pwrrank)
- EPR_STATUS_EGIP : Variation of EPR's dummy variable for "ethnic group in power," coded 1 for groups with status of Junior Partner, Senior Partner, Dominant, or Monopoly and 0 for all others. Irrelevant groups coded as 0 (a deviation from EPR where coded as NA).
- EPR_STATUS_EXCL : Variation of EPR's dummy variable for exclusion, coded 1 for groups with status of Self-Exclusion, Powerless, or Discriminated and 0 for all others. Irrelevant groups coded as 0 (a deviation from EPR where coded as NA).
- EPR_STATUS_SRPL : Coded 1 for groups with status of Senior Partner, Dominant, or Monopoly and 0 for all others.
- EPR_STATUS_JP : Coded 1 for groups with status of Junior Partner and 0 for all others.
- EPR_STATUS_IRR : Coded 1 for groups with status of Irrelevant and 0 for all others.
- EPR_DOWNGRADED5 : EPR measure of whether group has been downgraded in status in past five years. *Source:* EPR (downgraded5)

- EPR_TEK_EGIP : EPR dummy measure coded 1 when group has transnational ethnic kin in power in a neighboring state. *Source:* EPR (tek_egip)

- HORIZ_INEQ : lineq2 symmetric inequality measure *Source:* Cederman, Lars-Erik, Nils B. Weidmann, and Kristian Skrede Gleditsch. "Horizontal inequalities and ethnonationalist civil war: A global comparison." *American Political Science Review* 105, no. 3 (2011): 478-495.

- POP_LOG_LAG_EXT: Population of country, logged, lagged one year, linear extrapolation and interpolation for missing years, capped at max gap of 5 years. *Source:* Gleditsch, Kristian S. 2002. "Expanded Trade and GDP Data," Journal of Conflict Resolution 46: 712-24. (v 6.0 update)

- GDP_LOG_LAG_EXT : Country real GDP per capita, 2005 dollars, logged, lagged one year, linear extrapolation and interpolation for missing years, capped at max gap of 5 years. *Source:* Gleditsch, Kristian S. 2002. "Expanded Trade and GDP Data," Journal of Conflict Resolution 46: 712-24. (v 6.0 update), draws from Penn World Tables and Maddison Project.

- VDEM_POLYARCHY_LAG : Lagged VDEM Electoral democracy index (v2x_polyarchy) comprised of measures of freedom of association, clean elections, freedom of expression, elected officials, and suffrage. *Source:* Coppedge et al. 2017. V- Dem [Country-Year/Country-Date] Dataset v7.1 Varieties of Democracy (V-Dem) Project.

- VDEM_PHYSINT_LAG : Lagged VDEM physical violence index (v2x_clphy) comprised of measures of freedom from torture and freedom from political killings.

# Supplementary Tables and Models

Table 1: Campaign-Level Statistics on Ethnic Group Participation in NAVCO and ACD Conflicts

| | EGC | | ACD |
|---|---|---|---|
| | Nonviolent | Violent | Violent |
| Campaign Onsets | 96 | 121 | 326 |
| Multiple Groups | 47% | 25% | 12% |
| Average No. Groups | 2.17 | 1.44 | 1.19 |
| Ethnic Claim | 20% | 57% | 62% |
| | | | |
| *Participation by Group* | | | |
| Average Sum Group Size | .71 | .41 | .30 |
| Sr. Partners and Above. | 69% | 34% | 26% |
| Junior Partners | 17% | 11% | 14% |
| Excluded | 50% | 61% | 61% |
| Irrelevant | 16% | 13% | 7% |
| | | | |
| *Initiation by Group* | | | |
| Average Initiator Size | .59 | .36 | |
| Sr. Partners and Above | 65% | 31% | |
| JuniorPartners | 4% | 8% | |
| Excluded | 21% | 52% | |
| Irrelevant | 10% | 9% | |

Table 2: Group-Level Statistics

| EPR Status | Group-Years | Initiated Nonviolent | | Initiated Violent | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Sr. Partner and Above | 6,705 | 61 | 0.91% | 37 | 0.55% |
| Jr. Partner | 5,806 | 4 | 0.07% | 10 | 0.17% |
| Excluded | 19,168 | 20 | 0.10% | 63 | 0.33% |

