Stimuli for "Are there really any dual-character concepts?"

Associated publication: Phillips, J. & Plunkett, D. (2023) "Are there really any dual character concepts?" *Philosophical Perspectives*, 37(1): 340-369.

Experiment 1

All participants rated their agreement with the member and non-member assertions on a scale from 0 ("Totally disagree") to 100 ("Totally agree").

'Cashier'

> **Original description:** Kelly works at the supermarket where she scans the items customers are buying and then if the customers are paying by cash, she takes their money and, if required, gives them the relevant amount of money back. If the customers are paying by credit card, she has them swipe their card, sign the receipt and checks to make sure the signature on the card matches the signature on the receipt. There are many others who work at the supermarket, stocking shelves, bagging groceries, etc... but Kelly does not do any of these things. Kelly has no interest in numbers or math and she finds her job to be very boring.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Kelly is a cashier.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a cashier, you would have to say that Kelly is not truly a cashier.

> **New description:** UNIQLO is a retail store that mainly sells clothing in high volume. Because UNIQLO conducts such a high volume of sales, they decided to try a new system to automate how people check out and pay. Customers approach a register which has a computer that is attached to a basket, and customers are told by the computer to place all of the clothes they want to buy in the basket. The computer system then automatically scans each piece of clothing and calculates the total price. Then the computer then asks the customers a few more questions such as whether they would like a bag, how they would like to pay, and whether they would like a receipt. Finally, it tells the customers goodbye.

- **Member assertion:** There's a sense in which the new system is a cashier.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately, when you think about what it really means to be a cashier, you would have to say that the new system is not truly a cashier.

'Catalog'

> **Original description:** Pottery Barn just released a glossy pamphlet that lists all of its products. Unfortunately, though, when customers try to look through it, they always find it extremely unhelpful. The information is presented in no discernible order, the pictures are blurry and confusing, and the descriptions don't give people any sense of how the pottery could actually be used.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which the pamphlet is a catalog.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a catalog, you would have to say that the pamphlet is not truly a catalog.

> **New description:** Ulla's mom has always told her that college is the best opportunity to find a smart and motivated husband. Ulla has always been particularly attracted to football players. The football team publishes a roster complete with photos and jersey numbers of all the players each year and distributes physical copies at each of their games. Ulla and her friends often peruse the roster at length following each game, discussing who might be a good candidate for date functions.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which the football roster is a catalog.

- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a catalog, you would have to say that the football roster is not truly a catalog.

'Second Cousin'

Original description: Harry and Janet are two American teenagers. It turns out that they are actually related. Harry's grandmother had a brother, who is Janet's grandfather. However, Harry and Janet never spend any time with each other and don't have any warm feelings for each other. In fact, they would have a little bit of difficulty picking each other out in a crowd.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Harry and Janet are second cousins.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a second cousin, you would have to say that Harry and Janet are not truly second cousins.

New description: Leanne has a large family who all live in the same town and are extremely close. In total, Leanne has 4 aunts and uncles, 9 cousins, and also Paul and Tom. Paul and Tom are the grandchildren of Leanne's grandmother's best friend, whom Leanne's grandmother refers to as her sister. Because of this, Leanne's grandmother has always told Leanne that Paul and Tom are her second cousins, even though they are not technically related by blood or marriage in any way. Everyone in Leanne's family helps each other out whenever needed, and no one ever misses a family gathering, whether it's someone's birthday or a holiday, including Paul and Tom.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Paul and Tom are Leanne's second cousins.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a second cousin, you would have to say that Paul and Tom are not truly Leanne's second cousins.

'Chair'

Original description: Dave could never support himself as a poet, so he had to make a living putting together pieces of furniture that people could use to sit on while they were eating dinner. Though he tried his best, the result was always a disaster. In fact, one customer said that the piece of furniture she purchased was the most uncomfortable, wobbly thing she had ever sat on.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which this piece of furniture is a chair.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a chair, you would have to say this piece of furniture is not truly a chair.

New description: For José's final project in art class, he built a sculpture made entirely of stuffed animals. It has four vertical legs standing straight up that support a flat surface of glued-together stuffed animals with a perpendicular back attached to it. José says that it represents the fact that the person he is today rests upon his childhood memories and experiences. Although one could technically sit on his sculpture, it is delicate, and primarily meant to be admired.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which José's sculpture is a chair.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a chair, you would have to say that José's sculpture is not truly a chair.

'Obituary'

Original description: Harry was assigned by the newspaper to write a brief notice about a politician who had recently died. But his heart wasn't in it. When people saw the notice Harry had written, they thought that it completely failed to give the reader any sense of what was really important about the politician's life.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which this notice is an obituary.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be an obituary, you would have to say that this notice is not an obituary.

New description: Harry is a writer who really loves skiing. Recently, one of his favorite mountains, called Snow King, has decided to close. With the weather getting warmer every winter, they are not getting enough snow anymore and have been losing more and more money every year. Harry is truly devastated and decides to write a heartfelt piece for the local newspaper about the life that the ski mountain has lived, what it was able to accomplish while it was alive, and to list some of the people who will miss it most.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Harry has written an obituary.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be an obituary, you would have to say that Harry did not truly write one.

'Uncle'

Original description: James is Sophie's mother's brother. However, the truth is that James doesn't spend too much time with Sophie. He never talked with her much when she was a child, and he doesn't even bother keeping up with her now that she is an adult.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which James is an uncle.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be an uncle, you would have to say that James is not truly an uncle.

