Supplemental Appendix: White Racial Identity and Preferences for (Non) White Immigrants in the United States

Supplemental Appendix A: Detail on Variable Coding & Creation (pp. 1 - 7)

Supplemental Appendix B: Various Supplemental Analyses (pp. 7 - 9)

Appendix A

The following pages provide information on how each variable (in Table 2 in the main paper) was created and coded. Additional information on the Voter Study Group (VSG) panel, including the codebook and data in Stata format are available at the following link. `https://www.voterstudygroup.org/data/voter-survey`. I will also make all data publicly available for replication in the Harvard Dataverse upon acceptance for publication.

Variable Creation & Coding

All descriptive statistics and sample sizes are for the unweighted data and for my sample of non-Hispanic White Americans (survey respondents who self-identified as White in 2016, 2017, *and* 2018). The variable names in italics refer to the name in the VSG data.

- Support for Immigration - Europe

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *immi_region_eur_2018*

  Coded as follows: 1 = decreased; 2 = kept the same; 3 = increased

  Mean = 1.96; Standard Deviation = 0.58; Min = 1; Max = 3

  Valid N = 3,713

- Support for Immigration - Africa

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *immi_region_afr_2018*

  Coded as follows: 1 = decreased; 2 = kept the same; 3 = increased

  Mean = 1.74; Standard Deviation = 0.61; Min = 1; Max = 3

  Valid N = 3,714

- Support for Immigration - China

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *immi_region_china_2018*

  Coded as follows: 1 = decreased; 2 = kept the same; 3 = increased

  Mean = 1.72; Standard Deviation = 0.60; Min = 1; Max = 3

  Valid N = 3,718

- Support for Immigration - India

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *immi_region_india_2018*

  Coded as follows: 1 = decreased; 2 = kept the same; 3 = increased

  Mean = 1.79; Standard Deviation = 0.60; Min = 1; Max = 3

  Valid N = 3,705

- Support for Immigration - Mexico & Latin America (labeled as "Mexico")

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *immi_region_latin_2018*

  Coded as follows: 1 = decreased; 2 = kept the same; 3 = increased

  Mean = 1.68; Standard Deviation = 0.65; Min = 1; Max = 3

  Valid N = 3,715

- Support for Immigration - Middle East (labeled as "Mideast")

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *immi_region_mid_2018*

  Coded as follows: 1 = decreased; 2 = kept the same; 3 = increased

  Mean = 1.55; Standard Deviation = 0.63; Min = 1; Max = 3

  Valid N = 3,715

- White Identity

  Measured in 2017

  Created from *race_importance_2017*

  Higher values = stronger White identity

  Originally ranged from 1-5; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.40; Standard Deviation = 0.35; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,671

- Partisanship

  Measured in 2017

  Created from *pid7_2017*

  Higher values = stronger Republican identification

  Originally ranged from 1-7; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.51; Standard Deviation = 0.36; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,683

- Ideology (not sure/moderate = midpoint on 5-point scale)

  Measured in 2017

  Created from *ideo5_2017*

  Higher values = stronger conservative identification

  Originally ranged from 1-5; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.55; Standard Deviation = 0.28; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,717

- Trump Attitudes (index constructed from two variables)

  Measured in 2017

  Created by summing *trumpapp_2017* and *fav_trump_2017*

  Higher values = greater Trump support

  Originally ranged from 2-8; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.44; Standard Deviation = 0.43; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,607

- Authoritarianism (index constructed from four variables)

  Measured in 2016

  Created by summing *sc1_independent_2016*, *sc2_curiosity_2016*, *sc3_obedience_2016*, and *sc4_considerate_2016*

  Higher values = greater authoritarianism

  Originally ranged from 2-8; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.47; Standard Deviation = 0.34; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,193

- Egalitarianism (index constructed from four variables)

  Measured in 2017

  Created by summing *egalitarian_opportunities_2017*, *egalitarian_worryless_2017*, *egalitarian_chance_2017*, and *egalitarian_fewerproblems_2017*

  Higher values = greater egalitarianism

  Originally ranged from 4-20; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.59; Standard Deviation = 0.27; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,644

- Nationalism (index constructed from three variables)

  Measured in 2016

  Created by summing *usa_becitizen_2016*, *usa_ashamed_2016*, and *usa_belikeus_2016*

