Appendix: "The Comeback Kid: Donald Trump on Election Day in 2016."

Seth C. McKee, Daniel A. Smith, and M. V. (Trey) Hood III

Here, we show several analyses of the distribution of the presidential vote and the likelihood of voting for Trump based on the National Conference of State Legislatures (NCSL) classification of states according to voting options: Election Day (ED), Early In-Person (EIP), and Vote-By-Mail (VBM). Based on the NCSL classification scheme, there are four different categories of states: (1) All Options: ED, EIP, and VBM; (2) ED&(E)VBM (where E = Excuse); (3) ED&EIP; (4) VBM Only. CCES respondents self-report whether their ballot was cast via ED, EIP, or VBM, and we do not cull voters if they happen to report voting based on an option that according to the NCSL does not seem to be available or prevalent in the voter's state. For instance, Michigan is a state that the NCSL classifies as ED&(E)VBM and yet at least 29 CCES respondents reported voting Early In-Person (N=1,376). In the analysis shown in Table 2, we have not removed respondents like the 29 Michiganders who reported their use of a voting option not readily available according to the NCSL.

In Appendix Tables 2 and 3, we employ the NCSL state classification scheme, but we do not remove respondents from the analysis if they claim to use a voting option that the NCSL does not consider available or prevalent in a given state. Thus, the 29 respondents who reported voting EIP in Michigan remain in the analyses shown in these tables. We err on the side of including voters who report exercising a voting option that appears unavailable in their state (or rarely utilized) because there is in fact considerable disagreement regarding the classification of certain states with respect to the available voting options and therefore it would be questionable for us to make decisions regarding which voters to include and exclude based on a classification scheme that is admittedly imperfect (the NCSL is an authoritative source but disagreement persists with respect to classifying states by voting options and the NCSL includes considerable nuance regarding the availability of certain options in select states). Therefore, in the multivariate regressions displayed in Appendix Tables 2 and 3, the NCSL state classification categories serve as an indicator of the options *primarily* available/prevalent in a given state, even though it is possible and likely for some states to have many voters reporting their use of a voting option outside the NCSL state classification (e.g., EIP voting in a state classified as ED&(E)VBM). This means, for example, in Appendix Table 2, when Election Day is the dummy for the ED&EIP model, there are some respondents coded zero in the model who claimed to have voted via VBM. Nonetheless, if we rerun all of the models that the NCSL designates as having less than all three voting options (ED, EIP, and VBM), that is, the ED&(E)VBM and ED&EIP models, and then cull from the analysis the voters who report using an option not readily available (e.g., removing VBM voters from the ED&EIP models), the substantive findings do not change. We show these results in Appendix Table 4. We are not concerned with VBM Only states since the vote option (VBM) is constant (though, once again, there are some voters in VBM Only states who report using another option).

We begin with Appendix Table 1, which shows the distribution of the two-party vote (Trump/Clinton) according to voting options, state competitiveness (All States, Battleground, and Non-Battleground), and NCSL classification. We also show the percentage point difference in the two-party vote for each voting option category. In Appendix Table 2 we show the likelihood of voting for Trump with the Election Day dummy included and thus it is compared to voting prior to Election Day (via EIP or VBM). Next, in Appendix Table 3 we show the likelihood of voting for Trump when the two pre-Election Day options are included, EIP and VBM. As discussed, in Appendix Table 4 we show the likelihood of voting for Trump in the states *not* making all three options widely available and remove respondents who reported using a voting option that is designated as unavailable (no EIP voters in the ED&(E)VBM models). Finally, Appendix Table 5 shows the states listed under the four NCSL state classification categories.

Appendix Table 1. Two-Party Vote for Trump and Clinton by Vote Option, State Competitiveness, and NCSL Classifications

