Identifying Delegation and Constraints in Legislative Texts: A Computational Method Applied to the European Union

Fabio Franchino, Marta Migliorati, Giovanni Pagano, Valerio Vignoli
European Union Politics

CODEBOOK
Extraction Rules for Agenda-Setting, Delegating, and Constraining Provisions in European Union Laws

Abbreviations and Labels
NER model labels: MS (Member State), CA (national competent authority), COM (European Commission), AGE (supranational agency)
Syntax: Acomp (Adjectival complement), Advmod (adverbial modifier), Ccomp (clausal complement), Dobj. (Direct object), Pobj. (Prepositional object), Subj. (Subject), Subj.pass. (Subject passive) (note: Subj. and Subj.pass. refer also to the "representative", "official" or "staff" of the institution)
Modality: I (indicative), P (permissive modals: may, can), S (strict modals: shall, must, will), Need
Form: A (affirmation), N (negation). Voice: A (active), P (passive).
Verb labels: ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT, DELEGATION, CONSTRAINT, PERMISSION, SOFT_IMPL

Table of Contents

Member States: Delegating Provisions 3
Member States: Soft Obligation Provisions 5
Member States: Constraining Provisions 6
National Competent Authorities: Delegating Provisions 8
National Competent Authorities: Soft Obligation Provisions 10
National Competent Authorities: Constraining Provisions 11
European Commission: Agenda-Setting Provisions 13
European Commission: Delegating Provisions 14
European Commission: Soft Implementation Provisions 16
European Commission: Constraining Provisions 17
Supranational Agencies: Delegating Provisions 21
Supranational Agencies: Soft Implementation Provisions 23
Supranational Agencies: Constraining Provisions 24

Member States: Delegating Provisions

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P (Need)	A (N)	A	Member States may (need not) apply Member State representatives may take part

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for MS laws/representatives as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P (Need)	A (N)	P	… may (need not) be applied by the Member States
G1_act	Pobj. of *of* Subj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P	A	A	The laws of the Member States may provide
G1_actpass	Pobj. of *of* Pobj: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P	A	P	… may be determined by the laws of the Member States

MAIN RULE: DELEGATION PERMISSION

Features: MS are passive subjects

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
DP1	Subj. pass.	DELEGATION PERMISSION	I P S	A	P	Member States are (shall/may be) entitled Member States are (may*/shall be) authorized

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for MS as a) the object of the preposition *to* or b) the direct object of active sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
D1_pobj	Pobj. of *to*	DELEGATION	I P S	A	P	…is (shall/may be) delegated to the Member States
P1_dobj	Dobj.	PERMISSION	I P S	A	A	… (may*/shall) authorize the Member States

Note: * Sentences with 'may' potentially allow for more discretion but they are also constraints because authorization is subject to a procedure or condition. They *also* empower the actors granting the authorization (this empowerment is captured by other rules).

MAIN RULE: CONSTRAINT

Features: MS are the passive subjects of negated sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1	Subj. pass.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	P	Member States are (shall/may) not (be) obliged

Derivative Rules

Derivative rule accounts for MS, their laws or rights as the direct object of active negated sentences or nothing as nominal subject

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1_dobj	Dobj.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	A	… do/may/shall not prevent the Member States
C1_actright	Pobj. of *by/of* Dobj.: measure, right	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	A	… (may/shall) not preclude the adoption by the Member States … (may/shall) not affect the measure/right of the Member States
C1_nothing	Dobj.. Subj: 'Nothing', 'No provision'	CONSTRAINT	I P S	A	A	Nothing (no provision) (shall/may) prevent(s) the Member States

EXCEPTION: NO EFFECT RULE

Features: a) root verb: have, b) direct object: no effect/impact, c) prepositional object: measure

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
NO_EFFECT	Pobj. of *by/of* Dobj.: no effect/impact + Pobj.: measure	Have	S	N	A	… shall have no effect on the laws of Member States

EXCEPTION: RIGHT RULE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RIGHT	Subj.; Acomp.: free/exempt/competent *or* Dobj.: right	Be/Have/Remain/Retain/Reserve	I P S	A	A	Member States are (shall/may be) free/exempt Member States (shall/may) remain competent Member States (shall/may) have/retain the right

EXPRESSIONS: PREJUDICE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
PREJEXPR1	Pobj. of *of* + 'without prejudice' + Pobj.: right	Any verb	n/a	n/a	n/a	without prejudice to the power(s)/right(s)/ prerogative(s) of the Member States
PREJEXPR2	'grounds' + 'public policy' + 'public security'	Any verb	n/a	n/a	n/a	grounds of public policy, public security or public health

