```
R version 3.4.1 (2017-06-30) -- "Single Candle"
Copyright (C) 2017 The R Foundation for Statistical Computing
Platform: x86_64-apple-darwin15.6.0 (64-bit)

R is free software and comes with ABSOLUTELY NO WARRANTY.
You are welcome to redistribute it under certain conditions.
Type 'license()' or 'licence()' for distribution details.

  Natural language support but running in an English locale

R is a collaborative project with many contributors.
Type 'contributors()' for more information and
'citation()' on how to cite R or R packages in publications.

Type 'demo()' for some demos, 'help()' for on-line help, or
'help.start()' for an HTML browser interface to help.
Type 'q()' to quit R.

[R.app GUI 1.70 (7375) x86_64-apple-darwin15.6.0]

[History restored from /Users/mbuntaine/.Rapp.history]

> ################################################################################
> ################################################################################
> #Replication code for:
>
> #Mark T. Buntaine & Lauren Prather
> #Preferences for Domestic Action Over International Transfers in Global Climate Policy
> #Journal of Experimental Political Science, forthcoming.
>
> #Mark Buntaine contact (as of October 2017): buntaine@bren.ucsb.edu
> #Lauren Prather contact (as of October 2017): lprather@ucsd.edu
>
> #Compiled using R Version 3.4.1 (version "Single Candle") on Mac running OS X 10.12.6
> ################################################################################
> ################################################################################
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Packages
> ################################################################################
> library(nnet) #version 7.3-12
> library(ri) #version 0.9
> library(ggplot2) #version 2.2.1
> library(MASS) #version 7.3-47
> library(pscl) #version 1.5.1
Classes and Methods for R developed in the
Political Science Computational Laboratory
Department of Political Science
Stanford University
Simon Jackman
hurdle and zeroinfl functions by Achim Zeileis
> library(boot) #version 1.3-20
> library(nnet) #version 7.3-12
> library(stargazer) #version 5.2

Please cite as:

 Hlavac, Marek (2015). stargazer: Well-Formatted Regression and Summary Statistics Tables.
 R package version 5.2. http://CRAN.R-project.org/package=stargazer

> library(AER) #version 1.2-5
Loading required package: car

Attaching package: ‘car’

The following object is masked from ‘package:boot’:

    logit

Loading required package: lmtest
Loading required package: zoo

Attaching package: ‘zoo’

The following objects are masked from ‘package:base’:

    as.Date, as.Date.numeric

Loading required package: sandwich
Loading required package: survival

Attaching package: ‘survival’
```

```
The following object is masked from ‘package:boot’:

    aml

> library(reshape2) #version 1.4.2
> library(plyr) #version 1.8.4
> library(cowplot) #version 0.8.0

Attaching package: ‘cowplot’

The following object is masked from ‘package:ggplot2’:

    ggsave

>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Setting up data from Experiment 1
> ################################################################################
>
> data <- read.csv("~/Google Drive/Climate Transfers project/ClimateTransfer_MTurkData_coded.csv", stringsAsFactors=FALSE)
> data <- subset(data,consent==2 | is.na(consent)) #Removing subjects who decline to participate after reading consent
>
> data$effect1 <- ifelse(data$effect1=="effect",1,data$effect1)
> data$effect1 <- ifelse(data$effect1=="no effect",0,data$effect1) #These two lines make 0 the no cost-effectness and 1 the cost-
effectness treatments
> data$effect1 <- as.numeric(data$effect1)
>
> data$country <- ifelse(data$country=="the United States","US",data$country)
> data$country <- factor(data$country, levels=c("US","India","China"))
>
> data$wri.stated <- ifelse(data$wri.stated==2,0,data$wri.stated) #This transforms binary variable to expected values
> data$wri.bonus.W <- ifelse(data$wri.stated==1,1,10) #This is the reverse probability of sampling, which re-weights the sample because
only 10% of disapproving subjects selected into the bonus portion
>
> data$wri.bonus <- ifelse(data$wri.bonus==2,0,data$wri.bonus) #This transforms binary variable to expected values
> data$wri.bonus.confirm <- ifelse(data$wri.bonus.confirm==2,0,data$wri.bonus.confirm) #This transforms binary variable to expected
values
> data$wri.bonus.confirm.NArm <- ifelse(is.na(data$wri.bonus.confirm),0,data$wri.bonus.confirm)
> data$wri.fullbonus.final <- ifelse(is.na(data$wri.bonus),NA,data$wri.bonus.confirm.NArm) #This adds in the people who stated "no" to
the final confirmed step for those who said "yes"
>
> data$wri.bonus.amount <- ifelse(data$wri.bonus>=0,0,0)
> data$wri.bonus.amount <- ifelse(!is.na(data$wri.fullbonus.final) & data$wri.fullbonus.final==1,50,data$wri.bonus.amount)
> data$wri.bonus.amount <- ifelse(!is.na(data$wri.bonus.portion.confirm) & data$wri.bonus.portion.confirm==1 &
data$wri.bonus.portion==2,10,data$wri.bonus.amount)
> data$wri.bonus.amount <- ifelse(!is.na(data$wri.bonus.portion.confirm) & data$wri.bonus.portion.confirm==1 &
data$wri.bonus.portion==3,20,data$wri.bonus.amount)
> data$wri.bonus.amount <- ifelse(!is.na(data$wri.bonus.portion.confirm) & data$wri.bonus.portion.confirm==1 &
data$wri.bonus.portion==4,30,data$wri.bonus.amount)
> data$wri.bonus.amount <- ifelse(!is.na(data$wri.bonus.portion.confirm) & data$wri.bonus.portion.confirm==1 &
data$wri.bonus.portion==5,40,data$wri.bonus.amount)
>
> data$wri.bonus.any <- ifelse(data$wri.bonus.amount>0,1,0)
>
> data$govt.spending.support <- ifelse(data$govt.spending.support==2,0,data$govt.spending.support) #This transforms binary variable to
expected values, 1-approval; 0-disapprove
> data$govt.encourage <- ifelse(data$govt.encourage==2,0,1) #This transforms binary variable to expected values, 1-yes; 0-no
> data$govt.discourage <- ifelse(data$govt.discourage==2,0,1) #This transforms binary variable to expected values, 1-yes; 0-no
>
> data$govt.message <- NA #Combining govt.encourage and govt.discourage into one variable
> data$govt.message <- ifelse(data$govt.encourage==1 & !is.na(data$statement),"encourage",data$govt.message)
> data$govt.message <- ifelse(data$govt.discourage==1 & !is.na(data$govt.discourage)& !
is.na(data$statement),"discourage",data$govt.message)
> data$govt.message <- ifelse((data$govt.encourage==0 & !is.na(data$govt.encourage)) | (data$govt.discourage==0 & !
is.na(data$govt.discourage)) | (data$statement.nonmessage==1 & !is.na(data$statement.nonmessage)),"none",data$govt.message)
> data$govt.message <- as.factor(data$govt.message)
> data$govt.message <- relevel(data$govt.message,ref="none")
>
> data$representative[is.na(data$representative) & !is.na(data$govt.message)] <- 0
> data$rep.message <- ifelse(data$representative==1,as.character(data$govt.message),"none")
> data$rep.message <- as.factor(data$rep.message)
> data$rep.message <- relevel(data$rep.message,ref="none")
>
> data$govt.message.repclicked <- ifelse(data$repclicked==1 & !is.na(data$repclicked), as.character(data$govt.message), "none")
>
> data$govt.encourage.rep.final <- ifelse(data$govt.message.repclicked=="encourage",1,0)
> data$govt.discourage.rep.final <- ifelse(data$govt.message.repclicked=="discourage",1,0)
>
> ##Covariate recoding/generation
> data$bin.cc.serious.US <- ifelse(data$cc.serious.US==1 | data$cc.serious.US==2,1,0)
> data$bin.cc.serious.foreign <- ifelse(data$cc.serious.foreign==1 | data$cc.serious.foreign==2,1,0)
> data$bin.cc.notserious.US <- ifelse(data$cc.serious.US==3 | data$cc.serious.US==4,1,0)
> data$bin.cc.notserious.foreign <- ifelse(data$cc.serious.foreign==3 | data$cc.serious.foreign==4,1,0)
>
```

```
> data$cc.not.willing <- ifelse(data$cc.serious.foreign==4 & data$cc.serious.US==4,1,0)
>
> data$US.favorable <- ifelse(data$US.favorability==1 | data$US.favorability==2,1,0)
> data$india.favorable <- ifelse(data$india.favorability==1 | data$india.favorability==2,1,0)
> data$china.favorable <- ifelse(data$china.favorability==1 | data$china.favorability==2,1,0)
> data$US.unfavorable <- ifelse(data$US.favorability==3 | data$US.favorability==4,1,0)
> data$india.unfavorable <- ifelse(data$india.favorability==3 | data$india.favorability==4,1,0)
> data$china.unfavorable <- ifelse(data$china.favorability==3 | data$china.favorability==4,1,0)
>
> data$recall.ce[data$recall.ce==1]<-NA
> data$recall.ce[data$recall.ce==2]<-"somewhat"
> data$recall.ce[data$recall.ce==4]<-"not sure"
> data$recall.ce[data$recall.ce==5]<-"most"
> data$recall.ce[data$recall.ce==6]<-"least"
>
> data$bin.us.active <- ifelse(data$us.active==1,1,0)
>
> data$received.bonus <- ifelse(!is.na(data$wri.bonus),1,0)
>
> ##Data subsets
> data.us <- subset(data,country=="US")
> data.india <- subset(data,country=="India")
> data.china <- subset(data,country=="China")
> data.no.repub <- subset(data,party!=1)
> data.no.colgrad <- subset(data,education<5)
> data.colgrad <- subset(data,education>=5)
>
> data.us.ce0 <- subset(data,country=="US" & effect1==0)
> data.india.ce0 <- subset(data,country=="India" & effect1==0)
> data.china.ce0 <- subset(data,country=="China" & effect1==0)
> data.us.ce1 <- subset(data,country=="US" & effect1==1)
> data.india.ce1 <- subset(data,country=="India" & effect1==1)
> data.china.ce1 <- subset(data,country=="China" & effect1==1)
>
> data.click <- data[-(1:224),] #Discarding observations with unknown click tracking
> data.click.no.repub <- subset(data.click, party!=1) #Excluding Republicans for subgroup analysis
> data.click.no.colgrad <- subset(data.click, education<5)
> data.click.colgrad <- subset(data.click, education>=5)
> data.click.willing <- subset(data.click, cc.not.willing==0) #To match our sampling strategy of "hypothetically willing"
>
> data.willing <- subset(data,cc.not.willing==0) #To match our sampling strategy of "hypothetically willing"
> data.click.willing.ce0 <- subset(data.click.willing, effect1==0)
> data.willing.us <- subset(data,cc.not.willing==0 & country=="US")
> data.willing.india <- subset(data,cc.not.willing==0 & country=="India")
> data.willing.china <- subset(data,cc.not.willing==0 & country=="China")
>
> data.willing.us.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="US" & effect1==0)
> data.willing.india.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="India" & effect1==0)
> data.willing.china.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="China" & effect1==0)
> data.willing.us.ce1 <- subset(data.willing,country=="US" & effect1==1)
> data.willing.india.ce1 <- subset(data.willing,country=="India" & effect1==1)
> data.willing.china.ce1 <- subset(data.willing,country=="China" & effect1==1)
>
> data.willing.no.colgrad <- subset(data.willing, education<5)
>
>
> ##############################################################################
> ###Setting up data from Experiment 2
> ##############################################################################
>
> data2 <- read.csv("~/Google Drive/Climate Transfers project/MTurk_Experiment2_Export_coded.csv", stringsAsFactors=FALSE)
> data2 <- data2[-1,]
>
> #Treatments
> data2$pub <- ifelse(data2$control11==1 | data2$control21==1,0,1)
> data2$ce <- ifelse(data2$all11==1 | data2$pubcost11==1 | data2$all21==1 | data2$pubcost21==1,1,0)
> data2$priv <- ifelse(data2$all11==1 | data2$pubpriv11==1 | data2$all21==1 | data2$pubpriv21==1,1,0)
> data2$donate.first <- ifelse(data2$control11==1 | data2$pub11==1 | data2$pubcost11==1 | data2$all11==1 | data2$pubpriv11==1,1,0)
>
> #Outcomes
> data2$donate.us.amount <- as.numeric(data2$donate_1)
> data2$donate.foreign.amount <- as.numeric(data2$donate_2)
> data2$donate.diff <- data2$donate.us.amount - data2$donate.foreign.amount
> data2$keep <- as.numeric(data2$donate_3)
>
> data2$donate.multi <- NA
> data2$donate.multi <- factor(data2$donate.multi, levels=c("both","us.only","foreign.only","neither"))
> data2$donate.multi[(data2$donate.us.amount>0 & data2$donate.foreign.amount>0)] <- "both"
> data2$donate.multi[data2$donate.us.amount>0 & data2$donate.foreign.amount==0] <- "us.only"
> data2$donate.multi[data2$donate.us.amount==0 & data2$donate.foreign.amount>0] <- "foreign.only"
> data2$donate.multi[data2$donate.us.amount==0 & data2$donate.foreign.amount==0] <- "neither"
> table(data2$donate.multi, useNA = "always")

        both      us.only foreign.only      neither         <NA>
        1516          222          185          924           17
```

```
>
> data2$donate.any <- ifelse(data2$keep==20, 0, 1)
> data2$donate.total <- data2$donate.us.amount + data2$donate.foreign.amount
> data2$donate.prop.us <- data2$donate.us.amount / data2$donate.total
>
> data2$fundus <- as.numeric(data2$fundus)
> data2$fundus <- ifelse(data2$fundus==2,0,1)
> data2$fundfor <- as.numeric(data2$fundfor)
> data2$fundfor <- ifelse(data2$fundfor==2,0,1)
>
> #Written message & click
> data2$govt.us.encourage.rep.final <- ifelse(data2$fundus==1 & nchar(data2$text, allowNA = FALSE)>0 & is.na(data2$statement.nonmessage)
& data2$repclick==1, 1, 0)
> data2$govt.us.discourage.rep.final <- ifelse(data2$fundus==0 & nchar(data2$text, allowNA = FALSE)>0 & is.na(data2$statement.nonmessage)
& data2$repclick==1, 1, 0)
> data2$govt.foreign.encourage.rep.final <- ifelse(data2$fundfor==1 & nchar(data2$text, allowNA = FALSE)>0 &
is.na(data2$statement.nonmessage) & data2$repclick==1, 1, 0)
> data2$govt.foreign.discourage.rep.final <- ifelse(data2$fundfor==0 & nchar(data2$text, allowNA = FALSE)>0 &
is.na(data2$statement.nonmessage) & data2$repclick==1, 1, 0)
>
> #Covariates
> for (i in 22:24){
+   data2[,i] <- as.numeric(data2[,i])}
>
> data2$local.benefits.score <- rowMeans(data2[,22:24],na.rm=T) #This measures the extent to which subjects report local benefits to be
very important
>
> #Effective Data
> data2 <- subset(data2,Q70==2 | Q70=="") #Removing subjects who do not consent to participate
> data2.no.repub <- subset(data2, Q142!=1) #excluding subjects who identify as Republicans
> data2.no.colgrad <- subset(data2, Q115<5) #excluding subjects who graduated from college
>
> #Data Subsets
> data2.privT <- subset(data2,pub==1 & priv==1)
> data2.NOprivT <- subset(data2,pub==1 & priv==0)
>
> data2.willing <- subset(data2, Q202!=4 & Q203!=4)
> data2.w.pure.control <- subset(data2.willing, pub==0)
> data2.w.noT <- subset(data2.willing, ce==0 & priv==0)
> data2.w.pub <- subset(data2.willing, pub==1)
> data2.w.pb.ceiling <- subset(data2.willing, local.benefits.score<=3)
> data2.w.pb.prior <- subset(data2.willing, Q132_1!=2 & Q132_2!=4)
> data2.w.no.colgrad <- subset(data2.willing, Q115<5)
>
> data2.w.any <- subset(data2.w.pub, donate.us.amount>0 | donate.foreign.amount>0)
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ################################################################################
> ###Main manuscript
