Preaching to the Choir: A Problem of Participatory Interventions

Replication Package

Rebecca Hanson, Dorothy Kronick, and Tara Slough

January 31, 2023

README

Overview

The code in this replication package conducts all quantitative empirical analyses using cleaned/processed data using R. Six main files run all of the code to generate the outputs for the 20 figures and 11 tables in the paper and supplementary materials that rely on data. The replicator should expect the code to run for less than 10 minutes.

This replication package *does not* contain code for the following tables and figures because they do not rely on original analysis of data: Tables A3, A4, A5,and Figures 1, 4, A2, and A5.

Data Availability and Provenance Statements

Code for data cleaning and analysis is provided as part of the replication package. It is available at https://doi.org/10.24433/CO.0479587.v1 and on the *Journal of Politics* Dataverse at https://doi.org/10.7910/DVN/VY4FMR.

Statement about Rights

We certify that the author of the manuscript have legitimate access to and permission to use the data used in this manuscript.

Summary of Availability

- All quantitative data **are** publicly available. The qualitative meeting notes are not publicly available in an effort to protect the anonymity of attendees and officers.

Details on each Data Source

The data come from multiple sources, as enumerated below.

1. **Motivating data on community policing**
    - n-gram data was collected using https://books.google.com/ngrams/ to search for "community policing" in September 2023
    - Google scholar citations to community policing were collected through a search for "community policing" in September 2023
    - Community policing evaluations were taken from Blair et al. (2021)
2. **Motivating data on crime and trust in police in Medellín**

- Data on homicides were collected from Colombia's Departamento Administrativo Nacional de Estadística's vital statistics (estadísticas vitales nacimientos y defunciones historicos).
- Data on trust in police in Colombia comes from 2004-2018 LAPOP AmericasBarometer Merge (v. 1.0) available from the The AmericasBarometer by the LAPOP Lab, www.vanderbilt.edu/lapop.

3. **Experimental design and validation data**
   - The design features (random assignment and choice of priority neighborhoods/*manzanas*) were generated by the researchers.
   - Census data for balance tests comes from Colombia's Departamento Administrativo Nacional de Estadística.
   - Shapefiles for *manzanas* and police beats (*cuadrantes*) were provided by the Alcaldía of Medellín.
4. **Original baseline and endline surveys**
   - Baseline face-to-face surveys of 5,205 individuals (15 per each of 347 experimental police beats) were conducted by the survey firm INVAMER in January-March 2018.
   - Endline face-to-face surveys of 3,644 individuals (including 2,434 respondents from the baseline and 1,210 new respondents) were conducted by the survey firm INVAMER in September-December 2019.
5. **Survey data from five other Metaketa-IV experiments**
   - Survey data are taken from replication data for Blair et al. (2021).
6. **Latin American Public Opinion Project (LAPOP) survey data**
   - We report analyses based on the 2004-2018 LAPOP AmericasBarometer Merge (v. 1.0) available from the The AmericasBarometer by the LAPOP Lab, www.vanderbilt.edu/lapop.
7. **Processed original qualitative notes from community policing meetings**

Computational requirements

Software Requirements

- R 4.2.1
  - `RColorBrewer 1.1-3`
  - `dplyr_1.1.4`
  - `estimatr_1.0.2`
  - `ggplot2_3.4.2`
  - `ggstance_0.3.6`
  - `glmnet_4.1.8`
  - `gridExtra_2.3`
  - `lubridate_1.9.3`
  - `magrittr_2.0.3`
  - `mvtnorm_1.2.4`
  - `patchwork_1.2.0`
  - `plyr_1.8.9`
  - `readxl_1.4.3`
  - `sf_1.0.15`
  - `texreg_1.39.3`
  - `upstartr_0.1.2`
  - `xtable_1.8.4`

Controlled Randomness

- A random seed is set at line 14 of program `03_survey.R`, at line 8 of program `04_metaketa_comp.R`, and at line 9 of `05_lapop.R`.

Memory, Runtime, Storage Requirements

Summary Approximate time needed to reproduce the analyses on a standard 2022 desktop machine is <10 minutes.

Approximate storage space needed is 25 MB - 250 MB.