Member States: Soft Obligation Provisions

MAIN RULES: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	SOFT_IMPL	P	N	A	Member States may not facilitate
G2	Subj.	SOFT_IMPL	S	A N	A	Member States shall (not) facilitate

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	SOFT_IMPL	P	N	P	… may not be facilitated by the Member States
G2_pass	Pobj. of *by*	SOFT_IMPL	S	A N	P	… shall (not) be facilitated by the Member States

EXCEPTION: RECOMMEND RULE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RECOMMEND	Subj. , Dobj.: opinion, recommendation	Adopt Issue Make	S	A	A	The Member States shall make a recommendation

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) opinion or recommendation as nominal subjects

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RECOMMEND_pass	Pobj. of *by* Subj.: opinion, recommendation	Adopt Issue Make	S	A	P	Recommendation (opinion) shall be made/issued by the Member States

EXPRESSION: COLLABORATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
COLLABORATION	Subj., Agent + 'in collaboration/ coordination/cooperation'	Any verb	I P S	A N	A P	Member States, in cooperation, with ESMA shall.., … shall be applied by the Member States in cooperation with

Member States: Constraining Provisions

MAIN RULES: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	P	N	A	Member States may not apply
G2	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A N	A	Member States shall (not) apply

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) MS measures as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	P	N	P	… may not be adopted by the Member States
G2_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A N	P	… shall (not) be determined by the Member States
G1_act	Pobj. of *of* Subj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	P	N	A	The laws of the Member States may not provide
G1_actpass	Pobj. of *of* Pobj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	P	N	P	… may not be determined by the laws of the Member States
G2_act	Pobj. of *of* Subj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A N	A	The laws of the Member States shall (not) determine
G2_actpass	Pobj. of *of* Pobj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A N	P	… shall (not) be determined by the laws of the Member States

MAIN RULE: DELEGATION PERMISSION

Features: MS are the subjects of passive sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
DP1	Subj. pass.	DELEGATION PERMISSION	I P S	N	P	Member States are not (shall/may not be) entitled Member States are not (shall/may not be) permitted
P2	Subj. pass.	PERMISSION	P	A	P	Member States may be authorized *

Note: * These sentences potentially allow for more discretion but they are also constraints (e.g., executive action required) because authorization is subject to a procedure or condition. They *also* empower the actors granting the authorization (this empowerment is captured by other rules).

Derivative Rules

Derivative rule accounts for MS as a) the direct object of active sentences or a) the object of the preposition *to*

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
P2_dobj	Dobj.	PERMISSION	P	A	A	… may* authorize the Member States
D1_pobj	Pobj. of *to*	DELEGATION	I P S	N	P	…is not (shall/may not be) delegated to the Member States

Note: * These sentences potentially allow for more discretion but they are also constraints (e.g., executive action required) because authorization is subject to a procedure or condition. They *also* empower the actors granting the authorization (this empowerment is captured by other rules).

MAIN RULE: CONSTRAINT

Features: MS are the passive subjects of affirmative sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1	Subj. pass.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	A	P	Member States are (shall/may be) required

EXCEPTION: NO EFFECT RULE

Features: a) root verbs: have, b) subjects: measures (measure), c) direct object: no effect/impact

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
NO_EFFECT	Pobj. of *by/of* Subj.: measure + Dobj.: no effect/impact	Have	S	N	A	The measures taken by Member States shall have no effect

EXPRESSION: CONSULTATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
CONSULTATION	Subj., Agent + 'after/in consulting/consultation', 'after having heard', 'with/in the agreement of'	Any verb	I P S	A N	A P	Member States, after consulting (in consultation with), shall

National Competent Authorities: Delegating Provisions

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P (Need)	A (N)	A	Competent authorities may (need not) apply

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for CA measures as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P (Need)	A (N)	P	… may (need not) be applied by the competent authorities
G1_act	Pobj. of *of* Subj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P	A	A	The decision of the competent authorities may provide
G1_actpass	Pobj. of *of* Pobj: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P	A	P	… may be determined by the decision of the competent authorities

MAIN RULE: DELEGATION PERMISSION

Features: CA are the subjects of passive sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
DP1	Subj. pass.	DELEGATION PERMISSION	I P S	A	P	Competent authorities are (shall/may be) entitled Competent authorities are (may*/shall be) authorized

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for CA as a) the object of the preposition *to* or b) the direct object of active sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
D1_pobj	Pobj. of *to*	DELEGATION	I P S	A	P	…is (shall/may be) granted to the competent authorities
P1_dobj	Dobj.	PERMISSION	I P S	A	P	… (may*/shall) authorize authorize the competent authorities

Note: * Sentences with 'may' potentially allow for more discretion but they are also constraints because authorization is subject to a procedure or condition. They *also* empower the actors granting the authorization (this empowerment is captured by other rules).

