THE ANALYSIS OF TRANSLATION STRATEGIES IN AMATEUR SUBTITLING TRANSLATION BASED ON CULTURE-SPECIFIC ELEMENTS

*Dragana Ćuzović, University of Montenegro,
dragana_cuzovic@hotmail.com*

Marijana Cerović, University of Montenegro, marijanacer@ucg.ac.me

Original scientific paper

DOI: 10.31902/fll.36.2021.18

Abstract: The aim of this paper is to investigate translation strategies that amateur translators use when dealing with culture-specific words and expressions in the context of subtitling translation. Our research focuses on finding the most frequent source-oriented and target-oriented strategies (Pedersen 2011) found in the popular sitcom *Still open All Hours*. As amateur subtitling is one of the most interesting disciplines in audiovisual translation, it is still one of the most underexplored areas of AVT, which makes it suitable for the present research. Also, cultural references are considered to be one of the most challenging issues when it comes to translation (Nedergaard-Larsen, Pedersen), so exploring these aspects will enable us to come to valid conclusions and insights into the amateur translation process. The translation analysis will be done by taking into account the text-function theory (Nord 2005) and comparing amateur translation solutions with professional translation samples. As a result, we hope to find out if amateur translators have in mind a specific target audience when translating or whether the "external" aspect to translate for a specific audience is absent (Cronin 2012). In the same vein, we expect to investigate if these type of translations are just a mere "linguistic exchange" (Orrego-Carmona 2017) and if the translations provided are correct and context-appropriate. By analysing the corpus we will obtain results about the most used translation strategies and see if there are differences between amateur and professional translations, as well as if and to what extent the English language has influenced the Montenegrin language.

Keywords: amateur translation, culture specific words, professional translation.

1. Introduction

Numerous scientific papers and dissertations in the field of audiovisual translation are the result of growing interest in this discipline. This fact is not surprising since we are overwhelmed with content such as movies, series, documentaries and other content. Although some theorists point

out (Diaz-Cintas & Sanchez-Munoz) that amateur subtitling has so far been neglected in terms of research, because it is essentially an illegal activity, today there are numerous scientific papers on the phenomenon of amateur subtitling. The development of technology has influenced the translation process of amateurs, as well as the very perception of this phenomenon.

The availability of digital tools has enabled many, primarily those who are not professional translators, to start translating. The first subtitles of amateur-translators appeared in the 1980s and were called "fansubs." These subtitles were translated by fans of Japanese anime cartoons. (Lepre, 2015, 77) In literature we encounter various names that try to define and explain this type of subtitling such as fansubbing, home-made subtitling, amateur subtitling, fan-based subtitling, etc. (Lepre, 2015, 77) Today, fans increasingly have the role of creators and promoters of various types of audiovisual content.

The field of amateur translation is under-researched and many aspects are not known to the academic community despite the great interest in this field. For that reason, we will try to explain the amateur translation process and come to important conclusions on this topic.

2. Theoretical framework

2.1. The Functional theory and humor

Bartoll (2004, 58) points out that technical and linguistic subtitle parameters depend on the receiver of the message. For Pedersen, "paratextual parameters" are closely related to the Skopos theory and represent a limiting factor during the translation process.

Apart from the target audience, in the context of amateur translation, Pedersen observes that the genre alone can pose a problem during the translation. Various multimedia forms often serve to provide information about general or specialized domains. Translating documentaries, for example, requires the use of specialized terminology, words and expressions typical for a certain field. Petit (2004, 26-27) also states that the audiovisual genre has an impact on the final subtitled product and has its own function in a given context.

