NORC at the UNIVERSITY of CHICAGO

NORC METHODOLOGICAL REPORT

AMERICA IN ONE ROOM, 2019

PREPARED FOR STANFORD UNIVERSITY

September 27, 2019

Client Contact: Prof. James Fishkin, Prof. Larry Diamond, Stanford University
NORC Account Manager: J. Michael Dennis | Dennis-Michael@norc.org
NORC Project Manager: Jennifer Carter | Carter-Jennifer@norc.org

AAPOR Transparency Initiative
AMERICAN ASSOCIATION FOR PUBLIC OPINION RESEARCH

STUDY INTRODUCTION

NORC at the University of Chicago is proud to have been a partner with Stanford University, By the People Productions, and Helena in the landmark America in One Room project.

NORC at the University of Chicago is an independent research institution, which specializes in delivering reliable data and rigorous analysis to guide critical programmatic, business, and policy decisions. More information about NORC as an organization is available at norc.org.

America in One Room (A1R) is a first-of-its-kind event that brings together a representative sample of over 500 American registered voters for a bipartisan discussion about the major issues of the 2020 presidential election in a context where they can evaluate both candidates and issues. It is a national experiment in democracy.

The A1R event, which occurred at the Gaylord Texan Resort on Sept 19-Sept 22, 2019 in Grapevine, Texas, was based on a model known as Deliberative Polling that measures public opinion on core issues before and after the event. The A1R event structure offers both an in-depth and representative look at American political opinion and demonstrates how public opinion can shift after structured and substantive dialogue. The five issue areas—immigration, economy, health care, environment, and foreign policy—were selected based on respondent data from a previous NORC survey that identified these topics to be the top priorities for U.S. voters in the 2020 elections.

The A1R project employs an experimental design involving treatment and control groups. The treatment in the project involves being invited to and then participating in A1R as a "delegate." The control group is not invited to nor participates in A1R.

Both treatment and control groups were administered a pre-event and post-event survey. The two surveys are designed to measure opinion and knowledge shifts that could occur in the time period elapsing between the administrations of the two surveys.

NORC'S RESPONSIBILITIES FOR THE AMERICA IN ONE ROOM PROJECT

This NORC methodology report documents the work conducted by NORC for the America in One Room project.

NORC was responsible for a number of tasks, the most vital of which was the recruitment of a representative sample of registered voters (i.e., "delegates") that participated and attended in person the A1R event in Grapevine, Texas. NORC employed a rigorous scientific process in identifying the delegates in order to assure that the study findings represent the political, cultural, and demographic diversity of the American electorate.

NORC's responsibilities included, but are not limited to the following tasks:

- Questionnaire programming, pretesting, and data collection for the pre-event and post-event online surveys for both the treatment/delegate and control groups, NORC also designed, formatted, and prepared the paper-and-pencil survey (PAPI) instrument for the post-event survey administered to the delegates.

- Recruitment, selection, and field management representative of over 500 delegates that attended the A1R event. NORC provided extensive logistical support to the delegates to assure a high turn-out/attendance rate for the invited delegates.

- Survey data file cleaning and preparation, statistical weighting, delivery, and methodological analyses for the pre-event and post-event surveys, including the PAPI survey.

- Support for A1R media and press-related activities including support for gaining the consent of delegates to participate in media interviews, the film documentary, and other activities such as ad hoc analyses and NORC expert interviews with media (such as The New York Times and 538.com and for the film documentary).

STUDY-SPECIFIC DETAILS

Study Target Population

For both the treatment and control groups, the study target population for the study consists of U.S. citizens age 18 and over who are registered to vote. This is not a general population adult population or a study of the general electorate.

A1R Survey Methodology & Sample Sizes

The A1R project employs an experimental design using treatment and control groups. The treatment in the project involved being invited to and then participating in A1R as a "delegate." The control group, also a representative sample of registered voters, was not invited to participate in A1R and therefore did not receive the treatment. The respondents in the treatment and control groups were selected using stratified random sampling from NORC's probability-based AmeriSpeak® Panel. NORC selected a nationally representative sample of registered voters from the panel, and then randomly assigned the registered voters to the treatment and control groups.