> ################################################################################
> ################################################################################
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Figure 1: Location
> ################################################################################
>
> ### (A) Exp 1: Private Donation
> #Note: this runs the analysis for both the location and cost-effectiveness arms (Figure 2)
>
> #Analysis
> no.vector.us.ce0<-data.willing.us.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.us.ce0$wri.stated==0 & data.willing.us.ce0$randForce==1] #These
are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.china.ce0<-data.willing.china.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.china.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.china.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.india.ce0<-data.willing.india.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.india.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.india.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.us.ce1<-data.willing.us.ce1$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.us.ce1$wri.stated==0 & data.willing.us.ce1$randForce==1] #These
are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.china.ce1<-data.willing.china.ce1$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.china.ce1$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.china.ce1$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.india.ce1<-data.willing.india.ce1$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.india.ce1$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.india.ce1$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
>
> prob.switch.us.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.us.ce0)/length(no.vector.us.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.china.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.china.ce0)/length(no.vector.china.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.india.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.india.ce0)/length(no.vector.india.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.us.ce1 <- sum(no.vector.us.ce1)/length(no.vector.us.ce1) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.china.ce1 <- sum(no.vector.china.ce1)/length(no.vector.china.ce1) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.india.ce1 <- sum(no.vector.india.ce1)/length(no.vector.india.ce1) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
>
> #Setting up for the simulation
> imp <- data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final
>
> treat.country <- unique(data.willing$country)
```

```
> treat.ce <- c(0,1)
> sims <- 10000
>
> us.ob.ce0 <- rep(NA,sims)
> china.ob.ce0 <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.ob.ce0 <- rep(NA,sims)
> us.ob.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
> china.ob.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.ob.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> ate.china <- rep(NA,sims)
> ate.india <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> ate.china.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
> ate.india.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> ate.us.ce <- rep(NA,sims)
> ate.china.ce <- rep(NA,sims)
> ate.india.ce <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> #The sampling distribution for the ATE under the sharp null is formed over repeated imputations
> #This imputes a full data.willing dataset, sampling from the observed values for donating after stating "no"
> set.seed(201)
> for (j in 1:sims){
+
+   for (i in 1:nrow(data.willing)){
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="US" & data.willing$effect1[i]==0){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.us.ce0)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="China" & data.willing$effect1[i]==0){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.china.ce0)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="India" & data.willing$effect1[i]==0){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.india.ce0)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="US" & data.willing$effect1[i]==1){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.us.ce1)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="China" & data.willing$effect1[i]==1){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.china.ce1)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="India" & data.willing$effect1[i]==1){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.india.ce1)}
+   }
+
+   treatment.country <- sample(treat.country, size=nrow(data.willing), replace=TRUE)
+   treatment.ce <- sample(treat.ce, size=nrow(data.willing), replace=TRUE)
+
+   us.ob.ce0[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="US" & data.willing$effect1==0])
+   china.ob.ce0[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==0])
+   india.ob.ce0[j]  <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==0])
+   us.ob.ce1[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="US" & data.willing$effect1==1])
+   china.ob.ce1[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==1])
+   india.ob.ce1[j]  <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==1])
+
+   ate.china[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==0]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==0])
+   ate.india[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==0]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==0])
+
+   ate.china.ce1[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==1]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==1])
+   ate.india.ce1[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==1]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==1])
+
+   ate.us.ce[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.ce==1 & data.willing$country=="US"]) - mean(imp[treatment.ce==0 & data.willing$country=="US"])
+   ate.china.ce[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.ce==1 & data.willing$country=="China"]) - mean(imp[treatment.ce==0 &
data.willing$country=="China"])
+   ate.india.ce[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.ce==1 & data.willing$country=="India"]) - mean(imp[treatment.ce==0 &
data.willing$country=="India"])
+ }
>
> #Means after imputation:
> mean(us.ob.ce0) #0.2174562
[1] 0.2174562
> mean(india.ob.ce0) #0.2397313
[1] 0.2397313
> mean(china.ob.ce0) #0.1281301
[1] 0.1281301
> #Note: these are the values for Figure 1, Panel A
>
> mean(us.ob.ce1) #0.2411839
[1] 0.2411839
> mean(india.ob.ce1) #0.2354218
[1] 0.2354218
> mean(china.ob.ce1) #0.2049109
[1] 0.2049109
>
> #SEs of imputation:
> sd(us.ob.ce0) #0.01770294
```

```
[1] 0.01770294
> sd(india.ob.ce0) #0.01956023
[1] 0.01956023
> sd(china.ob.ce0) #0.01453143
[1] 0.01453143
> sd(us.ob.ce1) #0.02022568
[1] 0.02022568
> sd(india.ob.ce1) #0.01877704
[1] 0.01877704
> sd(china.ob.ce1) #0.01833503
[1] 0.01833503
>
> #Displaying the sampling distributions after imputation
> hist(ate.china)
> hist(ate.india)
>
> hist(ate.china.ce1)
> hist(ate.india.ce1)
>
> hist(ate.us.ce)
> hist(ate.china.ce)
> hist(ate.india.ce)
>
> ###Evaluating and then averaging the p-value of different imputations
> china.p <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.p <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> china.ce1.p <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.ce1.p <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> us.ce.p <- rep(NA,sims)
> china.ce.p <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.ce.p <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> for (k in 1:sims){
+   china.test <- (ate.china < (china.ob.ce0[k] - us.ob.ce0[k]))
+   india.test <- (ate.india < (india.ob.ce0[k] - us.ob.ce0[k]))
+
+   china.ce1.test <- (ate.china.ce1 < (china.ob.ce1[k] - us.ob.ce1[k]))
+   india.ce1.test <- (ate.india.ce1 < (india.ob.ce1[k] - us.ob.ce1[k]))
+
+   us.ce.test <- (ate.us.ce < (us.ob.ce1[k] - us.ob.ce0[k])) #One-tailed test about negative effect of poor CE information
+   china.ce.test <- (ate.china.ce > (china.ob.ce1[k] - china.ob.ce0[k])) #One-tailed test about positive effect of good CE information
+   india.ce.test <- (abs(ate.india.ce) > abs(india.ob.ce1[k] - india.ob.ce0[k])) #Two-tailed test about moderate CE information
+
+   china.p[k] <- sum(china.test)/length(china.test)
+   india.p[k] <- sum(india.test)/length(india.test)
+
+   china.ce1.p[k] <- sum(china.ce1.test)/length(china.ce1.test)
+   india.ce1.p[k] <- sum(india.ce1.test)/length(india.ce1.test)
+
+   us.ce.p[k] <- sum(us.ce.test)/length(us.ce.test)
+   china.ce.p[k] <- sum(china.ce.test)/length(china.ce.test)
+   india.ce.p[k] <- sum(india.ce.test)/length(india.ce.test)
+ }
>
> mean(china.p) #0.02991913
[1] 0.02991913
> mean(india.p) #0.6853572
[1] 0.6853572
>
> mean(china.ce1.p) #0.2372263
[1] 0.2372263
> mean(india.ce1.p) #0.457938
[1] 0.457938
>
> mean(us.ce.p) #0.6769077
[1] 0.6769077
> mean(china.ce.p) #0.04402671
[1] 0.04402671
> mean(india.ce.p) #0.6353137
[1] 0.6353137
>
> set.seed(201)
> se <- c(sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.us.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.2174562)/nrow(data.willing.us.ce0)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.india.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.2397313)/nrow(data.willing.india.ce0)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.china.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.1281301)/nrow(data.willing.china.ce0)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.us.ce1), n=10000, prob=0.2411839)/nrow(data.willing.us.ce1)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.india.ce1), n=10000, prob=0.2354218)/nrow(data.willing.india.ce1)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.china.ce1), n=10000, prob=0.2049109)/nrow(data.willing.china.ce1))
+ )
> #Note: the first three elements of "se" are the SEs for Figure 1, Panel A
>
> se <- c(0.04877672,0.05132853,0.04450108,0.03126550,0.02910411,0.02944495) #Based exactly on above
>
```

```
> #Plotting
> country <- rev(c("US","India","China"))
> prop.donate<-rev(c(0.2174562,0.2397313,0.1281301)) #From proportions calculated above
> se <- rev(c(0.04877672,0.05132853,0.04450108)) #From proportions calculated above
> prop.dta <- data.frame(prop.donate,country,se)
> se.bars <- aes(ymax = prop.donate + se, ymin = prop.donate - se)
>
> fig1.a <-ggplot(data=prop.dta, aes(x=country, y=prop.donate)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","khaki","indianred2")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Donating") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(A) Exp 1: Private Donation") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
>
> ### (B) Exp 2: Private Donation
>
> #Analysis
> diff.ob <- mean(data2.w.pure.control$donate.foreign.amount,na.rm=T) - mean(data2.w.pure.control$donate.us.amount, na.rm=T)
> diff.ob
[1] -0.4531835
> donate.vector <- c(data2.w.pure.control$donate.us.amount,data2.w.pure.control$donate.foreign.amount)
> diff <- rep(NA,10000)
> set.seed(202)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   sample <- sample(1:1068,534)
+   diff[i] <- mean(donate.vector[sample], na.rm=T) - mean(donate.vector[-sample], na.rm=T)
+ }
> location.p <- sum((diff < diff.ob))/10000 #0.018
>
> #Plotting
> dta2 <- melt(data2.w.pure.control, measure.vars = c('donate.foreign.amount','donate.us.amount')) #Make the object as we want it,
selecting final two columns
> dta2 <- dta2[,(ncol(dta2)-1):ncol(dta2)]
> names(dta2) <- c("Country","Amount")
> dta2$Country <- ifelse(dta2$Country=="donate.foreign.amount","Foreign","US")
> mean.info <- ddply(dta2, "Country", summarise, donate.mean=mean(Amount))
>
> foreign.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> US.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   foreign.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta2$Amount[1:534], size=534, replace=T))
+   US.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta2$Amount[535:1068], size=534, replace=T))
+ }
> mean.info$se[1] <- sd(foreign.store)
> mean.info$se[2] <- sd(US.store)
> se.bars2 <- aes(ymax = mean.info$donate.mean + mean.info$se, ymin = mean.info$donate.mean - mean.info$se)
>
> fig1.b<-ggplot(mean.info, aes(x=Country, y=donate.mean)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = mean.info$Country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","darkslategrey")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars2, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Amount Donated ($)") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(B) Exp 2: Private Donation") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
>
> ### (C) Exp 1: Public Spending
>
> #Analysis
> data.china.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country!="India" & effect1==0)
> data.china.test$treat.china <- ifelse(data.china.test$country=="China",1,0)
> perms <- genperms(data.china.test$treat.china) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 1.193695896881e+94 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.china.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.china.test$treat.china, HT=TRUE) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in
this case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.china.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.china.test$treat.china,  :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
> Ys <- genouts(data.china.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.china.test$treat.china, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under sharp
null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.0084

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.0092

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.9958
```

```
$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.0042

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
-0.06961353  0.06919878

$sd
[1] 0.03461506

$exp.val
[1] -9.558498e-07

>
> data.india.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country!="China" & effect1==0)
> data.india.test$treat.india <- ifelse(data.india.test$country=="India",1,0)
> perms <- genperms(data.india.test$treat.india) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 2.70471415145649e+89 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.india.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.india.test$treat.india) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in this case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.india.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.india.test$treat.india) :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
> Ys <- genouts(data.india.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.india.test$treat.india, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under sharp