MAIN RULE: CONSTRAINT

Features: CA are the passive subjects of negated sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1	Subj. pass.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	P	Competent authorities are (shall/may) not (be) obliged

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for CA, their laws or rights as the direct object of active negated sentences or nothing as a nominal subject

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1_dobj	Dobj.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	A	… do/may/shall not prevent the competent authorities
C1_actright	Pobj. of *by/of* Dobj.: measure, right	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	A	… (may/shall) not preclude the adoption by the competent authorities … (may/shall) not affect the measure/right of the competent authorities
C1_nothing	Dobj.. Subj: 'Nothing', 'No provision'	CONSTRAINT	I P S	A	A	Nothing (no provision) (shall/may) prevent(s) the competent authorities

EXCEPTION: NO EFFECT RULE

Features: a) root verb: have, b) direct object: no effect/impact, c) prepositional object: measure

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
NO_EFFECT	Pobj. of *by/of* Dobj.: no effect/impact + Pobj.: measure	Have	S	N	A	… shall have no effect on the decision of the competent authorities

EXCEPTION: RIGHT RULE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RIGHT	Subj. + Acomp.: free/exempt/competent *or* Dobj.: right *or* 'personnel'	Be/Have/Remain/Retain/Reserve	I P S	A	A	Comp. authorities are (shall/may be) free/exempt Comp. authorities (shall/may) remain competent Comp. authorities (shall/may) have/retain the right Comp. authorities shall have sufficient personnel

EXPRESSION: PREJUDICE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
PREJEXPR	Pobj. of *of* + 'without prejudice' + Pobj.: right	Any verb	n/a	n/a	n/a	without prejudice to the power(s)/right(s)/ prerogative(s) of the competent authorities

National Competent Authorities: Soft Obligation Provisions

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	SOFT_IMPL	P	N	A	Competent authorities may not facilitate
G2	Subj.	SOFT_IMPL	S	A N	A	Competent authorities shall (not) facilitate

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	SOFT_IMPL	P	N	P	… may not be facilitated by the competent authorities
G2_pass	Pobj. of *by*	SOFT_IMPL	S	A N	P	… shall (not) be facilitated by the competent authorities

EXCEPTION: RECOMMEND RULE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RECOMMEND	Subj. , Dobj.: opinion, recommendation	Adopt Issue Make	S	A	A	Competent authorities shall make a recommendation

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) opinion or recommendation as nominal subjects

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RECOMMEND_pass	Pobj. of *by* Subj.: opinion, recommendation	Adopt Issue Make	S	A	P	Recommendation (opinion) shall be made/issued by the competent authorities

EXPRESSION: COLLABORATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
COLLABORATION	Subj., Agent + 'in collaboration/ coordination/cooperation'	Any verb	I P S	A N	A P	Competent authorities, in cooperation, with ESMA shall... … shall be carried out by the comp. authorities in cooperation with

National Competent Authorities: Constraining Provisions

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	P	N	A	Competent authorities may not apply
G2	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A N	A	Competent authorities shall (not) apply Representatives of the competent authorities shall (not) keep a record

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) CA measures as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	P	N	P	… may not be adopted by the competent authorities
G2_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A N	P	… shall (not) be determined by the competent authorities Controls shall be carried out by representatives of the competent authority
G1_act	Pobj. of *of* Subj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	P	N	A	The measures of the competent authorities may not provide
G1_actpass	Pobj. of *of* Pobj: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	P	N	P	… may not be determined by the measures of the competent authorities
G2_act	Pobj. of *of* Subj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A N	A	The measures of the competent authorities shall (not) determine
G2_actpass	Pobj. of *of* Pobj: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT +	S	A N	P	… shall (not) be determined by the measures of the competent authorities