The translation of culture-specific elements and humor depends on technical, linguistic and cultural aspects. (Veiga 2009, 160) Sandersen and Veiga (2009, 123-175) recognize the factor of "relevance" as a factor that determines the way a word or and expression is translated. Ultimately, having in mind all the technical restraints, it prevents a certain element from being omitted. Pedersen also remarks on the importance of "centrality" (2005, 12) of a word when it comes to plot development, pointing out that if it is not central to the story, it can be

omitted, while it must be translated if it is introduced as a joke. In that sense, it is important to take into account both the text and co-text since humor cannot be interpreted out of context. (Diaz-Cintas, 2007, 214)

2.2. Norms and specific aspects in amateur and professional translations

Subtitling translation is based on norms and guidelines which are meant to facilitate the translation process. Such guidelines can be found in *The Code of Good Subtitling Practice*,¹ which gives the basic and general rules on how to achieve quality translation. However, those rules are not imperative and there are certain exceptions to the rules depending on what is translated, for whom it is translated and in which country it is translated. (Sanchez, Diaz-Cintas, Reamuel)

Two important limitations in subtitling are space and time factors. The subtitles must be synchronized with a source language dialogue and other acoustic and visual elements. (Diaz-Cintas & Remael 2007, 90) Subtitles should always keep up with the dialogue and should not appear too soon or too late. The viewer should be given enough time to read the on-screen text, and for that reason, the title is sometimes allowed to appear a few frames or seconds before the actual dialogue. When it comes to spatial restrictions, the titles usually appear in two lines, centrally positioned at the bottom of the screen. The number of permitted characters per line, including punctuation marks and spaces, is 33 to 39, which can go up to 40 for DVD films or cinema projections. (Diaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, 84) The lack of space in subtitling translation is the reason why so many dialogue words are omitted. Georgokoupoulou, citing Kovačić, (2009 27-28 cit. Kovačić 1991, 400) enumerates elements that are often omitted in dialogue:

- Repetitions
- Names in appellative constructions
- False starts and ungrammatical constructions
- Internationally known words, such as 'yes', 'no', 'OK'.
- Expressions followed by gestures to denote salutation, politeness, affirmation, negation, surprise, telephone responses, etc.
- Exclamations, such as 'oh', 'ah', 'wow', and the like.
- Instances of phatic communion and 'padding', often empty of semantic load, their presence being mostly functional speech embellishment aimed at maintaining the desired speech flow.

¹ Jan Ivarsson and Mary Carroll <https://www.esist.org/wp-content/uploads/2016/06/Code-of-Good-Subtitling-Practice.PDF>

Among these, we can find expressions such as 'you know', 'well', 'naturally', 'of course', 'undersandably'; prepositional phrases ('in view of the fact that'); rhetorical flourishes; and phrases used for sound effect ('ways and means').

Some of the principal rules are also the frequent use of synonyms to avoid longer expressions; the use of pronouns instead of long nouns and noun phrases; the use of simple tenses; the use of declarative sentences instead of exclamatory and interrogative; the use of passive voice, etc. In the same manner, all the non-standardized language forms such as dialect markers, grammatical categories and so on are omitted or neutralized according to the general norms. (Diaz-Cintas & Remael, 2007, 150-162)

On one hand, many authors (Bogucki, Sajna) believe that amateur translations abound in errors, which usually stem from the lack of knowledge and experience of amaterus. On the other hand, one of the positive aspects of amateur subtitling is a more creative approach in comparison to the professional titles. In amateur subtitles, especially in anime films, there are differences in treating the on-screen subtitles. Simo observes several: (2005 in Diaz-Cintas & Munoz-Sanchez, 2006, 45)

- Use of different fonts throughout the same programme.
- f Use of colours to identify different actors.
- f Use of subtitles of more than two lines (up to four lines).
- f Use of notes at the top of the screen.
- f Use of glosses in the body of the subtitles.
- f The position of subtitles varies on the screen (scenetiming).
- f Karaoke subtitling for opening and ending songs.
- f Adding of information regarding fansubbers.
- f Translation of opening and closing credits.