null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.2056

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.2171

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.8972

$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.1028

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
-0.06761313  0.07848422

$sd
[1] 0.03784205

$exp.val
[1] -1.379515e-06

>
> #Plotting
> tab <- as.data.frame.matrix(table(data.click.willing.ce0$country,data.click.willing.ce0$govt.encourage.rep.final))
> names(tab) <- c("X0","X1")
> tab$n <- tab$X1 + tab$X0
> tab$prop.govt.encourage <- tab$X1/(tab$X0+tab$X1)
>
> us.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> india.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> china.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   us.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[1], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[1]))
+   india.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[2], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[2]))
+   china.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[3], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[3]))
+ }
> tab$se[1] <- sd(us.store)
> tab$se[2] <- sd(india.store)
> tab$se[3] <- sd(china.store)
> tab$country <- row.names(tab)
> tab <- tab[order(tab$country),]
>
> se.bars.ps1 <- aes(ymax = tab$prop.govt.encourage + tab$se, ymin = tab$prop.govt.encourage - tab$se)
> fig1.c<-ggplot(tab, aes(x=country, y=prop.govt.encourage)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = tab$country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","khaki","indianred2")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars.ps1, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Writing to Support") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12,
colour="black")) + xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(C) Exp 1: Public Spending") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
>
> ### (D) Exp 2: Public Spending
```

```
>
> #Analysis
> diff.ob <- mean(data2.w.pure.control$fundfor,na.rm=T) - mean(data2.w.pure.control$fundus, na.rm=T)
> diff.ob
[1] -0.3009071
> support.vector <- c(data2.w.pure.control$fundus, data2.w.pure.control$fundfor)
> diff <- rep(NA,10000)
> set.seed(202)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   sample <- sample(1:1068,534)
+   diff[i] <- mean(support.vector[sample], na.rm=T) - mean(support.vector[-sample], na.rm=T)
+ }
> location.p <- sum((diff < diff.ob))/10000
>
> #Plotting
> dta4 <- melt(data2.w.pure.control, measure.vars = c("fundus","fundfor")) #Make the object as we want it, selecting final two columns
> dta4 <- dta4[,(ncol(dta4)-1):ncol(dta4)]
> names(dta4) <- c("Country","Write")
>
> dta4$Country <- ifelse(dta4$Country=="fundfor","Foreign","US")
> mean.info4 <- ddply(dta4, "Country", summarise, write.mean=mean(Write, na.rm=T))
>
> foreign.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> US.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   foreign.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta4$Write[1:534], size=534, replace=T), na.rm=T)
+   US.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta4$Write[535:1068], size=534, replace=T), na.rm=T)
+ }
> mean.info4$se[1] <- sd(foreign.store)
> mean.info4$se[2] <- sd(US.store)
> se.bars4 <- aes(ymax = mean.info4$write.mean + mean.info4$se, ymin = mean.info4$write.mean - mean.info4$se)
>
> fig1.d<-ggplot(mean.info4, aes(x=Country, y=write.mean)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = mean.info4$Country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","darkslategrey")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars4, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Support") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(D) Exp 2: Public Spending") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> F1<-plot_grid(fig1.a, fig1.b, fig1.c, fig1.d)
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Figure 2: Cost-Effectiveness
> ################################################################################
>
> par(mfrow=c(2,2),mar=c(2.1,4.1,2.1,1.1),mgp=c(2.5,1,0)) #This will plot the four panels together, skip if examining individually
>
> ### (A) Exp 1: Private Donation
> #Note: this runs the analysis for both the location and cost-effectiveness arms (Figure 1)
> #Note: this is an exact copy of the analysis in Figure 1, Panel A pasted here for convenience
>
> #Analysis
> no.vector.us.ce0<-data.willing.us.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.us.ce0$wri.stated==0 & data.willing.us.ce0$randForce==1] #These
are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.china.ce0<-data.willing.china.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.china.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.china.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.india.ce0<-data.willing.india.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.india.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.india.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.us.ce1<-data.willing.us.ce1$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.us.ce1$wri.stated==0 & data.willing.us.ce1$randForce==1] #These
are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.china.ce1<-data.willing.china.ce1$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.china.ce1$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.china.ce1$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.india.ce1<-data.willing.india.ce1$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.india.ce1$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.india.ce1$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
>
> prob.switch.us.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.us.ce0)/length(no.vector.us.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.china.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.china.ce0)/length(no.vector.china.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.india.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.india.ce0)/length(no.vector.india.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.us.ce1 <- sum(no.vector.us.ce1)/length(no.vector.us.ce1) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.china.ce1 <- sum(no.vector.china.ce1)/length(no.vector.china.ce1) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.india.ce1 <- sum(no.vector.india.ce1)/length(no.vector.india.ce1) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
>
> #Setting up for the simulation
> imp <- data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final
>
> treat.country <- unique(data.willing$country)
> treat.ce <- c(0,1)
> sims <- 10000
>
> us.ob.ce0 <- rep(NA,sims)
> china.ob.ce0 <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.ob.ce0 <- rep(NA,sims)
> us.ob.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
```

```
> china.ob.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.ob.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> ate.china <- rep(NA,sims)
> ate.india <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> ate.china.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
> ate.india.ce1 <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> ate.us.ce <- rep(NA,sims)
> ate.china.ce <- rep(NA,sims)
> ate.india.ce <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> #The sampling distribution for the ATE under the sharp null is formed over repeated imputations
> #This imputes a full data.willing dataset, sampling from the observed values for donating after stating "no"
> set.seed(201)
> for (j in 1:sims){
+
+   for (i in 1:nrow(data.willing)){
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="US" & data.willing$effect1[i]==0){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.us.ce0)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="China" & data.willing$effect1[i]==0){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.china.ce0)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="India" & data.willing$effect1[i]==0){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.india.ce0)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="US" & data.willing$effect1[i]==1){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.us.ce1)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="China" & data.willing$effect1[i]==1){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.china.ce1)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="India" & data.willing$effect1[i]==1){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.india.ce1)}
+   }
+
+   treatment.country <- sample(treat.country, size=nrow(data.willing), replace=TRUE)
+   treatment.ce <- sample(treat.ce, size=nrow(data.willing), replace=TRUE)
+
+   us.ob.ce0[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="US" & data.willing$effect1==0])
+   china.ob.ce0[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==0])
+   india.ob.ce0[j]  <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==0])
+   us.ob.ce1[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="US" & data.willing$effect1==1])
+   china.ob.ce1[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==1])
+   india.ob.ce1[j]  <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==1])
+
+   ate.china[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==0]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==0])
+   ate.india[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==0]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==0])
+
+   ate.china.ce1[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==1]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==1])
+   ate.india.ce1[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==1]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==1])
+
+   ate.us.ce[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.ce==1 & data.willing$country=="US"]) - mean(imp[treatment.ce==0 & data.willing$country=="US"])
+   ate.china.ce[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.ce==1 & data.willing$country=="China"]) - mean(imp[treatment.ce==0 &
data.willing$country=="China"])
+   ate.india.ce[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.ce==1 & data.willing$country=="India"]) - mean(imp[treatment.ce==0 &
data.willing$country=="India"])
+ }
>
> #Means after imputation:
> mean(us.ob.ce0) #0.2174562
[1] 0.2174562
> mean(india.ob.ce0) #0.2397313
[1] 0.2397313
> mean(china.ob.ce0) #0.1281301
[1] 0.1281301
> mean(us.ob.ce1) #0.2411839
[1] 0.2411839
> mean(india.ob.ce1) #0.2354218
[1] 0.2354218
> mean(china.ob.ce1) #0.2049109
[1] 0.2049109
> #Note: these are the values for Figure 2, Panel A
>
> mean(us.ob.ce1) #0.2411839
[1] 0.2411839
> mean(india.ob.ce1) #0.2354218
[1] 0.2354218
> mean(china.ob.ce1) #0.2049109
[1] 0.2049109
>
> #SEs of imputation:
> sd(us.ob.ce0) #0.01770294
[1] 0.01770294
```

```
> sd(india.ob.ce0) #0.01956023
[1] 0.01956023
> sd(china.ob.ce0) #0.01453143
[1] 0.01453143
> sd(us.ob.ce1) #0.02022568
[1] 0.02022568
> sd(india.ob.ce1) #0.01877704
[1] 0.01877704
> sd(china.ob.ce1) #0.01833503
[1] 0.01833503
>
> #Displaying the sampling distributions after imputation
> hist(ate.china)
> hist(ate.india)
>
> hist(ate.china.ce1)
> hist(ate.india.ce1)
>
> hist(ate.us.ce)
> hist(ate.china.ce)
> hist(ate.india.ce)
>
> ###Evaluating and then averaging the p-value of different imputations
> china.p <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.p <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> china.ce1.p <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.ce1.p <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> us.ce.p <- rep(NA,sims)
> china.ce.p <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.ce.p <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> for (k in 1:sims){
+   china.test <- (ate.china < (china.ob.ce0[k] - us.ob.ce0[k]))
+   india.test <- (ate.india < (india.ob.ce0[k] - us.ob.ce0[k]))
+
+   china.ce1.test <- (ate.china.ce1 < (china.ob.ce1[k] - us.ob.ce1[k]))
+   india.ce1.test <- (ate.india.ce1 < (india.ob.ce1[k] - us.ob.ce1[k]))
+
+   us.ce.test <- (ate.us.ce < (us.ob.ce1[k] - us.ob.ce0[k])) #One-tailed test about negative effect of poor CE information
+   china.ce.test <- (ate.china.ce > (china.ob.ce1[k] - china.ob.ce0[k])) #One-tailed test about positive effect of good CE information
+   india.ce.test <- (abs(ate.india.ce) > abs(india.ob.ce1[k] - india.ob.ce0[k])) #Two-tailed test about moderate CE information
+
+   china.p[k] <- sum(china.test)/length(china.test)
+   india.p[k] <- sum(india.test)/length(india.test)
+
+   china.ce1.p[k] <- sum(china.ce1.test)/length(china.ce1.test)
+   india.ce1.p[k] <- sum(india.ce1.test)/length(india.ce1.test)
+
+   us.ce.p[k] <- sum(us.ce.test)/length(us.ce.test)
+   china.ce.p[k] <- sum(china.ce.test)/length(china.ce.test)
+   india.ce.p[k] <- sum(india.ce.test)/length(india.ce.test)
+ }
>
> mean(china.p) #0.02991913
[1] 0.02991913
> mean(india.p) #0.6853572
[1] 0.6853572
>
> mean(china.ce1.p) #0.2372263
[1] 0.2372263
> mean(india.ce1.p) #0.457938
[1] 0.457938
>
> mean(us.ce.p) #0.6769077
[1] 0.6769077
> mean(china.ce.p) #0.04402671
[1] 0.04402671
> mean(india.ce.p) #0.6353137
[1] 0.6353137
>
> #Plotting
> set.seed(201)
> se.e1 <- c(sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.us.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.2174562)/nrow(data.willing.us.ce0)),
+          sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.china.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.1281301)/nrow(data.willing.china.ce0)),
+          sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.india.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.2397313)/nrow(data.willing.india.ce0)),
+          sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.us.ce1), n=10000, prob=0.2411839)/nrow(data.willing.us.ce1)),
+          sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.china.ce1), n=10000, prob=0.2049109)/nrow(data.willing.china.ce1)),
+          sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.india.ce1), n=10000, prob=0.2354218)/nrow(data.willing.india.ce1))
+ )
> se.e1 <- c(0.02958062,0.02430956,0.03149871,0.03139279,0.02972925,0.02913393) #Based exactly on block immediately above
>
> ce = c(0,-0.05,0.05,1,0.95,1.05)
> prop.donate=c(0.2174562,
```

```
+               0.1281301,
+               0.2397313,
+               0.2411839,
+               0.2049109,
+               0.2354218) #From Analysis block; Ordering: US.ce0,China.ce0,India.ce0,US.ce1,China.ce1,India.ce1
>
> plot(x=ce,y=prop.donate,xaxt="n",xlim=c(-0.3,1.3),ylim=c(0.05,0.3),ylab="Proportion Donating Full Bonus",xlab="",
+      main="(A) Exp 1: Private Donation", col=c("steelblue1","indianred2","khaki","steelblue1","indianred2","khaki"), pch=19,cex=1.5,
cex.main=1.4)
> lines(x=c(0,1), y=c(prop.donate[1],prop.donate[4]), col="steelblue1", lwd=2)