New description: Dave is an only child, but is extremely close to his best friend from college, Russel. They often say that they are closer than brothers. Russel is close to all of Dave's family, and plays an important role in the lives of Dave's children. Russel makes it a point to cultivate a relationship with Dave's kids, and takes them to things like baseball games or paintball on the weekends. When Dave's kids talk about their weekends, they tell others that they spent time with their uncle, even though they know that that is not strictly true.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Russel is an uncle to Dave's kids.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be an uncle, you would have to say that Russel is not truly an uncle to Dave's kids.

'Stroller'

Original description: Friendly Child Corp. just put together a device that parents can use to wheel around their babies. But the consensus is that this is one of the worst devices of its kind. It is needlessly heavy, extremely loud, very expensive, and what is worst of all, it tends to break after only three months of use.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which this device is a stroller.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a stroller, you would have to say that this device is not truly a stroller.

New description: Catherine is the mother of three young children but is homeless. Her youngest child is too young to walk, and so when they need to go from one place to another, Catherine puts her youngest child into a small shopping cart that she modified with cushions and blankets, so her child can sleep while she pushes him around. She also keeps the stuff her child might need, such as diapers or snacks, in the bottom of the cart.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which the small shopping cart is a stroller.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a stroller, you would have to say that the small shopping cart is not truly a stroller.

'Welder'

Original description: Patrick has a job welding pieces of metal together for a small business, but he has never really gotten the hang of it. The metal he welds together always looks a little messy, and if you wait a couple of years, you will find that it sometimes ends up breaking apart.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Patrick is a welder.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a welder, you would have to say that Patrick is not truly a welder.

  New description: Sean was never formally trained on metalworking, but has come up with an unusual technique for fusing metal together into interesting sculptures. He places cast iron plates into a pottery kiln which fires at 2200°F. Because cast iron melts at 2200°F, the plates fuse together, creating one large welded cast iron structure. Other artists who use more traditional techniques for fusing metal together often make fun of Sean's approach and tell him that he needs to get some real training.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Sean is a welder.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a welder, you would have to say that Sean is not truly a welder.

'Rustling'

Original description: As Kim goes to sleep at night, she often hears the sound of animals walking over the dried leaves outside. She finds the sound to be quite pleasant. One day Bill taped the sounds and played them to her over dinner. Kim found the sound to be really quite annoying at this time.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which the sound Kim hears is a rustling sound.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a rustling sound, you would have to say that the sound that Kim heard is not truly a rustling sound.

  New description: For the last several months, Margaret has been experiencing auditory hallucinations. She recently found out that she has a small brain tumor in her temporal lobe, which is responsible for the hallucinations. Although Margaret lives on a tree-less block in Midtown Manhattan, she often hears the sound of trees rustling in the wind when she is in her apartment. She is aware that the hallucinations are not real and tries her best to tune them out, as she does with the other noise of the city that infiltrates her apartment walls.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which the sound Margaret hears is a rustling sound.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a rustling sound, you would have to say that the sound Margaret hears is not truly a rustling sound.

'Firefighter'

Original description: Jeff has a job working for the fire department, where he is supposed to rush in and put out fires in people's houses. All of his coworkers swiftly concluded, however, that he had little or no talent for this. He is clumsy, forgetful, shows bad judgment and is in terrible shape physically.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Jeff is a firefighter.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a firefighter, you would have to say that Jeff is not truly a firefighter.

  New description: While cooking dinner, Jack started a small kitchen fire on his stove top. The flames leapt high, but he acted quickly and courageously grabbed a large bucket of tap water on the flaming pan, and he managed to put the fire out without any serious damage.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Jack is a firefighter.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a firefighter, you would have to say that Jack is not truly a firefighter.

'Blog'

New description: Janice's insurance does not cover therapy, so she has started using a new online teletherapy service. Each day, Janice posts about what she has been thinking about and feeling that day. Depending on when Janice posts, she receives comments, suggestions, and questions in response to her entry from one of several therapists who monitor the server. When she logs on to the teletherapy server, Jancie sees "Janice's Corner" in bold at the top of the page, followed by all of her past entries in chronological order with the therapist's notes at the bottom of each entry. There is also a blank entry form on the right side of the page that asks, "What's going on today?" with a space to input a heading and a body of text.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Janice's webpage on the teletherapy server is a blog.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a blog, you would have to say that Janice's webpage on the teletherapy server is not truly a blog.

'Caseworker'

New description: Jan worked as a caseworker in Minnesota for 40 years before retiring 7 years ago at the age of 65. Now, she mostly spends her time gardening and doing the daily crossword puzzles. She still considers being a caseworker a core part of her identity, however, and speaks often about her time in that occupation.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Jan is a caseworker.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a caseworkThere is something non-ideal about the way in which Claire is a biologist.er, you would have to say that Jan is not truly a caseworker.

'Mechanic'

New description: Bob lives in a friendly suburban neighborhood and works at an insurance company. For his 15th birthday, Bob bought his son, Peter, an old truck that they restored together. Many of Bob's son's friends also have cars that need work. Now, Bob spends most of his weekends working in his garage with Peter and Peter's friends, teaching them basic maintenance and repair.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Bob is a mechanic.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a mechanic, you would have to say that Bob is not truly a mechanic.

'Optician'

New description: Benjamin Franklin never received any formal optometry training, and made his living primarily as a writer and newspaper editor. After struggling with failing eyesight, however, he invented the bifocal eyeglasses to ease his time spent squinting at his typewriter. Benjamin Franklin was not, strictly speaking, qualified to manufacture or sell lenses, and he only created eyeglasses for his own personal use.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Benjamin Franklin was an optician.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be an optician, you would have to say that Benjamin Franklin was not truly an optician.