However, there are many websites with guidelines similar to the professional ones. The website *Titlovi.com* has proposed such norms and all the translations uploaded there go through a certain type of checkup by the admins. To name a few, the website proposes that all the titles must be short, which is a key factor to understanding the plot. It also points out that characters per line must be 60 (including letters, numbers, spaces and punctuation); it is not desirable to repeat or overuse personal names if the audience has already met the characters. Another important aspect is leaving out the words with no semantic load (oh, yeah, well, ok, so, etc.) as well as omitting parentheses and using explanations. The website states that you should not use pronouns, adjectives, if they are unnecessary; as well as the use of the passive

constructions as it does not correspond to the target language structure. It is forbidden to use the non-translated words or sentences such as *Yeah, Mr, Miss, etc.*, as well as leaving out the soundtrack in its original form.

3. Methodology

3.1. Corpus

The corpus consists of 14 episodes of the sitcom series *Still Open All Hours*. *Still Open All Hours* is a sequel to a popular comedy *Open All Hours* (1973-1985). The research has been done using the qualitative and quantitative as well as comparative methods. Firstly, the research is divided into two parts. The first part will encompass the qualitative analysis of 5 episodes, while the second part will deal with the quantitative analysis of three amateur translators of 9 episodes in total.

3.2. The selection of culture-specific elements

Scholars dealing with elements of culture usually make distinction between intralinguistic and extralinguistic cultural words. According to Nedergaard-Larsen (1993, 210), the intralinguistic domain consists of grammatical categories, vocative forms (tu/vous), rethoric, metaphors, idioms. Apart from that, the intralinguistic domain encompasses non-standardized language forms including taboo words and swear words. Extralinguistic domain consists of words relating to different objects and phenomena that are expressed in the source language culture. (209) The comprehensive explanation of what extralinguistic elements are can be found in Pedersen's definition: (2011)

Extralinguistic Cultural Reference (ECR) is defined as reference that is attempted by means of any cultural linguistic expression, which refers to an extralinguistic entity or process. The referent of the said expression may prototypically be assumed to be identifiable to a relevant audience as this referent is within the encyclopaedic knowledge of this audience. (Pedersen 2011: 43)

We need to define Pedersen's cultural elements in order to comprehend the whole concept behind the expression of "extralinguistic-cultural reference." What Pedersen (45) means by the term "extralinguistic" is that any object or process meant by it is found in the domain outside the language itself. In order to comprehend it, the only way to grasp the meaning would be through the so called "encyclopaedic knowledge." As Pedersen states, the knowledge of language alone can not help in the understanding of symbolism found in the meaning words or culturally conditioned connotations. (46) The

term "cultural" refers to those words and expressions which belong to one culture and as such are usually specific and unrecognizable in the other. Furthermore, the term "reference" is crucial for both Pedersen and this paper because it is viewed in a broader sense. To be able to include words and expressions such as allusions and other parts of speech other than nouns, these words are not strictly viewed in a linguistic sense. (50) Therefore, our research model will also include these type of references.

A starting point for the selection criteria for the corpus material are Pedersen's extralinguistic references. The corpus will be composed of cultural units that represent different levels of "culturality." Pedersen has divided the references into monocultural, transcultural and infracultural. (106-109) Monocultural units are recognized only by the source culture audience, while the target audience are met with a cultural barrier because they do not have the same amount of cultural knowledge. For this reason, they are often called "translation problems." Transcultural units are familiar to both the source and target audience because their referent encompasses the concepts that are part of general encyclopaedic knowledge. On the other hand, infracultural units are recognized by a smaller part of the source audience and have a local character.

3.3. The selection of translation strategies

In the book *Subtitling Norms for Television*, Pedersen (2011, 76) uses a model of source-oriented and target-oriented translation strategies based on the previously studied strategies by 14 different authors. This model was created to research cultural elements, which are the subject of this paper. The strategies apply to the cultural units found in this corpus, so we will explain them as follows:

Source-oriented strategies (2011, 77-98)

Retention – a strategy in which a foreign word is introduced into the target language keeping its original form. There is a subcategory of complete and adjusted retention. Complete retention happens when the source element is kept morphologically unchanged, which is when the word is marked either by italic font or by quotation marks, or adjusted retention when the word is transferred into the target language without the articles or by adjusting it to the written norms of the target language.

