Once and Future Peacemakers: Continuity of Third-Party Involvement in Civil War Peace Processes

Online Appendix

International Peacekeeping
< https://doi.org/10.1080/13533312.2020.1768074>

This supplementary material is also available at
< https://doi.org/10.7910/DVN/NGHM1Y>>

Chong Chen
School of Social Sciences
Tsinghua University
Beijing 100084, China
chongchen@tsinghua.edu.cn

Kyle Beardsley
Department of Political Science
Duke University
Durham, NC 27708, USA
kyle.beardsley@duke.edu

A. Online Tables

Table A1. Descriptive statistics (third-party post-conflict month level)

Statistic	N	Mean	St. Dev.	Min	Pctl(25)	Pctl(75)	Max
Post-Conflict Involvement	240,834	0.001	0.04	0	0	0	1
TP Neighboring	163,713	0.1	0.3	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0
TP wartime MICs(count)	240,834	0.1	1.4	0	0	0	65
TP Polity2	155,270	2.9	6.7	−10.0	−3.0	9.0	10.0
Postwar MIC(decay)	240,834	0.4	1.1	0	0	0.01	11
Conflict duration	240,834	1,072.5	1,624.2	0	74	1,370	7,348
Polity2	227,306	0.7	4.3	−7.0	−2.0	5.0	8.0
GDP per capita	232,290	642.1	764.0	124.7	204.9	772.7	4,745.0
Population	240,834	19,946,358.0	28,141,484.0	506,525	6,672,781	17,912,942	143,318,011
Peace Months	240,834	5.6	6.2	0	0	9	23
TP Aid	174,537	0.1	0.3	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0
TP Arms Transfer	174,537	0.01	0.1	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0
Non-State TP(=1)	240,834	0.3	0.4	0	0	1	1
TP wartime good office(count)	240,834	0.02	0.2	0	0	0	4
TP wartime peacekeeping(count)	240,834	0.004	0.1	0	0	0	1
Number of Postwar Violence	240,834	0.9	4.0	0	0	0	58
TP wartime Indirect Talk(count)	240,834	0.01	0.1	0	0	0	2
Peace agreement	240,834	0.1	0.3	0	0	0	1
Ceasefire	240,834	0.1	0.3	0	0	0	1
Government Victory	240,834	0.04	0.2	0	0	0	1
Rebel Victory	240,834	0.1	0.2	0	0	0	1
Low Activity	240,834	0.2	0.4	0	0	0	1