MAIN RULE: DELEGATION PERMISSION

Features: CA are the subjects of passive sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
DP1	Subj. pass.	DELEGATION PERMISSION	I P S	N	P	Competent authorities are not (shall/may not be) entitled Competent authorities are not (shall/may not be) permitted
P2	Subj. pass.	PERMISSION	P	A	P	Competent authorities may be authorized *

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for CA as either a) the object of the preposition *to* or b) the direct object of active sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
D1_pobj	Pobj. of *to*	DELEGATION	I P S	N	P	…is not (shall/may not be) granted to the competent authorities
P2_dobj	Dobj.	PERMISSION	P	A	A	… may* authorize the competent authorities

Note: * These sentences potentially allow for more discretion but they are also constraints (e.g. executive action required) because authorization is subject to a procedure or condition. They *also* empower the actors granting the authorization (this empowerment is captured by other rules).

MAIN RULE: CONSTRAINT

Features: CA are the passive subjects of affirmative sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1	Subj. pass.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	A	P	Competent authorities are (shall/may be) required

EXCEPTION: SECRECY

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
SECRECY_pobj	Pobj. + 'secrecy'	Apply	S	A	A	The obligation of professional secrecy shall apply to the competent authorities

EXPRESSION: CONSULTATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
CONSULTATION	Subj., Agent + 'after/in consulting/consultation', 'after having heard', 'with/in the agreement of'	Any verb	I P S	A N	A P	Competent authorities, after consulting (in consultation with), shall

European Commission: Agenda-Setting Provisions

MAIN RULE: PROPOSE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
PROPOSE	Subj.	Propose	P S	A	A	The Commission may/shall propose

Note: It accounts also for the expression "whether to propose".

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
PROPOSE_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Propose	P S	A	P	… may/shall be proposed by the Commission

MAIN RULE: SUBMIT

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
SUBMIT	Subj. + Dobj.: proposal *or* recommendation *or* measure (Pobj.: measure)	Make* / Prepare° / Put Forward / Submit+	P S	A	A	The Commission shall make a proposal The Commission may/shall submit a proposal/recommendation The Commission may/shall prepare a decision/recommendation The Commission shall prepare a report... with any proposed measures

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
SUBMIT_pass	Pobj. of *by;* Subj.: proposal *or* recommendation *or* measure	Make* / Prepare / Put Forward / Submit	P S	A	P	A proposal/recommendation may/shall be submitted by the Commission A draft decision may/shall be prepared by the Commission

Note: * The verb 'make' is paired only with 'proposal'. 'The Commission shall make a recommendation' is a soft power, not a proposal power. 'Representative of the Commission' is excluded as a subject. If the proposal is submitted to a committee, it is a constraint, usually under the comitology procedures.

EXPRESSIONS: PROPOSAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
PROPOSAL1	Pobj. *or* Compound + Pobj.: proposal + "on the / upon the / submission by the Commission"	Any verb	n/a	n/a	n/a	on (the basis of) a proposal from/of the Commission on (the basis of) a Commission proposal
PROPOSAL2	*by* + "legislative" + Pobj.: proposal	Any verb	n/a	n/a	n/a	accompanied … by a legislative proposal
PROPOSAL3	"by a legislative proposal" or "by legislative proposals"	Any verb	n/a	n/a	n/a	by (a) legislative proposal(s)

European Commission: Delegating Provisions

The comitology rules COMIT00-22b and COMIT10-22c for constraining provisions also delegate powers to the Commission.

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT*	I P S	A	A	the Commission (may/shall) decide the Commission is (shall/may be) responsible the Commission (shall/may have) has the right

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) COM measures as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT*	I P S	A	P	… is (may/shall be) decided by the Commission
G1_act	Pobj. of *of/by*, Compound Subj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT	P	A	A	Measures of the Commission (Commission measures) may… Measures decided upon by the Commission may…
G1_actpass	Pobj. of *of/by*, Compound Pobj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT	I P S	A	P	… are (may/shall be) … by Commission decision (of the Commission) … are (may/shall be) … by the decision taken by the Commission

Note: * Only with permissive modals.

MAIN RULE: DELEGATION PERMISSION

Features: COM is the subject of passive sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
DP1	Subj. pass.	DELEGATION PERMISSION	I P S	A	P	the Commission is (may/shall be) empowered the Commission is (may* /shall be) authorized

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for COM as a) a prepositional object or b) a direct object

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
D1_pobj	Pobj. of *by/to/on*	DELEGATION	I P S	A	P	…is (may/shall be) delegated by(to/on) the Commission
P1_dobj	Dobj.	PERMISSION	I P S	A	A	… (may* / shall) allow the Commission

Note: * Sentences with 'may' potentially allow for more discretion but they are also constraints because authorization is subject to a procedure or condition. They *also* empower the actors granting the authorization (this empowerment is captured by other rules).

