Robustness check

Rationale

To test if we can safely assume that solidarity frames are applicable across different groups of beneficiaries (solidarity referents), we conducted a robustness check of our results by looking at the effect of eliminating all the frames that refer to particular beneficiary groups. We focused consecutively on i) migrants and ii) health-related groups (the elderly, sick, people with disabilities and patients) for all parties, and iii) the Flemish because these groups are often treated as important and distinctive deservingness groups.

Procedure

We determined whether the distributions were *significantly* different from the original distributions based on a chi-square test of independence in Excel. A significant result means that the relative distributions of the frames after elimination of sentences referring to one of aforementioned referents differs significantly from the relative distributions based on all the sentences. None of the chi-square tests of independence is significant for alpha=0.01.

Observed relative distributions after elimination

Migration-related groups

Solidarity frames (1995)	Vlaams Blok	Volksunie	VLD	CVP	SP	Agalev
Group-based	0,243	0,340	0,000	0,129	0,034	0,047
Compassionate	0,393	0,280	0,273	0,435	0,466	0,427
Exchange-based	0,215	0,200	0,485	0,242	0,199	0,180
Empathic	0,150	0,180	0,242	0,194	0,301	0,347

Solidarity frames (2014)	Vlaams Belang	N-VA	Open VLD	CD&V	sp.a	Groen
Group-based	0,349	0,215	0,060	0,039	0,039	0,027
Compassionate	0,263	0,294	0,274	0,361	0,508	0,353
Exchange-based	0,316	0,311	0,293	0,325	0,268	0,319
Empathic	0,072	0,179	0,372	0,275	0,185	0,301

The elderly and health-related groups

Solidarity frames (1995)	Vlaams Blok	Volksunie	VLD	CVP	SP	Agalev
Group-based	0,289	0,339	0,150	0,190	0,045	0,053
Compassionate	0,300	0,270	0,200	0,345	0,333	0,467
Exchange-based	0,256	0,183	0,450	0,259	0,252	0,166
Empathic	0,156	0,209	0,200	0,207	0,369	0,314

Solidarity frames (2014)	Vlaams Belang	N-VA	Open VLD	CD&V	sp.a	Groen
Group-based	0,435	0,254	0,071	0,053	0,046	0,024
Compassionate	0,182	0,232	0,274	0,302	0,472	0,380
Exchange-based	0,312	0,323	0,305	0,353	0,301	0,295
Empathic	0,071	0,191	0,350	0,291	0,182	0,301

The Flemish

Solidarity frames (1995)	Vlaams Blok	Volksunie	VLD	CVP	SP	Agalev
Group-based	0,078	0,188	0,140	0,159	0,034	0,051
Compassionate	0,375	0,376	0,256	0,435	0,466	0,469
Exchange-based	0,297	0,224	0,419	0,217	0,199	0,160
Empathic	0,250	0,212	0,186	0,188	0,301	0,320

Solidarity frames (2014)	Vlaams Belang	N-VA	Open VLD	CD&V	sp.a	Groen
Group-based	0,176	0,169	0,071	0,053	0,046	0,024
Compassionate	0,141	0,241	0,274	0,302	0,472	0,380
Exchange-based	0,565	0,375	0,305	0,353	0,301	0,295
Empathic	0,118	0,215	0,350	0,291	0,182	0,301

Expected values

Solidarity frames (1995)	Vlaams Blok	Volksunie	VLD	CVP	SP	Agalev
Group-based	0,243	0,333	0,140	0,159	0,034	0,051
Compassionate	0,393	0,282	0,256	0,435	0,466	0,469
Exchange-based	0,215	0,179	0,419	0,217	0,199	0,160
Empathic	0,150	0,205	0,186	0,188	0,301	0,320

Solidarity frames (2014)	Vlaams Belang	N-VA	Open VLD	CD&V	sp.a	Groen
Group-based	0,442	0,254	0,071	0,053	0,046	0,026
Compassionate	0,266	0,355	0,396	0,431	0,608	0,453
Exchange-based	0,312	0,350	0,350	0,361	0,307	0,305
Empathic	0,071	0,196	0,416	0,296	0,203	0,306