State Voting Options% All Options/All States (N=28)	Two-Party Vote% Trump/Clinton	Trump% - Clinton% Difference
ED = 45.2%	50.8/49.2	+1.6
EIP = 25.4%	44.4/55.6	-11.2
VBM = 29.4%	43.1/56.9	-13.8
All Options/Battleground (N=6)	Trump/Clinton	Difference
ED = 38.8%	56.0/44.0	+12.0
EIP = 35.8%	45.9/54.1	-8.2
VBM = 25.4 %	49.8/50.3	-0.5
All Options/Non-Battleground (22)	Trump/Clinton	Difference
ED = 49.2%	48.0/52.0	-4.0
EIP = 18.7%	42.5/57.5	-15.0
VBM = 32.0%	39.7/60.3	-20.6
ED&(E)VBM/All States (N=13)	Trump/Clinton	Difference
ED = 90.3%	49.6/50.4	-0.8
VBM = 9.7%	46.2/53.9	-7.7
ED&(E)VBM/Battleground (N=4)	Trump/Clinton	Difference
ED = 86.8%	50.5/49.5	+1.0
VBM = 13.2%	46.4/53.6	-7.2
ED&(E)VBM/Non-Battleground (N=9)	Trump/Clinton	Difference
ED = 93.5%	48.9/51.1	-2.2
VBM = 6.5%	45.7/54.3	-8.6
ED&EIP/All States (N=7)	Trump/Clinton	Difference
ED = 43.6%	55.5/44.6	+10.9
EIP = 56.4%	54.1/45.9	+8.2
VBM Only/All States (N=3)	Trump/Clinton	Difference
VBM = 100.0%	43.8/56.2	-12.4
VBM Only/Battleground (N=1)	Trump/Clinton	Difference
VBM = 100.0%	45.0/55.0	-10.0
VBM Only/Non-Battleground (N=2)	Trump/Clinton	Difference
VBM = 100.0%	43.4/56.7	-13.3

Notes: Data weighted based on 2016 CCES post-election weight variable. "ED" = Election Day, "EIP" = Early In-Person, and "VBM" = Vote-By-Mail. "(E)VBM = Excuse-Vote-By-Mail. There are no battleground states based on the *POLITICO* classification for "ED&EIP" states. Total number of respondents for each category is: All Options/All States = 21,192; All Options/Battleground = 8,230; All Options/Non-Battleground = 12,962; ED&(E)VBM/All States = 10,716; ED&(E)VBM/Battleground = 5,034; ED&(E)VBM/Non-Battleground = 5,682; ED&EIP = 5,722; VBM Only/All States = 2,106; VBM Only/Battleground = 611; VBM Only/Non-Battleground = 1,495. Vote method(s) for each category sum to 100 percent (barring rounding error). Coding by vote method is from the National Conference of State Legislatures website (http://www.ncsl.org/research/elections-and-campaigns/absentee-and-early-voting.aspx).

Appendix Table 2. Likelihood of Voting for Trump, Election Day vs. Early Voting (EIP & VBM), State Competitiveness, and NCSL Classifications

	Full	Full	Full	All Options	All Options	All Options	ED&(E)VBM	ED&(E)VBM	ED&(E)VBM	ED&EIP
	All States	BG	N-BG	All States	BG	N-BG	All States	BG	N-BG	All States
Election Day	0.164***	0.228***	0.131***	0.188***	0.205***	0.167***	0.140**	0.219***	0.0455	0.0698
	(0.0273)	(0.0450)	(0.0319)	(0.0360)	(0.0584)	(0.0449)	(0.0465)	(0.0325)	(0.0851)	(0.0512)
Democrat	-2.918***	-2.893***	-2.941***	-2.937***	-2.922***	-2.966***	-2.793***	-2.776***	-2.805***	-2.927***
	(0.0483)	(0.0981)	(0.0534)	(0.0507)	(0.108)	(0.0528)	(0.0853)	(0.148)	(0.102)	(0.0733)
Independent	-1.359***	-1.387***	-1.352***	-1.350***	-1.377***	-1.337***	-1.299***	-1.342***	-1.261***	-1.394***
	(0.0395)	(0.0715)	(0.0471)	(0.0444)	(0.0934)	(0.0488)	(0.0724)	(0.102)	(0.103)	(0.107)
Black	-0.831***	-1.056***	-0.716***	-0.701***	-1.023***	-0.483**	-0.950***	-1.134***	-0.836***	-1.055***
	(0.0951)	(0.0807)	(0.117)	(0.144)	(0.112)	(0.162)	(0.126)	(0.117)	(0.143)	(0.293)
Latino	-0.347***	-0.268***	-0.364**	-0.226*	-0.289***	-0.185	-0.352*	-0.108	-0.445**	-0.638***
	(0.0875)	(0.0518)	(0.124)	(0.0907)	(0.0531)	(0.126)	(0.154)	(0.152)	(0.171)	(0.126)
Other	-0.295***	-0.136	-0.341***	-0.342***	-0.0981	-0.419***	-0.249**	-0.200	-0.282***	-0.146
	(0.0702)	(0.0961)	(0.0742)	(0.0910)	(0.0764)	(0.0810)	(0.0925)	(0.221)	(0.0730)	(0.118)
Battleground	0.0406			0.128*			-0.0920			
	(0.0526)			(0.0594)			(0.102)			
ED & (E)VBM	-0.00413	-0.155*	0.103							
	(0.0604)	(0.0605)	(0.0922)							
ED & EIP	0.158	.	0.187							
	(0.0988)	.	(0.0966)							
VBM Only	-0.0765	-0.182***	-0.0216							
	(0.0554)	(0.0434)	(0.0661)							
Constant	1.496***	1.572***	1.481***	1.437***	1.582***	1.438***	1.516***	1.374***	1.586***	1.748***
	(0.0683)	(0.0514)	(0.0748)	(0.0695)	(0.0575)	(0.0717)	(0.135)	(0.104)	(0.198)	(0.0989)
N	39624	13781	25843	20590	8000	12590	10844	5068	5776	5918
Pseudo R^2	0.499	0.491	0.505	0.502	0.492	0.508	0.494	0.489	0.501	0.492