> lines(x=c(-0.05,0.95), y=c(prop.donate[2],prop.donate[5]), col="indianred2", lwd=2)
> lines(x=c(0.05,1.05), y=c(prop.donate[3],prop.donate[6]), col="khaki", lwd=2)
> arrows(ce, prop.donate-se.e1, ce, prop.donate+se.e1, length=0.05, angle=90, code=3)
> axis(1,at=c(0,1),labels=c("Control","CE Treatment"), cex.axis=1.2)
> legend(x=0.9,y=0.11, legend=c("India","US","China"), cex=1,
+        fill=c("khaki","steelblue1","indianred2"), bty = "n")
>
>
> ### (B) Exp 2: Private Donation
>
> #Analysis
> data2.h2 <- subset(data2.willing,pub==1)
> mean(data2.h2$donate.us.amount[data2.h2$ce==1],na.rm=T) #2.90
[1] 2.898592
> mean(data2.h2$donate.us.amount[data2.h2$ce==0],na.rm=T) #3.32
[1] 3.322611
> diff.ob.us = mean(data2.h2$donate.us.amount[data2.h2$ce==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data2.h2$donate.us.amount[data2.h2$ce==0],na.rm=T)
> diff.ob.us
[1] -0.4240196
> sims <- 5000
> y1.mean.us <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean.us <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   treat.vector <- rbinom(n=nrow(data2.h2),size=1,prob=0.5)
+   y1 <- data2.h2$donate.us.amount[treat.vector==1]
+   y0 <- data2.h2$donate.us.amount[treat.vector==0]
+   y1.mean.us[i] <- mean(y1)
+   y0.mean.us[i] <- mean(y0)
+ }
> h2.diff.us <- y1.mean.us - y0.mean.us
> hist(h2.diff.us)
> ce.us.p <- sum((diff.ob.us > h2.diff.us))/sims #p = 0.0026
>
> mean(data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h2$ce==1],na.rm=T) #3.50
[1] 3.498592
> mean(data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h2$ce==0],na.rm=T) #3.00
[1] 2.999054
> diff.ob.foreign = mean(data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h2$ce==1],na.rm=T) -
mean(data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h2$ce==0],na.rm=T)
> diff.ob.foreign #0.50
[1] 0.4995376
> sims <- 5000
> y1.mean.foreign <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean.foreign <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   treat.vector <- rbinom(n=nrow(data2.h2),size=1,prob=0.5)
+   y1 <- data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[treat.vector==1]
+   y0 <- data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[treat.vector==0]
+   y1.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(y1)
+   y0.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(y0)
+ }
> h2.diff.foreign <- y1.mean.foreign - y0.mean.foreign
> hist(h2.diff.foreign)
> ce.foreign.p <- sum((diff.ob.foreign < h2.diff.foreign))/sims #p = 0.0006
>
> #Plotting
> treat.donate2=c(0,0,1,1)
> value.donate2=c(mean(data2.w.pub$donate.us.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==0],na.rm=T),
+                 mean(data2.w.pub$donate.foreign.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==0],na.rm=T),
+                 mean(data2.w.pub$donate.us.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==1],na.rm=T),
+                 mean(data2.w.pub$donate.foreign.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==1],na.rm=T)
+ )
> n.donate2=c(length(data2.w.pub$donate.us.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==0]),
+             length(data2.w.pub$donate.foreign.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==0]),
+             length(data2.w.pub$donate.us.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==1]),
+             length(data2.w.pub$donate.foreign.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==1])
+ )
>
> d <- data.frame(matrix(nrow=10000))[,-1] #Creating empty dataframe to fill with bootstrapped means
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   d$y0.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.w.pub$donate.us.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==0], replace=T, size=n.donate2[1]))
+   d$y0.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.w.pub$donate.foreign.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==0], replace=T, size=n.donate2[2]))
```

```
+   d$y1.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.w.pub$donate.us.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==1], replace=T, size=n.donate2[3]))
+   d$y1.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.w.pub$donate.foreign.amount[data2.w.pub$ce==1], replace=T, size=n.donate2[4]))
+ }
>
> se.donate2=c(sd(d$y0.mean.us),sd(d$y0.mean.foreign),sd(d$y1.mean.us),sd(d$y1.mean.foreign))
>
> plot(x=treat.donate2,y=value.donate2,xaxt="n",xlim=c(-0.5,1.5),ylim=c(2.6,3.7),ylab="Amount Donated ($)",xlab="",
+      main="(B) Exp 2: Private Donation", col=c("steelblue1","black","steelblue1","black"), pch=19,cex=1.5, cex.main=1.4)
> axis(1,at=c(0,1),labels=c("Control","CE Treatment"), cex.axis=1.2)
> arrows(treat.donate2, value.donate2-se.donate2, treat.donate2, value.donate2+se.donate2, length=0.05, angle=90, code=3)
> lines(x=c(0,1), y=c(value.donate2[1], value.donate2[3]), col="steelblue1", lwd=2)
> lines(x=c(0,1), y=c(value.donate2[2], value.donate2[4]), col="black", lwd=2)
> legend("bottomleft", legend=c("US","Foreign"), cex=1,
+        fill=c("steelblue1","black"), bty = "n")
>
>
> ### (C) Exp 1: Public Spending
>
> #Analysis
> data.us.ce.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country=="US")
> perms <- genperms(data.us.ce.test$effect1) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 2.44173895562917e+90 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.us.ce.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.us.ce.test$effect1) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in this case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.us.ce.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.us.ce.test$effect1) :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
> Ys <- genouts(data.us.ce.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.us.ce.test$effect1, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under sharp null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.5542

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.6285

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.2771

$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.7229

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
-0.07470166  0.08294692

$sd
[1] 0.04109783

$exp.val
[1] 1.101238e-06

>
> data.china.ce.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country=="China")
> perms <- genperms(data.china.ce.test$effect1) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 3.55546635683556e+92 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.china.ce.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.china.ce.test$effect1) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in this case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.china.ce.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.china.ce.test$effect1) :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
> Ys <- genouts(data.china.ce.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.china.ce.test$effect1, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under sharp
null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.0626

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.1022

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.9687

$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.0313

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
```

```
-0.04946050  0.04034061

$sd
[1] 0.02358619

$exp.val
[1] -4.33477e-07

>
> data.india.ce.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country=="India")
> perms <- genperms(data.india.ce.test$effect1) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 5.12878181536557e+92 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.india.ce.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.india.ce.test$effect1) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in this case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.india.ce.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.india.ce.test$effect1) :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
> Ys <- genouts(data.india.ce.test$govt.encourage.rep.final, data.india.ce.test$effect1, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under sharp
null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.0878

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.0839

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.9561

$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.0439

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
-0.05734101  0.05817940

$sd
[1] 0.02990155

$exp.val
[1] 6.511116e-07

>
> #Plotting
> ce = c(0.05,-0.05,0,1.05,0.95,1)
>
> us.e.ce0 <- data.click.willing$govt.encourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="US" & data.click.willing$effect1==0]
> china.e.ce0 <- data.click.willing$govt.encourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="China" & data.click.willing$effect1==0]
> india.e.ce0 <- data.click.willing$govt.encourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="India" & data.click.willing$effect1==0]
> us.e.ce1 <- data.click.willing$govt.encourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="US" & data.click.willing$effect1==1]
> china.e.ce1 <- data.click.willing$govt.encourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="China" & data.click.willing$effect1==1]
> india.e.ce1 <- data.click.willing$govt.encourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="India" & data.click.willing$effect1==1]
>
> prop.encourage=c(sum(us.e.ce0) / length(us.e.ce0),
+                  sum(china.e.ce0) / length(china.e.ce0),
+                  sum(india.e.ce0) / length(india.e.ce0),
+                  sum(us.e.ce1) / length(us.e.ce1),
+                  sum(china.e.ce1) / length(china.e.ce1),
+                  sum(india.e.ce1) / length(india.e.ce1)
+ )
>
> set.seed(201)
> se.pub <- c(sd(rbinom(size=length(us.e.ce0), n=10000, prob=mean(us.e.ce0)) / length(us.e.ce0)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(china.e.ce0), n=10000, prob=mean(china.e.ce0)) / length(china.e.ce0)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(india.e.ce0), n=10000, prob=mean(india.e.ce0)) / length(india.e.ce0)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(us.e.ce1), n=10000, prob=mean(us.e.ce1)) / length(us.e.ce1)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(china.e.ce1), n=10000, prob=mean(china.e.ce1)) / length(china.e.ce1)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(india.e.ce1), n=10000, prob=mean(india.e.ce1)) / length(india.e.ce1))
+ )
> #Note: this is actually a simplification of the bootstrapped CIs, which might not be symetric
>
> plot(x=ce,y=prop.encourage,xaxt="n",xlim=c(-0.3,1.3),ylim=c(0.00,0.20),ylab="Proportion Writing to Encourage",xlab="",
+      main="(C) Exp 1: Public Spending", col=c("steelblue1","indianred2","khaki","steelblue1","indianred2","khaki"), pch=19,cex=1.5,
cex.main=1.4)
> lines(x=c(0.05,1.05), y=c(sum(us.e.ce0) / length(us.e.ce0), sum(us.e.ce1) / length(us.e.ce1)), col="steelblue1", lwd=2)
> lines(x=c(-0.05,0.95), y=c(sum(china.e.ce0) / length(china.e.ce0), sum(china.e.ce1) / length(china.e.ce1)), col="indianred2", lwd=2)
> lines(x=c(0,1), y=c(sum(india.e.ce0) / length(india.e.ce0), sum(india.e.ce1) / length(india.e.ce1)), col="khaki", lwd=2)
> arrows(ce, prop.encourage-se.pub, ce, prop.encourage+se.pub, length=0.05, angle=90, code=3)
> axis(1,at=c(0,1),labels=c("Control","CE Treatment"), cex.axis=1.2)
> legend("bottomleft", legend=c("US","India","China"), cex=1,
+        fill=c("steelblue1","khaki","indianred2"), bty = "n")
```

```
>
>
> ### (D) Exp 2: Public Spending
>
> #Analysis
> diff.ob <- mean(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$ce==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$ce==0], na.rm=T)
> diff.ob #-0.03144224
[1] -0.03144224
> sims <- 5000
> treat.vector <- c(0,1)
> y1.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   rand.treat <- sample(treat.vector, size=length(data2.w.pub$fundus), replace=T)
+   y1 <- data2.w.pub$fundus[rand.treat==1]
+   y0 <- data2.w.pub$fundus[rand.treat==0]
+   y1.mean[i] <- mean(y1, na.rm=T)
+   y0.mean[i] <- mean(y0, na.rm=T)
+ }
> te <- y1.mean - y0.mean
> p <- sum((te < diff.ob))/sims #0.005
>
> diff.ob <- mean(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$ce==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$ce==0], na.rm=T)
> diff.ob #0.05716352
[1] 0.05716352
> sims <- 5000
> treat.vector <- c(0,1)
> y1.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   rand.treat <- sample(treat.vector, size=length(data2.w.pub$fundfor), replace=T)
+   y1 <- data2.w.pub$fundfor[rand.treat==1]
+   y0 <- data2.w.pub$fundfor[rand.treat==0]
+   y1.mean[i] <- mean(y1, na.rm=T)
+   y0.mean[i] <- mean(y0, na.rm=T)
+ }
> te <- y1.mean - y0.mean
> p <- sum((te > diff.ob))/sims #0.0028
>
> #Plotting
> treat.public2=c(1,0,1,0)
> value.public2=c(mean(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$ce==1],na.rm=T),
+                 mean(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$ce==0],na.rm=T),
+                 mean(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$ce==1],na.rm=T),
+                 mean(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$ce==0],na.rm=T))
> n.public2=c(length(!is.na(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$ce==1])),
+             length(!is.na(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$ce==0])),
+             length(!is.na(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$ce==1])),
+             length(!is.na(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$ce==0])))
>
> d <- data.frame(matrix(nrow=10000))[,-1] #Creating empty dataframe to fill with bootstrapped means
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   d$y1.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$ce==1], replace=T, size=n.donate2[1]),na.rm=T)
+   d$y0.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$ce==0], replace=T, size=n.donate2[2]),na.rm=T)
+   d$y1.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$ce==1], replace=T, size=n.donate2[3]),na.rm=T)
+   d$y0.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$ce==0], replace=T, size=n.donate2[4]),na.rm=T)
+ }
> se.public2=c(sd(d$y1.mean.us),sd(d$y0.mean.us),sd(d$y1.mean.foreign),sd(d$y0.mean.foreign))
>
> plot(x=treat.public2,y=value.public2,xaxt="n",xlim=c(-0.5,1.5),ylim=c(0.6,1),ylab="Proportion Stated Support",xlab="",
+      main="(D) Exp 2: Public Spending", col=c("steelblue1","steelblue1","black","black"), pch=19,cex=1.5, cex.main=1.4)
> lines(x=c(0,1), y=c(value.public2[2], value.public2[1]), col="steelblue1", lwd=2)
> lines(x=c(0,1), y=c(value.public2[4], value.public2[3]), col="black", lwd=2)
> axis(1,at=c(0,1),labels=c("Control","CE Treatment"), cex.axis=1,2)
> arrows(treat.public2, value.public2-se.public2, treat.public2, value.public2+se.public2, length=0.05, angle=90, code=3)
> legend("bottomleft", legend=c("US","Foreign"), cex=1,