Table A2. Bayesian logistic regression on post-conflict involvement

	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4	Model 5
Intercept	−8.584**	−7.908**	−7.443*	−12.355***	−11.103***
	(2.946)	(3.059)	(3.072)	(2.689)	(2.773)
TP Neighboring	2.534***	3.682***	3.932***		
	(0.259)	(0.308)	(0.342)		
TP Wartime MICs(count)	0.410***	0.582***	0.534***	0.367***	0.490***
	(0.027)	(0.036)	(0.040)	(0.017)	(0.025)
TP Polity2	0.068**	0.038·	0.037		
	(0.023)	(0.023)	(0.025)		
Postwar MIC(decay)	0.494***	0.493***	0.492***	0.487***	0.481***
	(0.051)	(0.054)	(0.055)	(0.041)	(0.043)
Polity2	−0.038	−0.039	−0.034	−0.097***	−0.068*
	(0.030)	(0.030)	(0.030)	(0.029)	(0.028)
Count of Postwar Violence	0.042	0.037	0.036	0.049	0.038
	(0.071)	(0.074)	(0.075)	(0.064)	(0.068)
Conflict Duration (log)	−0.126*	−0.100·	−0.097·	−0.157***	−0.182***
	(0.055)	(0.056)	(0.056)	(0.047)	(0.048)
GDP per Capita (log)	−0.589*	−0.718**	−0.751**	−0.048	−0.228
	(0.259)	(0.264)	(0.266)	(0.234)	(0.234)
Population (log)	0.294·	0.264	0.229	0.363*	0.362*
	(0.168)	(0.171)	(0.172)	(0.149)	(0.155)
Ceasefire	−0.089	−0.076	−0.011	−0.144	−0.327
	(0.500)	(0.498)	(0.497)	(0.469)	(0.472)
Government Victory	−2.707·	−2.691·	−2.575·	−2.734·	−2.960·
	(1.512)	(1.516)	(1.506)	(1.509)	(1.526)
Rebel Victory	0.243	0.564	0.565	1.598***	1.266***
	(0.416)	(0.424)	(0.425)	(0.365)	(0.370)
Low Activity	−0.331	−0.586·	−0.568·	0.072	−0.251
	(0.296)	(0.308)	(0.311)	(0.270)	(0.277)
Peace Months	−0.092	−0.113	−0.116	−0.081	−0.099
	(0.070)	(0.071)	(0.071)	(0.064)	(0.065)
Peace Months^2	0.004	0.004	0.005	0.003	0.004
	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)
Peace Months^3	−0.000	−0.000	−0.000	−0.000	−0.000
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
TP Neighboring*TP Wartime MICs(count)		−0.397***	−0.348***		
		(0.054)	(0.057)		
TP Aid			0.767·		
			(0.437)		
TP Arms Transfer			1.852***		
			(0.550)		
Non-state TP(=1)				−1.065***	−0.133
				(0.270)	(0.254)
Non-state TP(=1)*TP Wartime MICs(count)					−0.190***
					(0.028)
AIC	974.180	908.315	901.443	1473.454	1431.573
BIC	1129.601	1072.879	1084.292	1627.160	1594.886
Log Likelihood	-470.090	-436.158	-430.721	-720.727	-698.786
Deviance	940.180	872.315	861.443	1441.454	1397.573
Num. obs.	69041	69041	69041	109826	109826

$^{***}p < 0.001$, $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{\cdot}p < 0.1$

Table A3. Bayesian logistic regression on post-conflict involvement (types of involvement)

	Model 1	Model 2	Model 3	Model 4	Model 5
Intercept	−8.230**	−10.459***	−8.862**	−11.122***	−9.261***
	(2.664)	(2.671)	(2.767)	(2.401)	(2.410)
TP Neighboring	3.876***	4.055***	3.607***		
	(0.294)	(0.328)	(0.315)		
TP Wartime Peacekeeping(count)	2.866***				
	(0.700)				
TP Neighboring*TP Wartime Peacekeeping(count)	−2.138				
	(1.533)				
TP Polity2	0.036	0.036	0.034		
	(0.022)	(0.022)	(0.022)		
TP Aid	2.068***	2.159***	2.066***		
	(0.324)	(0.329)	(0.325)		
TP Arms Transfer	3.379***	3.477***	3.539***		
	(0.405)	(0.412)	(0.411)		
Postwar MIC(decay)	0.515***	0.403***	0.400***	0.397***	0.396***
	(0.045)	(0.050)	(0.050)	(0.041)	(0.040)
Conflict Duration (log)	0.061	0.032	0.132*	−0.010	0.048
	(0.052)	(0.055)	(0.060)	(0.047)	(0.047)
Polity2	−0.047.	−0.040	−0.041	−0.054*	−0.053*
	(0.027)	(0.028)	(0.028)	(0.024)	(0.023)
Count of Postwar Violence	0.049	0.033	0.061	0.037	0.059
	(0.061)	(0.075)	(0.054)	(0.065)	(0.050)
GDP per Capita (log)	−0.627**	−0.464*	−0.486*	−0.163	−0.206
	(0.240)	(0.234)	(0.237)	(0.205)	(0.208)
Population (log)	0.161	0.238	0.141	0.290*	0.186
	(0.142)	(0.147)	(0.150)	(0.126)	(0.123)
Ceasefire	0.151	0.045	−0.616	−0.181	−0.666
	(0.448)	(0.451)	(0.524)	(0.424)	(0.469)
Government Victory	−2.164	−2.436.	−2.178	−2.749.	−2.667.
	(1.463)	(1.478)	(1.472)	(1.481)	(1.472)
Rebel Victory	0.832*	1.325**	0.700.	1.503***	0.965**
	(0.386)	(0.404)	(0.393)	(0.347)	(0.324)
Low Activity	−0.075	−0.160	−0.161	−0.142	−0.161
	(0.268)	(0.279)	(0.273)	(0.249)	(0.241)
Peace Months	−0.032	−0.049	−0.078	−0.033	−0.070
	(0.065)	(0.066)	(0.069)	(0.060)	(0.063)
Peace Months^2	0.003	0.004	0.008	0.003	0.007
	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)	(0.007)
Peace Months^3	−0.000	−0.000	−0.000	−0.000	−0.000
	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)	(0.000)
TP Wartime Mediation (count)		0.913***		0.773***	
		(0.131)		(0.099)	
TP Neighboring*TP Wartime mediation(count)		−0.237			
		(0.179)			
TP Wartime Good office(count)			1.092**		1.410***
			(0.393)		(0.241)
TP Neighboring*TP Wartime Good Office(count)			1.142*		
			(0.451)		
Non-state TP(=1)				0.066	0.045
				(0.219)	(0.216)
Non-state TP(=1)*TP Wartime Mediation(count)				−0.282	
				(0.197)	
Non-state TP(=1)*TP Wartime Good Office(count)					−0.608
					(0.448)
AIC	1110.502	1075.887	1078.622	1843.405	1859.902
BIC	1293.351	1258.736	1261.471	2006.719	2023.215
Log Likelihood	-535.251	-517.943	-519.311	-904.703	-912.951
Deviance	1070.502	1035.887	1038.622	1809.405	1825.902
Num. obs.	69041	69041	69041	109826	109826