Specification – a strategy that signifies the transfer of cultural elements in their untranslated form with the addition of information

that does not exist in the original form. Specification can be realized either through completion or addition.

Direct translation – this strategy implies the changing of language from the source into the target, while the semantic load remains the same. This strategy is done either through the use of calque or shifting the elements within the phrase or sentence (shifted direct translation). Calque is a literally translated word (word for word, morpheme for morpheme), while the other type of literal translation implies the shifting of lexical elements in a sentence. In conclusion, in this type of translation, the structure of the source language remains the same if calque is used, or a somewhat natural language structure is preserved if the shifted translation is applied. Accordingly, we can say that this strategy can be found on both lexical and syntactic levels.

Target-oriented strategies

Generalization – a strategy that implies the generalization of cultural elements, either by using hyperonymy, i.e. a synonym that makes a word more general or by paraphrasing, which is the use of a longer expression.

Substitution – a strategy in which the source word is completely replaced by another word or concept from the target language. It can be realized either through cultural substitution (the word from the target culture that can replace the original word) or through functional substitution (a word that corresponds to a given situation).

Omission – a strategy that is characterized by the complete omission of a lexical unit in the target language.

The strategy of official equivalent is based on the linguistic consensus or which dictates how a lexical unit will be translated (2011, 97). Apart from that, official equivalent can be any word that is established into the target language through constant use. This strategy will not be taken into consideration in this research because it can be based on any translation strategy (99), so the examples of retention, direct translation, substitution, etc., can be all considered an example of official equivalent.

4. Research results

4.1. Dealing with humor

Many culturally marked samples show consistency towards the source dialogue. Although there are no visual elements that could impede that consistency, the original form of cultural references is still kept in the dialogue. In the following example, (Picture 1) there is no

intervention in the sense of adaptation because the name pronounced is present in the target language subtitles only using transcription.

Picture 1

We come here to a problematic moment concerning the extent to which a certain cultural unit is known to a particular audience. Since no adaptation is present in this case, we can argue that the amateur assessment was to not make any changes or give explanations because the cultural element is familiar enough to the target audience. However, the question arises whether any type of viewer will be aware of the fact that *Errol Flynn* was an actor and *Marks & Spencer* is a retail chain store.

In other cases, the amateur uses the substitution strategy to achieve humorous effect. This example (Picture 2) showcases a cultural reference with a name of a TV series. The TV show *Captain Midnight* was a popular anglophone series in the 1950s (Wikipedia) and the cultural reference we are dealing with is its namesake.

Picture 2

Ket tells Eric that he cannot be like *Captain Midnight* which is translated as *seks idol* (sex idol). Knowing that this was an Anglophone

show and that it was filmed and aired a long time ago, we cannot but wonder if the younger audience would recognize the name if it was not adapted. The translation solution in question is very appropriate because it is associated with the characteristics of the leading character, who was considered an attractive and desirable man.

Personal names are often present in comic references, which is also the case when it comes to the names of towns and cities. The toponyms in this corpus represent the towns and lesser-known areas located in the UK, and for that reason, they cannot be recognized by a wider audience. This type of geographical reference, which can even be unfamiliar to a part of the target audience, is called *infracultural*. (Pedersen) However, Pedersen claims that those do not present a translation problem because they relate to the events in the text, so they can be understood either from the text or co-text. Seeing it from our perspective, we can argue that they can also be *monocultural* because of a culturally different target audience. In the scene where Cecil explains how he is not a prejudiced man, only in the case of *people from Warrington*, we fail to understand why he chose this town as an example.