Table 3: Multinomial Logit: Initiating Violent and Nonviolent Campaigns

| | Base Model | | Group-Level Controls | | Binary IV | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | *1 = Nonviolent* | *1 = Violent* | *1 = Nonviolent* | *1 = Violent* | *1 = Nonviolent* | *1 = Violent* |
| | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* |
| | (1a) | (1b) | (2a) | (2b) | (3a) | (3b) |
| EPR Status: Jr. Partner | $-1.577^{**}$ | $-0.224$ | $-1.543^{**}$ | $-0.626$ | | |
| | (0.646) | (0.436) | (0.651) | (0.454) | | |
| EPR Status: Excluded | $-1.316^{***}$ | 0.471 | $-1.277^{***}$ | 0.031 | $-0.790^{**}$ | $0.564^{**}$ |
| | (0.397) | (0.308) | (0.424) | (0.326) | (0.347) | (0.252) |
| Group Size | $2.465^{***}$ | $2.169^{***}$ | $2.408^{***}$ | $1.434^{***}$ | $3.195^{***}$ | $2.277^{***}$ |
| | (0.489) | (0.419) | (0.519) | (0.472) | (0.419) | (0.363) |
| Country Population (log) | $0.192^{***}$ | $-0.003$ | $0.173^{**}$ | $-0.021$ | $0.205^{***}$ | 0.001 |
| | (0.070) | (0.065) | (0.080) | (0.078) | (0.070) | (0.065) |
| Country GDP Per Capita (log) | 0.092 | $-0.349^{***}$ | 0.094 | $-0.272^{**}$ | 0.126 | $-0.344^{***}$ |
| | (0.124) | (0.113) | (0.137) | (0.128) | (0.122) | (0.113) |
| Prior Group NV Participation | 0.253 | $-0.005$ | 0.234 | $-0.115$ | 0.235 | $-0.005$ |
| | (0.223) | (0.349) | (0.232) | (0.416) | (0.222) | (0.349) |
| Prior Group V Participation | 0.269 | $-0.286$ | 0.175 | $-0.557$ | 0.266 | $-0.283$ |
| | (0.299) | (0.316) | (0.318) | (0.379) | (0.300) | (0.316) |
| VDEM Electoral Democracy Index | $-2.448^{***}$ | $2.064^{**}$ | $-2.648^{***}$ | $2.636^{***}$ | $-2.573^{***}$ | $2.056^{**}$ |
| | (0.748) | (0.815) | (0.822) | (0.919) | (0.748) | (0.815) |
| VDEM Physical Integrity Index | 0.011 | $-2.847^{***}$ | 0.017 | $-3.421^{***}$ | $-0.035$ | $-2.851^{***}$ |
| | (0.646) | (0.638) | (0.715) | (0.728) | (0.647) | (0.638) |
| Neighboring Kin in Power | | | $-0.200$ | 0.242 | | |
| | | | (0.261) | (0.227) | | |
| Downgraded | | | 0.259 | $0.793^{**}$ | | |
| | | | (0.611) | (0.364) | | |
| Horizontal Inequality | | | $-0.017$ | 0.134 | | |
| | | | (0.363) | (0.302) | | |
| NV YEARS | 0.848 | $-0.411$ | 0.981 | $-0.205$ | 0.897 | $-0.401$ |
| | (0.763) | (0.713) | (0.809) | (0.792) | (0.766) | (0.712) |
| NV YEARS2 | $-0.184$ | 0.232 | $-0.324$ | 0.097 | $-0.209$ | 0.226 |
| | (0.338) | (0.335) | (0.354) | (0.367) | (0.338) | (0.334) |
| NV YEARS3 | 0.010 | $-0.027$ | 0.036 | $-0.005$ | 0.013 | $-0.027$ |
| | (0.042) | (0.042) | (0.043) | (0.046) | (0.042) | (0.042) |
| V YEARS | $-0.177$ | 0.112 | $-0.473$ | $-0.201$ | $-0.219$ | 0.101 |
| | (0.745) | (0.667) | (0.825) | (0.751) | (0.750) | (0.667) |
| V YEARS2 | 0.289 | $-0.035$ | 0.506 | 0.116 | 0.309 | $-0.029$ |
| | (0.338) | (0.338) | (0.380) | (0.378) | (0.339) | (0.337) |
| V YEARS3 | $-0.045$ | $-0.007$ | $-0.080^{*}$ | $-0.028$ | $-0.047$ | $-0.007$ |
| | (0.042) | (0.045) | (0.048) | (0.050) | (0.042) | (0.045) |
| Constant | $-9.515^{***}$ | $-3.024^{***}$ | $-9.065^{***}$ | $-2.824^{**}$ | $-10.500^{***}$ | $-3.202^{***}$ |
| | (1.307) | (1.133) | (1.423) | (1.271) | (1.281) | (1.085) |
| Observations | 30,601 | | 22,810 | | 30,601 | |
| Log Likelihood | -1,071 | | -924 | | -1092 | |