  Higher values = greater pro-USA nationalism

  Originally ranged from 3-15; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.59; Standard Deviation = 0.23; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,682

- Populism (index constructed from four variables)

  Measured in 2017

  Created by summing *expert_trustordinary_2017*, *expert_facts_2017*, *expert_help_2017*, and *expert_struggle_2017*

  Higher values = greater populism

  Originally ranged from 4-16; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.40; Standard Deviation = 0.21; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,616

- Social Trust (index constructed from three variables; "don't know" = midpoint)

  Measured in 2016

  Created by summing *people_trust_2016*, *people_helpful_2016*, and *people_fair_2016*

  Higher values = greater social trust

  Originally ranged from 0-6; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.49; Standard Deviation = 0.40; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,704

- Local Economy - Satisfaction

  Measured in 2017

  Created from *satisfaction_localeconomy_2017*

  Higher values = greater satisfaction

  Originally ranged from 1-5; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.60; Standard Deviation = 0.27; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,676

- Personal Income - Satisfaction

  Measured in 2017

  Created from *satisfaction_income_2017*

  Higher values = greater satisfaction

  Originally ranged from 1-5; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.55; Standard Deviation = 0.31; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,673

- Age

  Measured in 2018

  Created by subtracting *birthyr_2018* from the number 2018

  Measured in years; higher values = person is older

  Mean = 61.0; Standard Deviation = 17.9; Min = 25; Max = 93

  Valid N = 3,739

- Female

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *gender_2018*

  Coded as follows: 0 = male; 1 = female

  Mean = 0.52; Standard Deviation = 0.50; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,739

- College

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *educ_2018*

  Coded as follows: 0 = no HS/High school graduate/Some college/2-year; 1 = 4-year/Post-grad

  Mean = 0.41; Standard Deviation = 0.49; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,739

- Married

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *marstat_2018*

  Coded as follows: 0 = Separated/Divorced/Widowed/Never married/Domestic or civil partnership; 1 = Married

  Mean = 0.62; Standard Deviation = 0.49; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,739

- State Fixed Effects

  Measured in 2018

  Created from *inputstate_2018*

  Coded as a series of 51 dummy variables (Alabama, Alaska, Arkansas, etc.)

  Valid N = 3,739

Variables used in the Supplemental Analyses (see the "Robustness of Main Findings" section in the manuscript)

- White Identity (measured in 2016)

  Measured in 2016 instead of 2017

  Created from *race_importance_2016*

  Higher values = stronger White identity

  Originally ranged from 1-5; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.43; Standard Deviation = 0.35; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,710

- Feeling Thermometer - Black People

  Measured in 2017

  Created from *ft_black_2017*

  Higher values = warmer feelings

  Originally ranged from 0-100; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.70; Standard Deviation = 0.24; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,606

- Feeling Thermometer - Asian People

  Measured in 2017

  Created from *ft_asian_2017*

  Higher values = warmer feelings

  Originally ranged from 0-100; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.74; Standard Deviation = 0.22; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,592

- Feeling Thermometer - Hispanic People

  Measured in 2017

  Created from *ft_hisp_2017*

  Higher values = warmer feelings

  Originally ranged from 0-100; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.69; Standard Deviation = 0.24; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,594

- Feeling Thermometer - Muslim People

  Measured in 2017

  Created from *ft_muslim_2017*

  Higher values = warmer feelings

  Originally ranged from 0-100; re-scaled to range from 0-1

  Mean = 0.48; Standard Deviation = 0.31; Min = 0; Max = 1

  Valid N = 3,506

Appendix B

The following pages present results from additional models associated with the "Robustness of Main Findings" section in the manuscript. These are (Table B1) analyses that use a 2016 measure of White identity rather than a 2017 measure and (Table B2) models that include, for the five non-European immigrant groups, a measure of "out-group" attitudes based on 2017 feeling thermometer ratings (of Black People, Asian People, Hispanic People, and Muslim People).

