*Governing Security After War:*
*The Politics of Institutional Change in the Security Sector*

**Supplementary Appendix:**
**Robustness Checks**

**for**

**Chapter 6**
**Across Postwar Countries and Beyond:**
**Statistical Analysis of Security Governance**

**Louis-Alexandre Berg**
**Oxford University Press, 2022**

**LBerg@gsu.edu**

## A. Alternative Model Specification: Time-Series Cross-Sectional Logit Model

**Table R1: Results from Logit Model with robust standard errors clustered by country**

| | Officer Appointment | Military Integration | Civilian Control | Civilian Access | Legal Limits | Discipline |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Party fractionalization | 2.530** | 0.640 | 2.384** | 1.474** | 2.020* | 0.300 |
| | (1.016) | (1.038) | (1.096) | (0.733) | (1.143) | (0.903) |
| Oil Exporter | 0.236 | -0.345 | -3.057*** | -0.486 | 0.0109 | -3.972*** |
| | (0.920) | (1.352) | (1.087) | (0.602) | (1.248) | (1.000) |
| Log Population | 0.607 | -0.800** | -0.183 | 0.237 | 0.272 | 1.026*** |
| | (0.371) | (0.328) | (0.294) | (0.214) | (0.333) | (0.357) |
| Log GDP per cap | 0.575 | 0.367 | 0.446 | 0.871*** | -1.099 | 0.209 |
| | (0.426) | (0.519) | (0.484) | (0.266) | (0.674) | (0.477) |
| Ethnic fractionalization | -1.848 | 4.574** | 2.147 | -2.078* | 1.582 | -4.317** |
| | (2.027) | (1.991) | (2.031) | (1.063) | (2.312) | (1.877) |
| Peace agreement | 1.633* | 3.792*** | -0.628 | -0.169 | 1.490 | -1.417* |
| | (0.955) | (0.962) | (0.970) | (0.584) | (0.954) | (0.797) |
| Victory | 0.412 | 4.722*** | 0.0340 | 0.124 | 0.0718 | -2.374*** |
| | (0.818) | (1.356) | (0.716) | (0.551) | (0.954) | (0.840) |
| War duration | -0.0237 | 0.0792 | -0.0119 | 0.0190 | -0.0317 | 0.00917 |
| | (0.0495) | (0.0791) | (0.0600) | (0.0340) | (0.0576) | (0.0567) |
| UN peace operation | 1.311 | -0.693 | -1.611 | -0.450 | -0.130 | -0.0981 |
| | (1.006) | (0.740) | (0.998) | (0.612) | (0.842) | (0.709) |
| Democracy | 0.489 | -2.203*** | 4.371*** | 1.536*** | 3.034*** | -0.0683 |
| | (0.828) | (0.835) | (0.771) | (0.519) | (0.718) | (0.404) |
| Militarized interstate dispute | 0.300 | -0.797** | -0.112 | 0.0705 | -0.289 | 1.590** |
| | (0.393) | (0.352) | (0.335) | (0.352) | (0.306) | (0.721) |
| Cold War | 0.0935 | -1.321 | -0.643 | 1.493*** | -1.883* | 0.0629 |
| | (0.859) | (0.936) | (0.773) | (0.489) | (0.963) | (0.964) |
| peaceyear | 0.177 | 0.331* | -0.284 | 0.215 | 0.0187 | 0.359 |
| | (0.207) | (0.194) | (0.278) | (0.266) | (0.205) | (0.292) |
| peaceyear^2 | -0.00882 | -0.0294 | 0.0395 | -0.0382 | 0.0112 | -0.0258 |
| | (0.0273) | (0.0226) | (0.0385) | (0.0381) | (0.0279) | (0.0378) |
| peaceyear^3 | -0.0000489 | 0.000900 | -0.00160 | 0.00213 | -0.000748 | 0.000746 |
| | (0.00109) | (0.000919) | (0.00156) | (0.00161) | (0.00114) | (0.00155) |
| Constant | -16.42** | 2.501 | -1.552 | -11.04** | 20.12** | -16.97** |
| | (7.264) | (7.007) | (6.473) | (4.571) | (8.308) | (7.754) |
| Region | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes | yes |
| Observations | 582 | 571 | 581 | 579 | 581 | 581 |

Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

## B. Varying Length of Time after Civil War included in the analysis: 10, 20, and 30 years

**Table R2: Multilevel Logit Model with Random Effects by Country, 10-years postwar**

| | (1) **Officer Appointment** | (2) **Military Integration** | (3) **Civilian Control** | (4) **Civilian Access** | (5) **Legal Limits** | (6) **Discipline** |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Party fractionalization | 25.15*** | 0.0949 | 22.36*** | 2.842*** | 19.40*** | 19.31*** |
| | (4.272) | (3.646) | (4.130) | (1.018) | (4.014) | (5.133) |
| Oil Exporter | -3.989 | -12.52*** | -14.19*** | 0.314 | -0.961 | -20.14*** |
| | (4.001) | (3.836) | (2.719) | (0.739) | (2.674) | (4.389) |
| Log Population | 4.814*** | -3.105*** | -2.752** | -0.111 | 1.512 | 7.265*** |
| | (1.227) | (1.152) | (1.205) | (0.389) | (1.429) | (1.061) |
| Log GDP per cap | 4.103** | 4.562** | 2.966** | 1.934*** | -0.724 | 2.895** |
| | (1.698) | (1.892) | (1.431) | (0.540) | (1.157) | (1.244) |
| Ethnic fractionalization | 3.395 | 14.95** | 66.77*** | -0.710 | 1.172 | -24.90*** |
| | (7.093) | (6.287) | (7.832) | (2.048) | (5.825) | (6.124) |
| Peace agreement | 21.57*** | 10.93*** | -0.517 | -1.519* | -1.063 | -2.226 |
| | (2.866) | (3.377) | (2.621) | (0.833) | (1.596) | (2.673) |
| Victory | -1.012 | 9.378*** | 9.129*** | -0.212 | -3.207 | -7.674*** |
| | (2.758) | (3.276) | (2.326) | (0.653) | (2.932) | (2.848) |
| War duration | -1.177*** | 0.390** | 0.138 | -0.0238 | 0.00110 | -0.790*** |
| | (0.188) | (0.161) | (0.133) | (0.0528) | (0.140) | (0.161) |
| UN peace operation | -0.932 | -3.616 | -5.915** | -0.998* | -2.126 | -12.03*** |
| | (1.209) | (2.928) | (2.377) | (0.594) | (1.819) | (3.316) |
| Democracy | -3.148* | -2.636 | 14.28*** | 2.280*** | 7.512*** | 10.10*** |
| | (1.653) | (4.118) | (4.165) | (0.697) | (2.834) | (2.714) |
| Militarized interstate dispute | -0.0880 | 0.104 | -0.243 | 0.312 | -0.0134 | 0.613 |
| | (0.967) | (1.894) | (0.897) | (0.350) | (0.955) | (0.942) |
| Cold War | -9.844*** | -14.64*** | -9.249*** | 1.482** | -12.41*** | -11.24*** |
| | (3.010) | (3.810) | (2.560) | (0.722) | (3.207) | (3.243) |
| Constant | -126.4*** | -86.61 | -22.07 | -15.73** | -20.46 | -138.1*** |
| | (25.46) | (9570.1) | (24.25) | (6.590) | (23.46) | (20.98) |
| Region | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | yes |
| Observations | 453 | 442 | 452 | 453 | 452 | 452 |
| Log-likelihood | -52.25 | -25.08 | -63.46 | -211.6 | -62.80 | -65.38 |

Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

**Table R3: Multilevel Logit Model with Random Effects by Country, 20-years postwar**

| | (1) **Officer Appointment** | (2) **Military Integration** | (3) **Civilian Control** | (4) **Civilian Access** | (5) **Legal Limits** | (6) **Discipline** |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Party fractionalization | 22.02*** | -0.746 | 5.632*** | 2.246*** | 9.476*** | 11.93*** |
| | (5.601) | (2.992) | (1.412) | (0.745) | (2.369) | (2.314) |
| Oil Exporter | -6.006* | -8.233*** | -3.351** | 0.147 | 2.630 | -13.75*** |
| | (3.187) | (1.795) | (1.333) | (0.672) | (1.856) | (2.575) |
| Log Population | 5.625*** | -0.612 | -1.376 | 0.163 | 3.001*** | 5.414*** |
| | (1.154) | (0.872) | (0.951) | (0.312) | (0.559) | (0.813) |
| Log GDP per cap | 4.945*** | 1.506 | -0.0358 | 1.746*** | -0.882 | 4.838*** |
| | (1.109) | (1.282) | (0.550) | (0.330) | (0.660) | (0.901) |
| Ethnic fractionalization | -14.47*** | 5.472 | 29.74*** | -1.989 | -7.955** | -16.95*** |
| | (5.215) | (6.406) | (5.566) | (1.754) | (3.988) | (4.711) |
| Peace agreement | 18.74*** | 6.405** | 2.096 | -0.711 | 0.686 | 0.603 |
| | (3.118) | (2.651) | (2.652) | (0.640) | (1.219) | (1.962) |
| Victory | -1.187 | 4.048* | 2.877** | -0.0186 | 1.674 | -1.542 |
| | (2.741) | (2.253) | (1.328) | (0.557) | (1.627) | (1.408) |
| War duration | -0.913*** | 0.285* | -0.0408 | 0.0301 | 0.00993 | -0.117 |
| | (0.168) | (0.154) | (0.0936) | (0.0394) | (0.118) | (0.106) |
| UN peace operation | -1.467 | -2.244 | -5.944*** | -1.417*** | -2.589* | -5.570*** |
| | (1.082) | (2.304) | (2.243) | (0.540) | (1.323) | (1.322) |
| Democracy | -3.130** | -0.483 | 9.728*** | 1.750*** | 2.627** | 4.484*** |
| | (1.539) | (2.945) | (3.462) | (0.445) | (1.032) | (1.022) |
| Militarized interstate dispute | -0.0534 | 0.000470 | -0.464 | -0.114 | -0.313 | 0.0212 |
| | (0.860) | (1.269) | (0.600) | (0.288) | (0.676) | (0.629) |
| Cold War | -8.993*** | -7.913*** | -4.049*** | 1.836*** | -8.057*** | -1.290 |
| | (2.364) | (1.768) | (1.032) | (0.544) | (2.018) | (1.113) |
| Constant | 6.098*** | 3.801*** | 4.472*** | 1.310*** | 5.490*** | 4.665*** |
| | (0.399) | (0.272) | (0.449) | (0.407) | (0.574) | (0.398) |
| Region | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | yes |
| Observations | 665 | 654 | 677 | 655 | 664 | 664 |
| Log-likelihood | -62.43 | -21.25 | -121.2 | -303.4 | -83.62 | -94.91 |

Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

**Table R4: Multilevel Logit Model with Random Effects by Country, 30-years postwar**

| | (1) Officer Appointment | (2) Military Integration | (3) Civilian Control | (4) Civilian Access | (5) Legal Limits | (6) Discipline |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Party fractionalization | 19.34*** | -1.130 | 5.448*** | 1.829*** | 9.109*** | 9.717*** |
| | (4.282) | (2.483) | (1.229) | (0.628) | (2.405) | (2.743) |
| Oil Exporter | -4.680* | -5.141*** | -3.142** | 0.0444 | 4.059** | -19.66*** |
| | (2.758) | (1.930) | (1.376) | (0.641) | (1.953) | (4.361) |
| Log Population | 4.915*** | -1.922** | -2.313*** | 0.283 | 0.836 | 6.074*** |
| | (0.898) | (0.950) | (0.873) | (0.275) | (0.677) | (0.816) |
| Log GDP per cap | 4.660*** | 1.384 | 0.313 | 1.478*** | -0.966 | 5.178*** |
| | (1.083) | (0.985) | (0.456) | (0.249) | (0.628) | (1.053) |
| Ethnic fractionalization | -12.73*** | 10.30*** | 29.35*** | -1.539 | 1.565 | -17.89*** |
| | (4.786) | (3.603) | (8.115) | (1.562) | (3.985) | (5.187) |
| Peace agreement | 17.60*** | 4.857** | 2.066 | -0.532 | 1.065 | 1.633 |
| | (2.427) | (2.335) | (3.481) | (0.577) | (1.181) | (2.601) |
| Victory | -1.010 | 4.886*** | 2.299* | 0.0641 | 2.178 | -1.149 |
| | (2.395) | (1.856) | (1.225) | (0.514) | (1.666) | (1.517) |
| War duration | -0.853*** | 0.286*** | 0.00546 | -0.000801 | 0.126 | 0.00346 |
| | (0.153) | (0.100) | (0.0858) | (0.0346) | (0.133) | (0.0971) |
| UN peace operation | -1.460 | -3.150* | -5.840*** | -1.331*** | -2.274* | -6.456*** |
| | (1.009) | (1.798) | (2.182) | (0.507) | (1.345) | (2.004) |
| Democracy | -2.953** | -1.613 | 9.488*** | 1.647*** | 1.611* | 4.448*** |
| | (1.350) | (1.923) | (3.419) | (0.415) | (0.900) | (1.184) |
| Militarized interstate dispute | -0.147 | 0.0295 | -0.670 | 0.0841 | -0.426 | -0.308 |
| | (0.826) | (1.107) | (0.567) | (0.268) | (0.650) | (0.621) |
| Cold War | -8.974*** | -7.785*** | -3.680*** | 1.044** | -9.235*** | -0.120 |
| | (2.066) | (1.763) | (0.973) | (0.422) | (2.968) | (1.144) |
| Constant | -124.8*** | -54.78 | 19.38 | -16.86*** | -10.45 | -136.4*** |
| | (17.23) | (0) | (13.81) | (4.717) | (10.65) | (17.91) |
| Region | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | yes |
| Observations | 731 | 720 | 730 | 718 | 730 | 730 |
| Log-likelihood | -63.69 | -27.82 | -132.4 | -335.9 | -90.15 | -96.98 |

Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

C. **Lagged Independent Variables**

To test for the possibility of reverse causation, the independent variables (fractionalization and oil exporter) are lagged by 2, 4, and 5 years.