*Note:* $^{*}$p<0.1; $^{**}$p<0.05; $^{***}$p<0.01
GDP and population lagged 1 year.

Table 4: Alternative Operationalizations of the DV

| | Regime-Change Only | | Any Participation | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | *1 = Nonviolent* | *1 = Violent* | *1 = Nonviolent* | *1 = Violent* |
| | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* |
| | (4a) | (4b) | (5a) | (5b) |
| EPR Status: Jr. Partner | −1.399** | −0.472 | −0.407 | −0.293 |
| | (0.656) | (0.551) | (0.282) | (0.367) |
| EPR Status: Excluded | −1.743*** | 0.064 | −0.563** | 0.542** |
| | (0.459) | (0.359) | (0.239) | (0.264) |
| Group Size | 2.844*** | 2.701*** | 0.920*** | 1.556*** |
| | (0.521) | (0.494) | (0.344) | (0.367) |
| Country Population (log) | 0.193** | −0.154 | −0.008 | −0.080 |
| | (0.077) | (0.095) | (0.046) | (0.056) |
| Country GDP Per Capita (log) | 0.010 | −0.478*** | −0.115 | −0.451*** |
| | (0.136) | (0.154) | (0.081) | (0.098) |
| Prior Group NV Participation | 0.384* | 0.146 | 0.619*** | −0.004 |
| | (0.232) | (0.436) | (0.150) | (0.329) |
| Prior Group V Participation | −0.019 | −0.457 | 0.333* | −0.066 |
| | (0.323) | (0.393) | (0.202) | (0.261) |
| VDEM Electoral Democracy Index | −2.279*** | 2.072* | −2.336*** | 1.832*** |
| | (0.821) | (1.109) | (0.516) | (0.706) |
| VDEM Physical Integrity Index | −0.458 | −3.075*** | 0.210 | −2.745*** |
| | (0.688) | (0.833) | (0.426) | (0.538) |
| NV YEARS | 1.350* | −0.052 | 1.427*** | −0.368 |
| | (0.817) | (0.967) | (0.526) | (0.611) |
| NV YEARS2 | −0.339 | 0.288 | −0.506** | 0.193 |
| | (0.357) | (0.452) | (0.220) | (0.280) |
| NV YEARS3 | 0.028 | −0.047 | 0.056** | −0.021 |
| | (0.043) | (0.058) | (0.026) | (0.035) |
| V YEARS | −0.227 | 0.610 | −0.486 | 0.560 |
| | (0.762) | (0.825) | (0.484) | (0.562) |
| V YEARS2 | 0.225 | −0.434 | 0.418* | −0.216 |
| | (0.350) | (0.414) | (0.216) | (0.279) |
| V YEARS3 | −0.035 | 0.053 | −0.060** | 0.015 |
| | (0.043) | (0.054) | (0.026) | (0.036) |
| Constant | −9.133*** | −1.615 | −5.061*** | −1.284 |
| | (1.416) | (1.518) | (0.828) | (0.963) |
| Observations | 30,551 | | 30,739 | |
| Log Likelihood | -776 | | -1854 | |

*Note:* *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01
GDP and population lagged 1 year.