MAIN RULE: CONSTRAINT

Features: COM is the passive subject of negated sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1	Subj. pass.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	P	the Commission is (shall/may) not (be) required

Derivative Rules

Derivative rule accounts for a) COM or its rights are the direct objects of active negated sentences, b) the requirement of COM acts

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1_dobj	Dobj.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	A	… does/may/shall not affect/preclude the Commission
C1_actright	Pobj. of *by/of* Dobj.: measure, right	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	A	… (may/shall) not affect/preclude the measure/right of the Commission … (may/shall) not affect/preclude the measure taken by the Commission
C1_act	Pobj. of *by/of*, Dobj.:measure	CONSTRAINT	S	A	A	… shall require the written approval of the Commission

European Commission: Soft Implementation Provisions

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Provide* SOFT_IMPL	P S	A	A	The Commission may/shall facilitate

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Provide* SOFT_IMPL	P S	A	P	… may/shall be facilitated by the Commission

Note: * Includes: provide, exchange, supply.

EXCEPTION: RECOMMEND RULE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RECOMMEND	Subj. , Dobj.: opinion, recommendation	Adopt Issue Make	P S	A	A	The Commission may/shall make a recommendation

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) opinion or recommendation as nominal subjects

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RECOMMEND_pass	Pobj. of *by* Subj.: opinion, recommendation	Adopt Issue Make	P S	A	P	Recommendation (opinion) may/shall be made/issued by the Commission

EXPRESSION: COLLABORATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
COLLABORATION	Subj./Agent + 'in collaboration/ coordination/cooperation'	Any verb	I P S	A N	A P	The Commission in cooperation with ESMA shall.., … shall be … by the Commission in cooperation with

European Commission: Constraining Provisions

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P S	N	A	The Commission may/shall not apply Commission representatives may/shall not take part

Note: Negative sentences with *be* + responsible ("Commission shall not be responsible") are excluded because they are used to avoid responsibility and, therefore, should not be interpreted as constraints.

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) COM measures as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P S	N	P	… may/shall not be adopted by the Commission …may/shall not be taken by a representative of the Commission
G1_act_p	Pobj. of *of/by*, Compound Subj.: measure, recommendation, opinion	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P	N	A P	Measures of the Commission (Commission measures) may not [be] Measures decided upon by the Commission may not [be]
G1_act_s	Pobj. of *of/by*, Compound Subj.: measure, recommendation, opinion	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	S	A N	A P	Measures of the Commission (Commission measures) shall [not] [be] Measures decided upon by the Commission shall [not] [be]
G1_act_pass	Pobj. of *of/by*, Compound Pobj.: measure, recommendation, opinion	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	I P S	N	P	… are (may/shall) not (be) … by the Commission decision (of the Commission) …are (may/shall) not (be) … by the decision taken by the Commission

MAIN RULE: DELEGATION PERMISSION

Features: COM is the subject of passive sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
DP1	Subj. pass.	DELEGATION PERMISSION	I P S	N	P	the Commission is/may/shall not (be) entitled the Commission is/may/shall not (be) allowed
P2	Subj. pass.	PERMISSION	P	A	P	the Commission may be allowed *

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for COM as a) the object of the prepositions *by* or *to* or a) the direct object of active sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
D1_pobj	Pobj. of *by/to/on*	DELEGATION	I P S	N	P	…is/may/shall not (be) delegated by(to/on) the Commission
P2_dobj	Dobj.	PERMISSION	P	A	A	… may allow the Commission *

Note: * These sentences potentially allow for more discretion but they are also constraints (e.g. executive action required) because authorization is subject to a procedure or condition. They *also* empower the actors granting the authorization (this empowerment is captured by other rules).

