"Loyalty-Competence Tradeoffs for Top U.S. Federal Bureaucratic Leaders in the Administrative Presidency Era"

George A. Krause and Anne Joseph O'Connell

(Presidential Studies Quarterly 2019)

CODEBOOK FOR MANUSCRIPT ANALYSIS

---

obsident Observation Identifier See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

indident Individual Appointee Identifier See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

position Position Code Identifier See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

agency Agency Identifier See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

sbagency Subagency Identifier See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

agencyposition Position Identifer within Agency See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

agencyname Agency Name See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

opm Position Number Provided to Job by OPM See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

last Appointee Last Name See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

maiden Appointee Maiden Name See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

first Appointee First Name See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

resident Appointee's State of Residence See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

nominate Appointee's Nomination Date (mm/dd/yr). See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

adminmonth *Month* of a particular administration that the individual was nominated. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

adminqtr *Quarter* of a particular administration that the individual was nominated. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3

adminyear *Year* of a particular administration that the individual was nominated. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3

nomyear *Actual Year* that the individual was nominated. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript

& SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf

(https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&

version=1.3

See MMA-Appointments-AJPS Codebook

secondterm = 1 if individual was nominated during second term of a presidential administration; = 0 otherwise. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf

(https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

dividedpressenate = 1 if Senate majority and president are controlled by opposite parties; = 0 otherwise. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

congress Particular Congress in which nomination took place. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

irc 1 if individual is serving in an Independent Regulatory Commission; = 0 otherwise. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

exec = 1 if individual is serving in an Executive Branch Agency; = 0 otherwise. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

toplevel *Top Supervisory Position* indicator variable takes on a value of 1 if the position for which the respective appointee was selected is the highest level official in an agency and 0 otherwise. For example, Federal Trade Commission Chairs are coded as 1, but FTC Commissioners are coded as 0. Heads of sub-agencies within a cabinet department, such as the head of the FDA (located within the Department of Health and Human Services), are coded as 0. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

toplevel2 Same as **toplevel**, except that executive sub-agency heads are also coded as "1's" – i.e., *Top Supervisory Position* = 1. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

prespty = 1 for Republican Presidential Appointee; = 0 Democratic Presidential Appointee

carter = 1 for Carter Presidential Appointee; = 0 Otherwise

reagan = 1 for Reagan Presidential Appointee; = 0 Otherwise

bush41 = 1 for G.H.W. Bush Presidential Appointee; = 0 Otherwise

Clinton = 1 for Clinton Presidential Appointee; = 0 Otherwise

bush43 = 1 for G.W. Bush Presidential Appointee; = 0 Otherwise

---

agencyideol = −1 for ideologically ***liberal*** agencies based on Bayesian 95% credibility interpretation of Clinton-Lewis agency ideology scores; = 0 for ideologically ***moderate*** agencies based on Bayesian 95% credibility interpretation of Clinton-Lewis agency ideology scores; and + 1 for ideologically ***conservative*** agencies based on Bayesian 95% credibility interpretation of Clinton-Lewis agency ideology scores (see pages 17-19 of their 2008 *Political Analysis* article. Joshua D. Clinton and David E. Lewis. "Expert Opinion, Agency Characteristics, and Agency Preferences." 16(Winter): 3-20.).
See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

prespartyiddirect = −1 for Democratic administration appointment; = +1 for Republican administration appointment (a variation of **prespty**). See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

presallyagencyideol = 1 if President-Agency Ideologically Aligned; = -1 if President-Agency Ideologically Opposed; = 0 Otherwise [Moderate Agencies] -- Interaction variable term between **prespartyiddirect** & **agencyideol**. ***(Ally principle* test in SI document)**.
See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

NOTE: The next several variables listed below are estimates generated from Bayesian GLTA structural measurement model (See 2. *Bayesian Generalized Latent Trait Structural Models: Empirical Findings* in the Supporting Information document for the 2019 Krause and O'Connell *PSQ* article). Many of these variables are also discussed in the codebook for Krause and O'Connell's 2016 *AJPS* article. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

loyalmedian	Bayesian Posterior Median Estimates for Loyalty Latent Trait
loyalsd	Bayesian Posterior Standard Deviation Estimates for Loyalty Latent Trait
loyal25lcl	Bayesian Posterior 2.5 Percentile Estimates for Loyalty Latent Trait
loyal975ucl	Bayesian Posterior 97.5 Percentile Estimates for Loyalty Latent Trait
mecompmedian	Bayesian Posterior Median Estimates for Managerial Competence Latent Trait
mecompsd	Bayesian Posterior Std. Dev Estimates for Managerial Competence Latent Trait
mecomp25lcl	BayesianPosterior 2.5 Pctile Estimates for Managerial Competence Latent Trait