Table 5: Campaign-Level Comparison with Statistical Tests

| | Nonviolent | Violent | Test Statistic | P - Value | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Campaign Onsets | 96 | 121 | | | |
| Multiple Groups | 47% | 25% | $\chi^2 = 10.585$ | 0.001 | *** |
| Average No. Groups | 2.17 | 1.44 | t = 3.13 | 0.002 | *** |
| Ethnic Claim | 20% | 57% | $\chi^2 = 29.26$ | 0.000 | *** |
| *Participation by Group* | | | | | |
| Average Sum Group Size | .71 | .41 | t = 6.33 | 0.000 | *** |
| Sr. Partners and Above | 69% | 34% | $\chi^2 = 24.66$ | 0.000 | *** |
| Junior Partners | 17% | 11% | $\chi^2 = 1.15$ | 0.283 | |
| Excluded | 50% | 61% | $\chi^2 = 2.27$ | 0.132 | |
| Irrelevant | 16% | 13% | $\chi^2 = 0.09$ | 0.759 | |
| *Initiation by Group* | | | | | |
| Average Initiator Size | .59 | .36 | t = 4.92 | 0.000 | *** |
| Sr. Partners and Above | 65% | 31% | $\chi^2 = 23.60$ | 0.000 | *** |
| Junior Partners | 4% | 8% | $\chi^2 = 0.89$ | 0.346 | |
| Excluded | 21% | 52% | $\chi^2 = 20.81$ | 0.000 | *** |
| Irrelevant | 10% | 9% | $\chi^2 = 0.00$ | 0.923 | |

Table 6: Summary Statistics of Covariates

| Statistic | N | Mean | St. Dev. | Min | Max |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| PARTICIPATION | 31,902 | 0.011 | 0.102 | 0 | 1 |
| INITIATION | 31,902 | 0.006 | 0.078 | 0 | 1 |
| CLAIM | 31,902 | 0.003 | 0.058 | 0 | 1 |
| SOLO | 31,902 | 0.004 | 0.064 | 0 | 1 |
| RC_GOAL | 31,902 | 0.008 | 0.091 | 0 | 1 |
| TERR_GOAL | 31,902 | 0.002 | 0.045 | 0 | 1 |
| NV_ONSET | 31,902 | 0.006 | 0.076 | 0 | 1 |
| V_ONSET | 31,902 | 0.005 | 0.069 | 0 | 1 |
| MN_ONSET | 31,902 | 0.015 | 0.156 | 0 | 2 |
| INIT_NV_ONSET | 31,803 | 0.003 | 0.052 | 0 | 1 |
| INIT_V_ONSET | 31,861 | 0.003 | 0.059 | 0 | 1 |
| INIT_MN_ONSET | 31,762 | 0.010 | 0.128 | 0 | 2 |
| RC_MN_ONSET | 31,836 | 0.011 | 0.132 | 0 | 2 |
| INIT_RC_MN_ONSET | 31,706 | 0.006 | 0.102 | 0 | 2 |
| NVYEARS | 31,902 | 2.344 | 1.670 | 0.000 | 6.000 |
| VYEARS | 31,902 | 2.302 | 1.713 | 0.000 | 6.000 |
| PASTNV | 31,238 | 0.113 | 0.404 | 0 | 5 |
| PASTV | 31,238 | 0.141 | 0.407 | 0 | 4 |
| EPR_GROUPSIZE | 31,902 | 0.181 | 0.263 | 0.0001 | 0.980 |
| EPR_STATUS_ORD | 31,902 | 3.021 | 1.761 | 1 | 7 |
| EPR_STATUS_EGIP | 31,902 | 0.394 | 0.489 | 0 | 1 |
| EPR_STATUS_EXCL | 31,902 | 0.606 | 0.489 | 0 | 1 |
| EPR_STATUS_SRPL | 31,902 | 0.211 | 0.408 | 0 | 1 |
| EPR_STATUS_JP | 31,902 | 0.183 | 0.387 | 0 | 1 |
| EPR_STATUS_IRR | 31,902 | 0.000 | 0.000 | 0 | 0 |
| EPR_DOWNGRADED5 | 31,902 | 0.042 | 0.200 | 0 | 1 |
| EPR_TEK_EGIP | 31,902 | 0.376 | 0.484 | 0 | 1 |
| HORIZ_INEQ | 23,576 | 0.158 | 0.451 | 0.000 | 5.132 |
| POP_LOG_LAG_EXT | 31,902 | 9.954 | 1.907 | 3.584 | 14.066 |
| GDPPC_LOG_LAG_EXT | 31,902 | 8.068 | 1.114 | 4.889 | 13.357 |
| VDEM_POLYARCHY_LAG | 31,305 | 0.342 | 0.260 | 0.010 | 0.922 |
| VDEM_PHYSINT_LAG | 31,409 | 0.492 | 0.289 | 0.021 | 0.989 |