Details The code was last run on a **10-core Apple M1 Pro Laptop with MacOS version 13.2.1 with 340GB of free space**.

Description of programs/code

- Programs in `code/01_motivaton.R` generate Figures 2 and A1. The figures can be found in the `results` folder of the capsule/replication package.
- Programs in `code/02_design.R` generate Table A1 and Figure A3. The table and figure can be found in the `results` folder of the capsule/replication package.
- Programs in `code/03_survey.R` generate Tables 1, 3, A2, A6-A9 and Figures 3, 5, A5-A12, and A15-A17. The tables and figures can be found in the `results` folder of the capsule/replication package.
- Programs in `code/04_metaketa_comp.R` generate Tables 2 and A10. The tables can be found in the `results` folder of the capsule/replication package.
- Programs in `code/05_lapop.R` generate Table A11 and Figures 7 and A18. The table and figures can be found in the `results` folder of the capsule/replication package.
- Programs in `code/06_misc.R` generate Figures 6, A13, and A14. The figures can be found in the `results` folder of the capsule/replication package.

Instructions to Replicators

- In CodeOcean Capsule, the `Reproducible Run` button will run all programs to generate all results. To run a subset of the programs, remove relevant `Rscript` commands from the `code/.Rproj.user/run` file.
- If you have downloaded the code and data to run in R (outside CodeOcean), adjust the file path to the location of the replication files.

List of figures, tables and programs

The provided code reproduces selected tables and figures in the paper, as explained.

Figure/Table #	Program (in `code` folder)	Output file (in `results` folder)
Figure 1	n.a. (no data)	
Figure 2	`01_motivation.R`	`Figure_2.pdf`
Figure 3	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_3.pdf`
Figure 4	n.a. (no quantitative data)	
Figure 5	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_5.pdf`
Figure 6	`06_misc.R`	`Figure_6.pdf`
Figure 7	`05_lapop.R`	`Figure_7.pdf`
Table 1	`03_survey.R`	`Table_1.tex`
Table 2	`04_metaketa_comp.R`	`Table_2.tex`
Table 3	`03_survey.R`	`Table_3a.tex` and `Table_3b.tex`
Figure A1	`01_motivation.R`	`Figure_A1.pdf`
Figure A2	n.a. (no data)	

Figure/Table #	Program (in `code` folder)	Output file (in `results` folder)
Figure A3	`02_design.R`	`Figure_A3.pdf`
Figure A4	n.a. (no data)	
Figure A5	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A5.pdf`
Figure A6	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A6.pdf`
Figure A7	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A7.pdf`
Figure A8	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A8.pdf`
Figure A9	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A9.pdf`
Figure A10	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A10.pdf`
Figure A11	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A11.pdf`
Figure A12	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A12.pdf`
Figure A13	`06_misc.R`	`Figure_A13.pdf`
Figure A14	`06_misc.R`	`Figure_A14.pdf`
Figure A15	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A155.pdf`
Figure A16	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A16.pdf`
Figure A17	`03_survey.R`	`Figure_A17.pdf`
Figure A18	`05_laop.R`	`Figure_A18.pdf`
Table A1	`02_design.R`	`Table_A1.tex`
Table A2	`03_survey.R`	`Table_A2.tex`
Table A3	n.a. (no data)	
Table A4	n.a. (no data)	
Table A5	n.a. (no data)	
Table A6	`03_survey.R`	`Table_A6.tex`
Table A7	`03_survey.R`	`Table_A7.tex`
Table A8	`03_survey.R`	`Table_A8.tex`
Table A9	`03_survey.R`	`Table_A9.tex`
Table A10	`04_metaketa_comp.R`	`Table_A10.tex`
Table A11	`05_lapop.R`	`Table_A11.tex`

References

Blair, Graeme, Jeremy M Weinstein, Fotini Christia, Eric Arias, Emile Badran, Robert A Blair, Ali Cheema, Ahsan Farooqui, Thiemo Fetzer, Guy Grossman et al. 2021. "Community policing does not build citizen trust in police or reduce crime in the Global South." *Science* 374 (6571): eabd3446.

Acknowledgements

Some content on this page was copied from Hindawi. Other content was adapted from Fort (2016), Supplementary data, with the author's permission.