Table B1: White Identity and Support for Allowing Various Groups to Immigrate, When Measuring White Identity in 2016 rather than 2017

	DV = Support for Immigration (ranges 1-3; measured in 2018)					
	Europe	Africa	China	India	Mexico	Mideast
White_Identity_2016	-0.075	-0.521***	-0.349***	-0.470***	-0.404***	-0.303***
	(0.067)	(0.068)	(0.062)	(0.063)	(0.072)	(0.075)
Partisanship_2017	-0.045	0.007	0.071	0.130	0.014	0.022
	(0.095)	(0.102)	(0.083)	(0.096)	(0.086)	(0.096)
Ideology_2017	-0.171	-0.380**	-0.322**	-0.267*	-0.494***	-0.365**
	(0.143)	(0.149)	(0.140)	(0.150)	(0.150)	(0.166)
Trump_Attitudes_2017	-0.278***	-0.699***	-0.540***	-0.533***	-0.948***	-1.020***
	(0.101)	(0.071)	(0.076)	(0.096)	(0.094)	(0.086)
Authoritarianism_2016	-0.433***	-0.409***	-0.423***	-0.488***	-0.381***	-0.408***
	(0.064)	(0.076)	(0.072)	(0.084)	(0.103)	(0.090)
Egalitarianism_2017	0.162	0.806***	0.450***	0.562***	0.862***	1.072***
	(0.124)	(0.146)	(0.117)	(0.136)	(0.122)	(0.160)
Nationalism_2016	-0.226*	-0.487***	-0.272*	-0.104	-0.387***	-0.607***
	(0.131)	(0.108)	(0.146)	(0.130)	(0.114)	(0.123)
Populism_2017	-0.139	-0.316**	-0.459***	-0.298**	-0.621***	-0.489**
	(0.118)	(0.157)	(0.174)	(0.133)	(0.157)	(0.192)
Social_Trust_2016	0.321***	0.438***	0.313***	0.353***	0.356***	0.420***
	(0.054)	(0.043)	(0.052)	(0.057)	(0.064)	(0.074)
Satisfy_Local_Econ_2017	0.086	0.268***	0.307***	0.302***	0.224**	0.264***
	(0.098)	(0.102)	(0.085)	(0.105)	(0.107)	(0.099)
Satisfy_Personal_Income_2017	-0.094	0.184**	0.089	0.000	0.166	0.273***
	(0.070)	(0.092)	(0.082)	(0.107)	(0.125)	(0.102)
Age_2018	0.001	-0.006***	-0.005**	-0.001	-0.004*	-0.011***
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)
Female_2018	-0.246***	0.054	-0.053	-0.060	-0.012	0.007
	(0.051)	(0.046)	(0.052)	(0.038)	(0.051)	(0.042)
College_2018	0.295***	0.118***	0.121***	0.259***	0.071	0.110*
	(0.043)	(0.041)	(0.046)	(0.063)	(0.062)	(0.060)
Married_2018	-0.153***	-0.059	-0.042	-0.050	-0.078**	-0.038
	(0.049)	(0.044)	(0.040)	(0.042)	(0.037)	(0.059)
Constant cut1	-1.158***	-1.060***	-0.927***	-0.617***	-1.320***	-1.028***
	(0.178)	(0.194)	(0.199)	(0.223)	(0.214)	(0.269)
Constant cut2	1.008***	1.290***	1.229***	1.594***	0.802***	1.024***
	(0.171)	(0.194)	(0.198)	(0.227)	(0.220)	(0.242)
State Fixed Effects$_{(2018)}$	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Observations	2,857	2,854	2,858	2,854	2,856	2,855
Pseudo R^2	0.097	0.243	0.164	0.165	0.280	0.322

Note: Dependent variables are measured in 2018 and asks about preferred immigration allowance from different countries/regions of the world (1 = decrease; 2 = keep about the same; 3 = increase). All independent variables (except for age, gender, education, marital status, and state fixed effects) are measured in 2016 or 2017 and range from 0 to 1. Sample consists of Americans who identity as White, non-Hispanic (in 2016, 2017, *and* 2018). Ordered probit coefficients with robust standard errors clustered by state in parentheses. *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1, two-tailed test. Source is the VSG Panel Study.