Table 7: Decade and Regional Controls

| | Decade Controls | | Regional Controls | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | *1 = Nonviolent* | *1 = Violent* | *1 = Nonviolent* | *1 = Violent* |
| | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* | *0 = No Contention* |
| | (6a) | (6b) | (7a) | (7b) |
| EPR Status: Jr. Partner | −1.591** | −0.234 | −1.608** | −0.265 |
| | (0.641) | (0.435) | (0.650) | (0.444) |
| EPR Status: Excluded | −1.159*** | 0.466 | −1.399*** | 0.462 |
| | (0.392) | (0.307) | (0.399) | (0.305) |
| Group Size | 2.785*** | 2.150*** | 2.530*** | 2.168*** |
| | (0.494) | (0.423) | (0.497) | (0.417) |
| Country Population (log) | 0.227*** | −0.002 | 0.194** | −0.005 |
| | (0.074) | (0.067) | (0.083) | (0.074) |
| Country GDP Per Capita (log) | 0.207 | −0.362*** | −0.005 | −0.230* |
| | (0.129) | (0.119) | (0.173) | (0.135) |
| Prior Group NV Participation | 0.066 | −0.019 | 0.221 | −0.045 |
| | (0.251) | (0.371) | (0.216) | (0.374) |
| Prior Group V Participation | −0.005 | −0.257 | 0.393 | −0.369 |
| | (0.315) | (0.327) | (0.301) | (0.327) |
| VDEM Polyarchy Index | −2.697*** | 2.096** | −2.311*** | 2.248*** |
| | (0.749) | (0.817) | (0.798) | (0.843) |
| VDEM Physical Integrity Index | −0.272 | −2.732*** | −0.440 | −2.855*** |
| | (0.634) | (0.639) | (0.711) | (0.664) |
| Decade 56-65 | 0.712 | 0.077 | | |
| | (1.129) | (0.479) | | |
| Decade 66-75 | 0.719 | 0.364 | | |
| | (1.106) | (0.466) | | |
| Decade 76-85 | 1.192 | 0.367 | | |
| | (1.096) | (0.497) | | |
| Decade 86-95 | 2.445** | 0.414 | | |
| | (1.084) | (0.521) | | |
| Decade 96-06 | 1.926* | −0.328 | | |
| | (1.104) | (0.605) | | |
| Asia | | | −0.094 | 0.357 |
| | | | (0.440) | (0.372) |
| Europe | | | 0.761* | −1.047* |
| | | | (0.419) | (0.558) |
| Middle East and N. Africa | | | −0.512 | 0.507 |
| | | | (0.529) | (0.378) |
| Sub-Saharan Africa | | | 0.358 | 0.083 |
| | | | (0.478) | (0.362) |
| NV YEARS | 1.406* | −0.354 | 0.905 | −0.514 |
| | (0.795) | (0.740) | (0.762) | (0.709) |
| NV YEARS2 | −0.458 | 0.149 | −0.212 | 0.270 |
| | (0.360) | (0.349) | (0.334) | (0.333) |
| NV YEARS3 | 0.041 | −0.012 | 0.015 | −0.032 |
| | (0.045) | (0.044) | (0.041) | (0.042) |
| V YEARS | 0.022 | 0.183 | −0.153 | 0.184 |
| | (0.741) | (0.669) | (0.755) | (0.662) |
| V YEARS2 | 0.147 | −0.077 | 0.291 | −0.081 |
| | (0.340) | (0.341) | (0.337) | (0.336) |
| V YEARS3 | −0.030 | −0.0005 | −0.045 | −0.001 |
| | (0.043) | (0.046) | (0.041) | (0.045) |
| Constant | −12.096*** | −3.151** | −8.962*** | −3.942*** |
| | (1.694) | (1.262) | (1.670) | (1.372) |
| Observations | 30,601 | | 30,601 | |
| Log Likelihood | -1072 | | -1075 | |