'Baker'

New description: John works at a Panera in Connecticut. Each morning, the bakery items, sandwiches, soups, and salads are delivered in pre-packaged, plastic-wrapped containers by a truck that services every Panera in a 50 mile radius. Each worker that opens the café every morning is in charge of preparing a different food category so that the items are ready to serve when customers order them: one of John's coworkers places the soups in the big warming pots,

another unwraps the sandwiches and lines them up next to the oven to be heated. Before taking over the cash register each morning, John unwraps the packages of bakery items and fills large baking sheets with frozen croissants, cookies, and brownies. He places each sheet tray in the oven for the specified cook time, then arranges the freshly baked items in the bakery display case.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which John is a baker.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a baker, you would have to say that John is not truly a baker.

'Doorman'

New description: The Smiths have an enormous, loud German Shepherd named Buster. Every time someone comes to the door, Buster barks loudly and stands in front of the door. Often, Buster won't let someone past the doorway if he doesn't know or trust them.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Buster is a doorman.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a doorman, you would have to say that Buster is not truly a doorman.

'Mayor'

New description: Many years ago, Noah decided to leave his suburban neighborhood and move to a remote region of the Adirondacks. He has a large plot of land in the Cold River region, where he has a self-sustaining encampment on the banks of the river and where he fishes and hunts. He has a shelter, but not a proper house, and he tries to live in a way that respects the existing natural ecosystem of the area. Since he moved there, several more people have followed in his footsteps and set up their own encampments in proximity to Noah's; now, several families and individuals live in a similar manner along the banks of the Cold River. Noah rejects descriptions of the settlement as a "commune" and denies any responsibility for its functioning or the other people who choose to live there. Nevertheless, the general attitude among those living in the Cold River region is one of deference towards Noah. They look to him to set the tone for behavioral and cultural norms, and their actions are guided by his opinions and practices. In this way, Noah unofficially governs the loose collection of individuals that makes up this settlement.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Noah is a mayor.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a mayor, you would have to say that Noah is not truly a mayor.

'Waitress'

New description: Meg's father is 75 years old and has several health complications. Meg decided two years ago to hire a live-in nurse for him, who administers his medicine, runs errands, prepares his meals, and generally helps him with daily functioning. On Thursdays, the nurse takes her day off, and Meg spends the afternoon and evening at her father's house taking care of his needs. Each Thursday around 4pm while they watch TV, Meg asks her father what he would like to eat for dinner. After preparing what he has asked for, she sets the table and serves him his dinner. After he has finished, she clears the table and does the dishes. Meg enjoys this moment of service to her father each week, and works to provide exactly what he has asked for and to make him feel taken care of.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Meg is a waitress.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a waitress, you would have to say that Meg is not truly a waitress.

'Tailor'

New description: Johnny's right leg is shorter than his left leg by three inches. He normally takes every pair of shoes to a cobbler to add a three inch heel to the right shoe, so that he doesn't walk with a limp. However, due to the difference in length of his two legs, his right pant leg always bunches around his ankle. Normally, he either rolls up his right pant leg or cuts three inches off the cuff with a pair of scissors. Johnny recently found an old sewing machine in his grandmother's attic, however, and taught himself how to hem pant legs in order to make the right bottom cuff look a bit neater.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Johnny is a tailor.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a tailor, you would have to say that Johnny is not truly a tailor.

'Bartender'

New description: Mark works in finance. A restaurant near his apartment recently started offering cooking and bartending courses in the mornings, and Mark has spent the last several weekends going to their bartending sessions. Now, Mark's favorite time of the week is hosting Friday evening happy hour for all of his work friends. He sets up a table in the corner of his kitchen and puts all of his fancy liquors on the shelf behind him. When his friends order drinks, he tries to impress them with his new skills.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Mark is a bartender.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a bartender, you would have to say that Mark is not truly a bartender.

'Table of Contents'

New description: Laura is attempting to translate a collection of scientific essays that was originally written in Chinese into English. However, she is not particularly skilled at reading or writing in Chinese. In constructing the collection, not only did Laura mistranslate and misorder many of the section titles, she even misunderstood the book and inserted new essays that don't exist. The Table of Contents that she wrote does not at all accurately reflect what is included in the collection of essays. Further, it appears that she made several mistakes in the page numbers, so that the page numbers given in the Table of Contents do not direct the reader to the intended page in the book.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Laura has written a table of contents.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to write a table of contents, you would have to say that Laura did not truly write one.

'Biologist' (catch trial 1)

Original description: Claire is one of the greatest biologists in the world today. Her discoveries have completely revolutionized the study of evolutionary theory. However, she has little interest in anything else. In particular, she has never read a single work of literature and would never even dream of writing anything that was not directly related to biological research.

- **Member assertion:** There's a sense in which Claire is a biologist.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately, when you think about what it really means to be a biologist, you would have to say that Claire is not truly a biologist.

'Cat' (catch trial 2)

Original description: Bruce is a cat who lives in the home of an aspiring novelist. Bruce spends his days sleeping on couches, tearing up furniture and doing his best to ignore all of the visitors.

At first, some people thought that the aspiring novelist might have owned a dog. But that turns out not to be true. In fact, he actually hates dogs and would never even think of getting one.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Bruce is a cat.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a cat, you would have to say that Bruce is not truly a cat.