Both treatment and control groups were administered a pre-event and post-event survey. The two surveys are designed to measure opinion and knowledge shifts that could occur in the time period elapsing between the administrations of the two surveys. The pre-event survey was administered to the treatment (n=2,741 completions) and control (1,101 completions) groups between July 9, 2019 and August 5, 2019 in English and Spanish. The median survey length for completing the pre-event survey was 34 minutes. The post-event survey was administered to the control group (n=844, 76.7% follow-up rate) between September 10 and September 20, 2019. The A1R delegates completed the post-event survey on September 22, 2019 at the event itself using a self-administered paper survey. Of the 526 delegates attending A1R, 523 completed the post-event survey (99.4% completion rate).

Exhibit 1: Data Collection Parameters

	Start Date	End Date	Mode of Data Collection	Notes
Pre-Event Survey				
Treatment/Delegate	7/9/2019	8/5/2019	Online self-administered	Administered as standard AmeriSpeak survey
Controls	7/9/2019	8/5/2019	Online self-administered	Administered as standard AmeriSpeak survey
Post-Event Survey				
Treatment/Delegate	9/22/2019	9/22/2019	Paper and Pencil self-administered	Administered at A1R event
Controls	9/10/2019	9/20/2019	Online self-administered	Administered as standard AmeriSpeak survey

Exhibit 2: Interview Samples Sizes and Survey Completion Rates

Survey	No. of Sample Units Invited	No. of Survey Completions	Survey Completion Rate
Pre-Event Treatment Group	8,500	2,741	32.2%
Post-Event Treatment Group	526	523	99.4%
Pre-Event Control Group	3,720	1,101	29.6%
Post-Event Control Group	1,101	844	76.7%

Source of Registered Voter Sample for Treatment and Control Groups

The registered voter sample for the treatment and control groups was sourced from NORC's probability-based and nationally representative AmeriSpeak Panel®. Developed and funded by NORC at the University of Chicago, AmeriSpeak is the most scientifically rigorous panel solution available in the United States. Founded in 2015, NORC's AmeriSpeak business unit has conducted over 400 surveys sponsored by federal agencies, foundations, university researchers, media organizations, non-profit policy organization, and commercial concerns.

During the initial recruitment phase of the AmeriSpeak Panel, randomly selected U.S. households were sampled with a known, non-zero probability of selection from the NORC National Sample Frame and then contacted by U.S. mail, email, telephone, and by field interviewers (face-to-face). Approximately half of AmeriSpeak's 35,000 households are recruited as a result of in-person visits made by NORC field interviewers to sampled households. Recruitment is conducted in English and Spanish languages. AmeriSpeak

provides sample coverage of approximately 97% of the U.S. household population. Those excluded from the sample include people with P.O. Box-only addresses, some addresses not listed in the USPS Delivery Sequence File and some newly constructed dwellings. While most AmeriSpeak households participate in surveys by web, non-internet households can participate in AmeriSpeak surveys by telephone. Households without conventional internet access but having web access via smartphones are allowed to participate in AmeriSpeak surveys by web. Technical information is available on AmeriSpeak's research website.

Sample Selection from AmeriSpeak

Using AmeriSpeak as the probability sample source, NORC identified the delegates and controls in separate and independent processes to meet their respective requirements for targeted sample size.

The control sample was selected first under a systematic stratified random sample design to ensure a balanced sample with respect to age, gender, race/ethnicity, educational attainment, political party identification, geography, and other dimensions. After the control sample was selected, the delegate sample was identified from the rest of the sample frame using the same sample stratification procedure. The independent samples were drawn to create representative treatment and control samples that correspond to U.S registered voter population benchmarks derived from the November 2018 Current Population Survey or the 2018 General Social Survey.

- Age group (18-24, 25-49, 50+)
- Gender (2)
- Race/ethnicity (African American, Hispanic, Other)
- Census region (4)
- Rural/urban (2)
- Education (College, Other)
- Party ID (Democratic, Republican, Other)[1]

The treatment and control group samples were administered the same pre-event survey. All control group pre-event survey completions were retained for the post-event follow-up survey. All treatment group pre-event survey completions were potentially eligible for selection to the America in One Room even. NORC sub-sampled treatment group completions for selection to receive an invitation to participate in the America in One Room. The "final delegate" sample was selected from the pool of treatment pre-event survey completions who stated a willingness to be part of the event or were initially reluctant to participate. To ensure that the final delegates who participate in A1R fully represent the diversity of the registered voting population, we set a sample size quota for key subpopulations defined by age, gender, race/ethnicity, geography, educational attainment, and party identification, and LGB status.

