Response to "Shirking in the Contemporary Congress: A Reappraisal": Appendix

Lawrence S. Rothenberg
Department of Management and Strategy
Kellogg School of Management
Northwestern University
lawrence-rothenberg@kellogg.northwestern.edu

Mitchell S. Sanders
Department of Political Science
University of Notre Dame
msander1@nd.edu

In our response to Carson et al. we mention that using W-NOMINATE scores calculated only from 4th quarter votes provides evidence of shirking even with fixed effects (endnote 1). This note provides information supporting this assertion.

Specifically, our original analysis, which is critiqued by Carson et al., utilized an ideological scale combining members' roll call voting behavior in the 4th quarter of each Congress with the W-NOMINATE spatial positions of the roll call alternatives. A logical alternative is to employ W-NOMINATE scores calculated only from 4th quarter votes—while estimates may be less precise given the use of less data, only data from the period under investigation is utilized.

When our analysis is rerun using this measure, we find evidence of shirking even with fixed effects (Table 1). As the results for Model 1 show, the coefficient on *Retiring* is statistically significant, though that on *Pursuing Statewide Office* is not. Furthermore, the fact that the coefficients on *Retiring* and *Pursuing Statewide Office* are not statistically distinguishable ($F_{1,985}$=1.38, p=0.24) suggests that we should combine the two types of exit. When we use a variable, *Exiting*, equal to zero for members who are running for reelection and one for members who are not, it also achieves statistical significance (Model 2).

In short, despite the assertion to the contrary, substantively significant evidence of shirking behavior by exiting members of Congress does exist.

Table 1:
Determinants of Ideological Shirking with Alternative Ideological Change Measure
(Fixed effects estimates with standard errors in parentheses)

Variable	Model 1	Model 2
Constant	0.132**	0.132**
	(0.017)	(0.017)
Retiring	0.040*	–
	(0.018)	
Pursuing Statewide Office	0.019	–
	(0.023)	
Exiting	–	0.036*
		(0.018)
District Political Change	0.025	0.018
	(0.128)	(0.128)
Electoral Slack	0.024	0.024
	(0.022)	(0.022)
Seniority	0.000	0.000
	(0.000)	(0.000)
102nd Congress	-0.067**	-0.067**
	(0.008)	(0.008)
103rd Congress	-0.043**	-0.044**
	(0.007)	(0.007)
N	993	993
R^2	0.09	0.09

* p<.05, one-tailed ** p<.05, two-tailed