Notes: Probit regression coefficients with robust standard errors clustered on the state in parentheses. Dependent variable: 1 = Trump vote, 0 = Clinton vote. Data are weighted by the post-election CCES weight variable. For party affiliation, Republican is the omitted reference category. For race/ethnicity, white is the omitted reference category. "BG" = Battleground, "N-BG" = Non-Battleground. For voting options by state, "All Options" is the omitted reference category. There are no battleground states with the "ED&EIP" option. The omitted vote option reference categories are Early In-Person and Vote-By-Mail. $^{***}p < .001$, $^{**}p < .01$, $^{*}p < .05$ (two-tailed).

Appendix Table 3. Likelihood of Voting for Trump based on Vote Option, State Competitiveness, and NCSL Classifications

	Full	Full	Full	All Options	All Options	All Options	ED&(E)VBM	ED&(E)VBM	ED&(E)VBM	ED&EIP
	All States	BG	N-BG	All States	BG	N-BG	All States	BG	N-BG	All States
EIP	-0.0953*	-0.192**	-0.0563	-0.127*	-0.181*	-0.0638				-0.0541
	(0.0405)	(0.0725)	(0.0439)	(0.0578)	(0.0808)	(0.0817)				(0.0424)
VBM	-0.236***	-0.260***	-0.216***	-0.242***	-0.236*	-0.235***	-0.163***	-0.208***	-0.0874	
	(0.0296)	(0.0692)	(0.0362)	(0.0448)	(0.103)	(0.0532)	(0.0444)	(0.0376)	(0.112)	
Democrat	-2.920***	-2.894***	-2.942***	-2.941***	-2.924***	-2.970***	-2.791***	-2.772***	-2.805***	-2.929***
	(0.0488)	(0.0993)	(0.0538)	(0.0519)	(0.113)	(0.0534)	(0.0851)	(0.147)	(0.103)	(0.0730)
Independent	-1.363***	-1.388***	-1.357***	-1.356***	-1.380***	-1.346***	-1.299***	-1.339***	-1.262***	-1.395***
	(0.0397)	(0.0724)	(0.0467)	(0.0446)	(0.0976)	(0.0465)	(0.0722)	(0.103)	(0.102)	(0.107)
Black	-0.837***	-1.060***	-0.722***	-0.709***	-1.028***	-0.494**	-0.951***	-1.136***	-0.836***	-1.051***
	(0.0955)	(0.0824)	(0.117)	(0.146)	(0.115)	(0.166)	(0.126)	(0.115)	(0.143)	(0.292)
Latino	-0.344***	-0.268***	-0.360**	-0.221*	-0.289***	-0.174	-0.353*	-0.117	-0.447**	-0.640***
	(0.0880)	(0.0511)	(0.125)	(0.0896)	(0.0521)	(0.124)	(0.154)	(0.157)	(0.171)	(0.125)
Other	-0.295***	-0.139	-0.340***	-0.342***	-0.102	-0.415***	-0.250**	-0.202	-0.284***	-0.146
	(0.0680)	(0.0947)	(0.0716)	(0.0881)	(0.0708)	(0.0770)	(0.0925)	(0.220)	(0.0728)	(0.118)
Battleground	0.0328			0.115			-0.0885			
	(0.0506)			(0.0594)			(0.102)			
ED & (E)VBM	-0.00304	-0.147*	0.0923							
	(0.0596)	(0.0652)	(0.0899)							
ED & EIP	0.123	.	0.144							
	(0.0945)	.	(0.0931)							
VBM Only	-0.0226	-0.157*	0.0391							
	(0.0521)	(0.0662)	(0.0490)							
Constant	1.670***	1.797***	1.626***	1.634***	1.789***	1.612***	1.651***	1.584***	1.632***	1.806***
	(0.0664)	(0.0534)	(0.0702)	(0.0769)	(0.0689)	(0.0803)	(0.108)	(0.0793)	(0.128)	(0.0962)
N	39624	13781	25843	20590	8000	12590	10844	5068	5776	5918
Pseudo R^2	0.500	0.492	0.506	0.502	0.493	0.509	0.494	0.488	0.501	0.492