+        fill=c("steelblue1","black"), bty = "n")
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Figure 3: Provisioning Benefits
> ################################################################################
>
> ### (A) Exp 2: Private Donation
>
> #Analysis (Domestic/Public Goods Prompt)
> data2.h1 <- subset(data2.willing,ce==0 & priv==0)
> mean(data2.h1$donate.us.amount[data2.h1$pub==1],na.rm=T) #3.44
[1] 3.441121
> mean(data2.h1$donate.us.amount[data2.h1$pub==0],na.rm=T) #3.28
[1] 3.284644
> diff.ob = mean(data2.h1$donate.us.amount[data2.h1$pub==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data2.h1$donate.us.amount[data2.h1$pub==0],na.rm=T)
```

```
> sims <- 5000
> y1.mean.us <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean.us <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(202)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   treat.vector <- rbinom(n=nrow(data2.h1),size=1,prob=0.5)
+   y1 <- data2.h1$donate.us.amount[treat.vector==1]
+   y0 <- data2.h1$donate.us.amount[treat.vector==0]
+   y1.mean.us[i] <- mean(y1)
+   y0.mean.us[i] <- mean(y0)
+ }
> h1.diff.us <- y1.mean.us - y0.mean.us
> hist(h1.diff.us)
> pub.p <- sum((abs(h1.diff.us) > abs(diff.ob)))/sims #0.4954
>
> #Analysis (Domestic/Provisioning Benefits)
> data2.h2 <- subset(data2.willing,pub==1)
> mean(data2.h2$donate.us.amount[data2.h2$priv==1],na.rm=T) #3.05
[1] 3.049336
> mean(data2.h2$donate.us.amount[data2.h2$priv==0],na.rm=T) #3.17
[1] 3.169476
> diff.ob.us = mean(data2.h2$donate.us.amount[data2.h2$priv==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data2.h2$donate.us.amount[data2.h2$priv==0],na.rm=T)
> diff.ob.us #-0.12
[1] -0.1201398
> sims <- 5000
> y1.mean.us <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean.us <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   treat.vector <- rbinom(n=nrow(data2.h2),size=1,prob=0.5)
+   y1 <- data2.h2$donate.us.amount[treat.vector==1]
+   y0 <- data2.h2$donate.us.amount[treat.vector==0]
+   y1.mean.us[i] <- mean(y1)
+   y0.mean.us[i] <- mean(y0)
+ }
> h2.diff.us <- y1.mean.us - y0.mean.us
> hist(h2.diff.us)
> priv.us.p <- sum((diff.ob.us < h2.diff.us))/sims #p = 0.777
>
> #Analysis (Foreign/Public Goods Prompt)
> mean(data2.h1$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h1$pub==1],na.rm=T) #3.19
[1] 3.192523
> mean(data2.h1$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h1$pub==0],na.rm=T) #2.83
[1] 2.831461
> diff.ob = mean(data2.h1$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h1$pub==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data2.h1$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h1$pub==0],na.rm=T)
#0.36
> sims <- 5000
> y1.mean.foreign <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean.foreign <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(202)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   treat.vector <- rbinom(n=nrow(data2.h1),size=1,prob=0.5)
+   y1 <- data2.h1$donate.us.amount[treat.vector==1]
+   y0 <- data2.h1$donate.us.amount[treat.vector==0]
+   y1.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(y1)
+   y0.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(y0)
+ }
> h1.diff.foreign <- y1.mean.foreign - y0.mean.foreign
> hist(h1.diff.foreign)
> pub.p.for <- sum(h1.diff.foreign > diff.ob)/sims #0.0556
>
> #Analysis (Foreign/Provision Benefits)
> mean(data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h2$priv==1],na.rm=T) #3.10
[1] 3.095825
> mean(data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h2$priv==0],na.rm=T) #3.40
[1] 3.401685
> diff.ob.foreign = mean(data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h2$priv==1],na.rm=T) -
mean(data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[data2.h2$priv==0],na.rm=T)
> diff.ob.foreign #-0.31
[1] -0.30586
> sims <- 5000
> y1.mean.foreign <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean.foreign <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   treat.vector <- rbinom(n=nrow(data2.h2),size=1,prob=0.5)
+   y1 <- data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[treat.vector==1]
+   y0 <- data2.h2$donate.foreign.amount[treat.vector==0]
+   y1.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(y1)
+   y0.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(y0)
+ }
> h2.diff.foreign <- y1.mean.foreign - y0.mean.foreign
> hist(h2.diff.foreign)
> priv.foreign.p <- sum((diff.ob.foreign > h2.diff.foreign))/sims #p = 0.0236
>
```

```
> #Plotting
> country <- rep(c("US","Foreign"),3)
> country <- ordered(country, levels=c("US","Foreign"))
> prop.donate=c(mean(data2.willing$donate.us.amount[data2.willing$pub==0],na.rm=T),
+               mean(data2.willing$donate.foreign.amount[data2.willing$pub==0],na.rm=T),
+               mean(data2.willing$donate.us.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0],na.rm=T),
+               mean(data2.willing$donate.foreign.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0],na.rm=T),
+               mean(data2.willing$donate.us.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0],na.rm=T),
+               mean(data2.willing$donate.foreign.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0],na.rm=T))
>
> n.donate=c(length(data2.willing$donate.us.amount[data2.willing$pub==0]),
+            length(data2.willing$donate.foreign.amount[data2.willing$pub==0]),
+            length(data2.willing$donate.us.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0]),
+            length(data2.willing$donate.foreign.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0]),
+            length(data2.willing$donate.us.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0]),
+            length(data2.willing$donate.foreign.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0]))
>
> d <- data.frame(matrix(nrow=10000))[,-1] #Creating empty dataframe to fill with bootstrapped means
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   d$yc.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$donate.us.amount[data2.willing$pub==0], replace=T, size=n.donate[1]), na.rm=T)
+   d$yc.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$donate.foreign.amount[data2.willing$pub==0], replace=T, size=n.donate[2]), na.rm=T)
+   d$y0.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$donate.us.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0],
replace=T, size=n.donate[3]), na.rm=T)
+   d$y0.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$donate.foreign.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 &
data2.willing$ce==0], replace=T, size=n.donate[4]), na.rm=T)
+   d$y1.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$donate.us.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0],
replace=T, size=n.donate[5]), na.rm=T)
+   d$y1.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$donate.foreign.amount[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 &
data2.willing$ce==0], replace=T, size=n.donate[6]), na.rm=T)
+ }
> se.donate=c(sd(d$yc.mean.us),sd(d$yc.mean.foreign),sd(d$y0.mean.us),sd(d$y0.mean.foreign),sd(d$y1.mean.us),sd(d$y1.mean.foreign))
>
> cond <- c("Pure Control","Pure Control","Global Good","Global Good","Global Good + Local Co-Benefit","Global Good + Local Co-Benefit")
> cond <- ordered(cond, levels=c("Pure Control","Global Good","Global Good + Local Co-Benefit"))
> prop.dta <- data.frame(prop.donate,se.donate,country,cond)
> se.bars <- aes(ymax = prop.donate + se.donate, ymin = prop.donate - se.donate)
> facet_names <- list(
+   'US'="US",
+   'Foreign'="Foreign"
+ )
> facet_labeller <- function(variable,value){
+   return(facet_names[value])
+ }
>
> fig3.a <- ggplot(data=prop.dta, aes(x=cond, y=prop.donate)) +
+   geom_point(stat="identity", colour=rev(c("black","black","black","steelblue1","steelblue1","steelblue1")), size=4) +
+   geom_errorbar(se.bars, width=0.2) + facet_wrap(~country, labeller=facet_labeller) +
+   xlab("Treatment Condition") + ylab("Amount Donated ($)") +  ggtitle("(A) Exp 2: Private Donation") +
+   theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=11)) +
+   scale_x_discrete(labels=c("Pure Control" = "Pure Control", "Global Good" = "Global Good", "Global Good + Local Co-Benefit" = "Global
Good +\nLocal Co-Benefit"))
Warning message:
The labeller API has been updated. Labellers taking `variable`and `value` arguments are now deprecated. See labellers documentation.
>
>
> ### (B) Exp 2: Public Spending
>
> #Analysis (Domestic\Public Goods Prompt)
> data.test <- subset(data2.willing, ce==0 & priv==0)
> diff.ob <- mean(data.test$fundus[data.test$pub==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data.test$fundus[data.test$pub==0], na.rm=T)
> diff.ob #0.01139055
[1] 0.01139055
> sims <- 5000
> treat.vector <- c(0,1)
> y1.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   rand.treat <- sample(treat.vector, size=length(data.test$fundus), replace=T)
+   y1 <- data.test$fundus[rand.treat==1]
+   y0 <- data.test$fundus[rand.treat==0]
+   y1.mean[i] <- mean(y1, na.rm=T)
+   y0.mean[i] <- mean(y0, na.rm=T)
+ }
> te <- y1.mean - y0.mean
> p <- sum((te > diff.ob))/sims #0.2436
>
> #Analysis (Foreign\Public Goods Prompt)
> data.test <- subset(data2.willing, ce==0 & priv==0)
> diff.ob <- mean(data.test$fundfor[data.test$pub==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data.test$fundfor[data.test$pub==0], na.rm=T)
> diff.ob #0.05448668
[1] 0.05448668
> sims <- 5000
> treat.vector <- c(0,1)
```

```
> y1.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(202)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   rand.treat <- sample(treat.vector, size=length(data.test$fundfor), replace=T)
+   y1 <- data.test$fundfor[rand.treat==1]
+   y0 <- data.test$fundfor[rand.treat==0]
+   y1.mean[i] <- mean(y1, na.rm=T)
+   y0.mean[i] <- mean(y0, na.rm=T)
+ }
> te <- y1.mean - y0.mean
> p <- sum((te > diff.ob))/sims #0.0294
>
> #Analysis (Domestic/Provisioning Benefits)
> diff.ob <- mean(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$priv==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data2.w.pub$fundus[data2.w.pub$priv==0], na.rm=T)
> diff.ob #0.01037057
[1] 0.01037057
> sims <- 5000
> treat.vector <- c(0,1)
> y1.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   rand.treat <- sample(treat.vector, size=length(data2.w.pub$fundus), replace=T)
+   y1 <- data2.w.pub$fundus[rand.treat==1]
+   y0 <- data2.w.pub$fundus[rand.treat==0]
+   y1.mean[i] <- mean(y1, na.rm=T)
+   y0.mean[i] <- mean(y0, na.rm=T)
+ }
> te <- y1.mean - y0.mean
> p <- sum((te > diff.ob))/sims #0.2058
>
> #Analysis (Foreign/Provisioning Benefits)
> diff.ob <- mean(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$priv==1],na.rm=T) - mean(data2.w.pub$fundfor[data2.w.pub$priv==0], na.rm=T)
> diff.ob #-0.01988511
[1] -0.01988511
> sims <- 5000
> treat.vector <- c(0,1)
> y1.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> y0.mean <- rep(NA,sims)
> for (i in 1:sims){
+   rand.treat <- sample(treat.vector, size=length(data2.w.pub$fundfor), replace=T)
+   y1 <- data2.w.pub$fundfor[rand.treat==1]
+   y0 <- data2.w.pub$fundfor[rand.treat==0]
+   y1.mean[i] <- mean(y1, na.rm=T)
+   y0.mean[i] <- mean(y0, na.rm=T)
+ }
> te <- y1.mean - y0.mean
> p <- sum((te < diff.ob))/sims #0.161
>
> #Plotting
> country2 <- rep(c("US","Foreign"),3)
> country2 <- ordered(country2, levels=c("US","Foreign"))
> prop.ps=c(mean(data2.willing$fundus[data2.willing$pub==0],na.rm=T),
+           mean(data2.willing$fundfor[data2.willing$pub==0],na.rm=T),
+           mean(data2.willing$fundus[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0],na.rm=T),
+           mean(data2.willing$fundfor[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0],na.rm=T),
+           mean(data2.willing$fundus[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0],na.rm=T),
+           mean(data2.willing$fundfor[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0],na.rm=T))
>
> n.ps=c(length(data2.willing$fundus[data2.willing$pub==0]),
+        length(data2.willing$fundfor[data2.willing$pub==0]),
+        length(data2.willing$fundus[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0]),
+        length(data2.willing$fundfor[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0]),
+        length(data2.willing$fundus[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0]),
+        length(data2.willing$fundfor[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0]))
>
> d <- data.frame(matrix(nrow=10000))[,-1] #Creating empty dataframe to fill with bootstrapped means
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   d$yc.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$fundus[data2.willing$pub==0], replace=T, size=n.donate[1]), na.rm=T)
+   d$yc.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$fundfor[data2.willing$pub==0], replace=T, size=n.donate[2]), na.rm=T)
+   d$y0.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$fundus[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0], replace=T,
size=n.donate[3]), na.rm=T)
+   d$y0.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$fundfor[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$ce==0],
replace=T, size=n.donate[4]), na.rm=T)
+   d$y1.mean.us[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$fundus[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0], replace=T,
size=n.donate[5]), na.rm=T)
+   d$y1.mean.foreign[i] <- mean(sample(data2.willing$fundfor[data2.willing$pub==1 & data2.willing$priv==1 & data2.willing$ce==0],
replace=T, size=n.donate[6]), na.rm=T)
+ }
> se.ps=c(sd(d$yc.mean.us),sd(d$yc.mean.foreign),sd(d$y0.mean.us),sd(d$y0.mean.foreign),sd(d$y1.mean.us),sd(d$y1.mean.foreign))
>
> cond2 <- c("Pure Control","Pure Control","Global Good","Global Good","Global Good + Local Co-Benefit","Global Good + Local Co-Benefit")
> cond2 <- ordered(cond, levels=c("Pure Control","Global Good","Global Good + Local Co-Benefit"))
```

```
> prop.dta2 <- data.frame(prop.ps,se.ps,country2,cond2)
> se.bars2 <- aes(ymax = prop.ps + se.ps, ymin = prop.ps - se.ps)
> facet_names <- list(
+   'US'="US",
+   'Foreign'="Foreign"
+ )
> facet_labeller <- function(variable,value){
+   return(facet_names[value])
+ }
>
> fig3.b <- ggplot(data=prop.dta2, aes(x=cond2, y=prop.ps)) +
+   geom_point(stat="identity", colour=rev(c("black","black","black","steelblue1","steelblue1","steelblue1")), size=4) +
+   geom_errorbar(se.bars2, width=0.2) + facet_wrap(~country2, labeller=facet_labeller, scales = "free") +
+   xlab("Treatment Condition") + ylab("Proportion Stated Support") + ggtitle("(B) Exp 2: Public Spending") +
+   theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=11)) +
+   scale_x_discrete(labels=c("Pure Control" = "Pure Control", "Global Good" = "Global Good", "Global Good + Local Co-Benefit" = "Global
Good +\nLocal Co-Benefit"))
Warning message:
The labeller API has been updated. Labellers taking `variable`and `value` arguments are now deprecated. See labellers documentation.