MAIN RULE: CONSTRAINT

Features: COM is the subject of passive sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1	Subj. pass.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	A	P	the Commission is (shall/may be) required

Derivative Rule

Derivative rule accounts for a) Opinion as the direct object of active sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1_opinion	Subj., Dobj: opinion	CONSTRAINT	S	A	A	the Commission shall request an opinion

MAIN RULE: ACTIVE CONSTRAINT

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
AC1	Subj.	ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A	A	the Commission shall consult a representative of the Commission shall submit

Derivative Rule

Derivative rule accounts for the passive voice

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
AC1_pobj	Pobj. of *by*	ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A	P	… shall be consulted by the Commission … shall be submitted by a representative of the Commission

EXCEPTION: INFORMATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
INFORMATION1	Subj.; Dobj./Pobj.: information	Verb set	S	A	A	the Commission shall prepare a report

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) COM as the object of the preposition *by*

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
INFORMATION1_pobj	Pobj. of *by*; Subj.: information	Verb set	S	A	P	a report shall be prepared by the Commission

Note: Verbs set includes: conduct, draw, enter, exchange, give, hold, launch, start, submit, supply, take, prepare, present, produce, and provide.

EXCEPTION: PUBLIC

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
PUBLIC	Subj. Advmod./Ccomp: publicly/public	Make	S	A	A	the Commission shall make public (publicly available)

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for a) COM as the object of the preposition *by*

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
PUBLIC_pobj	Pobj. of *by* ; Advmod./Ccomp: publicly/public	Make	S	A	P	a report shall be made public by the Commission

EXCEPTION: REFER

Features: Commission measures as subjects or direct objects of the verbs 'refer' and 'bring' in affirmative statements and permissive modals

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
REFER	Pobj. of *by/of*, Compound Subj.: measure *or* Dobj.: measure	Refer Bring	P	A	A P	the measure of (decided upon by) the Commission may be referred ...may refer the decision of (taken by) Commission

EXPRESSIONS: COMITOLOGY

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
COMIT88-99a	Subj. *or* Dobj. Agent *or* Subj.: 'committee'	Assist	S	A	A P	The Commission shall be assisted by a committee The committee shall assist the Commission
COMIT88-99b	Subj., Subj. pass. *or* agent Pobj.: 'committee'	Any verb	S	A	A P	The Commission, assisted by a committee, shall [be] ...by the Commission assisted by a committee
COMIT00-22a	Subj. + 'accordance' + 'comitproc'	Any verb	I P S	A	A	the Commission shall/may adopt the decision in accordance with the regulatory procedure
COMIT00-22b*	'accordance' + 'comitproc'	Any verb	I P S	A	P	... may/shall be decided in accordance with the regulatory procedure
COMIT00-09	Subj., Subj. pass. *or* agent + 'subject to the advisory/ management/ regulatory/ safeguard/ examination procedure'	Any verb	I P S	A N	A P	the Commission may adopt, subject to the examination procedure, a decision

COMIT10-22a	Pobj. Subj.: right + ‘accordance’ *or* ‘subject to’ + ‘teract’	DELEGATION	I P S	A	P	Power to adopt delegated acts is conferred on the Commission subject to (in accordance with)
COMIT10-22b	Subj., Subj. pass. + ‘accordance’ + ‘teract’	Adopt DELEGATION	S	A	A P	the Commission shall adopt implementing acts in accordance with… the Commission shall be empowered to adopt delegated/ implementing acts in accordance with…
COMIT10-22c*	‘accordance’ + ‘teract’	Adopt	S	A	P	those implementing acts shall be adopted in accordance with

Note: ‘accordance’ refers to the terms ‘in accordance with’; ‘comitproc’ refers to the advisory, regulatory, management, safeguard, and examination procedures; ‘teract’ employs the ‘measure’ matcher function plus the terms ‘delegated’, ‘implementing’, and ‘technical’ as adjectival modifiers (amod) or clausal modifiers of noun (acl). * The provisions identified by these rules also delegate powers to the Commission.

EXPRESSION: CONSULTATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
CONSULTATION	Subj., Agent + ‘after/in consulting/consultation’, ‘after having heard’, ’with/in the agreement of’	Any verb	I P S	A N	A P	(by) the Commission, after consulting (in consultation with), …

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) measures of the actor as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
CONSULTATION_act	Pobj. of *of/by*./Compound + Pobj.: measure + ‘after consulting’, ‘after consultation’, ‘in consultation’…	Any verb	I P S	A	A P	measures may, after consultation of …, be suspended by a decision of the Commission

Note: The act rule is related to delegation rules G1_actpass.

Supranational Agencies: Delegating Provisions

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT*	I P S	A	A	the Agency may/shall decide Agency officials may/shall decide the Agency is (may/shall be) responsible

Note: Excluding provisions referring to organizational aspects, such as "The Agency shall have a Management Board".