mecomp975ucl BayesianPosterior 97.5 Pctile Estimates for Managerial Competence Latent Trait

pecompmedian Bayesian Posterior Median Estimates for Policy Competence Latent Trait

pecompsd Bayesian Posterior Std. Deviation Estimates for Policy Competence Latent Trait

pecomp25lcl Bayesian Posterior 2.5 Pctile Estimates for Policy Competence Latent Trait

pecomp975ucl Bayesian Posterior 97.5 Pctile Estimates for Policy Competence Latent Trait

zloyalmedian Standardized values of (loyalmedian)

zmecompmedian Standardized values of (mecompmedian)

zpecompmedian Standardized values of (pecompmedian)

stddiffloyalmecomp Difference Between zloyalmedian & zmecompmedian (Zm*)

stddiffloyalpecomp Difference Between zloyalmedian & zpecompmedian (Zp*)

stddiffmecomppecomp Difference Between zmecompmedian & zpecompmedian (Zc*)

loyalmediantype = +1 if zloyalmedian >75 Pctile; = 0 if Lies in IQ Range; = -1 if < 0.25 Pctile

mecompmediantype = +1 if zmecompmedian >75 Pctile; = 0 if Lies in IQ Range; = -1 if < 0.25 Pctile

pecompmediantype = +1 if zpecompmedian >75 Pctile; = 0 if Lies in IQ Range; = -1 if < 0.25 Pctile

loyalmedianlowtype = 1 if zloyalmedian < 0.25 Pctile; = 0 Otherwise

loyalmedianmodtype = 1 if zloyalmedian Lies in IQ Range; = 0 Otherwise

loyalmedianhightype = 1 if zloyalmedian > 0.75 Pctile; = 0 Otherwise

mecompmedianlowtype = 1 if zmecompmedian < 0.25 Pctile; = 0 Otherwise

mecompmedianmodtype = 1 if zmecompmedian Lies in IQ Range; = 0 Otherwise

mecompmedianhightype = 1 if zmecompmedian > 0.75 Pctile; = 0 Otherwise

pecompmedianlowtype = 1 if zpecompmedian < 0.25 Pctile; = 0 Other

pecompmedianmodtype = 1 if zpecompmedian Lies in IQ Range; = 0 Otherwise

pecompmedianhightype = 1 if zpecompmedian > 0.75 Pctile; = 0 Otherwise

zloyalsd Standardized values of (loyalsd)

zmecompsd Standardized values of (mecompsd)

zpecompsd Standardized values of (pecompsd)

---

ceo Prior CEO experience. = 1 if had CEO position in one of four previous jobs to nomination (excluded appointed and civil service jobs); = 0 otherwise. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

privmgt Prior top level private sector experience. = 1 if had CEO, VP, Chairman of Board, or President position in one of four previous jobs to nomination (excluded appointed and civil service jobs); = 0 otherwise. See Appointments.AJPS.Manuscript & SI Documents.Stata Variable Codebook.05-30-2015.pdf (https://dataverse.harvard.edu/file.xhtml?persistentId=doi:10.7910/DVN/E9UQ0S/VGUJKU&version=1.3)

nonsenconfirmed = 1 for Non-PAS Confirmed; = 0 PAS Confirmed

holdover = 1 Holdover Appointment; = 0 Otherwise

VARIABLES OF INTEREST FOR BONICA MATCHED DATABASE

obsidentokb Observation Identifier for Krause and Bonica common cases

indidentokb Appointee Identifier for Krause and Bonica common cases

zloyalmedian Standardized values of (loyalmedian)

elect1bmodel23fbit ELECT1B Loyalty Manifest Indicator [Model 23fbit: Reported Model]

party2bmodel23fbit PARTY2B Loyalty Manifest Indicator [Model 23fbit: Reported Model]

moneymodel23fbit MONEY Loyalty Manifest Indicator [Model 23fbit: Reported Model]

paepa2model23fbit PAEPA2 Loyalty Manifest Indicator [Model 23fbit: Reported Model]

govservmodel23fbit GOVSERV Loyalty Manifest Indicator [Model 23fbit: Reported Model]

ptyorg2model23fbit PTYORG2 Loyalty Manifest Indicator [Model 23fbit: Reported Model]

cfscore CF score for Agency Leader Appointee

presip CF score for Appointing President -- pres.ip (President's Ideal Point)

ln Appointee Last Name

presagencyleaderabsdist ABS(CFSCORE-PRES.IP) – Absolute difference between CFscore for Agency Appointee Leader and Appointing President's Ideal Point