Online appendix for

# "Who commits to regional human rights treaties? Reputational benefits, sovereignty costs, and regional dynamics."

*Journal of Human Rights*

Mathis Lohaus: mathis.lohaus@fu-berlin.de; orcid.org/0000-0002-8081-5781
Sören Stapel: soeren.stapel@politik.uni-freiburg.de; orcid.org/0000-0002-0564-4951b

**Table of contents**

Table A1: Data sources

Table A2: Summary statistics

Table A3: Extended model for the OAS without the 1994 treaty on women's rights

Table A4: Models with dummy variables for each country or treaty

Table A5: Models with shared frailty at the country or the treaty level

Table A6: Models with alternative democracy and democratization variables

Table A7: Negative binomial regression of ratifications per treaty

Table A1: Data sources

| Variable | Format | Description and source |
|---|---|---|
| Change in government | Dummy 1/0 | Own coding based on the Archigos dataset of political leaders. Coded as "1" for every year in which a new "leader-spell" according to Archigos has started.<br>Source: Archigos dataset version 4.1, February 2016 http://ksgleditsch.com/archigos.html, Goemans et al. 2009 |
| Common Law | Dummy 1/0 | Coded as "1" for countries with a British / Common Law legal heritage, such as former British colonies.<br>Source: La Porta et al. 1999 |
| Democracy score | Scale (0-10; higher is more democratic) | "Average of Freedom House (fh_pr and fh_cl) is transformed to a scale 0-10 and Polity (p_polity2) is transformed to a scale 0-10. These variables are averaged into fh_polity2. The imputed version has imputed values for countries where data on Polity is missing by regressing Polity on the average Freedom House measure."<br>Source: QoG Standard 2020 (Variable fh_ipolity2) |
| Democracy score, alternative specification | Scale (0-10, higher is more democratic) | "Electoral democracy index. Question: To what extent is the ideal of electoral democracy in its fullest sense achieved?"<br>Source: QoG Standard 2020 (Variable vdem_polyarchy)<br>Original source: V-Dem (Variable v2x_polyarchy)<br>Note: Original scale (0-1) multiplied by ten to match the scaling of the other democracy variable. |
| Democratization | Dummy 1/0 | Coded as "1" when the democracy score increased by 2.0 or more in the current or either of the two previous years. |
| Democratization, alternative specification | Dummy 1/0 | Coded as "1" when the democracy score (alternative specification) increased by at least 0.1 on the original scale in the current or either of the two previous years. |
| GDP | Continuous | "Data are in constant 2010 U.S. dollars. Dollar figures for GDP are converted from domestic currencies using 2010 official exchange rates."<br>Source: World Bank World Development Indicators, https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/NY.GDP.MKTP.KD<br>Note: Transformed into the natural logarithm. |
| High sovereignty cost | Dummy 1/0 | Coded as "1" when a regional treaty imposes relatively high sovereignty costs by creating an enforcement mechanism (human rights court)<br>Source: Own research of treaty contents. |

| | | |
|---|---|---|
| Internal armed conflict | Dummy 1/0 | "Number of internal armed conflicts per country in a given year. Internal armed conflict occurs between the government of a state and one or more internal opposition group(s) without intervention from other states."<br>Source: QoG Standard 2020 (Variable ucdp_type3)<br>Original source: UCDP/PRIO<br>Note: Recoded from a count (number of parallel conflicts) to a dummy variable. |
| Neighborhood ratification | Continuous | Number of countries from the same sub-region as the country under investigation that had ratified the respective treaty prior to the current year. (Set to 0 for the first year each treaty is available to ratify.)<br>Source: Own calculation using the sub-regions specified in the World Bank WDI |
| UN meeting | Dummy 1/0 | Coded as "1" when a United Nations conference on the topic of the regional treaty has taken place in the current or either of the two previous years.<br>Source: Own research on dates of UN conferences based on Wikipedia and web research. |

Table A2: Summary statistics

| Variable | Observations | Mean | Std. Dev. | Min | Max |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| *Dependent variable* | | | | | |
| Ratification | 10163 | 0.045 | 0.207 | 0 | 1 |
| *Independent variables* | | | | | |
| Democracy score | 9347 | 6.255 | 3.186 | 0.25 | 10 |
| Democratization | 9113 | 0.043 | 0.202 | 0 | 1 |
| Neighborhood ratification | 10163 | 2.955 | 3.771 | 0 | 16 |
| High sovereignty costs | 10163 | 0.224 | 0.417 | 0 | 1 |
| GDP (USD, logged) | 9161 | 22.904 | 2.334 | 18.621 | 30.513 |
| Common law | 9993 | 0.477 | 0.500 | 0 | 1 |
| Change in government | 9136 | 0.229 | 0.420 | 0 | 1 |
| UN event | 10163 | 0.014 | 0.118 | 0 | 1 |
| Internal armed conflict | 9993 | 0.100 | 0.301 | 0 | 1 |

