For online publication
To support the paper "Face-saving or fair-minded: What motivates moral behavior?"

Alexander W. Cappelen   Trond Halvorsen   Erik Ø. Sørensen

Bertil Tungodden

March 23, 2015

In this appendix, we present a translation of the instructions (including screenshots) and the letters used in the experiment. Instructions given to dictators in treatment T2 are presented in Section **??**. In the paper, we explain how the other treatments differ from T2. The letters for all the treatments are presented in Section **??**.

A.1   Instructions

A.1.1   Introduction (applies to all treatments)

Welcome to this experiment. My name is X and I shall be in charge of the experiment.

The results from this experiment will be used in a research project, and it is important that everyone follows the rules of conduct given to you. If you have questions or problems along the way, please raise your hand and we will come to you. You must not attempt to open other web-pages than those of the experiment. If you break these rules, you must leave the room. There will be waiting periods during the experiment, and it is important that you then remain quiet.

You will be anonymous in the experiment. It won't be possible for us, the other participants, or anyone else to find out what choices you make in the experiment.

When the experiment is finished, you will be given a payment code on the screen. You should write this code down on a form at your workstation. When you leave the room after the experiment, you present this form and you will be given an envelope with the money you have earned. The envelope will be prepared by persons who will not be in this room when the envelopes are distributed. We do this to make sure that no-one will know how much each of you earned in this experiment.

The experiment has two parts, and I shall know explain what you will do in the experiment.

1

The first thing you will do in this experiment is to work on a task that lasts for 15 minutes. The task is to find a certain number in a matrix with a large number of different numbers. You get one point each time you tick off the correct number in the matrix and you lose one point each time you tick off an incorrect number. You can move to a new matrix at any time. To complete the task, you will have to collect 70 points within the time limit. You will be informed about the number of points you have earned during the task. If you finish the task before the time limit you will be told so. You can then await further instructions.

A.1.2 Production phase (applies to all treatments)

[Figure **??** about here.]

A.1.3 Distribution phase - introduction (T2)

You reached the production target in the first part of the experiment and for this you have earned 100 NOK.

You have been randomly matched with another participant in this experiment who is also a student at NHH, but who is in a different room. This person has also earned 100 NOK for doing the same task as you, but has not been informed about this.

This person will not be matched with other participants than you. You will not be told who this person is, and this person will not be told who you are.

You will be asked to determine how you want to distribute the amount you and the other participant have earned together, 200 NOK, between yourself and him (or her). After the experiment is finished, the person you are matched with will be sent a letter. In this letter this person will be informed that he (or she) randomly has been drawn to be a recipient in this experiment. The person will also be informed that he has been matched with another participant (i.e. you), and that both you and him have earned 100 NOK for the task you performed, and that you have been asked to determine how much of the earnings from the experiment he should have. The money you decide to distribute to him will be enclosed to the letter. If you decide to give nothing to this other participant, the letter will be sent without any money enclosed.

Your payment from the experiment will be your show up fee plus the amount you decide to keep for yourself. When the experiment is completed you will be given a payment code on the screen that you should write down. When you leave the room, you present this code and you will receive an envelope with your money. To ensure anonymity, the envelopes will be prepared by persons who will not be in the room when the envelopes are distributed. Therefore, none of us present in this room will know what amount is in the envelope you receive.

On the payment form you will also find contact information for a person in the administration at NHH. By reporting your payment code to this person you will, if you want, be sent an anonymized copy of the letter sent to the other participant and a copy

Figure A.1: Production technology. Screenshot to the left, translated text to the right.

Produksjonsoppgave

Du tjener et poeng for hvert korrekt tall du krysser av, og taper et poeng for hver feil avkryssing.

Produksjonen er ferdig når du når 70 poeng.

Du kan få frem en ny tabell når som helst ved å trykke på "send" knappen.

I tabellen under, kryss av for tallet **892**.

892	118	892	241	956	241	920	223	454	241	313	592	144	313	592	144	313
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
368	956	698	223	368	144	223	454	220	144	368	864	313	956	698	698	956
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
592	864	144	698	454	118	486	313	223	241	592	956	144	892	454	956	118
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
864	223	144	892	920	486	368	920	144	698	920	864	220	454	486	956	144
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
313	223	220	892	892	313	956	592	368	313	486	956	454	892	241	313	144
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
592	313	892	892	368	920	486	118	920	486	864	223	486	368	144	223	220
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
368	313	956	241	368	223	920	144	956	241	241	144	698	220	241	118	
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	
241	698	592	956	454	956	486	118	220	118	220	698	592	368	118	454	
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	
223	864	920	118	368	454	486	698	486	920	864	920	454	592	486	313	
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	
864	220	313	698	892	956	698	241	144	220	698	592	486	956	368	313	698
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐
920	956	220	144	368	956	368	920	223	486	864	220	864	920	368	454	
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	
368	698	313	368	220	698	223	368	920	223	698	241	486	592	368	920	144
☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐	☐

Sekunder igjen: 847.8   Send

Production task

You earn one point for each correct number you tick off, and lose one point each time you tick off an incorrect number.

