NATCOOP Field Trip 2 -- Tanzania

Experimental Instructions

Introduction

- Welcome, and thank you all for participating in our survey.
- The meeting will take about 2 hours with a break in between.
- We ask you to use a tablet to answer questions and take decisions.
- Your decisions will have financial consequences: You can earn money. How much you earn will depend on your own decisions and may therefore be different for each of you. Note that you cannot lose money.
- Your answers on the tablet are fully anonymous. We only see which page you are currently on. We ask you to sign a consent form and give us your contact information for repeated contact. Taking part is voluntary and you can leave at any time. You will receive the money you have earned in cash at the end of the session.

Why is this important and what is the role of fishers?

- This survey is part of a larger project on fishermen behavior. This is the second visit.
- We work with fishers because they have something important to say. You are out on the water every day and know about the challenges to catch fish in an ever-changing environment.

Consent Forms ***[Distribute blue folders to all participants.]***

You find the consent forms in the blue folders and we go through them together. We ask you to sign these forms, and we will collect them afterwards.

[Go through forms, give option to ask question and to leave, collect consent forms.]

General Instructions

[Team hands out tablets according to the folder numbers (and ask participants to sit in order of the number denoted on the tablets/folders.)]

- Now that you all have a tablet in hand, we explain the survey to you.
- Put these shields around your tablet so that no one sees what you decide.
- You are not allowed to talk to others.
- Should you have a question, please raise your hand and we will come and help you.
- The session has several parts, before each part we will explain how it works.
- **Every page has a "next" button. Please only hit the "next" button when I give you a sign.**
- The decisions you make will have financial consequences. In each of the decision situations, you can earn points. The points you earned will be exchanged to Tanzania-Schilling (TZS) at the end of the session. One point is worth **250** TZS.
- On the first screen, you will learn about two types of actions you are asked to take on the tablet. Please select the button with the ***blue person*** so that you see a small point below

the picture. And type in the number ***20*** in the field below. Then submit your answer with the "next" button.

Rule Explanation and Comprehension

- We are now starting with the first situation. Please take a look at this poster. ***[Team member shows poster]***
- There are always three participants that form a group. Group members are randomly matched such that no one will know who they are matched with, neither during nor after the decision.
- Each group has a group account.
- ***[Team member plays this out]*** In the beginning, each group member has an endowment of 4 points.
- Each group member has to either put the points into the group account or put them in her private account.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the group account, then the points in the group account are increased to 6 and split equally among all group members. This means every group member gets 2 points.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the private account, this means that only this group member receives 4 points into her private account.
- The decision is private and no one knows what the other group member have decided.
- Notice that this will potentially result in different payoffs:
- ***[Go through the following scenarios with help of marbles:]***
  - *Imagine that group member A puts the 4 points in the group account, while group members B and C each put them in the private account. Then one member has put 4 points to the group account, the points in the group account are increased to 6 and split equally among all group members. This means that every group member receives 2 points into her private account. You see the situation on your screen. The first person is member A, the second is member B and the third is member C. How much will the blue person in this situation earn in total? Please enter your answer in the tablet and hit "next". If your answer is incorrect, please try again. What is the correct answer? The blue person has put the points to the private account and receives 2 points from the group account. So she earns a total of 6 points. Note that member A, who has put the points in the group account will earn a total of 2 points. Please hit "next".*
  - *Imagine all three group members put the points in the private account. Then, there will be zero points in the group account. You see the situation on your screen. The first person is member A, the second is member B and the third is member C. How much will the blue person in this situation earn in total? Please enter your answer in the tablet and hit "next". If your answer is incorrect, please try again. What is the correct answer? The blue person will earn the 4 points that she put in her private account. Please hit "next".*
  - *Imagine all 3 group members choose to put the points in the group account. Then there are 12 points in the group account, the points in the group account are increased to 18 and split equally among all group members. This means that every group member*

receives 6 points into her private account. You see the situation on your screen. The first person is member A, the second is member B and the third is member C. How much will the blue person in this situation earn in total? Please enter your answer in the tablet and hit "next". If your answer is incorrect, please try again. What is the correct answer? The blue person will earn 6 points from the group account. Please hit "next".