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) measures (measure) of the actor as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT*	I P S	A	P	… is (may/shall be) decided by the Agency … is (may/shall be) decided by Agency officials
G1_act	Pobj. of *of/by*, Compound Subj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT	P	A	A	Measures of the Agency (Agency measures) may Measures decided upon by the Agency may
G1_actpass	Pobj. of *of/by*, Compound Pobj.: measure	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT	I P S	A	P	… are (may/shall) be … by Agency decision (of the Agency) … are (shall/may be)… by the decision taken by the Agency

Note: * Only with permissive modals.

MAIN RULE: DELEGATION PERMISSION

Features: AGE is the subject of passive sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
DP1	Subj. pass.	DELEGATION PERMISSION	I P S	A	P	the Agency is (may/shall be) empowered the Agency is (may* /shall be) authorized

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for AGE as a) a prepositional object or b) a direct object

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
D1_pobj	Pobj. of *by/to/on*	DELEGATION	I P S	A	P	…is (may/shall be) delegated by(to/on) the Agency
P1_dobj	Dobj.	PERMISSION	I P S	A	A	… (may* / shall) allow the Agency

Note: * Sentences with 'may' potentially allow for more discretion but they are also constraints because authorization is subject to a procedure or condition. They *also* empower the actors granting the authorization (this empowerment is captured by other rules).

MAIN RULE: CONSTRAINT

Features: COM is the passive subject of negated sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1	Subj. pass.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	P	the Agency is (shall/may) not (be) required

Derivative Rules

Derivative rule accounts for a) AGE or its rights are the direct objects of active negated sentences, b) the requirement of AGE acts

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1_dobj	Dobj.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	A	… does/may/shall not affect/preclude the Agency
C1_actright	Pobj. of *by/of* Dobj.: measure, right	CONSTRAINT	I P S	N	A	… (may/shall) not affect/preclude the measure/right of the Agency … (may/shall) not affect/preclude the measure taken by the Agency
C1_act	Pobj. of *by/of*, Dobj.:measure	CONSTRAINT	S	A	A	… shall require the approval of the Agency

Supranational Agencies: Soft Implementation Provisions

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Provide* SOFT_IMPL	P S	A	A	The Agency may/shall facilitate

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Provide* SOFT_IMPL	P S	A	P	… may/shall be facilitated by the Agency

Note: * Includes: provide, exchange, supply.

EXCEPTION: RECOMMEND RULE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RECOMMEND	Subj. , Dobj.: opinion, recommendation	Adopt Issue Make	P S	A	A	The Agency may/shall make a recommendation

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) opinion or recommendation as nominal subjects

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
RECOMMEND_pass	Pobj. of *by* Subj.: opinion, recommendation	Adopt Issue Make	P S	A	P	Recommendation (opinion) may/shall be made/issued by the Agency

EXPRESSION: COLLABORATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
COLLABORATION	Subj./Agent + 'in collaboration/ coordination/cooperation'	Any verb	I P S	A N	A P	EBA in cooperation with ESMA shall … … shall be … by EBA in cooperation with

Supranational Agencies: Constraining Provisions

MAIN RULE: GENERAL

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1	Subj.	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P S	N	A	The Agency may/shall not apply Agency officials may/shall not take part

Note: Negative sentences with *be* + responsible ("Agency shall not be responsible") are excluded because they are used to avoid responsibility and, therefore, should not be interpreted as constraints.

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for a) passive voice and b) COM measures as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
G1_pass	Pobj. of *by*	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P S	N	P	… may/shall not be adopted by the Agency … may/shall not be adopted by Agency officials
G1_act_p	Pobj. of *of/by* Subj.: measure, recommendation, opinion	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	P	N	A P	Measures of the Agency (Agency measures) may not [be] Measures decided upon by the Agency may not [be]
G1_act_s	Pobj. of *of/by* Subj.: measure, recommendation, opinion	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION CONSTRAINT ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	S	A N	A P	Measures of the Agency (Agency measures) shall [not] [be] Measures decided upon by the Agency shall [not] [be]
G1_act_pass	Pobj. of *of/by*, Compound Pobj.: measure, recommendation, opinion	Nonspecial DELEGATION PERMISSION ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT CONSTRAINT SOFT_IMPL	I P S	N	P	… are (may/shall) not (be) … by the Agency decision (of the Agency) …are (may/shall) not (be) … by the decision taken by the Agency