The production task is completed when you reach 70 points.

You can proceed to a new matrix at any time by pressing the "submit" button.

In the matrix below, tick off for the number **892**.

[matrix]

Seconds left: 847.8 [Submit]

3

of the receipt in the accounts of NHH that confirms that the amount you decided to distribute to the recipient was actually transferred to the recipient.

Before you go on you will be given the opportunity to view the letter that will be sent to the recipient. When you have looked at this letter you will be given the opportunity to move on.

A.1.4   Distribution phase - distributive choice (T2)

[Figure **??** about here.]

A.1.5   Distribution phase - choice of information condition (T2)

[Figure **??** about here.]

[Figure **??** about here.]

[Figure **??** about here.]

Valg av fordeling

Du er, som vi allerede har orientert deg om, tilfeldig blitt koblet sammen med en annen deltaker i dette eksperimentet som også er student ved NHH, men sitter i et annet rom.

Denne personen vil etter eksperimentet motta brevet du nettopp har sett. Dersom du vil se brevet på nytt, klikk her

[Se på brev]

Du og den andre deltakeren har tjent til sammen 200 kroner på oppgaven dere har utført.

Skriv inn hvor mye av dette beløpet du ønsker å gi til den andre deltakeren:

Til den andre: [____]

[Send beslutning]

Choice of distribution

You are, as we have already informed you, randomly matched with another participant in this experiment who is also a student at NHH, but located in another room.

After the experiment, this person will receive the letter you have just seen. If you want to see the letter again, hit the button below

[Look at letter]

You and the other participant have earned 200 NOK in total for the task you have performed.

Enter how much of this amount you would like to give the other participant.

To the other: [. . .]

[Submit decision]

Figure A.2: Distribution choice. Screenshot to the left, translation to the right.

Mulighet til å endre informasjon

Du får nå mulighet til å endre innholdet i brevet som den du er koblet sammen med vil motta etter eksperimentet. Dersom du ønsker det, vil brevet kun inneholde generell informasjon om at vedkommende er trukket ut til å motta penger fra et økonomisk eksperiment ved NHH og ingen informasjon om at det er en spesifikk person (dvs. deg) som har tatt dette valget og at dere begge har tjent penger i eksperimentet.

Dersom du velger å endre innholdet i brevet, vil du også få muligheten til å endre beløpet du sender til den andre. Dersom du i dette tilfellet velger ikke å sende noe til den andre, vil vedkommende heller ikke motta brev om eksperimentet.

Du får nå se denne varianten av brevet:

Se på brev

Copyright Department of Economics, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration.

Opportunity to change the information

You will now be given the opportunity to change the content of the letter that the person you are matched with will receive after the experiment. If you wish so, the letter will only contain general information stating that the recipient has been drawn to receive money from an economic experiment at NHH and no information there being a specific person (i.e. you) that has made this choice and that you have both earned money in the experiment.

If you decide to change the content of the letter, you will also be given the opportunity to revise the amount you give to the other participant. In this case, if you choose not to send any money, the other person will also not receive a letter about the experiment.

You can now look at the alternative letter:

[Look at letter]

6

Figure A.3: Screenshot to the left, translation to the right. After the participant had looked at the letter a new button appeared that allowed him to move on.

Valg av brevalternativ

Kryss av for det alternativet du foretrekker. Når du har valgt alternativ kan du gå videre.

○ Jeg ønsker at den jeg er koblet sammen med skal få informasjon om hvor mye vi har tjent og mitt valg. Dersom du på nytt vil se brevet som vedkommende mottar med dette alternativet, trykk

[Se brev]

○ Jeg ønsker at den jeg er koblet sammen med ikke skal få informasjon om hvor mye vi har tjent og mitt valg. Dersom du på nytt vil se brevet som vedkommende mottar med dette alternativet, trykk

[Se brev]

[Send beslutning]

Copyright Department of Economics, Norwegian School of Economics and Business Administration.