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ################################################################################
> ###Supporting Information
> ################################################################################
> ################################################################################
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Table S1: Characteristics of Experimental Sample
> ################################################################################
>
> ##Study 1
> sum(data.willing$gender==2, na.rm=T)/length(data.willing$gender[!is.na(data.willing$gender)]) #Female
[1] 0.5162423
> sum(data.willing$education>=5, na.rm=T)/length(data.willing$education[!is.na(data.willing$education)]) #College Graduates
[1] 0.5087719
> sum(data.willing$employed==4, na.rm=T)/length(data.willing$employed[!is.na(data.willing$employed)]) #Unemployed
[1] 0.1122807
> sum(data.willing$race==1, na.rm=T)/length(data.willing$race[!is.na(data.willing$race)]) #White
[1] 0.7366111
> sum(data.willing$party==2, na.rm=T)/length(data.willing$party[!is.na(data.willing$party)]) #Democrat
[1] 0.4541446
> sum(data.willing$party==1, na.rm=T)/length(data.willing$party[!is.na(data.willing$party)]) #Republican
[1] 0.1472663
> sum(data.willing$party==3, na.rm=T)/length(data.willing$party[!is.na(data.willing$party)]) #Independent
[1] 0.3641975
>
> ##Study 2
> sum(data2.willing$Q55==2, na.rm=T)/length(data2.willing$Q55[!is.na(data2.willing$Q55)]) #Female
[1] 0.3987199
> sum(data2.willing$Q115>=5, na.rm=T)/length(data2.willing$Q115[!is.na(data2.willing$Q115)]) #College Graduates
[1] 0.5082831
> sum(data2.willing$Q70.1==4, na.rm=T)/length(data2.willing$Q70.1[!is.na(data2.willing$Q70.1)]) #Unemployed
[1] 0.07981928
> sum(data2.willing$Q141==1, na.rm=T)/length(data2.willing$Q141[!is.na(data2.willing$Q141)]) #White
[1] 0.7564006
> sum(data2.willing$Q142==2, na.rm=T)/length(data2.willing$Q142[!is.na(data2.willing$Q142)]) #Democrat
[1] 0.4713855
> sum(data2.willing$Q142==1, na.rm=T)/length(data2.willing$Q142[!is.na(data2.willing$Q142)]) #Republican
[1] 0.1430723
> sum(data2.willing$Q142==3, na.rm=T)/length(data2.willing$Q142[!is.na(data2.willing$Q142)]) #Independent
[1] 0.3486446
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Table S3: Climate opinions of national samples regarding climate harm
> ################################################################################
>
> #Ex1
> prop.table(table(data.willing$bin.cc.serious.US))

        0         1
0.1564148 0.8435852
> prop.table(table(data.willing$bin.cc.serious.foreign))

        0         1
0.1665198 0.8334802
>
> #Ex2
> #Q202 is perception of seriousness of climate change for US
> #Q203 is perception of seriousness of climate change for foreign countries
> #Response categories: 1=very serious problem; 2=somewhat serious problem; 3=less serious problem; 4=not a problem; 5=not sure;
> prop.table(table(data2.willing$Q202))

                    1           2           3           5
```

```
0.000376506 0.490587349 0.378765060 0.118599398 0.011671687
> prop.table(table(data2.willing$Q203))

                     1           2           3           5
0.001506024 0.554969880 0.347138554 0.082454819 0.013930723
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Table S4: Treatment Assignments in Experiment 1
> ################################################################################
>
> #Donation outcome (d)
> table(data.willing$country, data.willing$effect1)

         0   1
  US    194 186
  India 179 211
  China 186 184
>
> #Letter-writing outcome (l)
> table(data.click.willing$country, data.click.willing$effect1)

         0   1
  US    158 147
  India 144 170
  China 159 153
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Table S5: Treatment Assignments in Experiment 2
> ################################################################################
>
> nrow(data2.willing[data2.willing$pub==0,]) #Pure control
[1] 534
> nrow(data2.willing[data2.willing$ce==0 & data2.willing$priv==0 & data2.willing$pub==1,]) #Provisioning=0 & CE=0
[1] 535
> nrow(data2.willing[data2.willing$ce==1 & data2.willing$priv==0,]) #Provisioning=0 & CE=1
[1] 533
> nrow(data2.willing[data2.willing$ce==0 & data2.willing$priv==1,]) #Provisioning=1 & CE=0
[1] 522
> nrow(data2.willing[data2.willing$ce==1 & data2.willing$priv==1,]) #Provisioning=1 & CE=1
[1] 532
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Table S6: Treatment Assignments in Ex1 for subjects unwilling to donate
> ################################################################################
>
> #Total
> table(data.willing$effect1, data.willing$country)

     US India China
  0 194   179   186
  1 186   211   184
>
> #"no" stated
> data.no <- subset(data.willing, wri.stated==0)
> table(data.no$effect1, data.no$country)

     US India China
  0 142   127   141
  1 122   158   137
>
> #bonus
> data.bonus <- subset(data.no, randForce==1)
> table(data.bonus$effect1, data.bonus$country)

    US India China
  0 10    16    16
  1 13    23    10
>
> #donated
> data.donated <- subset(data.bonus, wri.fullbonus.final==1)
> table(data.donated$effect1, data.donated$country)

    US India China
  0  1     2     1
  1  2     3     1
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Table S7: Manipulation checks for cost-effectiveness treatments
> ################################################################################
>
> #Study 1
```

```
> sub <- subset(data.willing, country=="US")
> prop.table(table(sub$effect1,sub$recall.ce),1)

        least       most   not sure   somewhat
  0 0.13471503 0.07772021 0.17616580 0.61139896
  1 0.77297297 0.02702703 0.07567568 0.12432432
>
> sub <- subset(data.willing, country=="India")
> prop.table(table(sub$effect1,sub$recall.ce),1)

        least       most   not sure   somewhat
  0 0.07303371 0.11797753 0.33707865 0.47191011
  1 0.04326923 0.03365385 0.10096154 0.82211538
>
> sub <- subset(data.willing, country=="China")
> prop.table(table(sub$effect1,sub$recall.ce),1)

        least       most   not sure   somewhat
  0 0.07526882 0.12903226 0.37634409 0.41935484
  1 0.07103825 0.72677596 0.07650273 0.12568306
>
> #Study 2
> tab <- table(data2.willing$ce,data2.willing$manipcheck) #1:Neither; 4:Rapidly Developing more; 3:Not sure; 5:US more; 6:both CE
> prop.table(tab, 1)

                           1           3           4           5           6
  0 0.0006285355 0.0685103708 0.3092394720 0.2721558768 0.1954745443 0.1539912005
  1 0.0018779343 0.0300469484 0.1220657277 0.6638497653 0.1079812207 0.0741784038
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Table S8: Manipulation checks for cost-effectiveness treatments among non-college graduates
> ################################################################################
>
> #Study 1
> sub <- subset(data.willing.no.colgrad, country=="US")
> prop.table(table(sub$effect1,sub$recall.ce),1)

        least       most   not sure   somewhat
  0 0.16279070 0.05813953 0.22093023 0.55813953
  1 0.67816092 0.04597701 0.09195402 0.18390805
>
> sub <- subset(data.willing.no.colgrad, country=="India")
> prop.table(table(sub$effect1,sub$recall.ce),1)

        least       most   not sure   somewhat
  0 0.03488372 0.11627907 0.37209302 0.47674419
  1 0.05000000 0.04000000 0.11000000 0.80000000
>
> sub <- subset(data.willing.no.colgrad, country=="China")
> prop.table(table(sub$effect1,sub$recall.ce),1)

        least       most   not sure   somewhat
  0 0.05000000 0.14000000 0.47000000 0.34000000
  1 0.08333333 0.71875000 0.09375000 0.10416667
>
> #Study 2
> tab <- table(data2.w.no.colgrad$ce, data2.w.no.colgrad$manipcheck) #1:Neither; 4:Rapidly Developing more; 3:Not sure; 5:US more; 6:both
CE
> prop.table(tab, 1)

                         1           3           4           5           6
  0 0.000000000 0.075129534 0.325129534 0.240932642 0.194300518 0.164507772
  1 0.001872659 0.037453184 0.134831461 0.612359551 0.127340824 0.086142322
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Figure S1: Discouraging Public Spending in Experiment 1
> ################################################################################
>
> #Analysis
> data.china.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country!="India" & effect1==0)
> data.china.test$treat.china <- ifelse(data.china.test$country=="China",1,0)
> mean(data.china.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.china.test$treat.china==0]) #0.01265823
[1] 0.01265823
> mean(data.china.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.china.test$treat.china==1]) #0.05031447
[1] 0.05031447
> perms <- genperms(data.china.test$treat.china) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 1.193695896881e+94 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.china.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.china.test$treat.china) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in this case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.china.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.china.test$treat.china) :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
```

```
> Ys <- genouts(data.china.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.china.test$treat.china, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under sharp
null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.038

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.0694

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.019

$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.981

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
-0.03809503  0.03764695

$sd
[1] 0.01971849

$exp.val
[1] 2.881411e-07

>
> data.india.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country!="China" & effect1==0)
> data.india.test$treat.india <- ifelse(data.india.test$country=="India",1,0)
> mean(data.india.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.india.test$treat.india==0]) #0.01265823
[1] 0.01265823
> mean(data.india.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.india.test$treat.india==1]) #0.02777778
[1] 0.02777778
> perms <- genperms(data.india.test$treat.india) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 2.70471415145649e+89 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.india.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.india.test$treat.india) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in this case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.india.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.india.test$treat.india) :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
> Ys <- genouts(data.india.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.india.test$treat.india, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under sharp
null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.3326

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.297

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.1663

$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.8337

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
-0.02473109  0.02840626

$sd
[1] 0.01598011

$exp.val
[1] 3.383434e-08

>
> data.us.ce.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country=="US")
> mean(data.us.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.us.ce.test$effect1==0]) #0.01265823
[1] 0.01265823
> mean(data.us.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.us.ce.test$effect1==1]) #0.006802721
[1] 0.006802721
> perms <- genperms(data.us.ce.test$effect1) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 2.44173895562917e+90 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.us.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.us.ce.test$effect1) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in this case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.us.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.us.ce.test$effect1) :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
```

```
> Ys <- genouts(data.us.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.us.ce.test$effect1, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under sharp null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.2834

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.6132

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.8583

$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.1417

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
-0.01897058  0.02044943

$sd
[1] 0.01143461

$exp.val
[1] -6.39807e-08

>
> data.china.ce.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country=="China")
> mean(data.china.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.china.ce.test$effect1==0]) #0.05031447
[1] 0.05031447
> mean(data.china.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.china.ce.test$effect1==1]) #0.03921569
[1] 0.03921569
> perms <- genperms(data.china.ce.test$effect1) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 3.55546635683556e+92 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.china.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.china.ce.test$effect1) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in this
case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.china.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.china.ce.test$effect1) :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
> Ys <- genouts(data.china.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.china.ce.test$effect1, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under
sharp null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.4552

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.5921

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.7724

$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.2276

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
-0.04945256  0.04034701

$sd
[1] 0.02336773

$exp.val
[1] -4.157031e-07

>
> data.india.ce.test <- subset(data.click.willing, country=="India")
> mean(data.india.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.india.ce.test$effect1==0]) #0.02777778
[1] 0.02777778
> mean(data.india.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.india.ce.test$effect1==1]) #0.04705882
[1] 0.04705882
> perms <- genperms(data.india.ce.test$effect1) # all possible permutations of treatment
Too many permutations to use exact method.
Defaulting to approximate method.
Increase maxiter to at least 5.12878181536557e+92 to perform exact estimation.
> ate <- estate(data.india.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.india.ce.test$effect1) #point estimate of the ATE (simple in this
case)
Warning message:
In estate(data.india.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.india.ce.test$effect1) :
  Probabilities not specified. Assuming equal probabilities.
```

```
> Ys <- genouts(data.india.ce.test$govt.discourage.rep.final, data.india.ce.test$effect1, ate=0) # generate potential outcomes under
sharp null
> distout <- gendist(Ys,perms) # generate sampling distribution under sharp null
Warning message:
In gendist(Ys, perms) : Generating probabilities from permutation matrix.
> dispdist(distout, ate) # display characteristics of sampling dist. for inference
$two.tailed.p.value
[1] 0.2338

$two.tailed.p.value.abs
[1] 0.3234

$greater.p.value
[1] 0.1169

$lesser.p.value
[1] 0.8831

$quantile
       2.5%       97.5%
-0.04493159  0.04484871

$sd
[1] 0.02158717

$exp.val
[1] 2.600015e-07

>
> #Plotting
> ce = c(0.05,-0.05,0,1.05,0.95,1)
>
> us.e.ce0 <- data.click.willing$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="US" & data.click.willing$effect1==0]
> china.e.ce0 <- data.click.willing$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="China" & data.click.willing$effect1==0]
> india.e.ce0 <- data.click.willing$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="India" & data.click.willing$effect1==0]
> us.e.ce1 <- data.click.willing$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="US" & data.click.willing$effect1==1]
> china.e.ce1 <- data.click.willing$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="China" & data.click.willing$effect1==1]
> india.e.ce1 <- data.click.willing$govt.discourage.rep.final[data.click.willing$country=="India" & data.click.willing$effect1==1]
>
> prop.encourage=c(sum(us.e.ce0) / length(us.e.ce0),
+                  sum(china.e.ce0) / length(china.e.ce0),
+                  sum(india.e.ce0) / length(india.e.ce0),
+                  sum(us.e.ce1) / length(us.e.ce1),
+                  sum(china.e.ce1) / length(china.e.ce1),
+                  sum(india.e.ce1) / length(india.e.ce1)
+ )
>
> se.pub <- c(sd(rbinom(size=length(us.e.ce0), n=10000, prob=mean(us.e.ce0)) / length(us.e.ce0)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(china.e.ce0), n=10000, prob=mean(china.e.ce0)) / length(china.e.ce0)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(india.e.ce0), n=10000, prob=mean(india.e.ce0)) / length(india.e.ce0)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(us.e.ce1), n=10000, prob=mean(us.e.ce1)) / length(us.e.ce1)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(china.e.ce1), n=10000, prob=mean(china.e.ce1)) / length(china.e.ce1)),
+             sd(rbinom(size=length(india.e.ce1), n=10000, prob=mean(india.e.ce1)) / length(india.e.ce1))
+ )
>
> #pdf("FigS1_JEPS-Final.pdf", width=4, height=4)
> par(mfrow=c(1,1),mar=c(2.1,4.1,2.1,1.1),mgp=c(2,1,0))
> plot(x=ce,y=prop.encourage,xaxt="n",xlim=c(-0.3,1.3),ylim=c(0.00,0.08),ylab="Proportion Writing to Discourage Public Spending \n and
Clicking Representative Link",xlab="",
+      main="Discourage Public Spending", col=c("steelblue1","indianred2","khaki","steelblue1","indianred2","khaki"), pch=19,cex=1.5)
>
> lines(x=c(0.05,1.05), y=c(sum(us.e.ce0) / length(us.e.ce0), sum(us.e.ce1) / length(us.e.ce1)), col="steelblue1", lwd=2)
> lines(x=c(-0.05,0.95), y=c(sum(china.e.ce0) / length(china.e.ce0), sum(china.e.ce1) / length(china.e.ce1)), col="indianred2", lwd=2)
> lines(x=c(0,1), y=c(sum(india.e.ce0) / length(india.e.ce0), sum(india.e.ce1) / length(india.e.ce1)), col="khaki", lwd=2)
> arrows(ce, prop.encourage-se.pub, ce, prop.encourage+se.pub, length=0.05, angle=90, code=3)
> axis(1,at=c(0,1),labels=c("No Info","CE Info"))
> legend("top", legend=c("China","India","US"), cex=1,
+        fill=c("indianred2","khaki","steelblue1"), bty = "n")
> #dev.off()
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Table S9: Binary and Donation Amount in Experiment 2
> ################################################################################
>
> any <- lm(donate.any ~ ce*priv, data=data2.w.pub)
> summary(any)

Call:
lm(formula = donate.any ~ ce * priv, data = data2.w.pub)

Residuals:
    Min      1Q  Median      3Q     Max
-0.7111 -0.6860  0.2931  0.2970  0.3140
```

```
Coefficients:
            Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
(Intercept)  0.68598    0.01979  34.655   <2e-16 ***
ce           0.02509    0.02802   0.895    0.371
priv         0.02092    0.02817   0.743    0.458
ce:priv     -0.02898    0.03976  -0.729    0.466
---
Signif. codes:  0 ‘***’ 0.001 ‘**’ 0.01 ‘*’ 0.05 ‘.’ 0.1 ‘ ’ 1

Residual standard error: 0.4578 on 2118 degrees of freedom
Multiple R-squared:  0.0004367,   Adjusted R-squared:  -0.0009791
F-statistic: 0.3085 on 3 and 2118 DF,  p-value: 0.8193

>
> total <- lm(donate.total ~ ce*priv, data=data2.w.pub)
> summary(total)

Call:
lm(formula = donate.total ~ ce * priv, data = data2.w.pub)

Residuals:
   Min     1Q Median     3Q    Max
-6.634 -6.002 -1.286  3.714 13.998

Coefficients:
            Estimate Std. Error t value Pr(>|t|)
(Intercept)   6.6336     0.2530  26.218   <2e-16 ***
ce           -0.1252     0.3582  -0.350   0.7267
priv         -0.6317     0.3600  -1.755   0.0795 .