Experiment 2

All participants rated their agreement with the member and non-member assertions on a scale from 0 ("Totally disagree") to 100 ("Totally agree").

'Artist'

Original description: Greg makes a living by creating paintings, which then appear in art galleries and museums. However, Greg does not actually care at all about the aesthetic value or originality of the paintings he creates. His only goal is to make lots of money, and he does that by carefully keeping track of the latest fashions in the art world and putting together paintings that fit these fashions exactly.

New description: Greg makes a living by creating paintings, which then appear in art galleries and museums. However, Greg is not actually very good at art at all. He never took any classes and he initially started painting after he lost his job as a bartender. He now paints every day and does art full-time, even though he doesn't think his art is very good. He often considers switching jobs. Still, Greg continues to get more famous each year, and people often pay quite high prices for his art.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Greg is an artist.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be an artist, you would have to say that Greg is not truly an artist.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way the way in which Greg is an artist.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Greg is an artist.

'Criminal'

Original description: Fred is generally a very honest man, and he had always hoped to become a doctor. Unfortunately, though, he lives in a country ruled by an extraordinarily corrupt government, and as a result, he hasn't been able to get a decent job. Instead, he has been surviving by stealing things from nearby stores and selling them on the black market.

New description: Fred lives in a country ruled by an extraordinarily corrupt government, and as a result, he hasn't been able to get a decent job. Instead, he has been surviving by stealing things from nearby stores and selling them on the black market. However, Fred gets confused very easily and so often steals the wrong things from the wrong people. He once took all of one woman's heart medication when he was trying to steal opioids and he wasn't able to sell the heart medication for any money at all.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Fred is a criminal.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a criminal, you would have to say that Fred is not truly a criminal.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Fred is a criminal.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Fred is a criminal.

'Love'

Original description: Christie has intense feelings of attraction and affection for James, along with a strong sense of commitment. However, it turns out that Christie is a high school student

while James is already in his thirties. In addition, James is actually a callous womanizer who shares none of Christie's interests and has never had any kind of deep conversation with her.

New description: Christie has intense feelings of attraction and affection for James, along with a strong sense of commitment. However, Christie is very attractive and does modeling photoshoots while James is far from attractive and very few people find him charming. In addition, people often rudely ask James how he was able to trick Christie into being so attracted to him or having so much affection for him, when she is way out of his league.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Christie is in love.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately, when you think about what it really means to be in love, you would have to say that Christie is not truly in love.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Christie is in love.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Christie is in love.

'Minister'

Original description: Sam works at a church, where he is in charge of officiating at weddings and funerals. But Sam never shows even the slightest interest in actually helping people with their spiritual needs. His only goal is to climb his way up the church hierarchy, and he is willing to use even the most ruthless methods in his quest for this kind of success.

New description: Sam works at a church, where he is in charge of officiating at weddings and funerals. But Sam has secretly been having an affair with one of the women in the church, who is also married. Neither the woman nor Sam has ever told anyone else about the affair, and no one knows. Sam carries out every aspect of his job so dutifully in part because of the guilt he feels. He prays for more strength and his own salvation every night.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Sam is a minister.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately, when you think about what it really means to be a minister, you would have to say that Sam is not truly a minister.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Sam is a minister.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Sam is a minister.

'Mentor'

Original description: Jack was assigned to take care of one of the new employees when she first got hired, and he dutifully meets with her once a month to talk about how things have been going for her at work. However, Jack has never shown any real interest in this new employee and keeps forgetting her first name.

New description: Jack was assigned to take care of one of the new employees when she first got hired, and he dutifully meets with her once a month to talk about how things have been going for her at work. However, Jack has always worked in a different division and so he has to ask her to explain everything in a lot of detail every time she asks him for advice. Sometimes he can be helpful, but sometimes he ends up giving her advice that would make more sense for his own division.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Jack is a mentor.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately, when you think about what it really means to be a mentor, you would have to say that Jack is not truly a mentor.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Jack is a mentor.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Jack is a mentor.

'Mentor'

Original description: Jack was assigned to take care of one of the new employees when she first got hired, and he dutifully meets with her once a month to talk about how things have been

going for her at work. However, Jack has never shown any real interest in this new employee and keeps forgetting her first name.

New description: Jack was assigned to take care of one of the new employees when she first got hired, and he dutifully meets with her once a month to talk about how things have been going for her at work. However, Jack has always worked in a different division and so he has to ask her to explain everything in a lot of detail every time she asks him for advice. Sometimes he can be helpful, but sometimes he ends up giving her advice that would make more sense for his own division.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Jack is a mentor.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately, when you think about what it really means to be a mentor, you would have to say that Jack is not truly a mentor.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Jack is a mentor.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Jack is a mentor.

'Comedian'

Original description: Janet's job is to stand up on stage and tell jokes. But Janet's jokes are never funny. She doesn't spontaneously see or look for what is funny in life, nor does she have the urge to make other people laugh. She only got this job because she needed a way to pay her bills.

New description: Janet is a well-known comedic performer, who recently booked her very own, full-length Netflix special. For the special, she will stand on stage and tell jokes that she wrote into a microphone for an hour. However, everyone says that Janet is a nasty and difficult person to work with. She is highly demanding and exacting about the way things are done, and constantly yells at the people who work with her on set.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Janet is a comedian.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a comedian, you would have to say that Janet is not truly a comedian.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Janet is a comedian.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Janet is a comedian.