Choice of letter

Tick off for the alternative you prefer. When you have chosen an alternative you can go on.

- I want the person that I am matched with to receive information about how much we earned and my choice. If you want to see the letter this person receives in this case once more you can hit [See letter].

- I want the person that I am matched with not to receive information about how much we have earned and my choice. If you want to see the letter this person receives in this case once more you can hit [See letter].

[Submit decision]

Figure A.4: Choice of letter. Screenshot to the left, translation to the right.

Ønsker du å endre fordelingsbeslutning?

Du valgte at den du er koblet sammen med ikke skal få informasjon om at dere begge har tjent penger og ditt valg. Dersom du vil se brevet vedkommende vil motta på nytt, klikk her

[Se på brev]

Dere har tjent til sammen 200 kroner på oppgaven dere har utført.

Velg mellom følgende to alternativer:

- ○ Behold opprinnelig fordeling og gi den andre 40 kroner.
- ○ Endre fordeling og gi den andre [ ] kroner.

[Send beslutning]

Do you wish to revise the distribution choice?

You chose that the person you are matched with should not be informed about that you have both earned money and your choice. If you want to see the letter again, hit the button

[See letter]

You have earned 200 NOK together for the task you have done.
Choose between one of the following alternatives:

- Keep original distribution and give the other participant 40 NOK.
- Change distribution and given the other participant [...] NOK.

[Submit decision]

Figure A.5: Revising the distribution choice. Screenshot to the left, translation to the right. (The 40 NOK amount reflects the choice made while taking screenshots, not a constant in the program.)

A.1.6 Questionnaire phase (applies to all treatments)

[Figure **??** about here.]

Vi vil gjerne at du svarer på disse spørsmålene:

Hvilket kull går du på?

Hvor gammel er du?

Er du mann eller kvinne?

Hvor mye har du i løpet av det siste året gitt til veldedige formål?

Hvilket parti stemte du på ved forrige valg?

Send

We would like you to answer the following questions

- In which school year are you?

- How old are you?

- Are you male or female?

- How much have you in the last year donated to charity?

- Which party did you vote for in the previous election?

Figure A.6: Background questions. Screenshot to the left, translation to the right.

A.2 Letters

We here present all the letters used in the experiment.

[Figure **??** about here.]

[Figure **??** about here.]

[Figure **??** about here.]

[Figure **??** about here.]

[Figure **??** about here.]

Bergen, 03.11.2009

Kjære Navn,

Du har blitt trukket ut som en mottaker i et økonomisk eksperiment gjennomført på Norges Handelshøyskole (NHH). Ditt navn er tilfeldig trukket ut fra et utvalg av studentene på NHH.

I eksperimentet tjente en deltaker, som også er en student ved NHH, 200 kroner på å utføre en oppgave. Vedkommende fikk så beskjed om at han (eller hun) var blitt koblet sammen med annen person som var tilfeldig trukket blant de øvrige studentene på NHH (dvs. deg), og ble bedt om å bestemme hvor mye av de 200 kronene han ville gi til deg. Før han gjorde dette valget fikk han også se en kopi av dette brevet.

Han valgte å gi deg ... kroner, og disse pengene er lagt ved dette brevet. Hvis det ikke er noen penger i konvolutten, betyr det at deltakeren valgte ikke å gi deg noe av pengene han tjente.

Hvis du har spørsmål knyttet til eksperimentet kan du sende en mail til undertegnede (trond.halvorsen(at)nhh.no), som er administrativt ansvarlig for eksperimentet.

Mvh

Trond Halvorsen
PhD student, institutt for samfunnsøkonomi

Dear Name,

You have been selected to receive x NOK from an economic experiment conducted at the Norwegian School of Economics (NHH). Your name has been randomly selected among the students at NHH.

In this experiment a participant, who is also a student at NHH, has earned 200 NOK by performing a task. The participant was then informed that he (or she) had been matched with another person, randomly selected among the other students at NHH (i.e. you), and was asked to decide how much of the 200 NOK he wanted to give to you. Before he made his choice, he was shown a copy of this letter.

He decided to give you x NOK, which is enclosed to this letter. If the envelope does not contain any money, however, the participant decided not to give you any of his earnings.

If you have questions regarding the experiment, you can send an e-mail to the signatory (trond.halvorsen(at)nhh.no), who is administratively responsible for the experiment.

Yours sincerely,

Trond Halvorsen
PhD student, Department of Economics

Figure A.7: Informative letter (applies in treatments T1, and T1*). Screenshot to the left, translation to the right.