- *Imagine that group member A puts the 4 points in her private account, while group members B and C put their 4 points in the group account. Then there are 8 points in the group account, the points in the group account are increased to 12 and split equally among all group members. This means that every group member receives 4 points into her private account. You see the situation on your screen. The first person is member A, the second is member B and the third is member C. How much will the blue person in this situation earn in total? Please enter your answer in the tablet and hit "next". If your answer is incorrect, please try again. What is the correct answer? The blue person will earn 4 points from the group account. Note that member C will earn a total of 8 points. Please hit "next".*

- Is the situation clear? Recall that in this situation, it is only possible to either put the 4 points to the private account or to put them in the group account. Please hit next?

• Social information message (high): In a previous survey, it was found that many participants chose to put the points to the group account and not put them to the private account.
• Social information message (low): In a previous survey, it was found that many participants chose to put the points in their private account and not put them to the group account.

Belief Elicitation

- Now we ask you to answer three questions about this situation:
  1. First, what do you think one ought to do? This is about what you personally believe is the morally right thing to do. No one will see what you have chosen.
     [Illustrate the different choices with the help of pictorial posters and ask them to make a decision.]
     - Put the points to the group account.
     - Put the points in the private account.
     - Do what the others do. This means that you think one ought to put the points in the group account when the others do so, and one ought to put the points in the private account when the others put the points in the private account, too.
       After your decision, please hit "next".
  2. Second, what do you guess most people in this session think one ought to do? This is <u>not</u> about your personal belief but about what you think the others believe is the right thing to do.
     You will get 1 additional point if you guess correctly what most participants have selected, so think carefully.

[Illustrate the different choices with the help of pictorial posters and ask them to make a decision.]

- Put the points to the group account.
- Put the points in the private account.
- Do what the others do.

After your decision, please hit "next".

• Social information message (high): In a previous survey, it was found that many participants chose to put the points to the group account and not put them to the private account.
• Social information message (low): In a previous survey, it was found that many participants chose to put the points in their private account and not put them to the group account.

3. Third, what do you guess most people in this session would actually do?
   You will get 1 additional point if your guess is correct, so think carefully. After your decision, please hit "next".
   - Put the points to the group account.
   - Put the points in the private account.

Please note that whether your guess is correct will only be revealed at the end of the meeting before the final payout.

Contribution in one-shot social dilemma with feedback [low-F and hi-F]

- Now we get to the next stage, where we ask you to make a decision yourself. Please listen to the instructions first, we will then give you the code to proceed with the next stage.
- Remember, you will be paired with 2 other participants from this session. You will never know who your group members are, nor will they.
- After all group members made their decisions, there is a bonus stage, where each group member can get a bonus of 1 point.
- However, you have the possibility to exclude group members from the bonus. There are three options to exclude members:
  [show participants the three options on poster]
  1. You can vote to exclude group members who decided to put their points in the group account.
  2. You can vote to exclude group members who decided to put their points in the private account.
  3. You can vote to not exclude any group members.
- The option that gets at least two votes will be implemented. If no option gets two votes, no one will be excluded from the bonus.
- At the end of each round, you learn about the decisions of the group members, about the voting result and also about how many points you earned.

Contribution

- Now you will make a decision.
- Each group member (that is, you and the other 2 members of your group) has 4 points. You can decide to put the points in the group account or put them in the private account.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the group account, then the points in the group account are increased to 6 and split equally among all group members. This means every group member gets 2 points.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the private account, this means that only this group member receives 4 points into her private account.
- Remember that earned points will be exchanged to Tanzania-Schilling (TZS) at the end of the session. One point is worth **250** TZS and this situation will be payed out.

To make your decision, please enter the code 1234 into the tablet and hit "next".

- What is your decision:
  - Put the points in the group account.
  - Put the points in the private account.

Feedback

- Now, there is a possible bonus of 1 point available for each member in your group.
- However, you have the possibility to exclude group members from the bonus.
- You can vote for who should be excluded from receiving the bonus.
- The option that gets at least two votes will be executed. If no option gets two votes, no one will be excluded from the bonus.
- ***[Show Poster with exclusion possibilities.]***

To make your decision, please enter the code 9876 into the tablet and hit "next".

