Chapter 4 Methodological Appendix

Table A4.1 provides descriptive statistics for the variables included in the models presented in chapter 4.

Table A4.1: Descriptive Statistics for Included Variables

Variables	Mean	Std. Dev.	Min	Max
Dependent Variable	1.3	1.43	0	3
Judicial Policy Preferences				
Asylum Liberalism (+)	1.344	0.97	0.11	4.08
Applicant Characteristics				
Log of Trade with US (-)	8.92	2.91	-0.33	13.26
US Military Aid (-)	0.85	0.36	0	1
Top Ten Illegal Immigration (-)	0.24	0.43	0	1
World Bank Development Class (+)	0.91	0.68	0	3
Democracy (Polity) (-)	1.19	0.82	0	2
Human Rights Abuse (PTS-St. Dept.) (+)	3.46	0.71	1	5
Economic Threat				
MSA Unemployment (-)	5.48	1.86	2.2	16.9
Immig. Employment Ratio (+)	0.064	0.006	0.047	0.095
Contact/Threat				
Percent Pop. Foreign Born (+/-)	0.25	0.10	0.04	0.38
Diaspora Community (+/-)	0.27	0.45	0	1
Politicized Places				
Nat'l Immig. Salience (~)	26	14	5	66
Change in % Foreign Born (~)	0.08	0.06	-0.07	0.34
Nat'l Immig. Salience * Change in % Foreign Born (-)	2.14	2.00	-4.36	22.374
Interactions				
MSA Unemply. * Aslyum Liberalism	7.42	6.24	0.28	48.16
Immig. Employ. Ratio * Asylum Liberalism	0.09	0.06	0.01	0.28
Percent Pop. Foreign Born * Asylum Liberalism	0.35	0.30	0.01	1.36
Diaspora Comm. * Asylum Liberalism	0.46	0.96	0.00	4.08
Immig. Salience * Asylum Liberalism	35.94	34.91	0.54	268.99
Change % Forgn Born * Asylum Liberalism	0.11	0.10	-0.19	0.71
Immig. Salience * Chng. % Foreign Born * Asylum Lib.	2.82	3.31	-4.68	42.12
Controls				
Gender (+)	0.38	0.49	0	1
Legal Represenation (+)	0.92	0.68	0	1
English Speaker (+)	0.12	0.32	0	1
Arabic Speaker (+/-)	0.02	0.15	0	1
Detention Status (-)	0.32	0.62	0	2
Affirmative Application (+)	0.61	0.49	0	1
Democratic Admin. (+)	0.15	0.36	0	1
MSA Democratic Vote (+)	55.19	8.42	28.09	76.47
Registered NGOs (+)	37	33	2	113

Table A4.2 provides a side-by-side comparison of the two stereotype logit models that we use in Chapter 4. One included parameter estimates and standard errors clustered by IJ and one provides them clustered by MSA. Obviously the coefficients from the two models are identical and so we focus here on the standard errors. The standard errors in the model with clusters based

on MSAs are higher as we would expect given the smaller number of clusters available (32 versus 271). Nevertheless, the choice of clustering makes little difference for inference with a few exceptions. First, the t-statistic for World Bank classification in the judge-clustered model is 4.6 but in the MSA clustered model the t-statistic is 1.8. This is a large difference, although even at the lower bound of 1.8 World Bank classification approaches conventional levels of statistical significance. A similar story emerges for diaspora communities, which experience a somewhat less dramatic difference between the two models. In the judge-clustered model the t-statistic is 2.5 whereas in the MSA-clustered model the t-statistic is 1.8, again close to conventional levels of significance. Finally, there is a large change for the English language control variable, which has a t-statistic of 2.4 in the judge-clustered model but just a 1.4 in the MSA-clustered data. This is a difference that suggests that inferences about the effect of English language are sensitive to the choice of clustering and so our inference about this variable's effect on IJ decision making is tenuous, but its effect is small (about a 2 percentage point difference) and so we are, again, not overly concerned about this difference.