NHH

Navn Student NHH
Adresse

Bergen, 03.11.2009

Kjære Navn,

Du har blitt trukket ut som en mottaker i et økonomisk eksperiment gjennomført på Norges Handelshøyskole (NHH). Ditt navn er tilfeldig trukket ut blant studentene som var i det rommet du satt i under dette eksperimentet, tirsdag 3. november.

I eksperimentet tjente en deltaker i et annet rom, som også er en student ved NHH, 100 kroner på å utføre samme oppgave som du utførte den dagen. Vedkommende fikk så beskjed om at han (eller hun) var blitt koblet sammen med en annen person som var tilfeldig trukket blant studentene som deltok i eksperimentet (dvs. deg). Han fikk beskjed om at du hadde utført den samme oppgaven og klart produksjonsmålet. Han fikk også beskjed om at du hadde tjent det samme beløpet, 100 kroner, men at du ikke hadde blitt informert om dette. Vi ba deretter den andre om å bestemme hvor mye av pengene dere hadde tjent til sammen, 200 kroner, han ville gi til deg. Før han gjorde dette valget fikk han også se en kopi av dette brevet.

Han valgte å gi deg ... kroner, og disse pengene er lagt ved dette brevet. Hvis det ikke er noen penger i konvolutten, betyr det at deltakeren valgte ikke å gi deg noe av pengene dere tjente.

Hvis du har spørsmål knyttet til eksperimentet kan du sende en mail til undertegnede (trond.halvorsen(at)nhh.no), som er administrativt ansvarlig for eksperimentet.

Mvh

Trond Halvorsen

Trond Halvorsen
PhD student, institutt for samfunnsøkonomi

Dear Name,

You have been selected to receive x NOK from an economic experiment conducted at the Norwegian School of Economics (NHH). Your name has been randomly selected among the students in the room you were sitting in during the experiment on Tuesday November 3.

In this experiment a participant in a different room, who is also a student at NHH, has earned 100 NOK by performing the same task as you. The participant was then informed that he (or she) had been matched with another person, randomly selected among the other students that participated in the experiment (i.e. you). He was informed that you had completed the same task. He was also informed that you had earned the same amount, 100 NOK, but that you had not been informed about this. We then asked him to decide how much of the joint earnings of 200 NOK, he wanted to give to you. Before he made his choice, he was shown a copy of this letter.

He decided to give you x NOK, which is enclosed to this letter. If the envelope does not contain any money, however, the participant decided not to give you any of the money that the two of you had earned."

Yours sincerely,

Trond Halvorsen
PhD student, Department of Economics

Figure A.8: Informative letter (applies in treatments T2, and T2*). Screenshot to the left, translation to the right.

NHH

Navn Student NHH
Adresse

Bergen, 03-11-2009

Kjære Navn,

Du har blitt trukket ut til å motta kroner ... i forbindelse med et økonomisk eksperiment gjennomført på Norges Handelshøyskole (NHH). Ditt navn er tilfeldig trukket ut fra et utvalg av studentene på NHH

Hvis du har spørsmål knyttet til eksperimentet kan du sende en mail til undertegnede (trond.halvorsen(at)nhh.no), som er administrativt ansvarlig for eksperimentet.

Mvh

Trond Halvorsen
PhD student, institutt for samfunnsøkonomi

Norges Handelshøyskole
NORWEGIAN SCHOOL OF ECONOMICS AND BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION
Helleveien 30
NO-5045 Bergen
Norway
Tlf/Tel: +47 55 95 90 00
Faks/Fax: +47 55 95 91 00
nhh.postmottak@nhh.no
www.nhh.no
Bankkonto 7694 0500 350
Bank Account No64 7694 05100 350

Dear Name,

You have been selected to receive x NOK from an economic experiment conducted at the Norwegian School of Economics (NHH). Your name has been randomly selected among the students at NHH.

If you have questions regarding the experiment, you can send an e-mail to the signatory (trond.halvorsen(at)nhh.no), who is administratively responsible for the experiment.

Yours sincerely,

Trond Halvorsen
PhD student, Department of Economics

Figure A.9: Non-informative letter (applies in treatments T1, T1*, T2, and T2*). Screenshot to the left, translation to the right.

THE LETTER IS TRANSLATED FROM SWAHILI WHICH IS THE OFFICIAL
LANGUAGE OF TANZANIA

Dear Name,

You have been selected to receive x NOK (equivalent to y USD) from an economic experiment conducted at the Norwegian School of Economics (NHH) in Norway. Your name has been randomly selected among the clients in the micro finance institution PRIDE TANZANIA in Dar es Salaam in Tanzania.