Picture 3

The town of *Warrington* is recognized by the group of people called *chavs*, and the name is often used in a pejorative sense to denote the people of lower social status, who have a recognizable dialect, a pattern of behavior and specific clothing style and jewelry.² This fact would be familiar only to a small part of a target audience that knows British culture. In this example, we cannot be certain if the amateur recognized the allusion of the original term. The question is how and whether it would be possible to find an adapted solution that could fit the context.

² The dictionaries consulted Merriam-Webster and Urban Dictionary

Unlike the previous case, particular examples are easier to adapt due to their linguistic nature. Although it is not typical in standard translation to provide explanations in parentheses due to space limitations, this is not the case in amateur translations. In the following scene (Picture4) Granville, trying to be a matchmaker to Gastric and grumpy Madge, tells Mavis that Madonna used to chase Gastric, and then Mavis answers that *she's no good at gravy* (kako ona stoji s prelivom /lakom zaradom/).

Picture 4

We know that gravy is a type of sauce typical of the British region and in this context it has an idiomatic meaning. In jargon, one of the meanings associated with the term gravy is related to a well-paid and easy job.³ In the given situation, Mavis probably alludes to Madonna's poor culinary skills, and the amateur recognizes the meaning of this word and gives an explanation in the parentheses.

In the case of *Royal Ascot* – which stands for a location where horse races are held, we cannot determine the nature of the amateur's choice of translation strategy. (Picture 5)

While talking about aristocracy and renting suits, Granville says that people who gather at such places (Royal Ascot), only rent suits and that *all that splendor is not theirs*. The amateur in this case translates *Royal Ascot* as *derbi*, the term which has a more narrow sense, given that it refers to sports terminology and is a type of a horse race.⁴ Specifically, the word *derbi* refers to the three-year-old horse race traditionally held in England, and only horse race aficionados could connect this term with aristocracy, which is the aim of Granville's sentence. In

³ Urban Dictionary

⁴ Oxford Learner's Dictionary

Montenegrin, the word *derbi* is generally found in football context, referring to football matches and championships. Here the question arises whether the amateur knew the meaning of this word or he/she used *derbi* as a general sports term.

Picture 5

In the same manner, the following example shows us the wrong choice of translation strategy which as a result leads to ambiguities in meaning. During the conversation, Delphine and Grenville mention the expression *Building Society*.

G: Well, he's worth a few bob, Izgleda da je on težak neku kintu? then, is he?

D: Oh, yes, in the building society, Da, u građevinarstvu,

aside from his ISA s.

ne gledajući njegov konto

The term *Building Society* is translated into our language as *štedno-kreditna zadruga* ili *stabmeno društvo*.⁵ The translation *u građevinarstvu* (in construction) is wrong and fails to transfer the meaning of the original term, which adds to more confusion because the dialogue that comes after mentions *ISA* (Individual Saving Account) which is translated as *konto* (bank account).

As we can see from the previous examples, some of the cultural references can be more specific, i.e. monocultural, and be limited to the original cultural context, while others can be found in many cultures and even be used in everyday speech. All this does not mean that the

⁵ <https://www.proz.com/kudoz/english-to-croatian/finance-general/6354209-building-society-account.html>

amateur will know how to use the appropriate translation solution. We can find an example of this in the following situation:

Picture 6

The original subtitle (Picture 6) expression *and just remember – there's a self-help buffet* is translated with certain lexical shifting using direct translation and retention. Although the mentioned translation is not necessarily wrong, it would have been better if the amateur used the word *švedski sto*, having in mind that it is more common in everyday speech. Essentially, the viewer will understand the meaning of the expression, which is not the case with the use of the sports term previously discussed. Translation solutions such as *bife sa samoposluživanjem* would not be accepted in standard translations. Based on the given samples, we can say that the amateur tries to adapt the original word in most cases, but when it comes to words and expressions that are less culturally specific, he fails to use the corresponding term.