Respondent Incentives to Reward Study Participation

NORC provided the respondent incentives for the survey completions for the pre-event and post-event surveys. By the People Productions was responsible for the disbursement of respondent incentives and expense reimbursement for the delegates attending the A1R event.

[1] Benchmarks sourced from the 2018 General Social Survey of general population adults age 18 and over.

Exhibit 3: Respondent Incentives & Reimbursement

	Post-Completion Incentive	Expense Reimbursement
Pre-Event Survey		
Treatment/Delegate	$5.00	NA
Controls	$5.00	NA
Post-Event Survey		
Treatment/Delegate	$300.00[2]	Variable
Controls	$5.00	NA

Delegate Recruitment Contacting Methodology

NORC sent an email invitation to attend A1R for those pre-event treatment cases selected for A1R. NORC Field Managers (NORC staff whose typical responsibilities are to train and supervise field interviewers for face-to-face interviewing) contacted the registered voters two days after the invitation was sent. The two-day pause gave respondents an opportunity to complete A1R registration and possibly book travel on their own. Field Managers made their first contact attempt by phone to those respondents who had not registered yet. Field Managers also sent an email and/or SMS text message. FMs waited an additional 2-3 days before attempting contact and repeated the 2-3 day cycle. The content of the email message varied with every new attempt. Respondents who completed registration on their own, but not travel booking, received a call within two days to complete travel booking. Respondents who completed registration and travel booking on their own received a call within a week to solidify engagement, clarify allowable reimbursements, and address inquiries. Final contact was made to all delegates with confirmed travel plans 7-10 days before the A1R event. Final contact consisted of a phone call followed immediately by an email or text message. If no actual contact resulted, final contact was reattempted 5 days later.

NORC employed a "concierge approach" to facilitate the participation of A1R delegates. The concierge approach involves extensive "hand holding" which was initiated with the emailed A1R study invitation and continuing through A1R registration, travel booking, and travel to the actual event. Each respondent was assigned a designated NORC Field Manager who was effectively the respondent's study "concierge" and was the respondent's first point of contact for resolving all obstacles that could prevent A1R study participation. The Field Manager concierge was focused on securing participation by establishing trust and creating some excitement about this "once-in-a-lifetime opportunity." To that end, the concierge was primarily tasked with identifying and removing barriers to participation and facilitating special accommodation requests. Once commitment was secured, the concierge helped the respondent to register and complete travel plans while on the phone with respondent. Unresolved barriers were escalated to the NORC director of the Field Managers.

[2] By the People Productions was responsible for incentive and expense reimbursement payments for the delegates.

The NORC Field director was the liaison to By the People Productions to secure request additional funds for special cases.

Statistical Weighting

NORC provided statistical weights customized for the (i) treatment/delegate group and (2) the control group. For the both the treatment group and control group weights, the base weight is the inverse of the probability of selection for the sample unit from the panel recruitment stage and then modified by the inverse of the selection probability of selection for the pre-event survey. Selection probabilities are unequal at study selection stage because of the use stratified random sampling to assure a representative sample with respect to age, gender, race/ethnicity, geography, and other factors. The next step is the correction for non-response to the pre-event and post-event surveys with respect to gender, race/ethnicity, age, educational obtainment, and ideology (liberal-conservative). The non-response adjustment is made possible by pre-collected AmeriSpeak profile data available for all AmeriSpeak panelists. The final stage of the weighting process is the application of post-stratification raking using population control totals for U.S. registered voters from the November 2018 Current Population Survey. The raking variables are gender, age, race/ethnicity, educational obtainment, Census Region, and Metro/Non-Metro Area. The final step is the scaling of the weights such that the sum of the weights equals the number of completed interviews (n=844 for controls, n=523 for treatment group delegates).