Table A4.2: Model Parameters

Variables	Clustered by Judge	Clustered by MSA
Judicial Policy Preferences		
Asylum Liberalism (+)	-0.06 (1.02)	-0.06 (1.27)
Applicant Characteristics		
Log of Trade with US (-)	-0.12 (.01)	-0.12 (.02)
US Military Aid (-)	-0.05 (.04)	-0.05 (.07)
Top Ten Illegal Immigration (-)	-1.16 (.07)	-1.16 (.18)
World Bank Development Class (+)	0.14 (.03)	0.14 (.08)
Democracy (Polity) (-)	-0.43 (.04)	-0.44 (.06)
Human Rights Abuse (PTS-St. Dept.) (+)	0.27 (.03)	0.27 (.09)
Economic Threat		
MSA Unemployment (-)	0.02 (.03)	0.02 (.06)
Immig. Employment Ratio (+)	20.33 (17.69)	20.33 (23.49)
Contact/Threat		
Percent Pop. Foreign Born (+/-)	-1.92 (1.47)	-1.92 (1.49)
Diaspora Community (+/-)	0.30 (.13)	0.30 (.18)
Politicized Places		
Nat'l Immig. Salience (~)	0.009 (.003)	0.009 (.003)
Change in % Foreign Born (~)	-0.91 (2.87)	-0.91 (3.38)
Nat'l Immig. Salience * Change in % Foreign Born (-)	-0.07 (.03)	-0.07 (.02)
Interactions		
MSA Unemply. * Aslyum Liberalism	-0.03 (.01)	-0.03 (.01)
Immig. Employ. Ratio * Asylum Liberalism	9.22 (17.69)	9.22 (16.84)
Percent Pop. Foreign Born * Asylum Liberalism	-0.77 (1.28)	-0.77 (0.97)
Diaspora Comm. * Asylum Liberalism	-0.08 (.06)	-0.08 (.04)
Immig. Salience * Asylum Liberalism	-0.005 (.002)	-0.005 (.001)
Change % Forgn Born * Asylum Liberalism	-0.07 (2.74)	-0.07 (2.66)
Immig. Salience * Chng. % Foreign Born * Asylum Lib.	0.08 (.03)	0.08 (.02)
Controls		
Gender (+)	0.27 (.15)	0.27 (.19)
Legal Represenation (+)	0.77 (.07)	0.77 (.12)
English Speaker (+)	0.16 (.06)	0.16 (.12)
Arabic Speaker (+/-)	0.06 (.09)	0.06 (.13)
Detention Status (-)	-0.34 (.06)	-0.34 (.09)
Affirmative Application (+)	0.43 (.04)	0.43 (.09)
Democratic Admin. (+)	0.55 (.11)	0.55 (.20)
MSA Democratic Vote (+)	0.009 (.005)	0.009 (.006)
Registered NGOs (+)	0.02 (.002)	0.02 (.002)
N	129284	129284
Clusters	271	32
Wald Chi Square	1636 (p=0.000)	16678 (p=0.000)
Phi 1	1	1
Phi 2	0.78 (.06)	0.78 (.15)
Phi 3	0.31 (.04)	0.31 (.07)
Phi 4	0	0

Finally, Table A4.3 provides information on the new data we collected for the models in Chapter 4, including a description of the variable and the sources of information used to create it.

Table A4.3: Newly Included Data for Chapter 4

New Variables for Chapter 4	Variable Source & Description
MSA Unemployment	Coded from monthly Bureau of Labor Statistics data.
Immig. Employment Ratio	Based on Nichlson-Crotty and Nicholson-Crotty's (2011)
Percent Pop. Foreign Born	Based on U.S. Census data; coded yearly
Diaspora Community	Based on information from the Migration Policy Institute
Nat'l Immig. Salience	Coded by authors using Lexis/Nexis; count of stories mentioning "immigration" or "asylum" in the USA Today, by month
Change in % Foreign Born	Based on U.S. Census data; coded based on change from 2000-2005
MSA Democratic Vote	Coded from presidential election returns for 2004 and 2008; MSA level vote is based on average of counties included in the MSA
Registered NGOs	Coded from list provided by EOIR of registered representatives; counted any NGO within a one hour dirve of the MSA