MAIN RULE: DELEGATION PERMISSION

Features: AGE is the subject of passive sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
DP1	Subj. pass.	DELEGATION PERMISSION	I P S	N	P	the Agency is/may/shall not (be) entitled the Agency is/may/shall not (be) allowed
P2	Subj. pass.	PERMISSION	P	A	P	the Agency may be allowed *

Derivative Rules

Derivative rules account for AGE as a) the object of the prepositions *by* or *to* or a) the direct object of active sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
D1_pobj	Pobj. of *by/to/on*	DELEGATION	I P S	N	P	…is/may/shall not (be) delegated by(to/on) the Agency
P2_dobj	Dobj.	PERMISSION	P	A	A	… may allow the Agency *

Note: * These sentences potentially allow for more discretion but they are also constraints (e.g. executive action required) because authorization is subject to a procedure or condition. They *also* empower the actors granting the authorization (this empowerment is captured by other rules).

MAIN RULE: CONSTRAINT

Features: AGE is the subject of passive sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1	Subj. pass.	CONSTRAINT	I P S	A	P	the Agency is (shall/may be) required

Derivative Rule

Derivative rule accounts for a) Opinion as the direct object of active sentences

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
C1_opinion	Subj., Dobj.: opinion	CONSTRAINT	S	A	A	the Agency shall request an opinion

MAIN RULE: ACTIVE CONSTRAINT

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
AC1	Subj. (be + Acomp.: accountable, open, subject)	ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT Be	I S	A	A	the Agency shall consult a representative of the Agency shall submit the Agency is (shall be) accountable

Derivative Rule

Derivative rule accounts for the passive voice

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
AC1_pobj	Pobj. of *by*	ACTIVE_CONSTRAINT	S	A	P	… shall be consulted by the Agency … shall be submitted by an official of the Agency

EXCEPTION: INFORMATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
INFORMATION1	Subj.; Dobj./Pobj.: information	Verb set	S	A	A	the Agency shall prepare a report

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) AGE as the object of the preposition *by*

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
INFORMATION1_pobj	Pobj. of *by*; Subj.: information	Verb set	S	A	P	a report shall be prepared by the Agency

Note: Verbs set includes: conduct, draw, enter, exchange, give, hold, launch, start, submit, supply, take, prepare, present, produce, and provide.

EXCEPTION: PUBLIC

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
PUBLIC	Subj. Advmod./Ccomp: publicly/public/good	Make	S	A	A	the Agency shall make public (publicly available) the Agency shall make good any damage

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) COM as the object of the preposition *by*

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
PUBLIC_pobj	Pobj. of *by* Advmod./Ccomp: publicly/public	Make	S	A	P	a report shall be made public by the Agency

EXCEPTION: REFER

Features: Agency measures as subjects or direct objects of the verbs 'refer' and 'bring' in affirmative statements and permissive modals

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
REFER	Pobj. of *by/of*, Compound Subj.: measure *or* Dobj.: measure	Refer Bring	P	A	A P	the measure of (decided upon by) the Agency may be referred ...may refer the decision of (taken by) Agency

EXCEPTION: SECRECY

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
SECRECY	Subj. + 'secrecy'	Apply	S	A	A	The Agency shall apply rules of professional secrecy

Derivative Rules

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
SECRECY_pobj	Pobj. + 'secrecy'	Apply	S	A	A	The obligation of professional secrecy shall apply to the Agency

EXPRESSION: ACCORDANCE

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
ACCORDANCE	Subj., Agent + 'accordance' *or* 'subject to'	Any verb	I P S	A	A P	the Agency shall/may adopt the decision in accordance with… ... shall be adopted by the Agency in accordance with…

Note: 'accordance' refers to the terms 'in accordance with'.

EXPRESSION: CONSULTATION

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
CONSULTATION	Subj., Agent + 'after/in consulting/consultation', 'after having heard', 'with/in the agreement of'	Any verb	I P S	A N	A P	(by) the Agency, after consulting (in consultation with), …

Derivative Rule

Derivative rules account for a) measures of the actor as subjects or agents

Label	Syntax	Verb (root)	Modality	Form	Voice	Example
CONSULTATION_act	Pobj. of *of/by*./Compound + Pobj.: measure + 'after consulting', 'after consultation', 'in consultation'…	Any verb	I P S	A	A P	measures may, after consultation of …, be suspended by a decision of the Agency

Note: The act rule is related to delegation rules G1_actpass.