ce:priv       0.4090     0.5082   0.805   0.4210
---
Signif. codes:  0 ‘***’ 0.001 ‘**’ 0.01 ‘*’ 0.05 ‘.’ 0.1 ‘ ’ 1

Residual standard error: 5.852 on 2118 degrees of freedom
Multiple R-squared:  0.001675,    Adjusted R-squared:  0.0002605
F-statistic: 1.184 on 3 and 2118 DF,  p-value: 0.3143

>
> stargazer(any, total, type = "html",
+           dep.var.labels = c("Donate Any (0|1)  ", "Donate Amount ($)"),
+           covariate.labels = c("Cost-Effectiveness","Provisioning","Cost-Effectiveness * Provisioning","Intercept"),
+           df = FALSE, omit.stat = c("rsq","ser")
+ )

<table style="text-align:center"><tr><td colspan="3" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr><tr><td style="text-align:left"></
td><td colspan="2"><em>Dependent variable:</em></td></tr>
<tr><td></td><td colspan="2" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>Donate Any (0|1)</td><td>Donate Amount ()</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(1)</td><td>(2)</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="3" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr><tr><td style="text-align:left">Cost-Effectiveness</td><td>0.025</
td><td>-0.125</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(0.028)</td><td>(0.358)</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left">Provisioning</td><td>0.021</td><td>-0.632<sup>*</sup></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(0.028)</td><td>(0.360)</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left">Cost-Effectiveness * Provisioning</td><td>-0.029</td><td>0.409</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(0.040)</td><td>(0.508)</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left">Intercept</td><td>0.686<sup>***</sup></td><td>6.634<sup>***</sup></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(0.020)</td><td>(0.253)</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="3" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr><tr><td style="text-align:left">Observations</td><td>2,122</
td><td>2,122</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left">Adjusted R<sup>2</sup></td><td>-0.001</td><td>0.0003</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left">F Statistic</td><td>0.308</td><td>1.184</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="3" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr><tr><td style="text-align:left"><em>Note:</em></td><td colspan="2"
style="text-align:right"><sup>*</sup>p<0.1; <sup>**</sup>p<0.05; <sup>***</sup>p<0.01</td></tr>
</table>
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Table S10: Multinomial regression of donation type in Experiment 2
> ################################################################################
>
> multi <- multinom(donate.multi ~ ce*priv, data=data2.w.pub)
# weights:  20 (12 variable)
initial  value 2941.716634
iter  10 value 2244.524271
final  value 2227.567003
converged
> summary(multi)
Call:
multinom(formula = donate.multi ~ ce * priv, data = data2.w.pub)
```

```
Coefficients:
             (Intercept)          ce         priv     ce:priv
us.only       -2.2961903 -0.42518477  0.761617458 -0.25799989
foreign.only  -2.3979268  0.68818442 -0.028721739 -0.07391960
neither       -0.6061516 -0.07392009 -0.008875875  0.06798123

Std. Errors:
             (Intercept)        ce      priv   ce:priv
us.only       0.18843282 0.2979933 0.2354437 0.3786500
foreign.only  0.19738727 0.2458328 0.2872247 0.3580573
neither       0.09591207 0.1377752 0.1388116 0.1969315

Residual Deviance: 4455.134
AIC: 4479.134
> coeftest(multi)

z test of coefficients:

                           Estimate Std. Error  z value  Pr(>|z|)
us.only:(Intercept)      -2.2961903  0.1884328 -12.1857 < 2.2e-16 ***
us.only:ce               -0.4251848  0.2979933  -1.4268  0.153630
us.only:priv              0.7616175  0.2354437   3.2348  0.001217 **
us.only:ce:priv          -0.2579999  0.3786500  -0.6814  0.495639
foreign.only:(Intercept) -2.3979268  0.1973873 -12.1483 < 2.2e-16 ***
foreign.only:ce           0.6881844  0.2458328   2.7994  0.005120 **
foreign.only:priv        -0.0287217  0.2872247  -0.1000  0.920346
foreign.only:ce:priv     -0.0739196  0.3580573  -0.2064  0.836442
neither:(Intercept)      -0.6061516  0.0959121  -6.3199 2.618e-10 ***
neither:ce               -0.0739201  0.1377752  -0.5365  0.591595
neither:priv             -0.0088759  0.1388116  -0.0639  0.949017
neither:ce:priv           0.0679812  0.1969315   0.3452  0.729942
---
Signif. codes:  0 ‘***’ 0.001 ‘**’ 0.01 ‘*’ 0.05 ‘.’ 0.1 ‘ ’ 1

>
> stargazer(multi, type = "html",
+           dep.var.labels = c("US Only", "Foreign Only", "Neither"),
+           covariate.labels = c("Cost-Effectiveness","Provisioning","Cost-Effectiveness * Provisioning","Intercept"),
+           df = FALSE, omit.stat = c("rsq","ser")
+ )

<table style="text-align:center"><tr><td colspan="4" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr><tr><td style="text-align:left"></
td><td colspan="3"><em>Dependent variable:</em></td></tr>
<tr><td></td><td colspan="3" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>US Only</td><td>Foreign Only</td><td>Neither</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(1)</td><td>(2)</td><td>(3)</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="4" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr><tr><td style="text-align:left">Cost-Effectiveness</td><td>-0.425</
td><td>0.688<sup>***</sup></td><td>-0.074</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(0.298)</td><td>(0.246)</td><td>(0.138)</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left">Provisioning</td><td>0.762<sup>***</sup></td><td>-0.029</td><td>-0.009</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(0.235)</td><td>(0.287)</td><td>(0.139)</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left">Cost-Effectiveness * Provisioning</td><td>-0.258</td><td>-0.074</td><td>0.068</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(0.379)</td><td>(0.358)</td><td>(0.197)</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left">Intercept</td><td>-2.296<sup>***</sup></td><td>-2.398<sup>***</sup></td><td>-0.606<sup>***</sup></td></
tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td>(0.188)</td><td>(0.197)</td><td>(0.096)</td></tr>
<tr><td style="text-align:left"></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="4" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr><tr><td style="text-align:left">Akaike Inf. Crit.</
td><td>4,479.134</td><td>4,479.134</td><td>4,479.134</td></tr>
<tr><td colspan="4" style="border-bottom: 1px solid black"></td></tr><tr><td style="text-align:left"><em>Note:</em></td><td colspan="3"
style="text-align:right"><sup>*</sup>p<0.1; <sup>**</sup>p<0.05; <sup>***</sup>p<0.01</td></tr>
</table>
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Figure S2: Home preference among self-described Democrats
> ################################################################################
>
> ##Donation 1
> #Note: Overwriting objects from main to avoid recoding plotting code
> #Note: Rerun setup blocks if going back to any of the analyses/plots above
>
> data.willing <- subset(data,cc.not.willing==0 & effect1==0 & party==2)
> data.willing.us.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="US")
> data.willing.india.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="India")
> data.willing.china.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="China")
>
> no.vector.us.ce0<-data.willing.us.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.us.ce0$wri.stated==0 & data.willing.us.ce0$randForce==1] #These
are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.china.ce0<-data.willing.china.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.china.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.china.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.india.ce0<-data.willing.india.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.india.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
```

```
data.willing.india.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
>
> prob.switch.us.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.us.ce0)/length(no.vector.us.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.china.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.china.ce0)/length(no.vector.china.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.india.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.india.ce0)/length(no.vector.india.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
>
> #Setting up for the simulation
> imp <- data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final
> treat.country <- unique(data.willing$country)
> sims <- 10000
>
> us.ob.ce0 <- rep(NA,sims)
> china.ob.ce0 <- rep(NA,sims)
> india.ob.ce0 <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> ate.china <- rep(NA,sims)
> ate.india <- rep(NA,sims)
>
> #The sampling distribution for the ATE under the sharp null is formed over repeated imputations
> #This imputes a full data.willing set, sampling from the observed values for donating after stating "no"
> set.seed(201)
> for (j in 1:sims){
+
+   for (i in 1:nrow(data.willing)){
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="US"){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.us.ce0)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="China"){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.china.ce0)}
+     if(is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)[i] & data.willing$country[i]=="India"){
+       imp[i] <- rbinom(n=1,size=1,prob=prob.switch.india.ce0)}
+   }
+
+   treatment.country <- sample(treat.country, size=nrow(data.willing), replace=TRUE)
+
+   us.ob.ce0[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="US" & data.willing$effect1==0])
+   china.ob.ce0[j] <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==0])
+   india.ob.ce0[j]  <- mean(imp[data.willing$country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==0])
+
+   ate.china[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="China" & data.willing$effect1==0]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==0])
+   ate.india[j] <- mean(imp[treatment.country=="India" & data.willing$effect1==0]) - mean(imp[treatment.country=="US" &
data.willing$effect1==0])
+ }
>
> #Means after imputation:
> mean(us.ob.ce0) #0.3014809
[1] 0.3014809
> mean(india.ob.ce0) #0.3039405
[1] 0.3039405
> mean(china.ob.ce0) #0.1948053
[1] 0.1948053
>
> #SEs of mean value (this is different than SEs of imputation)
> set.seed(201)
> se <- c(sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.us.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.3014809)/nrow(data.willing.us.ce0)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.india.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.3039405)/nrow(data.willing.india.ce0)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.china.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.1948053)/nrow(data.willing.china.ce0))
+ )
> se <- c(0.04856768,0.05338192,0.04081898) #Based exactly on above
>
> country <- rev(c("US","India","China"))
> prop.donate<-rev(c(0.3014809,0.3039405,0.1948053)) #From "Means after imputation" directly above
> se <- rev(se)
> prop.dta <- data.frame(prop.donate,country,se)
> se.bars <- aes(ymax = prop.donate + se, ymin = prop.donate - se)
>
> figS2.a<-ggplot(data=prop.dta, aes(x=country, y=prop.donate)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","khaki","indianred2")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Donating") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(A) Exp 1: Private Donation") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> ##Donation 2
> data2.w.pure.control.dem <- subset(data2.w.pure.control, Q142==2)
> dta2 <- melt(data2.w.pure.control.dem, measure.vars = c('donate.foreign.amount','donate.us.amount')) #Make the object as we want it,
selecting final two columns
> dta2 <- dta2[,(ncol(dta2)-1):ncol(dta2)]
>
> names(dta2) <- c("Country","Amount")
> dta2$Country <- ifelse(dta2$Country=="donate.foreign.amount","Foreign","US")
> mean.info <- ddply(dta2, "Country", summarise, donate.mean=mean(Amount))
>
> foreign.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> US.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
```

```
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   foreign.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta2$Amount[1:243], size=243, replace=T))
+   US.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta2$Amount[244:486], size=243, replace=T))
+ }
> mean.info$se[1] <- sd(foreign.store)
> mean.info$se[2] <- sd(US.store)
> se.bars2 <- aes(ymax = mean.info$donate.mean + mean.info$se, ymin = mean.info$donate.mean - mean.info$se)
>
> figS2.b<-ggplot(mean.info, aes(x=Country, y=donate.mean)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = mean.info$Country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","darkslategrey")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars2, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Amount Donated ($)") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(B) Exp 2: Private Donation") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> ##Public Spending 1
> data.click.willing.dem <- subset(data.click.willing, party==2)
> tab <- as.data.frame.matrix(table(data.click.willing.dem$country, data.click.willing.dem$govt.encourage.rep.final))
> names(tab) <- c("X0","X1")
> tab$n <- tab$X1 + tab$X0
> tab$prop.govt.encourage <- tab$X1/(tab$X0+tab$X1)
>
> us.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> india.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> china.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   us.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[1], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[1]))
+   india.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[2], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[2]))
+   china.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[3], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[3]))
+ }
> tab$se[1] <- sd(us.store)
> tab$se[2] <- sd(india.store)
> tab$se[3] <- sd(china.store)
> tab$country <- row.names(tab)
> tab <- tab[order(tab$country),]
> se.bars.ps1 <- aes(ymax = tab$prop.govt.encourage + tab$se, ymin = tab$prop.govt.encourage - tab$se)
>
> figS2.c<-ggplot(tab, aes(x=country, y=prop.govt.encourage)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = tab$country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","khaki","indianred2")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars.ps1, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Writing to Support") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12,
colour="black")) + xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(C) Exp 1: Public Spending") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> ##Public Spending 2
> data2.w.pure.control.dem <- subset(data2.w.pure.control, Q142==2)
> dta4 <- melt(data2.w.pure.control.dem, measure.vars = c("fundus","fundfor")) #Make the object as we want it, selecting final two
columns
> dta4 <- dta4[,(ncol(dta4)-1):ncol(dta4)]
> names(dta4) <- c("Country","Write")
> dta4$Country <- ifelse(dta4$Country=="fundfor","Foreign","US")
> mean.info4 <- ddply(dta4, "Country", summarise, write.mean=mean(Write, na.rm=T))
>
> foreign.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> US.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   foreign.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta4$Write[1:243], size=243, replace=T), na.rm=T)
+   US.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta4$Write[244:486], size=243, replace=T), na.rm=T)
+ }
> mean.info4$se[1] <- sd(foreign.store)
> mean.info4$se[2] <- sd(US.store)
> se.bars4 <- aes(ymax = mean.info4$write.mean + mean.info4$se, ymin = mean.info4$write.mean - mean.info4$se)
>
> figS2.d<-ggplot(mean.info4, aes(x=Country, y=write.mean)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = mean.info4$Country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","darkslategrey")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars4, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Support") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(D) Exp 2: Public Spending") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> S2 <- plot_grid(figS2.a, figS2.b, figS2.c, figS2.d)