$^{***}p < 0.001$, $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{.}p < 0.1$

B. List of Third Parties

Table B1. Descriptive statistics (third-party post-conflict level)

Statistic	N	Mean	St. Dev.	Min	Max
Post-Conflict Involvement	179	0.3	0.4	0	1
Wartime Involvement Experience	179	0.7	0.5	0	1
Neighbors	179	0.3	0.4	0	1
Aid Donors	179	0.2	0.4	0	1
Arm Supplier	179	0.3	0.5	0	1

Table B2. Logistic regression on post-conflict involvement (third-party level)

	Dependent Variable: Post-Conflict Involvement
Intercept	-4.577^{***}
	(1.047)
Wartime Involvement Experience	3.427^{***}
	(1.037)
Neighbors	1.644^{***}
	(0.424)
Aid Donors	0.357
	(0.635)
Arm Supplier	0.073
	(0.572)
AIC	161.612
BIC	177.549
Log Likelihood	-75.806
Deviance	151.612
Num. obs.	179

$^{***}p < 0.001$, $^{**}p < 0.01$, $^{*}p < 0.05$, $^{\cdot}p < 0.1$

Table B3. List of third parties

Row Number	Third-party ID	Third-party Name
1	12033	The Sant' Egidio Community
2	12029	Vatican
3	11010	EC/EU
4	11024	UN
5	11000	AU
6	12040	FIDH
7	11015	NATO
8	12018	Jimmy Carter
9	12020	Envoy or representative of Julius Nyerere (former Tanzanian President)
10	12019	Julius Nyerere
11	12028	NGO, domestic or local
12	12030	Privat person - not in a former official position acting independently
13	12026	Nelson Mandela (former President of South Africa)
14	12027	Envoy or representative of Nelson Mandela
15	12008	Civil society / community activists
16	11001	Arab League
17	11019	South African Development Community
18	12007	Christian representatives (catholics, lutherans, russian orthodox etc.)
19	12045	ACCORD
20	11006	ECOWAS
21	12003	Amnesty
22	11005	Commonwealth of Portugese Speaking States
23	12005	Businessmen
24	11012	International Francophone Organisation
25	11023	The New Partnership for Africa's Development