**Table R5: Multilevel Logit Model with Random Effects by Country, 2-year lags**

| | (1) **Officer Appointment** | (2) **Military Integration** | (3) **Civilian Control** | (4) **Civilian Access** | (5) **Legal Limits** | (6) **Discipline** |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Party Fract. (Lagged 2-yr) | 10.18*** (3.505) | -0.312 (5.115) | 6.764*** (2.277) | 1.379 (0.908) | 14.84** (6.899) | 7.141 (7.023) |
| Oil Exporter (Lagged 2-yr) | -6.369* (3.605) | -0.895 (4.936) | -0.903 (2.255) | -2.057** (1.006) | 3.430 (3.782) | -29.32* (15.77) |
| Log Population | 2.988** (1.306) | -4.257*** (1.608) | -0.689 (0.978) | 0.558 (0.357) | 3.012** (1.281) | 10.50*** (2.319) |
| Log GDP per cap | 5.601*** (2.003) | 5.628** (2.213) | 1.408 (1.446) | 1.578*** (0.403) | -0.330 (1.470) | 8.268*** (1.891) |
| Ethnic fractionalization | -4.760 (5.800) | 18.82*** (7.200) | 24.98*** (6.994) | -2.009 (2.041) | -4.578 (7.212) | -28.28*** (8.562) |
| Peace agreement | 8.888*** (3.132) | 18.47*** (5.213) | -1.113 (2.905) | -0.683 (0.768) | 4.770 (3.819) | -1.910 (3.111) |
| Victory | -5.919** (2.469) | 15.93*** (3.905) | 1.646 (4.381) | 0.603 (0.773) | -3.749 (3.719) | -13.49*** (4.118) |
| War duration | -0.356* (0.196) | 0.949*** (0.184) | 0.153 (0.218) | -0.0258 (0.0530) | -0.0158 (0.132) | -0.400*** (0.153) |
| UN peace operation | -0.735 (2.016) | -5.085 (4.057) | -1.352 (3.198) | -0.916 (0.767) | 0.185 (3.881) | -6.627** (2.858) |
| Democracy | -0.964 (1.459) | -6.031 (4.781) | 16.31*** (3.280) | 1.938*** (0.610) | 6.026 (4.065) | 8.767*** (3.050) |
| Militarized interstate dispute | -1.251 (1.077) | 0.386 (2.435) | 0.320 (0.913) | -0.585 (0.370) | -0.0000439 (1.053) | 0.631 (1.184) |
| Cold War | -7.596*** (2.466) | -14.96*** (4.409) | -3.897 (2.664) | 1.675** (0.743) | -10.37** (4.537) | -11.15** (4.332) |
| Constant | -91.18*** (29.60) | -83.04*** (26.56) | -19.25 (16.35) | -19.36*** (6.280) | -47.95* (26.08) | -227.1*** (45.79) |
| Region | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | yes |
| Observations | 471 | 463 | 471 | 468 | 471 | 471 |
| Log-likelihood | -54.17 | -20.38 | -68.68 | -208.1 | -56.62 | -59.88 |

Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

**Table R6: Multilevel Logit Model with Random Effects by Country, 4-year lags**

*Note: the post-civil war timeframe is extended to 20 years to compensate for the reduced sample size. Since peace spells shorter than 4 years are dropped from this sample, these results should be interprented with caution.*

| | (1) **Officer Appointment** | (2) **Military Integration** | (3) **Civilian Control** | (4) **Civilian Access** | (5) **Legal Limits** | (6) **Discipline** |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Party Fract. (Lagged 4-yr) | 11.30** | -2.520 | 3.668** | 0.134 | 9.273*** | -4.257 |
| | (5.036) | (6.762) | (1.444) | (0.862) | (3.248) | (3.400) |
| Oil Exporter (Lagged 4-yr) | -11.02** | 7.845 | -1.036 | -0.807 | 8.156*** | -26.40*** |
| | (5.618) | (8.139) | (1.566) | (0.963) | (2.014) | (4.387) |
| Log Population | 4.813** | -4.899*** | -0.663 | 0.576 | 1.235 | 6.851*** |
| | (1.915) | (1.836) | (1.008) | (0.372) | (1.159) | (0.990) |
| Log GDP per cap | 2.854 | 4.991 | 0.809 | 1.635*** | -0.744 | 4.417*** |
| | (2.107) | (3.627) | (0.629) | (0.419) | (0.777) | (1.006) |
| Ethnic fractionalization | -9.291 | 9.083 | 10.98* | -3.785* | -0.710 | -17.11*** |
| | (8.410) | (8.593) | (5.741) | (2.125) | (4.431) | (5.685) |
| Peace agreement | 7.900* | 88.11 | 1.848 | -0.163 | 6.701*** | -4.550* |
| | (4.576) | . | (2.596) | (0.839) | (2.489) | (2.540) |
| Victory | -6.002 | 94.05*** | -0.823 | 0.505 | -0.236 | -14.27*** |
| | (4.772) | (3.169) | (2.039) | (0.921) | (2.365) | (3.166) |
| War duration | -0.203 | 1.256*** | -0.214 | -0.0128 | 0.249** | 0.0412 |
| | (0.366) | (0.276) | (0.134) | (0.0524) | (0.107) | (0.129) |
| UN peace operation | -1.088 | -0.953 | -4.933** | -0.708 | 6.231 | -7.703*** |
| | (2.019) | (4.041) | (2.362) | (0.975) | (4.271) | (2.220) |
| Democracy | 2.843 | -2.378 | 10.02** | 1.745*** | 15.60*** | 6.890*** |
| | (2.754) | (4.427) | (3.889) | (0.595) | (4.700) | (2.170) |
| Militarized interstate dispute | -3.182* | 0.821 | 0.579 | -0.626 | 1.594 | -1.413 |
| | (1.745) | (2.841) | (0.813) | (0.385) | (1.176) | (0.968) |
| Cold War | -4.831 | -4.517 | -4.184*** | 1.792** | -6.821*** | -5.602* |
| | (4.064) | (6.027) | (1.297) | (0.732) | (2.490) | (3.136) |
| Constant | -105.2*** | -137.0 | -4.826 | -18.33*** | -23.33 | -130.1*** |
| | (33.88) | (397.5) | (15.12) | (6.717) | (19.47) | (20.09) |
| Region | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | yes |
| Observations | 468 | 462 | 468 | 458 | 468 | 468 |
| Log-likelihood | -45.32 | -12.99 | -84.55 | -195.2 | -41.59 | -49.21 |

Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

**Table R7: Multilevel Logit Model with Random Effects by Country, 5-year lags**

*Note: the post-civil war timeframe is extended to 30 years to compensate for the reduced sample size. Since peace spells shorter than 4 years are dropped from this sample, these results should be interpreted with caution.*

| | (1) **Officer Appointment** | (2) **Military Integration** | (3) **Civilian Control** | (4) **Civilian Access** | (5) **Legal Limits** | (6) **Discipline** |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Party Fract. (Lagged 5-yr) | 16.06*** (4.156) | -0.278 (5.673) | 1.805* (1.027) | -0.559 (0.744) | 6.441* (3.870) | -0.469 (2.997) |
| Oil Exporter (Lagged 5-yr) | -2.494 (4.044) | 8.221 (7.281) | 0.946 (1.714) | -0.334 (0.901) | 6.211** (2.707) | -17.40*** (3.906) |
| Log Population | 7.542*** (1.074) | -4.037** (1.935) | -1.562 (1.077) | 0.841** (0.380) | 0.139 (2.190) | 4.553*** (0.863) |
| Log GDP per cap | 3.133* (1.651) | 4.004 (3.708) | 1.500*** (0.508) | 1.754*** (0.351) | -0.882 (1.055) | 2.196*** (0.831) |
| Ethnic fractionalization | -10.05 (7.546) | 3.726 (10.19) | 14.37** (6.271) | -4.566** (2.224) | 2.892 (7.244) | -10.51** (5.248) |
| Peace agreement | 13.27*** (3.278) | 157.7*** (4.725) | 2.325 (2.493) | 0.252 (0.940) | 6.161 (3.792) | -4.721** (2.242) |
| Victory | 1.552 (2.750) | 164.0 . | -1.335 (2.152) | 1.371 (0.949) | 0.658 (2.882) | -5.531** (2.413) |
| War duration | -0.502*** (0.176) | 0.970** (0.445) | -0.127 (0.119) | -0.00877 (0.0498) | -0.0693 (0.139) | 0.0238 (0.114) |
| UN peace operation | -1.059 (1.963) | -1.227 (4.796) | -5.771** (2.563) | -0.983 (1.104) | 5.805 (3.964) | -7.548*** (2.261) |
| Democracy | 4.848 (3.375) | -3.145 (4.696) | 12.55*** (3.218) | 1.967*** (0.688) | 17.68*** (4.419) | 7.427*** (2.368) |
| Militarized interstate dispute | -1.098 (1.302) | 0.0907 (2.532) | 0.642 (0.720) | 0.0716 (0.363) | -0.792 (1.187) | -1.870** (0.923) |
| Cold War | -5.512** (2.597) | -3.910 (4.410) | -3.468*** (1.123) | 0.666 (0.543) | -11.64*** (3.179) | -9.436*** (2.275) |
| Constant | -149.9*** (23.96) | -298.7*** (36.83) | 4.680 (17.04) | -23.53*** (6.783) | 1.228 (34.98) | -80.34*** (16.41) |
| Region | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | yes |
| Observations | 495 | 490 | 495 | 482 | 495 | 495 |
| Log-likelihood | -44.97 | -13.88 | -99.90 | -202.3 | -38.61 | -51.27 |

Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

## D. Alternative Variable Specifications

**Table R8: Multilevel Logit Model with Random Effects by Country, with Party Dominance**
*Note: party dominance should have the reverse effect (opposite sign) from party fractionalization*

| | (1) **Officer Appointment** | (2) **Military Integration** | (3) **Civilian Control** | (4) **Civilian Access** | (5) **Legal Limits** | (6) **Discipline** |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Party Dominance | -15.89*** | -0.910 | -2.949** | -2.523*** | -8.069*** | -12.19*** |
| | (3.587) | (3.090) | (1.500) | (0.884) | (2.526) | (2.905) |
| Oil Exporter | -2.884 | -8.612*** | -1.610 | 0.0444 | 1.942 | -11.36*** |
| | (3.161) | (2.052) | (1.274) | (0.673) | (2.290) | (2.779) |
| Log Population | 3.698*** | -1.743** | -1.065 | 0.0473 | 2.877** | 5.074*** |
| | (1.153) | (0.825) | (0.999) | (0.327) | (1.311) | (0.878) |
| Log GDP per cap | 4.028*** | 4.264*** | 0.558 | 1.794*** | -0.272 | 3.242*** |
| | (1.144) | (1.356) | (1.003) | (0.384) | (1.068) | (1.008) |
| Ethnic fractionalization | -7.045 | 6.219 | 28.41*** | -1.623 | 1.558 | -14.39*** |
| | (8.149) | (4.752) | (6.441) | (1.791) | (5.536) | (4.449) |
| Peace agreement | 14.30*** | 4.157 | 2.188 | -1.004 | -0.579 | -1.446 |
| | (2.757) | (2.613) | (2.996) | (0.684) | (1.510) | (3.390) |
| Victory | -3.508* | 5.544** | 5.195*** | -0.171 | 1.185 | -3.294** |
| | (1.994) | (2.306) | (1.752) | (0.553) | (1.786) | (1.458) |
| War duration | -0.723*** | 0.387*** | -0.0620 | 0.0206 | 0.0742 | -0.128 |
| | (0.148) | (0.0905) | (0.107) | (0.0425) | (0.144) | (0.0969) |
| UN peace operation | -1.487 | -2.834 | -3.625* | -1.301** | -1.342 | -5.726*** |
| | (1.021) | (2.139) | (2.180) | (0.551) | (1.447) | (1.754) |
| Democracy | -4.528*** | -1.819 | 14.23*** | 1.916*** | 7.524** | 7.517*** |
| | (1.511) | (2.567) | (4.064) | (0.515) | (3.327) | (2.413) |
| Militarized interstate dispute | -0.0582 | -0.0384 | -0.529 | 0.101 | -0.0534 | 0.417 |
| | (0.782) | (1.243) | (0.646) | (0.299) | (0.738) | (0.688) |
| Cold War | -7.880*** | -8.983*** | -6.000*** | 1.690*** | -6.877** | -3.004** |
| | (1.958) | (2.291) | (1.613) | (0.577) | (3.067) | (1.273) |
| Constant | -78.18*** | -75.32 | 1.214 | -13.34** | -38.46* | -96.93*** |
| | (20.04) | (7294.6) | (17.72) | (5.613) | (20.56) | (16.75) |
| Region | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | yes |
| Observations | 585 | 574 | 584 | 582 | 584 | 584 |
| Log-likelihood | -65.12 | -26.48 | -97.26 | -273.5 | -79.45 | -86.33 |

Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$

**Table R9: Multilevel Logit Model with Random Effects by Country, with Extended UN Peacekeeping Variable (UN_long = 1 if peacekeepers deployed for all years in a given peace spell, including after peacekeepers depart)**

| | (1) Officer Appointment | (2) Military Integration | (3) Civilian Control | (4) Civilian Access | (5) Legal Limits | (6) Discipline |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Party fractionalization | 9.546*** | -1.387 | 6.040*** | 1.244 | 7.140*** | 19.23*** |
| | (2.777) | (3.440) | (2.054) | (0.782) | (2.589) | (2.887) |
| Oil Exporter | -0.597 | -8.439*** | -3.321** | 0.103 | 2.453 | -19.23*** |
| | (2.162) | (2.620) | (1.530) | (0.644) | (1.964) | (4.277) |
| Log Population | 4.443*** | -3.496*** | -1.085 | 0.446 | 3.197*** | 8.076*** |
| | (1.036) | (1.227) | (0.942) | (0.305) | (0.791) | (1.099) |
| Log GDP per cap | 3.436*** | 7.065*** | 0.731 | 1.731*** | -0.0730 | 6.402*** |
| | (1.088) | (2.088) | (1.066) | (0.353) | (0.828) | (1.133) |
| Ethnic fractionalization | -10.49* | 5.232 | 35.07*** | -2.121 | 0.164 | -27.30*** |
| | (5.628) | (6.218) | (7.287) | (1.620) | (3.772) | (6.417) |
| Peace agreement | 9.593*** | 9.047** | 2.503 | -0.852 | -1.090 | -2.634 |
| | (1.746) | (3.591) | (3.382) | (0.607) | (1.583) | (2.808) |
| Victory | -1.458 | 8.174*** | 5.495*** | 0.171 | 1.430 | -3.903** |
| | (1.920) | (2.958) | (1.902) | (0.540) | (1.772) | (1.719) |
| War duration | -0.248** | 0.265 | -0.0933 | 0.00380 | 0.146 | -0.580*** |
| | (0.107) | (0.183) | (0.110) | (0.0394) | (0.117) | (0.127) |
| UN_Long | 0.831 | -2.005 | -1.736 | 1.194** | 2.978 | -3.328 |
| | (2.165) | (2.775) | (1.995) | (0.581) | (2.165) | (3.045) |
| Democracy | -1.809 | -5.824 | 14.99** | 2.030*** | 7.270* | 9.012*** |
| | (1.105) | (4.941) | (7.376) | (0.494) | (4.245) | (2.500) |
| Militarized interstate dispute | 0.0394 | -0.265 | -0.458 | 0.0619 | -0.0246 | 0.190 |
| | (0.706) | (1.675) | (0.691) | (0.296) | (0.724) | (0.699) |
| Cold War | -3.851** | -14.42*** | -5.894*** | 1.788*** | -5.850** | -5.211*** |
| | (1.583) | (3.145) | (1.618) | (0.556) | (2.302) | (1.578) |
| Constant | -100.3*** | -56.55 | -9.054 | -21.88*** | -55.71*** | -178.7*** |
| | (21.83) | (13572.7) | (18.24) | (5.410) | (13.52) | (22.66) |
| Region | yes | yes | yes | yes | no | yes |
| Observations | 582 | 571 | 581 | 579 | 581 | 581 |
| Log-likelihood | -61.78 | -23.46 | -94.21 | -274.3 | -77.77 | -92.25 |

Standard errors in parentheses. * $p < 0.10$, ** $p < 0.05$, *** $p < 0.01$