Chi-square test

1995	Migration-related	Elderly and health-related	Flemish
χ^2	0,361	0,479	0,493
df	15	15	15
p	1	1	1

2014	Migration-related	Elderly and health-related	Flemish
χ^2	0,100	0,138	0,633
df	15	15	15
p	1	1	1

ISP comparison

Original ISP

ISP 1995	Vlaams Blok	Volksunie	VLD	CVP	SP	Agalev
Group-based	0,881	1,711	-0,128	-0,408	-1,021	-1,035
Compassionate	0,032	-1,285	-1,321	1,368	0,651	0,555
Exchange-based	-0,261	-0,00037	2,079	-0,043	-0,761	-1,013
Empathic	-0,783	-0,151	-0,188	-1,418	1,060	1,481

ISP 2014	Vlaams Belang	N-VA	Open VLD	CD&V	sp.a	Groen
Group-based	1,965	0,641	-0,546	-0,605	-0,661	-0,793
Compassionate	-1,304	-0,666	-0,667	0,045	1,457	1,135
Exchange-based	-0,071	0,606	0,922	1,128	-1,004	-1,581
Empathic	-1,733	-0,471	1,438	0,621	-0,322	0,466

ISP after elimination

Migration-related groups

Solidarity frames (1995)	Vlaams Blok	Volksunie	VLD	CVP	SP	Agalev
Group-based	0,906	1,698	-1,080	-0,026	-0,800	-0,699
Compassionate	0,181	-1,308	-1,404	0,749	1,150	0,633
Exchange-based	-0,365	-0,507	2,200	-0,109	-0,521	-0,698
Empathic	-1,238	-0,800	0,098	-0,605	0,947	1,598

Solidarity frames (2014)	Vlaams Belang	N-VA	Open VLD	CD&V	sp.a	Groen
Group-based	1,890	0,780	-0,509	-0,688	-0,687	-0,786
Compassionate	-0,956	-0,580	-0,820	0,221	2,003	0,131
Exchange-based	0,543	0,298	-0,623	1,018	-1,927	0,692
Empathic	-1,631	-0,530	1,452	0,457	-0,470	0,722

The elderly and health-related groups

Solidarity frames (1995)	Vlaams Blok	Volksunie	VLD	CVP	SP	Agalev
Group-based	1,012	1,470	-0,252	0,109	-1,207	-1,132
Compassionate	-0,235	-0,609	-1,462	0,314	0,173	1,819
Exchange-based	-0,057	-0,847	2,051	-0,023	-0,093	-1,031
Empathic	-1,172	-0,454	-0,572	-0,479	1,715	0,962

Solidarity frames (2014)	Vlaams Belang	N-VA	Open VLD	CD&V	sp.a	Groen
Group-based	1,923	0,715	-0,509	-0,628	-0,679	-0,822
Compassionate	-1,311	-0,782	-0,344	-0,048	1,723	0,763
Exchange-based	-0,151	0,419	-0,518	1,993	-0,727	-1,016
Empathic	-1,712	-0,433	1,278	0,642	-0,524	0,749

The Flemish

Solidarity frames (1995)	Vlaams Blok	Volksunie	VLD	CVP	SP	Agalev
Group-based	-0,531	1,395	0,543	0,891	-1,299	-0,998
Compassionate	-0,288	-0,268	-1,917	0,529	0,953	0,991
Exchange-based	0,524	-0,342	1,960	-0,414	-0,636	-1,092
Empathic	0,134	-0,593	-1,082	-1,037	1,112	1,466

Solidarity frames (2014)	Vlaams Belang	N-VA	Open VLD	CD&V	sp.a	Groen
Group-based	1,441	1,310	-0,314	-0,609	-0,735	-1,094
Compassionate	-1,541	-0,580	-0,265	0,007	1,630	0,750
Exchange-based	2,123	0,101	-0,649	-0,131	-0,692	-0,752
Empathic	-1,587	-0,352	1,361	0,610	-0,769	0,737