'Theory'

Original description: Craig thinks there is a mathematical explanation for everything, and he has put together a bunch of equations that are supposed to explain how the stock market works. But the truth is, Craig's equations don't really give people any deeper insight into why the stock market works the way it does. The equations can sometimes be helpful for solving certain practical problems that people run into when buying stocks, but when economists take a look at them, they always say that the equations leave all the more fundamental questions unanswered.

New description: Craig thinks there is a mathematical explanation for everything, and he has put together a bunch of equations that are supposed to explain how the stock market works. But the truth is, Craig's equations are so complicated that no one other than him has been able to use them. He can often predict exactly when people should buy stocks and how much money they will make, but whenever other economists take a look at them, they always say that the equations are so complex that they have to ask Craig to help explain them.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Craig's proposal is a theory.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a theory, you would have to say that Craig's proposal is not truly a theory.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Craig's proposal is a theory.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Craig's proposal is a theory.

'Boyfriend'

Original description: Luke has been living with Kristin for five years. At first, he would buy her flowers all the time and sometimes even make her breakfast in bed, but now he mostly just stays out drinking with his friends until past 3:00 am and hardly ever takes the time to ask Kristin how she is doing.

New description: Luke and Kristen have been dating for five years and are in a committed, monogamous relationship. They met in San Francisco and were living together for 2 years. However, 9 months ago Luke's job transferred him to San Diego, which is a 1.5 hour flight away from San Francisco, not counting the time to get to and from the airport. Still Kristen and Luke are committed to keeping up their long distance relationship, but they see a lot less of one another. They text often and talk on the phone, but they are only able to visit each other every other month, and don't know how they'll end up being able to live in the same place.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Luke is a boyfriend.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be an boyfriend, you would have to say that Luke is not truly a boyfriend.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Luke is a boyfriend.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Luke is a boyfriend.

'Friend'

Original description: Charlotte and Susan always spend a lot of time together, talking about each other's lives and consoling each other when problems arise. They enjoy each other's company and generally have a lot of fun together. However, it turns out that Charlotte is not a very trustworthy person. If Susan were ever in serious trouble and needed help, there is a decent chance that Charlotte might end up betraying her.

New description: Charlotte and Susan are both in their mid-20s and avid runners. Both are very active in various online running communities, forums, and social media platforms. Several years ago, they connected in one of these online groups, and began emailing and then texting extensively, first about running, then about many other parts of their lives.Charlotte and Susan have been in consistent, regular contact over the past few years through text, email, phone calls, and various online running groups, and each considers the other a valuable source of support and advice. They have never, however, met in person and aren't sure exactly what the other looks like.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Charlotte and Susan are friends.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a friend, you would have to say that Charlotte and Susan are not truly friends.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Charlotte and Susan are friends.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Charlotte and Susan are friends.

'Argument'

Original description: Jamie is a lawyer who has agreed to put together a brief for a charity. It turns out that she has almost no time, so she just throws something together as quickly as she can. She wants to give it a fancy name, so she calls it the Prospective Ulteriority Defense. It uses all the right legal language and has the right sort of form, but when the judges actually take a look at it, they feel like it provides no good reason at all to side with the charity.

New description: Matt's 8-year-old son Jamie has recently been begging for a dog. Matt told Jamie to give him good reasons why they should get a dog. In response, Jamie gave his Dad several reasons, including: "It would be fun," "I've wanted a dog for at least 3 months" , "I want to run around outside with him," and "all my friends have dogs".

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Jamie made an argument.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be an argument, you would have to say that Jamie did not truly make an argument.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Jamie made an argument.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Jamie made an argument.

'Teacher'

> **New description:** Rachel graduated from college in May, and began working at an elementary school as a kindergarten teacher in September. However, Rachel has no official training; she was a math major, but never took any of the education classes that her college offered. She also had no teaching experience prior to her first day, and came up with her own idiosyncratic method for explaining math, which involves drawing pictures that she then cuts into pieces and puts back together in different arrangements. Still, the students seem to enjoy her class, and parents reported that their children are learning, and can solve math problems as long as they can also cut up and rearrange pictures.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Rachel is a teacher.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a teacher, you would have to say that Rachel is not truly a teacher.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Rachel is a teacher.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Rachel is a teacher.

'Art museum'

> **New description:** A wealthy, childless alumnus of an elite university recently died and left most of his estate to the school, including his extensive and valuable art collection. The alumnus's only requirements were that his art collection could not be visited by more than one person per year, and that it be called "My Collection". The university agreed to these conditions and built a new building to house the art collection, called "My Collection". The collection has a full time curator, and each year, the university selects one student who is able to visit the art museum and is given a guided tour by the curator.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which "My Collection" is an art museum.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be an art museum, you would have to say that "My Collection" is an art museum.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which "My Collection" is an art museum.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which "My Collection" is an art museum.

'Poem'

> **New description:** Jenna is a very creative person who has been developing her own private language since childhood. No one else understands the language at all, but Jenna can speak and write it fluently . For her mother's birthday, Jenna decided to write a 10-line piece in verse and rhyming couplets in her made up language about how important their relationship is to Jenna. Jenna presented the piece on a small slip of paper tucked into her mother's birthday card.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Jenna wrote a poem.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to write a poem, you would have to say that Jenna did not write a poem.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Jenna wrote a poem.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Jenna wrote a poem.