- What do you vote for:
  1. Exclude group members who decided to put their points in the group account.
  2. Exclude group members who decided to put their points in the private account.
  3. Not exclude any group members.

- Thank you for completing all stages of this situation.
- You will now be able to see on your tablet the voting result and who was excluded from the bonus. ***[Use poster to explain what participants see.]***

Contribution in one-shot social dilemma without feedback [low-noF and hi-noF]

- Now we get to the next stage, where we ask you to make a decision yourself.
- Remember, you will be paired with 2 other participants from this session. You will never know who your group members are, nor will they.

Contribution

- Each group member (that is, you and the other 2 members of your group) has 4 points. You can decide to put the points in the group account or put them in the private account.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the group account, then the points in the group account are increased to 6 and split equally among all group members. This means every group member gets 2 points.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the private account, this means that only this group member receives 4 points into her private account.
- Remember that earned points will be exchanged to Tanzania-Schilling (TZS) at the end of the session. One point is worth **250** TZS and this situation will be paid out.
- What is your decision:
    1. Put the points in the group account.
    2. Put the points in the private account.

To make your decision, please enter the code 1234 into the tablet and hit "next".

- Thank you for completing all stages of this situation.
- You will now be able to see on your tablet the total points earned for this situation.

Repeated social dilemma with feedback [low-F and hi-F]

- We will now repeat the same situation for 6 rounds. At the end, we will throw a dice to select which of these 6 rounds is being paid out. Thus, each round is equally important for your earnings. Remember that one point is exchanged to 250 TZS in cash.
- Please listen to the instructions first, we will then give you the code to proceed with the next stage.
- Before each round, you will be matched with 2 other participants from this session that have never been in your group before and will not be in your group again.
- Each round you have an endowment of 4 points and must decide whether to put the points in the group account or put the points in the private account.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the group account, then the points in the group account are increased to 6 and split equally among all group members. This means every group member gets 2 points.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the private account, this means that only this group member receives 4 points into her private account.
- At the beginning of each round, you will be asked about your guess what most people will actually do in this round? You will get 1 additional point if your guess is correct.
- Then, you will decide whether you want to put the points in the group account or put them in the private account.
- After all group members made their decisions, there is a bonus stage, where each group member can get a bonus of 1 point.
- However, you have the possibility to exclude group members from the bonus. There are three options to exclude members:

1. You can vote to exclude group members who decided to put their points in the group account.
2. You can vote to exclude group members who decided to put their points in the private account.
3. You can vote to not exclude any group members.

- The option that gets at least two votes will be implemented. If no option gets two votes, no one will be excluded from the bonus.
- At the end of each round, you learn about the decisions of the group members, about the voting result and also about how many points you earned.
- Let's start with the 6 repeated rounds. Please always hit "next" until the next code.

To start with the repeated rounds, please enter the code 2468 into the tablet and hit "next".

Repeated social dilemma without feedback [low-noF and hi-noF]

- We will now repeat the same situation for 6 rounds. At the end, we will throw a dice to select which of these 6 rounds is being paid out. Thus, each round is equally important for your earnings. Remember that one point is exchanged to 250 TZS in cash.
- Please listen to the instructions first, we will then give you the code to proceed with the next stage.
- Before each round, you will be matched with 2 other participants from this session that have never been in your group before and will not be in your group again.
- Each round you have an endowment of 4 points and must decide whether to put the points in the group account or put the points in the private account.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the group account, then the points in the group account are increased to 6 and split equally among all group members. This means every group member gets 2 points.
- If a group member puts the 4 points to the private account, this means that only this group member receives 4 points into her private account.
- At the beginning of each round, you will be asked about your guess what most people in this session will actually do? You will get 1 additional point if your guess is correct.
- Then, you will decide whether you want to put the points in the group account or put them in the private account.
- Let's start with the 6 repeated rounds. Please always hit "next" until the next code.

To start with the repeated rounds, please enter the code 2468 into the tablet and hit "next".