Details on the Methodology Adopted in the Article "Multilevel Governance of Social Policy: Social Services in Metropolises"

Available at: https://brazilianpoliticalsciencereview.org/article/multilevel-governance-of-social-policy-social-services-in-metropolises/

This article adopted a mostly qualitative methodology, combining literature review, analysis of regulatory acts, and management reports on social services policies in São Paulo and Belo Horizonte, as well as in-depth interviews with social services managers who have had an outstanding history in one of these two cities and occasionally in the federal government. Data collection occurred mainly between 2017 and 2022.

Bibliographic review mostly focused on national and international studies on the multilevel governance of public policies, as well as on co-production of public policies, policy implementation, and federative policy coordination, in addition to specific texts on the structuring of the social services policy in Brazil and in the two cities selected for the study.

In the case of regulatory acts, we looked into decrees, laws, ordinances, normative resolutions, and technical notes that guide the organization of the social services policy, particularly at the basic social protection level. The regulatory acts produced at the federal level (particularly regulations formulated by the Ministry of Development and Social Services, Family, and Fight against Hunger and the National Social Services Council) and the subnational regulations produced specifically in the cities of São Paulo and Belo Horizonte were considered. The legal provisions that regulate partnerships between the government and civil society organizations (CSOs) hired for the provision of social services and assistance were also analyzed, focusing on the Regulatory Framework for Civil Society Organizations (MROSC), regulated at the national level by Law No. 13,019, of July 31st, 2014, and its respective specific regulations in São Paulo and Belo Horizonte.

To collect perceptions about the governance processes of the social services policy, 25 in-depth interviews were conducted, based on a semi-structured script, with mid- and high-level public managers, actors connected to the legislature, actors who hold seats on municipal councils related to the social services policy, former federal social services policy managers, and representatives of CSOs and social

movements connected to the social services policy, both in São Paulo and Belo Horizonte, as well as former federal managers.

On average, the interviews were 1-hour long, and they were all recorded after respondents agreed to the elements contained in the Free and Informed Consent Form, which presented the objectives of the research and also guaranteed the anonymity of the interviewees whenever requested. The study was approved by the Research Ethics Committee (CEP) of the School of Arts, Sciences, and Humanities (EACH) of the University of São Paulo (USP).

Our analysis and interpretation process was based on the triangulation of information and data collected through these three main sources: (1) bibliographic material, (2) documents (laws, decrees, and ordinances, social services documents from each municipality), (3) in-depth interviews.

For the bibliographic material and documents investigated, we produced a simple systematization by topic, date, and main contents. Documentary data were also the basis for building simple quantitative indicators, which describe the basic structuring of the social services policy in São Paulo and Belo Horizonte.

The interviews were analyzed according to the following procedures. We listened to all interviews in full at least twice. On these occasions, the main points addressed in each of them were transcribed. The transcripts of the main excerpts of the interviews were organized in a single document. Subsequently, this material was analyzed and empirical categories were created—the main topics addressed in the interviews—based on which the material was reorganized. This was the material used as a basis for writing the article. The interpretation was conducted by crossing this information and in the light of the analytical categories presented in the text.

Regarding the production of Table 1, the information regarding the demographic characteristics of the two municipalities was extracted from IBGE and Atlas Brasil data, obtained through the following links:

Demographic data on Belo Horizonte:
https://www.ibge.gov.br/cidades-e-estados/mg/belo-horizonte.html
https://cidades.ibge.gov.br/brasil/mg/belo-horizonte
http://www.atlasbrasil.org.br/perfil/municipio/310620#sec-renda

Demographic data on São Paulo:
https://www.ibge.gov.br/cidades-e-estados/sp/sao-paulo.html
https://cidades.ibge.gov.br/brasil/sp/sao-paulo/panorama
http://www.atlasbrasil.org.br/perfil/municipio/355030

As for the characteristics of the social services and assistance network, the number *of regional divisions of services (territorialization)* and the *number of public facilities* (basic, high complexity, and homeless population) were extracted from the Municipal Social Services Plans of each municipality. These are the main documents that systematize information on social services policy at the local level and are usually made available on the official websites of city departments.

Links to Municipal Plans:
https://www.prefeitura.sp.gov.br/cidade/secretarias/upload/assistencia_social/documentos%20ju/Plano%20Municipal%20de%20Assist%C3%AAncia%20Social%20de%20S%C3%A3o%20Paulo-SP%20REV%2013%2012%202019%20-%20ALTERADO%2001_2020.pdf
https://prefeitura.pbh.gov.br/smasac/suass/pmas

Links to the official websites of the departments:
https://www.prefeitura.sp.gov.br/cidade/secretarias/assistencia_social/rede_socioassistencial/index.php?p=3200
https://prefeitura.pbh.gov.br/smasac/assistencia-social

In the case of data on the network of public facilities, we aimed to distinguish the public provision of services from indirect provision through partnerships with CSOs. In São Paulo, the vast majority of services are provided indirectly by CSOs, and information about these partnerships can be obtained directly on the SMADS website: https://www.prefeitura.sp.gov.br/cidade/secretarias/assistencia_social/rede_socioassistencial/index.php?p=325118

In the case of Belo Horizonte, accurately estimating the relative weight of indirect provision vis-à-vis direct provision is more challenging. In BH, the organization between facilities (physical centers), services, and programs is very different from that of São Paulo. Probably due to BH Cidadania's intersectoriality, in Belo Horizonte there is a smaller number of physical centers, but they are larger in size and cover greater complexity, offering more than one service at the same premises. Direct and indirect services are offered in these physical centers (DRAS, CRAS, CRAS, Day Care Centers for older adults and persons with disabilities, Pop Centers).

In the interviews we conducted, respondents mentioned a 70/30 ratio regarding the direct and indirect network. The two municipal plans analyzed (2018-2021, 2022-2025) present contradictory information, and it is difficult to understand this organization of the network of social services and assistance. In the 2022-2025 Municipal Social Services Plan (PMAS), there is the following information on the number of workers, which corroborates this ratio between the direct and indirect network:

> Profile of human resources within the social services policy in the municipality
>
> "SUAS-BH has 4243 workers holding a variety of positions. Among them, 2971 (70%) work in the indirect complementary network and 1272 (30%) work in the provision of services directly executed by the municipal executive branch. The vast majority, as reported, are female, making up 75% of SUAS-BH workers. Regarding their education level, 52% (2182) of workers have a high school degree, 36% (1297) have a college degree, and 17% (699) have an elementary school degree. Another remarkable piece of information is the significant number of workers in the Institutional Intake Centers—2356, making up 55% of SUAS-BH workers."

Therefore, we generally chose to use this 70-30% ratio between services provided directly and services provided through partnerships in Belo Horizonte.

> Source: https://prefeitura.pbh.gov.br/sites/default/files/estrutura-de-governo/smasac/2023/suass_pmas-2022-2025-versao-25-04-2022.pdf