'Soldier'

New description: Darryl is currently on deployment for the United States Military. Darryl receives payment and regular benefits for his work in the military, and is expected to be on deployment for another 3 months with his team. However, according to his fellow soldiers and commanding officers, he is a difficult soldier to work with. He has poor directional skills, takes criticism badly, and often picks petty fights with his fellow soldiers, which his officers say sows distrust within the squads.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Darryl is a soldier.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a soldier, you would have to say that Darryl is not a soldier.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Darryl is a soldier.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Darryl is a soldier.

'Sculpture'

New description: June is a painter. Her father is nearly 80 years old and now needs extensive health help; he is also a hoarder. June recently moved into her father's house to take care of him and begin to clear out some of the junk that clutters every inch of his house and property. While she takes many garbage bags to the dump every day, she has also taken to playing around with some of the items littering her father's yard. She often takes old tires, crates, and other materials and arranges them into interesting and dynamic configurations that stand around the property. June says she will eventually get rid of them, but they make the task of cleaning up the yard more interesting, in the meantime.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which June's creations are sculptures.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a sculpture, you would have to say that June's creations are not sculptures.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which June's creations are sculptures.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which June's creations are sculptures.

'Musician'

New description: Julia has been playing the guitar for many years. She practices for several hours a day, writes her own music, and has a large body of work on Spotify. Despite her time commitment, everyone thinks that Julie is bad at music, and no one listens to her music for enjoyment. Bizarrely, Julie's sound has a peculiar effect on animals; in particular, her music seems to calm domesticated parakeets that are otherwise quite restless in their birdcages. For this reason, countless pet stores across the country play Julie's music on a loop throughout the night to keep their birds calm, and Julie makes a decent income off the profits from these streams.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Julia is a musician.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a musician, you would have to say that Julia is not a musician.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Julia is a musician.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Julia is a musician.

'Mother'

New description: Anna had two children with her ex-husband, and is now the children's sole caretaker. Anna generally feels overwhelmed in her life. As a single mother of two and full-time employee, Anna often expresses frustration with her self-proclaimed inability to be a good mom. Normally, her children spend the afternoon playing at a friend's house while Anna is at work, and Anna picks them up and takes them home around dinner time. Usually, Anna is so exhausted at the end of the day that she just picks up takeout on the way home and turns on the TV with her

children rather than help them with homework. Anna often feels bad and tells her friends that she worries she is "no mother at all".

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Anna is a mother.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a mother, you would have to say that Anna is not a mother.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Anna is a mother.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Anna is a mother.

'Novel'

New description: Benjamin's lifelong dream has been to publish a novel. After retiring from his high-paying job two years ago, he finally put pen to paper and wrote a 200-page fictional story about a group of friends on vacation. However, every publisher that he has contacted has rejected his pitch, and told him his manuscript was practically unreadable. Benjamin decided he was too old to wait around for his dream to come true, and invested a large sum of his personal funds into getting his story self-published and listed on Amazon. Shoppers can pay $13.49 for his book, and they receive a small, plainly decorated softcover book with Benjamin's story printed inside, and a short description of the plot and Benjamin's biography on the back.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Benjamin's book is a novel.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a novel, you would have to say that Benjamin's book is not a novel.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Benjamin's book is a novel.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Benjamin's book is a novel.

'Scientist'

New description: Maria is currently in the midst of conducting a series of rigorous experiments in her basement. Maria used to be a biologist but has retried and is now an avid gardener. She currently has a nasty insect infestation that is ruining her flower beds. The Improvement Society of her town has banned her from hiring an exterminator, as they think the insects increases the biodiversity of the area. Maria, however, will let nothing stop her gardening endeavors, and she built a lab in her lab in her basement she is attempting to create a poison that will kill the insects without harming her flowers. She goes to her basement lab every day, has excellent research and safety practices, and records the results of every experiment she conducts, and if she is able to succeed, she plans on getting a patent for her new insecticide.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Maria is a scientist.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a scientsit, you would have to say that Maria is not a scientist.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Maria is a scientist.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Maria is a scientist.

'Rock music'

New description: A classic rock cover band plays at their local bar every Thursday night, in conjunction with the bar's happy hour. They play many well-known and beloved classic rock songs and consist of 5 musicians who play guitar, bass, drums, piano, and a lead singer. However, the band is not very good; they often play out of key, are unable to match each other's tempo, and the singer often forgets the words to the songs they cover. Regardless, the audience always sings along and seems to enjoy their performances, so the bar continues to allow them to play each week.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which the band plays rock music.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to play rock music, you would have to say that the band does not actually play rock music.

- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which the band plays rock music.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which the band plays rock music.

'Biologist' (catch trial 1)

> **Original description:** Claire is one of the greatest biologists in the world today. Her discoveries have completely revolutionized the study of evolutionary theory. However, she has little interest in anything else. In particular, she has never read a single work of literature and would never even dream of writing anything that was not directly related to biological research.

- **Member assertion:** There's a sense in which Claire is a biologist.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately, when you think about what it really means to be a biologist, you would have to say that Claire is not truly a biologist.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Claire is a biologist.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Claire is a biologist.

'Cat' (catch trial 2)

> **Original description:** Bruce is a cat who lives in the home of an aspiring novelist. Bruce spends his days sleeping on couches, tearing up furniture and doing his best to ignore all of the visitors. At first, some people thought that the aspiring novelist might have owned a dog. But that turns out not to be true. In fact, he actually hates dogs and would never even think of getting one.

- **Member assertion:** There is a sense in which Bruce is a cat.
- **Non-member assertion:** Ultimately when you think about what it really means to be a cat, you would have to say that Bruce is not truly a cat.
- **atypical assertion:** There is something atypical about the way in which Bruce is a cat.
- **non-ideal assertion:** There is something non-ideal about the way in which Bruce is a cat.