Table B3. List of third parties

Row Number	Third-party ID	Third-party Name
26	12015	ICRC
27	12014	International Alert, The London-based mediation group
28	11022	The Commonwealth
29	11007	Economic Community of West African States Monitoring Group
30	11025	World Bank
31	11011	IGADD/IGAD
32	12037	CARE International
33	12041	Abdel Alier
34	12042	Archbishop of Uganda
35	12038	US Catholic Church
36	12010	Henry Dunant Center for Humanitarian Dialogue
37	12043	Acholi Religious Leaders Peace Initiative
38	11026	EAC
39	12044	Prof. Washington Okumu
40	12039	Betty Bigombe
41	12047	Autonomous Government of Southern Sudan
42	12049	Pax Christi
43	12050	The Uganda Joint Christian Council
44	12046	Moi Africa Institute
45	12048	The Elders
46	12025	Muslim / Islamic Religious Representatives (shiite, sunni etc.)
47	12011	Human Rights organisation
48	11017	Organisation of the Islamic Conference
49	11021	The Arab Maghreb Union
50	651	Egypt
51	220	France
52	560	South Africa
53	230	Spain
54	710	China
55	2	United States
56	483	Chad
57	475	Nigeria
58	255	Germany
59	435	Mauritania
60	235	Portugal
61	437	Cote d'Ivoire
62	403	Sao Tome and Principe
63	551	Zambia
64	552	Zimbabwe
65	616	Tunisia
66	600	Morocco
67	434	Benin
68	200	United Kingdom
69	481	Gabon
70	484	Congo
71	565	Namibia
72	530	Ethiopia
73	517	Rwanda
74	490	Congo, the Democratic Republic of the
75	325	Italy

Table B3. List of third parties

Row Number	Third-party ID	Third-party Name
76	702	Tajikistan
77	501	Kenya
78	510	Tanzania, United Republic of
79	211	Belgium
80	327	Holy See (Vatican City State)
81	471	Cameroon
82	500	Uganda
83	346	Bosnia and Herzegovina
84	375	Finland
85	452	Ghana
86	541	Mozambique
87	20	Canada
88	210	Netherlands
89	620	Libya
90	482	Central African Republic
91	625	Sudan
92	436	Niger
93	580	Madagascar
94	461	Togo
95	740	Japan
96	516	Burundi
97	900	Australia
98	439	Burkina Faso
99	225	Switzerland
100	571	Botswana
101	553	Malawi
102	540	Angola
103	520	Somalia
104	531	Eritrea
105	450	Liberia
106	420	Gambia
107	402	Cabo Verde
108	433	Senegal
109	451	Sierra Leone
110	438	Guinea
111	615	Algeria
112	432	Mali
113	590	Mauritius
114	404	Guinea-Bissau
115	380	Sweden
116	678	Yemen Arab Republic
117	522	Djibouti
118	385	Norway
119	670	Saudi Arabia
120	694	Qatar
121	696	United Arab Emirates
122	630	Iran, Islamic Republic of
123	652	Syrian Arab Republic
124	645	Iraq
125	732	Korea, Republic of

Table B3. List of third parties

Row Number	Third-party ID	Third-party Name
126	365	Russian Federation
127	680	Yemen People's Republic
128	390	Denmark
129	663	Jordan
130	349	Slovenia
131	820	Malaysia
132	338	Malta
133	212	Luxembourg
134	666	Israel
135	570	Lesotho
136	411	Equatorial Guinea
137	572	Swaziland
138	155	Chile
139	770	Pakistan
140	350	Greece
141	140	Brazil
142	205	Ireland
143	840	Philippines
144	360	Romania
145	370	Belarus
146	315	Czechoslovakia
147	316	Czech Republic
148	290	Poland
149	317	Slovakia
150	369	Ukraine
151	355	Bulgaria
152	310	Hungary
153	705	Kazakhstan
154	359	Moldova, Republic of
155	135	Peru
156	830	Singapore
157	372	Georgia
158	340	Serbia
159	731	Korea, Democratic People's Republic of
160	750	India
161	344	Croatia
162	305	Austria
163	640	Turkey
164	850	Indonesia
165	703	Kyrgyzstan
166	345	Yugoslavia
167	352	Cyprus
168	366	Estonia
169	395	Iceland
170	690	Kuwait
171	223	Liechtenstein
172	221	Monaco
173	920	New Zealand
174	713	Taiwan, Province of China
175	800	Thailand

Table B3. List of third parties

Row Number	Third-party ID	Third-party Name
176	698	Oman
177	679	Yemen
178	581	Comoros
179	605	Western Sahara