No.	Data Set	Definition of Democracy	Dimensions†	Components for Measuring†	Identification of Attributes based on Munck and Verkuilen (2002)‡	Author's Identification of Attributes	Reference Concept
1	Arat (1991)	"a political setting that provides means for the effective popular control of decisionmakers by the masses" (p. 20)	participation	(effective) executive selection	Offices + Effectiveness	Contestation (Electoral Competition) + Effectiveness	Downs (1957) and Dahl's (1956) concepts
				legislative selection	Offices	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	
				legislative effectiveness	Effectiveness	Effectiveness	
				the competitiveness of the nomination procedure	Contestation	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	
			inclusiveness of the process	participation	Participation	Participation	
			competitiveness	party legitimacy	Contestation	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	
				party competitiveness			
			civil liberties	government coercivenss	Coerciveness (Civil Liberties)	Contestation (Political and Civil Liberties)	
2	Bollen (1980)	"*the extent to which the political power of the elite is minimized and that of the nonelite is maximized*" (italics in original, p. 372)	popular sovereignty	fairness of elections	Participation (Fairness)	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	Original definition
				executive selection	Offices		
				legislative selection	Offices + Effectiveness	Contestation (Electoral Competition) + Effectiveness	
			political liberties	press freedom	Contestation (Political Liberties)	Contestation (Political and Civil Liberties)	
				freedom of group opposition			
				government sanction			
3	Coppedge & Reinicke (1990)	"the set of institutional arrangements that permits public opposition and establishes the right to participate in politics" (p. 51)	public contestation	free and fair elections	Contestation + Participation (Fairness) + Offices	Contestation (Political and Civil Liberties)	Dahl's (1971) polyarchy
				freedom of organization	Contestation (Political Liberties)		
				freedom of expression			
				availability of alternative sources of information		Contestation (Electoral Competition)	
			inclusiveness*	the extent of suffrage =right to vote	Participation	Participation (Right to vote)	
4	Freedom House	"At a minimum, a democracy is a political system in which the people choose their authoritative leaders freely from among competing groups and individuals who are not designated by the government" (Freedom House 2002). According to Freedom House (2010), a country with this electoral aspect—i.e., "political rights"—is labeled as "electoral democracy." However, political rights + civil liberties = "liberal democracy" (Freedom House 2010).	political rights	1. Electoral Process 2. Political Pluralism and Participation 3. Functioning of Government	Contestation + Participation + Offices + Political Rights + Effectiveness + Political Violence	Contestation (Electoral Competition) + Contestation (Political and Civil Liberties) + Participation (Right to Vote) + Effectiveness + Political Violence	Primary purpose is to measure not democracy but freedom. But electoral democracy is similar to Schumpeterian competitive democracy (Vreeland, 2003, p. 4).
			civil liberties	1. Freedom of Expression and Belief 2. Associational and Organizational Rights 3. Rule of Law 4. Personal Autonomy and Individual Rights	Political and Civil Liberties + Rule of Law + Political Violence + Social/Economic Freedom	Contestation (Political and Civil Liberties) + Rule of Law + Political Violence + Social/Economic Freedom	
5	Gasiorowski (1996) Reich (2002)	"A regime in which (a) meaningful and extensive competition exists among individuals and organized groups for all effective positions of government power, at regular intervals and excluding the use of force; (b) a highly inclusive level of political participation exists in the selection of leaders and policies, such that no major (adult) social group is excluded; and (c) a sufficient level of civil and political liberties exists to ensure the integrity of political competition and participation" (Gasirowski, 1996, p. 471)	(a) competiton + effecitiveness		Contestation + Offices + Effectiveness	Contestation (Electoral Competition) + Effectiveness	Diamond, Linz, and Lipset's (1989, pp. xvi-xvii) concept which is based on Dahl's (1971) polyarchy
			(b) inclusiveness		Participation	Participation	
			(c) political rights and civil liberties	right of political opposition	Contestation (Political Liberties)	Contestation (Political and Civil Liberties)	
				information critical of government and leaders			
				physical intimidation as suppressing political opposition			