Experiment 3

'Artist'

> **Original description:** Greg makes a living by creating paintings, which then appear in art galleries and museums. However, Greg does not actually care at all about the aesthetic value or originality of the paintings he creates. His only goal is to make lots of money, and he does that by carefully keeping track of the latest fashions in the art world and putting together paintings that fit these fashions exactly.
>
> **Relevant criteria context:** At a cafe, a group of different kinds of artists are gossiping about other artists and someone asks whether Greg counts as an artist.
>
> **Irrelevant criteria context:** A firm of tax attorneys have just gotten a bunch of new clients, including Greg, and they need to figure out how to divide them up. Some of the attorneys specialize in small family farms, some specialize in corporate taxes, and some specialize in the tax laws that apply to artists and musicians. They are discussing which tax attorney should handle Greg's case and so need to decide if he counts as an artist.

- **Member assertion:** Greg is an artist.
- **Non-member assertion:** Greg is not an artist.

'Criminal'

> **Original description:** Fred is generally a very honest man, and he had always hoped to become a doctor. Unfortunately, though, he lives in a country ruled by an extraordinarily corrupt government, and as a result, he hasn't been able to get a decent job. Instead, he has been surviving by stealing things from nearby stores and selling them on the black market.

Relevant criteria context: In a local prison, a group of prisoners have heard that Fred is selling things on the black market, and one of the prisoners asks whether Fred is a criminal.

Irrelevant criteria context: An HR department in this country is currently considering several applicants for a job opening, including Fred. Because of legal liability, the HR department does not hire anyone with a criminal record. They are discussing Fred's application and the company lawyer asks whether anyone has checked whether Fred is a criminal.

- **Member assertion:** Fred is a criminal.
- **Non-member assertion:** Fred is not a criminal.

'Love'

Original description: Christie has intense feelings of attraction and affection for James, along with a strong sense of commitment. However, it turns out that Christie is a high school student while James is already in his thirties. In addition, James is actually a callous womanizer who shares none of Christie's interests and has never had any kind of deep conversation with her.

Relevant criteria context: Christie's family is discussing her relationship and whether she will get married to James. Her sister asks the family if they think Christie is in love.

Irrelevant criteria context: Christie's friend Maria is in high school and has a large group of girlfriends she decided to invite to her birthday party, including Christie. She wants to get each of them a party favor and has a great gift idea for her friends who are in love (a book that guides you through 25 important conversations to have with your partner), but she doesn't want to give that gift to her friends who are not in love, since it might just make them sad. Next they are considering what to give Christie, and Maria's mom asks Maria if Christie is in love.

- **Member assertion:** Christie is in love.
- **Non-member assertion:** Christie is not in love.

'Minister'

Original description: Sam works at a church, where he is in charge of officiating at weddings and funerals. But Sam never shows even the slightest interest in actually helping people with their spiritual needs. His only goal is to climb his way up the church hierarchy, and he is willing to use even the most ruthless methods in his quest for this kind of success.

Relevant criteria context: A small group of ministers who are very dedicated to their churches and the people in them meet weekly at a coffee shop to support each other and trade advice. One of the ministers brings up Sam, who is not part of their group, and a new member of the group asks whether Sam is a minster.

Irrelevant criteria context: A couple in Sam's neighborhood are getting married next week, but the minister they hired for the ceremony just cancelled. The couple is not religious and do not attend church, but they find churches beautiful and so want to get married in one. Now they are desperately looking for some other minister who can preform their wedding ceremony in a church, and an acquaintance of theirs just put them in touch with Sam. The couple is now discussing if Sam could marry them even though the wedding is next week, and a friend of theirs asks if Sam is a minister.

- **Member assertion:** Sam is a minister.
- **Non-member assertion:** Sam is not a minister.

'Mentor'

Original description: Jack was assigned to take care of one of the new employees at this company when she first got hired, and he dutifully meets with her once a month to talk about

how things have been going for her at work. However, Jack has never shown any real interest in this new employee and keeps forgetting her first name.

Relevant criteria context: Some of the younger employees are meeting to discuss their experiences with different mentors, and Jack comes up during that conversation. One of the people who just joined asks whether Jack is a mentor to a new employee.

Irrelevant criteria context: In order to be eligible for full benefits, Jack's company requires all employees above a certain seniority to be a mentor to a new employee by meeting with that employee once a month. The HR department is meeting to decide whether any of the senior employees are not benefits-eligible because they have not been a mentor over the past year, and Jack's name is next on the list of people to check. Someone asks whether Jack is a mentor to a new employee.

- **Member assertion:** Jack is a mentor.
- **Non-member assertion:** Jack is not a mentor.

'Comedian'

Original description: Janet's job is to stand up on stage and tell jokes. But Janet's jokes are never funny. She doesn't spontaneously see or look for what is funny in life, nor does she have the urge to make other people laugh. She only got this job because she needed a way to pay her bills.

Relevant criteria context: A group of young comedians are having a drink at a bar and are discussing different people they've seen preform recently. Someone mentions Janet, and then another person who has seen Janet's comedy routine, asks whether Janet is a comedian.

Irrelevant criteria context: A job counseling firm in New York City tries to make sure they have at least one person who has worked in every occupation so that they can provide a counselor who knows the challenges of each industry. Recently they realized they don't have anyone who is a comedian and so they look through past job applications to see if they can find someone to hire. They find Janet's application and are discussing hiring her, and someone who just joined asks whether Janet is a comedian.