SAMPLING MARGIN OF ERROR NOTICE

For analysis of the 523 delegates completing both the pre-event and post-event surveys, the sampling margin of error for a 50% statistic is +/- 4.78 percentage points. This sampling margin of error statistic is not applicable to assessing the statistical significance of attitude changes (which need to be assessed on a question-specific basis). The design effect (which takes into account deviations from straight random sampling with a 100% response rate) is 1.24672.

For analysis of the 844 control group members completing both the pre-event and post-event surveys, the sampling margin of error for a 50% statistic is +/- 3.51 percentage points. This sampling margin of error statistic is not applicable to assessing the statistical significance of attitude changes ((which need to be assessed on a question-specific basis). The design effect (which takes into account deviations from straight random sampling with a 100% response rate) is 1.08.

In addition to sampling margin of error, the accuracy of surveys can also be affected by other sources of error such as non-coverage and measurement error.

SAMPLE REPRESENTATIVENESS OF THE TREATMENT AND CONTROL GROUP SAMPLES

The pre-event and post-event survey samples are broadly representative of registered voters, as shown on the following page where we provide a comparison of the treatment/delegate and control groups compared to U.S. Census benchmarks from the Current Population Survey (November 2018). The table presents the demographic composition of those delegate and control group members completing both the pre-event and post-event surveys. The application of statistical weights helped to reduce bias in the interviewed samples. In designing the treatment/delegate sample plan, a consideration was the oversampling of young adults and non-white segments in order to assure a diverse representation of registered voters at the A1R event.

Exhibit 4: Treatment and Control Group Demographic Comparison to Census Benchmarks for U.S. Registered Voters, Unweighted and Weighted (in %)

	Treatment "Delegates" (n=523)		Control Group (n=844)		Population Benchmark (Nov 2018 CPS)
	Unweighted	Weighted	Unweighted	Weighted	
Gender					
Male	48.4	46.6	51.5	46.6	46.6
Female	51.6	53.4	48.5	53.4	53.4
Age					
18 - 24	10.1	7.1	6.6	7.1	7.1
25 - 29	6.9	6.7	6.6	6.7	6.7
30 - 39	14.9	14.3	17.3	14.3	14.3
40 - 49	14.3	15.7	16.1	15.7	15.7
50 - 59	19.9	18.9	17.7	18.9	18.9
60 - 64	10.7	10.2	10.9	10.2	10.2
65 +	23.1	27.1	24.8	27.1	27.1
Race/Ethnicity					
Non-Hispanic White	63.9	72.8	71.8	72.8	72.8
Non-Hispanic Black	16.4	11.9	9.7	11.9	11.9
Hispanic	10.1	9.6	11.3	9.6	9.6
All Other	9.6	5.7	7.2	5.7	5.7
Education Level					
High School or Less	9.8	26.9	20.5	26.9	26.9
Some College	39.0	29.7	34.7	29.7	29.7
College Degree	51.2	43.4	44.8	43.4	43.4
Census Region					
New England	4.8	4.9	3.6	4.9	4.9
Middle Atlantic	9.0	12.5	12.1	12.5	12.5
East North Central	14.0	15.4	17.2	15.4	15.4
West North Central	8.6	7.2	6.4	7.2	7.2
South Atlantic	20.1	20.2	19.7	20.2	20.2
East South Central	5.7	5.9	3.8	5.9	5.9
West South Central	12.6	10.5	10.9	10.5	10.5
Mountain	6.9	7.7	8.4	7.7	7.7
Pacific	18.4	15.6	18.0	15.6	15.6
Metro/Non-Metro					
Non-Metro Areas	12.2	13.6	12.1	13.6	13.6
Metro Areas	87.8	86.4	87.9	86.4	86.4

Treatment and Control Groups: Political Party Identification

The treatment/delegate and control groups are substantively similar with respect to self-reported party identification. The marginal distributions are within the normal range seen in recent polling by reputable survey organizations. The delegate group is slightly less likely to be Republican, and slightly more likely to be

Democrat or Independent. However, the differences between the delegate and control groups are not statistically significant when taking into account sampling margin of error (see below).

Exhibit 5: Self-Reported Party Identification for Treatment/Delegates and Controls (Unweighted)

Party ID	**Treatment "Delegates" (n=523)**	**Control Group (n=844)**
Democrat	36.9	34.5
Republican	24.9	29.5
Independent	38.2	36.0