In this experiment a participant, who is a student at NHH, earned 200 NOK by performing a task. The participant was then informed that he (or she) had been matched with another person, randomly selected among the clients in PRIDE TANZANIA in Tanzania (i.e. you), and was asked to decide how much of his earnings he wanted to give to you. Before he made his choice, he was shown a copy of this letter.

He decided to give you x NOK (equivalent to y USD), which is enclosed to this letter. If the envelope does not contain any money, however, the participant decided not to give you any of the money that the two of you had earned.

If you have questions regarding the experiment, you can contact the head of your branch in PRIDE TANZANIA, or send an e-mail to the signatory (trond.halvorsen(at)nhh.no), who is administratively responsible for the experiment.

Yours sincerely,

Trond Halvorsen

PhD student, Department of Economics

NHH

BREVET ER OVERSATT FRA SWAHILI, SOM ER NASJONALSPRÅKET I
TANZANIA.

Navn Låntaker PRIDE TANZANIA
Dar es Salaam
TANZANIA

Bergen, 03.11.2009

Kjære Navn,

Du har blitt trukket ut til å motta ... norske kroner (tilsvarende ...USD) i forbindelse med et økonomisk eksperiment gjennomført på Norges Handelshøyskole (NHH) i Norge. Ditt navn er tilfeldig trukket ut blant låntakerne i mikrokredittorganisasjonen PRIDE TANZANIA i Dar es Salaam i Tanzania.

I eksperimentet tjente en deltaker, som er en student ved NHH, ... norske kroner (tilsvarende ...USD) på å utføre en oppgave. Vedkommende fikk så beskjed om at han (eller hun) var blitt koblet sammen med en person som var tilfeldig trukket blant låntakerne i PRIDE TANZANIA i Dar es Salaam (dvs. deg), og ble bedt om å bestemme hvor mye han ville gi til deg. Før han gjorde dette valget fikk han også se en kopi av dette brevet.

Han valgte å gi deg ... norske kroner (tilsvarende ... USD) og disse pengene er lagt ved dette brevet. Hvis det ikke er noen penger i konvolutten, betyr det at deltakeren valgte ikke å gi deg noe av pengene han tjente.

Hvis du har spørsmål knyttet til eksperimentet, kan du ta kontakt med lederen for din avdeling i PRIDE TANZANIA eller sende en mail til undertegnede (trond.halvorsen(at)nhh.no), som er administrativt ansvarlig for eksperimentet.

Mvh

Trond Halvorsen
PhD student, institutt for samfunnsøkonomi

Figure A.10: Informative letter (applies in treatments T3, and T3*). Screenshot to the left, translation to the right.

NHH

BREVET ER OVERSATT FRA SWAHILI, SOM ER NASJONALSPRÅKET I
TANZANIA.

Navn Låntaker PRIDE TANZANIA
Dar es Salaam
TANZANIA

Bergen, 03-11-2009

Kjære Navn,

Du har blitt trukket ut til å motta ... norske kroner (tilsvarende ...USD) i forbindelse med et økonomisk eksperiment gjennomført på Norges Handelshøyskole (NHH) i Norge. Ditt navn er tilfeldig trukket ut blant låntakerne i mikrokredittorganisasjonen PRIDE TANZANIA i Dar es Salaam i Tanzania.

Hvis du har spørsmål knyttet til eksperimentet, kan du ta kontakt med lederen for din avdeling i PRIDE TANZANIA eller sende en mail til undertegnede (trond.halvorsen(at)nhh.no), som er administrativt ansvarlig for eksperimentet.

Mvh

Trond Halvorsen

Trond Halvorsen
PhD student, institutt for samfunnsøkonomi

THE LETTER IS TRANSLATED FROM SWAHILI WHICH IS THE OFFICIAL
LANGUAGE OF TANZANIA

Dear Name,

You have been selected to receive x NOK (equivalent to y USD) from an economic experiment conducted at the Norwegian School of Economics (NHH) in Norway. Your name has been randomly selected among the clients in the micro finance institution PRIDE TANZANIA in Dar es Salaam in Tanzania.

If you have questions regarding the experiment, you can contact the head of your branch in PRIDE TANZANIA, or send an e-mail to the signatory (trond.halvorsen(at)nhh.no), who is administratively responsible for the experiment.

Yours sincerely,

Trond Halvorsen
PhD student, Department of Economics

Figure A.11: Non-informative letter (applies in treatments T3, and T3*). Screenshot to the left, translation to the right.