*Note:* *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01
GDP and population lagged 1 year.

Table 8: Single Equation Models: Nonviolent

| | DV: 1 = Initiate Nonviolent; 0 = No Nonviolent | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | *Logit* | | *Probit* | *Rare Events Logit* |
| | (8) | (9) | (10) | (11) | (12) |
| EPR Status: Jr. Partner | −1.576** | −1.576** | −1.576** | −0.490** | −1.428** |
| | (0.646) | (0.675) | (0.691) | (0.199) | (0.646) |
| EPR Status: Excluded | −1.320*** | −1.320*** | −1.320*** | −0.415*** | −1.308*** |
| | (0.397) | (0.465) | (0.441) | (0.133) | (0.397) |
| Group Size | 2.453*** | 2.453*** | 2.453*** | 0.914*** | 2.422*** |
| | (0.489) | (0.568) | (0.611) | (0.174) | (0.489) |
| Country Population (log) | 0.193*** | 0.193*** | 0.193*** | 0.070*** | 0.185*** |
| | (0.070) | (0.056) | (0.071) | (0.025) | (0.070) |
| Country GDP Per Capita (log) | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.095 | 0.028 | 0.093 |
| | (0.124) | (0.124) | (0.124) | (0.044) | (0.124) |
| Prior Group NV Participation | 0.253 | 0.253 | 0.253 | 0.114 | 0.278 |
| | (0.223) | (0.180) | (0.186) | (0.086) | (0.223) |
| Prior Group V Participation | 0.271 | 0.271 | 0.271 | 0.133 | 0.308 |
| | (0.299) | (0.289) | (0.292) | (0.109) | (0.299) |
| VDEM Polyarchy Index | −2.459*** | −2.459*** | −2.459*** | −0.866*** | −2.415*** |
| | (0.748) | (0.822) | (0.933) | (0.267) | (0.748) |
| VDEM Physical Integrity Index | 0.029 | 0.029 | 0.029 | 0.054 | 0.032 |
| | (0.646) | (0.664) | (0.798) | (0.234) | (0.646) |
| NV YEARS | 0.847 | 0.847 | 0.847 | 0.345 | 0.831 |
| | (0.763) | (0.770) | (0.748) | (0.282) | (0.763) |
| NV YEARS2 | −0.184 | −0.184 | −0.184 | −0.090 | −0.188 |
| | (0.338) | (0.394) | (0.386) | (0.124) | (0.338) |
| NV YEARS3 | 0.010 | 0.010 | 0.010 | 0.007 | 0.012 |
| | (0.042) | (0.053) | (0.053) | (0.015) | (0.042) |
| V YEARS | −0.178 | −0.178 | −0.178 | −0.055 | −0.169 |
| | (0.745) | (0.762) | (0.756) | (0.269) | (0.745) |
| V YEARS2 | 0.290 | 0.290 | 0.290 | 0.117 | 0.274 |
| | (0.338) | (0.378) | (0.371) | (0.121) | (0.338) |
| V YEARS3 | −0.045 | −0.045 | −0.045 | −0.019 | −0.042 |
| | (0.042) | (0.051) | (0.049) | (0.015) | (0.042) |
| Constant | −9.543*** | −9.543*** | −9.543*** | −4.145*** | −9.346*** |
| | (1.307) | (1.225) | (1.208) | (0.462) | (1.307) |
| Clustered SEs | No | Group | State | No | No |
| Observations | 30,641 | 30,641 | 30,641 | 30,641 | 30,641 |
| Log Likelihood | -468.993 | -468.993 | -468.993 | -468.111 | -468.993 |

*Note:* *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01
GDP and population lagged 1 year.