Table A3: Extended model for the OAS without the 1994 treaty on women's rights

| | |
|---|---|
| Democracy | 1.188** (0.065) |
| Democratization | 2.382** (0.673) |
| Neighborhood | 1.127*** (0.041) |
| High cost | 1.222 (0.210) |
| GDP (USD, logged) | 1.032 (0.055) |
| Common law | 0.030*** (0.017) |
| Change in government | 1.506* (0.263) |
| UN event | 7.827 (9.355) |
| Internal armed conflict | 1.273 (0.327) |
| No. of countries | 34 |
| No. of treaties | 7 |
| Time at risk / observations | 4126 |
| Ratifications | 125 |
| BIC | 1109.377 |

*Note: Shaded cells indicate results that differ substantially from the models reported in the main text (in effect size and/or statistical significance).*

Table A4: Models with dummy variables for each country or treaty

| | **Dummy variable for each country** | | | | **Dummy variable for each treaty** | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | **Main model** | | **Extended model** | | **Main model** | | **Extended model** | |
| | OAS | OAU/AU | OAS | OAU/AU | OAS | OAU/AU | OAS | OAU/AU |
| Democracy | | | | | 1.299*** (0.067) | 1.016 (0.031) | 1.302*** (0.071) | 1.011 (0.031) |
| Democratization | | | | | 2.047** (0.510) | 0.621 (0.211) | 1.877* (0.481) | 0.553 (0.186) |
| Neighborhood | 1.362*** (0.054) | 1.144*** (0.029) | 1.280*** (0.053) | 1.144*** (0.030) | 1.069* (0.035) | 1.065** (0.025) | 1.063 (0.036) | 1.073** (0.026) |
| High cost | 1.017 (0.253) | 0.379*** (0.072) | 1.046 (0.265) | 0.379*** (0.072) | | | | |
| GDP (USD, logged) | | | | | 0.995 (0.041) | 1.117** (0.045) | 0.989 (0.042) | 1.133** (0.048) |
| Common law | | | | | 0.048*** (0.015) | 1.005 (0.172) | 0.051*** (0.016) | 1.009 (0.173) |
| Change in government | | | | | | | 1.321 (0.231) | 0.887 (0.135) |
| UN event | | | 4.547*** (1.336) | 1.001 (1.050) | | | | |
| Internal armed conflict | | | | | | | 1.460 (0.380) | 0.905 (0.256) |
| | *(Coefficients for country dummies omitted.)* | | | | *(Coefficients for treaty dummies omitted.)* | | | |
| No. of countries | 34 | 54 | 34 | 54 | 34 | 52 | 34 | 51 |
| No. of treaties | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 |
| Time at risk | 5003 | 4990 | 5003 | 4990 | 4615 | 3986 | 4273 | 3638 |
| Ratifications | 158 | 298 | 158 | 298 | 157 | 259 | 157 | 253 |
| BIC | 1706.133 | 3534.220 | 1689.167 | 3542.735 | 1433.302 | 2704.667 | 1436.614 | 2634.781 |

*Note: Models with treaty-level (country-level) dummy variables exclude treaty-level (country-level) explanatory variables. Shaded cells indicate results that differ substantially from the models reported in the main text (in effect size and/or statistical significance).*