Notes: Probit regression coefficients with robust standard errors clustered on the state in parentheses. Dependent variable: 1 = Trump vote, 0 = Clinton vote. Data are weighted by the post-election CCES weight variable. For party affiliation, Republican is the omitted reference category. For race/ethnicity, white is the omitted reference category. "BG" = Battleground, "N-BG" = Non-Battleground. For voting options by state, "All Options" is the omitted reference category. There are no battleground states with the "ED&EIP" option. The omitted vote option reference category is Election Day. $^{***}p < .001$, $^{**}p < .01$, $^{*}p < .05$ (two-tailed).

Appendix Table 4. Likelihood of Voting for Trump, Election Day vs. Early Voting, State Competitiveness, and Voting *Limited* by NCSL Classifications

	ED&(E)VBM All States	ED&(E)VBM BG	ED&(E)VBM N-BG	ED&EIP All States
Election Day	0.165***	0.213***	0.0905	0.0680
	(0.0392)	(0.0344)	(0.0910)	(0.0476)
Democrat	-2.770***	-2.752***	-2.783***	-2.918***
	(0.0803)	(0.135)	(0.0979)	(0.0870)
Independent	-1.289***	-1.322***	-1.259***	-1.365***
	(0.0740)	(0.108)	(0.104)	(0.105)
Black	-0.940***	-1.139***	-0.817***	-1.039***
	(0.134)	(0.119)	(0.153)	(0.297)
Latino	-0.330*	-0.0556	-0.435*	-0.606***
	(0.166)	(0.131)	(0.179)	(0.112)
Other	-0.261**	-0.220	-0.289***	-0.174
	(0.0919)	(0.218)	(0.0660)	(0.113)
Battleground	-0.0800			.
	(0.0972)			.
Constant	1.473***	1.364***	1.530***	1.730***
	(0.127)	(0.107)	(0.204)	(0.0952)
N	10418	4900	5518	553
Pseudo R^2	0.489	0.483	0.493	0.488

Notes: Probit regression coefficients with robust standard errors clustered on the state in parentheses. Dependent variable: 1 = Trump vote, 0 = Clinton vote. Data are weighted by the post-election CCES weight variable. For party affiliation, Republican is the omitted reference category. For race/ethnicity, white is the omitted reference category. "BG" = Battleground, "N-BG" = Non-Battleground. There are no battleground states with the "ED&EIP" option. In these models, respondents who claim a vote option that is not available/prevalent in the state, are excluded. Hence, there are no respondents who claimed to exercise the EIP option included in the ED&(E)VBM models; and there are no respondents who claimed the VBM option included in the ED&EIP model.

***$p < .001$, **$p < .01$, *$p < .05$ (two-tailed).

Appendix Table 5. NCSL Classification of States According to Voting Options

All Options (N=28)	ED&(E)VBM (N=13)	ED&EIP (N=7)	VBM Only (N=3)
AK, AZ, CA, D.C., FL, GA, HI, ID, IL, IA, KS, ME, MD, MN, MT, NE, NV, NJ, NM, NC, ND, OH, OK, SD, UT, VT, WI, WY	AL, CT, DE, KY, MI, MS, MO, NH, NY, PA, RI, SC, VA	AR, IN, LA, MA, TN, TX, WV	CO, OR, WA

Notes: These state classifications come directly from the NCSL website, accessed June 5, 2017: http://www.ncsl.org/research/elections-and-campaigns/absentee-and-early-voting.aspx.