- **Member assertion:** Janet is a comedian.
- **Non-member assertion:** Janet is not a comedian.

'Theory'

Original description: Craig thinks there is a mathematical explanation for everything, and he has put together a bunch of equations that are supposed to explain how the stock market works. But the truth is, Craig's equations don't really give people any deeper insight into why the stock market works the way it does. The equations can sometimes be helpful for solving certain practical problems that people run into when buying stocks, but when economists take a look at them, they always say that the equations leave all the more fundamental questions unanswered.

Relevant criteria context: At an economic conference with some of the most famous researchers in the field, Craig's recent proposal comes up, and one of the top economists in the room asks whether Craig's proposal is a theory.

Irrelevant criteria context: There is a small investing conference coming up that has an open call for submissions for proposals involving theoretical work on the stock market. The conference is new and so they don't have enough submissions of high quality, but they are committed to serving as a workshop for theories rather than just another meeting about empirical studies or historical trends. They are currently reviewing Craig's submission to conference and have to check if the work is theoretical, and someone on the committee asks if the proposal is a theory.

- **Member assertion:** Craig's proposal is a theory.
- **Non-member assertion:** Craig's proposal is not a theory.

'Boyfriend'

Original description: Luke has been living with Kristin for five years. At first, he would buy her flowers all the time and sometimes even make her breakfast in bed, but now he mostly just stays out drinking with his friends until past 3:00 am and hardly ever takes the time to ask Kristin how she is doing.

Relevant criteria context: One day two friends, Emily and Katie, who both moved to the city recently, decide to meet for dinner and discuss their dating lives. The conversation turns to Kristin and Luke's relationship, and Emily asks whether Luke is a boyfriend.

Irrelevant criteria context: Kristin decides to bring Luke to her college reunion and some of her old friends see Luke for the first time. Because Kristin and Luke look relatively similar and have some of the same facial features, there's some confusion about who Luke is. One of Kristin's old friends asks another mutual friend if Luke is a boyfriend.

- **Member assertion:** Luke is a boyfriend.
- **Non-member assertion:** Luke is not a boyfriend.

'Friend'

Original description: Charlotte and Susan always spend a lot of time together, talking about each other's lives and consoling each other when problems arise. They enjoy each other's company and generally have a lot of fun together. However, it turns out that Charlotte is not a very trustworthy person. If Susan were ever in serious trouble and needed help, there is a decent chance that Charlotte might end up betraying her.

Relevant criteria context: Some of Susan's best childhood friends met up at their high school reunion. They started discussing who Susan's friends are, and Charlotte's name came up. Someone who couldn't quite hear what was said asked whether Charlotte and Susan are friends.

Irrelevant criteria context: Susan recently went viral when she was recorded screaming at a group of homeless people for being lazy and in her way on the sidewalk. Because it happened in a small city, everyone was gossiping about it, and asking each other about who Susan's friends are. One afternoon, Susan's colleagues were talking about the viral video at lunch and Charlotte's name came up. Someone who couldn't quite hear what was said asked whether Charlotte and Susan are friends.

- **Member assertion:** Charlotte and Susan are friends.
- **Non-member assertion:** Charlotte and Susan are not friends.

'Argument'

Original description: Jamie is a lawyer who has agreed to put together a brief for the charity. It turns out that she has almost no time, so she just throws something together as quickly as she can. She wants to give it a fancy name, so she calls it the Prospective Ulteriority Defense. It uses all the right legal language and has the right sort of form, but when the judges actually take a look at it, they feel like it provides no good reason at all to side with the charity.

Relevant criteria context: Later, when the charity decides that they want to appeal the judges' decision, their new lawyer, Dwight, asks them whether Jamie made an argument on their behalf.

Irrelevant criteria context: The reason Jamie agreed put the legal brief together for the charity at the last minute is that the charity needed a lawyer to offer an argument in court so that even if judges do not rule in their favor, they can still appeal the decision and buy themselves time to build a more solid legal defense. If the charity doesn't offer some kind of argument, they won't be able to appeal. Later, when the charity decides that they want to appeal the judges' decision, their new lawyer, Dwight, double checks with them to make sure Jamie made an argument on their behalf.

- **Member assertion:** Jamie made an argument.
- **Non-member assertion:** Jamie did not make an argument.

'Biologist' (catch trial 1)

Original description: Claire is one of the greatest biologists in the world today. Her discoveries have completely revolutionized the study of evolutionary theory. However, she has little interest in anything else. In particular, she has never read a single work of literature and would never even dream of writing anything that was not directly related to biological research.

Conversational context: A group of scientists are discussing which discipline Claire belongs to, and someone asks whether Claire is a biologist.

- **Member assertion:** Claire is a biologist.
- **Non-member assertion:** Claire is not a biologist.

'Cat' (catch trial 2)

Original description: Bruce is a cat who lives in the home of an aspiring novelist. Bruce spends his days sleeping on couches, tearing up furniture and doing his best to ignore all of the visitors. At first, some people thought that the aspiring novelist might have owned a dog. But that turns out not to be true. In fact, he actually hates dogs and would never even think of getting one.

Conversational context: Some of the novelist's friends are discussing the pets they know, and one of the people in the conversation brings up Bruce. Another friend asks whether Bruce is a cat.

- **Member assertion:** Bruce is a cat.
- **Non-member assertion:** Bruce is not a cat.