Table A5: Models with shared frailty at the country or the treaty level

| | **Shared frailty – by country** | | | | **Shared frailty – by treaty** | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | **Main model** | | **Extended model** | | **Main model** | | **Extended model** | |
| | OAS | OAU/AU | OAS | OAU/AU | OAS | OAU/AU | OAS | OAU/AU |
| Democracy | 1.175** (0.060) | 1.006 (0.029) | 1.193** (0.065) | 1.011 (0.029) | 1.285*** (0.065) | 1.012 (0.026) | 1.281*** (0.069) | 1.010 (0.026) |
| Democratization | 2.058** (0.510) | 0.584 (0.219) | 2.072** (0.522) | 0.507 (0.203) | 2.062** (0.510) | 0.622 (0.229) | 1.927** (0.489) | 0.553 (0.219) |
| Neighborhood | 1.235*** (0.040) | 1.105*** (0.024) | 1.146*** (0.038) | 1.116*** (0.025) | 1.086* (0.035) | 1.071*** (0.019) | 1.085* (0.036) | 1.082*** (0.020) |
| High cost | 1.540 (0.404) | 0.361*** (0.069) | 1.252 (0.334) | 0.393*** (0.077) | 0.754 (0.663) | 0.327*** (0.103) | 0.829 (0.578) | 0.354** (0.113) |
| GDP (USD, logged) | 0.997 (0.053) | 1.143* (0.062) | 0.999 (0.047) | 1.171** (0.066) | 0.999 (0.041) | 1.117** (0.046) | 0.995 (0.043) | 1.136** (0.049) |
| Common law | 0.084*** (0.027) | 0.933 (0.181) | 0.080*** (0.025) | 0.925 (0.182) | 0.052*** (0.016) | 1.005 (0.139) | 0.057*** (0.018) | 1.007 (0.141) |
| Change in government | | | 1.318 (0.228) | 0.847 (0.152) | | | 1.309 (0.228) | 0.880 (0.155) |
| UN event | | | 6.132*** (1.776) | 0.857 (0.886) | | | 2.550* (1.083) | 0.415 (0.428) |
| Internal armed conflict | | | 1.211 (0.325) | 1.081 (0.224) | | | 1.392 (0.361) | 0.923 (0.171) |
| No. of countries | 34 | 52 | 34 | 51 | 34 | 52 | 34 | 51 |
| No. of treaties | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 |
| Time at risk | 4615 | 3986 | 4273 | 3638 | 4615 | 3986 | 4273 | 3638 |
| Ratifications | 157 | 259 | 157 | 253 | 157 | 259 | 157 | 253 |
| BIC | 1461.084 | 2671.904 | 1437.110 | 2609.383 | 1412.652 | 2674.804 | 1421.069 | 2611.931 |

*Note: Shaded cells indicate results that differ from the models reported in the main text (in effect size and/or statistical significance).*

Table A6: Models with alternative democracy and democratization variables

| | **Main model** | | **Extended model** | |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| | OAS | OAU/AU | OAS | OAU/AU |
| Democracy *(alt. spec.)* | 1.124* (0.066) | 1.031 (0.036) | 1.143* (0.063) | 1.035 (0.039) |
| Democratization *(alt. spec.)* | 1.992* (0.560) | 1.030 (0.239) | 1.814* (0.522) | 0.998 (0.236) |
| Neighborhood | 1.168*** (0.041) | 1.087*** (0.025) | 1.124** (0.041) | 1.097*** (0.026) |
| High cost | 1.125 (0.171) | 0.377*** (0.063) | 1.016 (0.179) | 0.415*** (0.070) |
| GDP (USD, logged) | 1.002 (0.068) | 1.122** (0.042) | 0.987 (0.059) | 1.138** (0.047) |
| Common law | 0.115*** (0.053) | 0.939 (0.148) | 0.105*** (0.046) | 0.947 (0.152) |
| Change in government | | | 1.531** (0.233) | 0.833 (0.126) |
| UN event | | | 4.486*** (1.323) | 0.794 (0.829) |
| Internal armed conflict | | | 1.322 (0.269) | 1.018 (0.261) |
| No. of countries | 26 | 52 | 26 | 51 |
| No. of treaties | 8 | 8 | 8 | 8 |
| Time at risk | 3216 | 4223 | 3036 | 3875 |
| Ratifications | 148 | 273 | 148 | 267 |
| BIC | 1350.514 | 2882.297 | 1332.096 | 2821.321 |

*Note: The alternative democracy and democratization variables (see Table A1) lead to better coverage of the early years (1969-1972). However, these indicators are unavailable for a number of smaller states. Compare the number of countries and ratifications indicated below each model.*

Table A7: Negative binomial regression of ratifications per treaty

| | |
|---|---|
| OAU/AU dummy | 0.818*** (0.156) |
| High cost | 0.148 (0.335) |
| OAU/AU * high cost | -1.106* (0.647) |
| Constant | 2.760*** (0.647) |
| Observations | 16 |
| BIC | 126.353 |

*Note: One of the anonymous reviewers suggested a count poisson regression of the number of ratifiers per treaty per year to probe the effect of treaty-related sovereignty costs. Unfortunately, this would leave us without any covariates that change over time, since organization and sovereignty costs are constant for each treaty. Moreover, the number of new ratifications per year is limited by the fact that each organization has a fixed number of member states, which puts a ceiling on the count variable that seems difficult to model. To avoid these issues, we have fit a negative binomial regression with the cumulative count of ratifications for each treaty (n=16). Here, the interaction between the African Union and treaty-specific sovereignty costs is negative and statistically significant, supporting the results of our main model. (Negative binomial regression is used due to overdispersion of the dependent variable. The results from the poisson regression are virtually identical.)*