Table 9: Single Equation Models: Violent

| | DV: 1 = Initiate Nonviolent; 0 = No Nonviolent | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | *Logit* | | | *Probit* | *Rare Events Logit* |
| | (13) | (14) | (15) | (16) | (17) |
| EPR Status: Jr. Partner | −0.219 | −0.219 | −0.219 | −0.075 | −0.177 |
| | (0.436) | (0.511) | (0.431) | (0.146) | (0.436) |
| EPR Status: Excluded | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.477 | 0.160 | 0.476 |
| | (0.308) | (0.395) | (0.342) | (0.111) | (0.308) |
| Group Size | 2.161*** | 2.161*** | 2.161*** | 0.769*** | 2.165*** |
| | (0.419) | (0.498) | (0.450) | (0.154) | (0.419) |
| Country Population (log) | −0.003 | −0.003 | −0.003 | −0.002 | −0.004 |
| | (0.065) | (0.063) | (0.099) | (0.022) | (0.065) |
| Country GDP Per Capita (log) | −0.349*** | −0.349*** | −0.349** | −0.123*** | −0.346*** |
| | (0.113) | (0.115) | (0.143) | (0.039) | (0.113) |
| Prior Group NV Participation | −0.010 | −0.010 | −0.010 | 0.009 | 0.082 |
| | (0.348) | (0.297) | (0.297) | (0.118) | (0.348) |
| Prior Group V Participation | −0.289 | −0.289 | −0.289 | −0.114 | −0.241 |
| | (0.317) | (0.254) | (0.272) | (0.112) | (0.317) |
| VDEM Polyarchy Index | 2.085** | 2.085** | 2.085** | 0.690** | 2.073** |
| | (0.815) | (0.860) | (0.984) | (0.272) | (0.815) |
| VDEM Physical Integrity Index | −2.853*** | −2.853*** | −2.853*** | −0.958*** | −2.814*** |
| | (0.638) | (0.634) | (0.633) | (0.216) | (0.638) |
| NV YEARS | −0.416 | −0.416 | −0.416 | −0.127 | −0.377 |
| | (0.713) | (0.741) | (0.564) | (0.249) | (0.713) |
| NV YEARS2 | 0.233 | 0.233 | 0.233 | 0.072 | 0.205 |
| | (0.335) | (0.356) | (0.252) | (0.116) | (0.335) |
| NV YEARS3 | −0.028 | −0.028 | −0.028 | −0.008 | −0.023 |
| | (0.042) | (0.046) | (0.034) | (0.015) | (0.042) |
| V YEARS | 0.117 | 0.117 | 0.117 | 0.017 | 0.132 |
| | (0.667) | (0.665) | (0.545) | (0.234) | (0.667) |
| V YEARS2 | −0.038 | −0.038 | −0.038 | −0.006 | −0.050 |
| | (0.338) | (0.344) | (0.261) | (0.116) | (0.338) |
| V YEARS3 | −0.006 | −0.006 | −0.006 | −0.003 | −0.004 |
| | (0.045) | (0.045) | (0.035) | (0.015) | (0.045) |
| Constant | −3.023*** | −3.023*** | −3.023*** | −1.746*** | −3.013*** |
| | (1.133) | (0.980) | (1.170) | (0.386) | (1.133) |
| Clustered SEs | No | Group | State | No | No |
| Observations | 30,699 | 30,699 | 30,699 | 30,699 | 30,699 |
| Log Likelihood | -619.318 | -619.318 | -619.318 | -618.932 | -619.318 |

*Note:* *p<0.1; **p<0.05; ***p<0.01
GDP and population lagged 1 year.