No.	Data Set	Definition of Democracy	Dimensions[†]		Components for Measuring[†]	Identification of Attributes based on Munck and Verkuilen (2002)[‡]	Author's Identification of Attributes	Reference Concept
6	Hadenius (1992)	"Public policy is to be governed by the freely expressed will of the people whereby all individuals are to be treated as equal" (p. 9).	Elections	Universal suffrage	Proportion of electorates	Participation	Participation (Right to vote)	Hadenius (1992, Chapter 2) denies the concept of democracy restricting citizen's political participation to the leader selection.
					Proportion of elected seats	Offices	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	
				Meaningful elections	Open	Contestation	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	
					Correct	Participation		
					Effective	Effectiveness	Effectiveness	
			Political Liberties		Organizational freedoms	Contestation (Political Liberties)	Contestation (Political and Civil Liberties)	
					Freedom of opinion			
					Political violence and repression			
7	Mainwaring et al. (2001)	"a regime (1) that sponsors free and fair competitive elections for the legislature and executive; (2) that allows for inclusive adult citizenship; (3) that protects civil liberties and political rights; and (4) in which the elected governments really govern and the military is under civilian control" (p. 38)	Elections for Legislature and Executive		free and fair elections	Contestation + Participation + Offices	Contestation (Electoral Comeptition)	Mainwaring et al. (2001) criticizes the subminimal concept of democracy as proposed by Schumpeter (2010) [1942] and Przeworski et al. (2000). They create the original concept, expanding Dahl's two dimensions by adding civil liberties and effective government.
			Is the Franchise Inclusive?		Right to vote + Not triggering social protests	Participation	Participation (Right to vote)	
			Are Civil Liberties Respected?			Contestation (Political Liberties)	Contestation (Political and Civil Liberties)	
			Do the Elected Rulers Enjoy Real Governing Capacity?			Effectiveness	Effectiveness	
8	Moon et al. (2006)	Polity + Citizens' actual participation	Competitiveness	Polity IV	Competitiveness of executive recruitment (XRCOMP)	Contestation + Offices	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	Dahl's (1971) polyarchy and Polity project
					Openness of executive recruitment (XROPEN)	Contestation + Offices		
					Regulation of participation (PARREG)	Contestation		
					Competitiveness of participation (PARCOMP)			
			Constraints		Constraints on executive (XCONST)	Effectiveness	Effectiveness	
			Participation		breadth of political participation	Participation	Participation (Breadth of participation)	
9	Munck (2009), UNDP (2004, pp. 207-213)	The core of his concept of electoral democracy is based on "procedures pertaining to the access to state offices" (Munck, 2009, p. 55)	Right to Vote			Participation	Participation (Right to vote)	Schumpeter (2010) [1942]; Rokkan et al. (1970); Dahl (1989); Sartori (1987); Przeworski et al. (2000); O'Donnell (2001)
			Clean Elections			Participation (Fairness)		
			Free Elections			Contestation	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	
			Elected Public Offices			Offices		
10	Polity IV (Marshall & Jaggers, 2009)	"Democracy is conceived as three essential, interdependent elements. One is the presence of institutions and procedures through which citizens can express effective preferences about alternative policies and leaders. Second is the existence of institutionalized constraints on the exercise of power by the executive. Third is the guarantee of civil liberties to all citizens in their daily lives and in acts of political participation. Other aspects of plural democracy, such as the rule of law, systems of checks and balances, freedom of the press, and so on are means to, or specific manifestations of, these general principles. We do not include coded data on civil liberties (Marshall & Jaggers, 2009, p. 13)."	Competitiveness of Executive Recruitment			Contestation + Offices	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	Primary purpose is to measure not democracy but "authority patterns" (Marshall & Jaggers, 2009, p. 1).
			Openness of Executive Recruitment			Contestation + Offices		
			Executive Constraints			Effectiveness	Effectiveness	
			Regulation of Participation			Contestation	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	
			Competitiveness of Participation			Contestation		

No.	Data Set	Definition of Democracy	Dimensions†	Components for Measuring†	Identification of Attributes based on Munck and Verkuilen (2002)‡	Author's Identification of Attributes	Reference Concept
11	Przeworski et al. (2000)	"a regime in which those who govern are selected through contested elections" (p. 15)	Competition	executive selection legislative selection party (PARTY + INCUMB) alternation	Offices Contestation	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	Schumpeter's (2010 [1942]) competition and Dahl's (1971) contestation
12	Vanhanen (2000)	"a political system in which ideologically and socially different groups are legally entitled to compete for political power, and in which institutional power-holders are elected by the people and are responsible to the people" (p. 252)	Competition		Contestation + Offices	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	Dahl's (1971) polyarchy
			Participation		Participation	Participation (Breadth of participation)	
13	Vreeland (2003)	"*the probability* that key government offices are filled through contested elections" (italics in original, p. 1)	Competition		Offices + Contestation	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	Schumpeter (2010 [1942]) and Przeworski et al. (2000)
14	Boix et al. (2013)	"democracies feature political leaders chosen through free and fair elections and satisfy a threshold value of suffrage" (in Abstract, p. 1523)	Contestation	executive selection legislative selection	Contestation	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	Dahl (1971) and Przeworski et al. (2000)
			Participation	right to vote	Participation	Participation (Right to Vote)	
15	Skaaning et al. (2015)	"a regime where leaders are selected through contested elections held periodically before a broad electorate" (p. 1495)		legislative selection executive selection opposition competition (uncertainty)	Contestation	Contestation (Electoral Competition)	Schumpeter (2010 [1942])
				male suffrage female suffrage	Participation	Participation (Right to Vote)	

* Inclusiveness is not included in their dataset.

† Based on Munck and Verkuilen's Table 3 (2002, p. 10), I modify it and newly assess the existing datasets.