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Figure S3: Home preference among self-described Republicans
> ################################################################################
>
> ##Donation 1
> #Note: Overwriting objects from main to avoid recoding plotting code
> #Note: Rerun setup blocks if going back to any of the analyses/plots above
> data.willing <- subset(data,cc.not.willing==0 & effect1==0 & party==1)
> data.willing.us.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="US")
```

```
> data.willing.india.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="India")
> data.willing.china.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="China")
>
> no.vector.us.ce0<-data.willing.us.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.us.ce0$wri.stated==0 & data.willing.us.ce0$randForce==1] #These
are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.china.ce0<-data.willing.china.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.china.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.china.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.india.ce0<-data.willing.india.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.india.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.india.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
>
> prob.switch.us.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.us.ce0)/length(no.vector.us.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.china.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.china.ce0)/length(no.vector.china.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
> prob.switch.india.ce0 <- sum(no.vector.india.ce0)/length(no.vector.india.ce0) #This is the probability of donating after stating "no"
>
> #Setting up for the simulation
> imp <- data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final
> table(imp)
imp
0 1
9 4
> #Note: insufficient number of observations (11) for the imputation to run behavioral result
> #Note: switching to stated intention to vote
>
> prop.donate <- c(sum(data.willing.us.ce0$wri.stated)/length(data.willing.us.ce0$wri.stated),
+                  sum(data.willing.india.ce0$wri.stated)/length(data.willing.india.ce0$wri.stated),
+                  sum(data.willing.china.ce0$wri.stated)/length(data.willing.china.ce0$wri.stated))
>
> #SEs of prop.donate
> set.seed(201)
> se <- c(sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.us.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.03846154)/nrow(data.willing.us.ce0)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.india.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.14814815)/nrow(data.willing.india.ce0)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.china.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.08333333)/nrow(data.willing.china.ce0))
+ ) #Note: probabilities come from prop.donate
>
> se <- c(0.03757992,0.06833109,0.05643995) #Based exactly on above
>
> country <- rev(c("US","India","China"))
> prop.donate<-rev(c(0.03846154,0.14814815,0.08333333)) #From "Means after imputation" directly above
> se <- rev(c(0.03757992,0.06833109,0.05643995)) #From "se" directly above
> prop.dta <- data.frame(prop.donate,country,se)
> se.bars <- aes(ymax = prop.donate + se, ymin = prop.donate - se)
>
> figS3.a<-ggplot(data=prop.dta, aes(x=country, y=prop.donate)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","khaki","indianred2")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Willing to Donate") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12,
colour="black")) + xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(A) Exp 1: Private Donation") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> ##Donation 2
> data2.w.pure.control.rep <- subset(data2.w.pure.control, Q142==1)
> dta2 <- melt(data2.w.pure.control.rep, measure.vars = c('donate.foreign.amount','donate.us.amount'))
> dta2 <- dta2[,(ncol(dta2)-1):ncol(dta2)]
> names(dta2) <- c("Country","Amount")
> dta2$Country <- ifelse(dta2$Country=="donate.foreign.amount","Foreign","US")
> mean.info <- ddply(dta2, "Country", summarise, donate.mean=mean(Amount))
>
> foreign.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> US.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   foreign.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta2$Amount[1:74], size=74, replace=T))
+   US.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta2$Amount[75:148], size=74, replace=T))
+ }
> mean.info$se[1] <- sd(foreign.store)
> mean.info$se[2] <- sd(US.store)
> se.bars2 <- aes(ymax = mean.info$donate.mean + mean.info$se, ymin = mean.info$donate.mean - mean.info$se)
>
> figS3.b<-ggplot(mean.info, aes(x=Country, y=donate.mean)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = mean.info$Country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","darkslategrey")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars2, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Amount Donated ($)") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(B) Exp 2: Private Donation") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> ##Public Spending 1
> data.click.willing.rep <- subset(data.click.willing, party==1)
> tab <- as.data.frame.matrix(table(data.click.willing.rep$country, data.click.willing.rep$govt.encourage.rep.final))
> names(tab) <- c("X0","X1")
> tab$n <- tab$X1 + tab$X0
> tab$prop.govt.encourage <- tab$X1/(tab$X0+tab$X1)
>
> us.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> india.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> china.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
```

```
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   us.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[1], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[1]))
+   india.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[2], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[2]))
+   china.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[3], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[3]))
+ }
> tab$se[1] <- sd(us.store)
> tab$se[2] <- sd(india.store)
> tab$se[3] <- sd(china.store)
> tab$country <- row.names(tab)
> tab <- tab[order(tab$country),]
> se.bars.ps1 <- aes(ymax = tab$prop.govt.encourage + tab$se, ymin = tab$prop.govt.encourage - tab$se)
>
> figS3.c<-ggplot(tab, aes(x=country, y=prop.govt.encourage)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = tab$country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","khaki","indianred2")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars.ps1, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Writing to Support") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12,
colour="black")) + xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(C) Exp 1: Public Spending") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> ##Public Spending 2
> data2.w.pure.control.rep <- subset(data2.w.pure.control, Q142==1)
> dta4 <- melt(data2.w.pure.control.rep, measure.vars = c("fundus","fundfor"))
> dta4 <- dta4[,(ncol(dta4)-1):ncol(dta4)]
> names(dta4) <- c("Country","Write")
> dta4$Country <- ifelse(dta4$Country=="fundfor","Foreign","US")
> mean.info4 <- ddply(dta4, "Country", summarise, write.mean=mean(Write, na.rm=T))
>
> foreign.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> US.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   foreign.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta4$Write[1:74], size=74, replace=T), na.rm=T)
+   US.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta4$Write[75:148], size=74, replace=T), na.rm=T)
+ }
> mean.info4$se[1] <- sd(foreign.store)
> mean.info4$se[2] <- sd(US.store)
> se.bars4 <- aes(ymax = mean.info4$write.mean + mean.info4$se, ymin = mean.info4$write.mean - mean.info4$se)
>
> figS3.d<-ggplot(mean.info4, aes(x=Country, y=write.mean)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = mean.info4$Country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","darkslategrey")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars4, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Support") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(D) Exp 2: Public Spending") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> S3 <- plot_grid(figS3.a,figS3.b,figS3.c,figS3.d)
>
>
> ################################################################################
> ###Figure S4: Home preference among self-described Independents
> ################################################################################
>
> ##Donation 1
> #Overwriting objects from main ClimateTransfers.R analysis to keep from recoding
> data.willing <- subset(data,cc.not.willing==0 & effect1==0 & party==3)
> data.willing.us.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="US")
> data.willing.india.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="India")
> data.willing.china.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="China")
>
> no.vector.us.ce0<-data.willing.us.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.us.ce0$wri.stated==0 & data.willing.us.ce0$randForce==1] #These
are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.china.ce0<-data.willing.china.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.china.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.china.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
> no.vector.india.ce0<-data.willing.india.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final[data.willing.india.ce0$wri.stated==0 &
data.willing.india.ce0$randForce==1] #These are the observations of the "no" respondents who were forced to the bonus part
>
> #Note: probability of switching for independents is always zero in our sample
>
> data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final[is.na(data.willing$wri.fullbonus.final)] <- 0
> data.willing.us.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="US")
> data.willing.india.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="India")
> data.willing.china.ce0 <- subset(data.willing,country=="China")
>
> prop.donate <- c(sum(data.willing.us.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final)/length(data.willing.us.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final),
+                  sum(data.willing.india.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final)/length(data.willing.india.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final),
+                  sum(data.willing.china.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final)/length(data.willing.china.ce0$wri.fullbonus.final))
>
> #SEs of prop.donate
> set.seed(201)
> se <- c(sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.us.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.18309859)/nrow(data.willing.us.ce0)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.india.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.14492754)/nrow(data.willing.india.ce0)),
+         sd(rbinom(size=nrow(data.willing.china.ce0), n=10000, prob=0.07017544)/nrow(data.willing.china.ce0))
+ ) #Note: probabilities come from prop.donate
>
```

```
> se <- c(0.04574577,0.04237056,0.03401052) #Based exactly on above
>
> country <- rev(c("US","India","China"))
> prop.donate<-rev(prop.donate) #From "prop.donate" directly above
> se <- rev(se) #From "se" directly above
> prop.dta <- data.frame(prop.donate,country,se)
> se.bars <- aes(ymax = prop.donate + se, ymin = prop.donate - se)
>
> figS4.a<-ggplot(data=prop.dta, aes(x=country, y=prop.donate)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","khaki","indianred2")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Donating") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(A) Exp 1: Private Donation") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> ##Donation 2
> data2.w.pure.control.ind <- subset(data2.w.pure.control, Q142==3)
> dta2 <- melt(data2.w.pure.control.ind, measure.vars = c('donate.foreign.amount','donate.us.amount'))
> dta2 <- dta2[,(ncol(dta2)-1):ncol(dta2)]
> names(dta2) <- c("Country","Amount")
> dta2$Country <- ifelse(dta2$Country=="donate.foreign.amount","Foreign","US")
> mean.info <- ddply(dta2, "Country", summarise, donate.mean=mean(Amount))
>
> foreign.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> US.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   foreign.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta2$Amount[1:196], size=196, replace=T))
+   US.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta2$Amount[197:392], size=196, replace=T))
+ }
> mean.info$se[1] <- sd(foreign.store)
> mean.info$se[2] <- sd(US.store)
> se.bars2 <- aes(ymax = mean.info$donate.mean + mean.info$se, ymin = mean.info$donate.mean - mean.info$se)
>
> figS4.b<-ggplot(mean.info, aes(x=Country, y=donate.mean)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = mean.info$Country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","darkslategrey")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars2, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Amount Donated ($)") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(B) Exp 2: Private Donation") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> ##Public Spending 1
> data.click.willing.ind <- subset(data.click.willing, party==3)
> tab <- as.data.frame.matrix(table(data.click.willing.ind$country, data.click.willing.ind$govt.encourage.rep.final))
> names(tab) <- c("X0","X1")
> tab$n <- tab$X1 + tab$X0
> tab$prop.govt.encourage <- tab$X1/(tab$X0+tab$X1)
>
> us.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> india.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> china.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   us.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[1], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[1]))
+   india.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[2], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[2]))
+   china.store[i] <- mean(rbinom(n=tab$n[3], size=1, prob=tab$prop.govt.encourage[3]))
+ }
> tab$se[1] <- sd(us.store)
> tab$se[2] <- sd(india.store)
> tab$se[3] <- sd(china.store)
> tab$country <- row.names(tab)
> tab <- tab[order(tab$country),]
> se.bars.ps1 <- aes(ymax = tab$prop.govt.encourage + tab$se, ymin = tab$prop.govt.encourage - tab$se)
>
> figS4.c<-ggplot(tab, aes(x=country, y=prop.govt.encourage)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = tab$country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","khaki","indianred2")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars.ps1, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Writing to Support") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12,
colour="black")) + xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(C) Exp 1: Public Spending") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> ##Public Spending 2
> data2.w.pure.control.ind <- subset(data2.w.pure.control, Q142==3)
> dta4 <- melt(data2.w.pure.control.ind, measure.vars = c("fundus","fundfor"))
> dta4 <- dta4[,(ncol(dta4)-1):ncol(dta4)]
> names(dta4) <- c("Country","Write")
> dta4$Country <- ifelse(dta4$Country=="fundfor","Foreign","US")
> mean.info4 <- ddply(dta4, "Country", summarise, write.mean=mean(Write, na.rm=T))
>
> foreign.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> US.store <- rep(NA, 10000)
> set.seed(201)
> for (i in 1:10000){
+   foreign.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta4$Write[1:196], size=196, replace=T), na.rm=T)
+   US.store[i] <- mean(sample(dta4$Write[197:392], size=196, replace=T), na.rm=T)
```

```
+ }
> mean.info4$se[1] <- sd(foreign.store)
> mean.info4$se[2] <- sd(US.store)
> se.bars4 <- aes(ymax = mean.info4$write.mean + mean.info4$se, ymin = mean.info4$write.mean - mean.info4$se)
>
> figS4.d<-ggplot(mean.info4, aes(x=Country, y=write.mean)) + theme_grey() + scale_x_discrete(limits = mean.info4$Country) +
+   geom_bar(stat="identity", fill=rev(c("steelblue1","darkslategrey")), colour="black") + geom_errorbar(se.bars4, width=0.3) +
+   ylab("Proportion Support") + theme(axis.text.x  = element_text(size=12), axis.text.y  = element_text(size=12, colour="black")) +
xlab("") +
+   coord_flip() +
+   ggtitle("(D) Exp 2: Public Spending") + theme(plot.title = element_text(lineheight=1, face="bold"))
>
> S4 <- plot_grid(figS4.a,figS4.b,figS4.c,figS4.d)
>
>
>
```