Table B2: White Identity and Support for Allowing Various Groups to Immigrate, When Controlling for Specific Out-Group Attitudes

	DV = Support for Immigration (ranges 1-3; measured in 2018)					
	Europe	Africa	China	India	Mexico	Mideast
White_Identity_2017	-0.040	-0.504***	-0.286***	-0.448***	-0.333***	-0.161**
	(0.072)	(0.069)	(0.084)	(0.085)	(0.085)	(0.079)
Partisanship_2017	-0.033	0.017	0.061	0.137	0.020	0.083
	(0.092)	(0.098)	(0.076)	(0.095)	(0.078)	(0.100)
Ideology_2017	-0.167	-0.286**	-0.213	-0.173	-0.363**	-0.228
	(0.141)	(0.143)	(0.133)	(0.153)	(0.146)	(0.168)
Trump_Attitudes_2017	-0.282***	-0.710***	-0.557***	-0.561***	-1.024***	-0.792***
	(0.102)	(0.063)	(0.074)	(0.097)	(0.100)	(0.095)
Authoritarianism_2016	-0.434***	-0.426***	-0.422***	-0.509***	-0.376***	-0.400***
	(0.063)	(0.077)	(0.071)	(0.087)	(0.110)	(0.098)
Egalitarianism_2017	0.170	0.627***	0.445***	0.498***	0.686***	0.884***
	(0.123)	(0.147)	(0.129)	(0.148)	(0.132)	(0.179)
Nationalism_2016	-0.235*	-0.552***	-0.305**	-0.137	-0.472***	-0.591***
	(0.133)	(0.135)	(0.152)	(0.151)	(0.120)	(0.149)
Populism_2017	-0.159	-0.307**	-0.393**	-0.233*	-0.511***	-0.433**
	(0.117)	(0.154)	(0.174)	(0.128)	(0.148)	(0.195)
Social_Trust_2016	0.320***	0.367***	0.285***	0.293***	0.251***	0.325***
	(0.053)	(0.052)	(0.057)	(0.063)	(0.071)	(0.086)
Satisfy_Local_Econ_2017	0.105	0.180*	0.247***	0.234**	0.176*	0.095
	(0.099)	(0.106)	(0.094)	(0.103)	(0.097)	(0.109)
Satisfy_Personal_Income_2017	-0.104	0.178*	0.067	-0.039	0.072	0.244**
	(0.070)	(0.094)	(0.085)	(0.112)	(0.118)	(0.108)
Age_2018	0.001	-0.008***	-0.006**	-0.001	-0.005**	-0.014***
	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.003)	(0.002)	(0.002)	(0.002)
Female_2018	-0.248***	0.009	-0.063	-0.074**	-0.046	-0.084*
	(0.050)	(0.046)	(0.056)	(0.037)	(0.049)	(0.050)
College_2018	0.294***	0.142***	0.104**	0.244***	0.074	0.105*
	(0.043)	(0.041)	(0.047)	(0.064)	(0.062)	(0.060)
Married_2018	-0.154***	-0.067	-0.050	-0.056	-0.095***	-0.055
	(0.048)	(0.041)	(0.042)	(0.042)	(0.037)	(0.056)
FT_Blacks_2017		1.197***				
		(0.150)				
FT_Asians_2017			0.884***	1.026***		
			(0.125)	(0.113)		
FT_Hispanics_2017					1.438***	
					(0.139)	
FT_Muslims_2017						1.559***
						(0.140)
Constant cut1	-1.153***	-0.401**	-0.277	0.086	-0.786***	-0.518*
	(0.178)	(0.196)	(0.203)	(0.223)	(0.212)	(0.268)
Constant cut2	1.015***	2.020***	1.898***	2.326***	1.419***	1.638***
	(0.173)	(0.196)	(0.199)	(0.229)	(0.218)	(0.243)
State Fixed Effects$_{(2018)}$	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓	✓
Observations	2,846	2,778	2,778	2,774	2,775	2,706
Pseudo R^2	0.096	0.270	0.175	0.183	0.310	0.362

Note: Dependent variables are measured in 2018 and asks about preferred immigration allowance from different countries/regions of the world (1 = decrease; 2 = keep about the same; 3 = increase). All independent variables (except for age, gender, education, marital status, and state fixed effects) are measured in 2016 or 2017 and range from 0 to 1. Sample consists of Americans who identity as White, non-Hispanic (in 2016, 2017, *and* 2018). Ordered probit coefficients with robust standard errors clustered by state in parentheses. *** p<0.01, ** p<0.05, * p<0.1, two-tailed test. Source is the VSG Panel Study.