4.2 Comparing amateur translations

In this part of the paper, we will try to determine the type of approach the amateur-translators apply, i.e. the representation of translation strategies which are closer to the source language and of those which are closer to the language of the target culture. The mentioned cultural items have been identified in the translations of three amateur-translators: Nt, ModestyMiss and Darby O'Gill. The aim of the comparative analysis is to determine whether amateur-translators apply more often those translation strategies which foreignize the source content or whether they adapt the elements of culture in such a way as to be closer to the target culture. For the

purposes of clarity, in the table below, we enclose the categories which will be the subject of our analysis:

- Units of measurement
- Proper names
- Food and drink
- Art, religion, history
- Currency
- Technical material

The amateur-translators mostly convert the units of measurement, while in the other categories, foreignising techniques predominate. Therefore, we can conclude that the amateurs are aware that in certain cases the original elements need to be adapted to the target audience. In the example given below we have a character name created by means of the adjective *gastric*, whose meaning in Montenegrin is *želudac*, *želudačni*. The three amateurs, however, translated the name by using three different translation strategies, two of which - a literal translation and a specification – actually transfer the meaning of the name:

<i>Name of amateur-translator:</i>	<i>Translation:</i>
Nt	Želučić
ModestyMiss	Gastric
Darby O'Gill	Podriguša

We can see that ModestyMiss does not truthfully convey the meaning of the name Gastric, while the other two translators do. In the case of Nt, the meaning is literally conveyed, while Darby O'Gill provided the most vivid description of the character in the series by choosing the term *Podriguša* (Burpy in English). In the last example, we have a narrowing of meaning, and we can say that subordination is present. According to Pedersen (2011, 82), the use of a term that specifies meaning is rare, because in most cases it prevents viewers from understanding it. This, of course, applies to the items which are more culturally conditioned, so in this case, the term *Podriguša*, as one of the connotations of the term Gastric, is very close to the meaning of the source word.

Within the *food* and *drink* categories, we have identified a lexeme which occurs in all three amateur translations. It is the lexeme *muffin*, which denotes round sweet cakes which have recently become popular in our country as well, so that one can often hear a foreign word *mafin* in everyday interaction. The contexts in which the term *muffin* occurs in the corpus are different, so are the strategies the translators have

applied. Also, in this case, the visual absence of muffins on the screen allows the translators to apply generalizing techniques.

<u>Amateur:</u>	Nt	ModestyMiss	DarbyO'Gill
<u>Translation solution:</u>	<i>krafna</i>	<i>pecivo</i>	<i>blesavo</i>

All three translation solutions are selected in such a way as to fit the context in which they occur. By using the term *krafna*, which is a different spoken variant of the term *doughnut* in the target language, the amateur Nt, adapts the translation to our culture, in which doughnut is a more represented sweet. We have a similar situation with ModestyMiss's translation, where the superordinate term *pecivo* (pastry) is used, while in the third case the translator recognized that a somewhat looser translation was needed, hence, he/she provided the translation *blesavo* (silly).

Table 1 An overview of translation strategies, from the one which is considered to be the closest to the source language (complete retention) to the one closest to the target language (substitution)

By inspecting the Table above, one can note a smaller number of target-oriented strategies in all amateur translations. The source-oriented techniques are more represented, and the translator who uses the strategies closest to the source language is Nt, in whose work cultural references are realized by complete retention. The amateurs ModestyMiss and Darby O'Gill use the retention strategy more often

than amateur Nt, but in their translations there are almost no cases of complete retention. The technique which is halfway between retention and adjustment is direct translation and it is most prevalent in Nt's translation, while the other two amateurs are uniform in terms of this strategy. The low representation of target-oriented strategies indicates that amateurs recognize certain situations as those where some kind of adaptation to the target language is required. The majority of techniques of target approach are found in the work of Nt, where we have a larger number of units. The high prevalence of source-oriented strategies in relation to the target-oriented ones does not necessarily mean the absence of amateur-translators' skills, but a confirmation that due to the globalization, there is a growing closeness between the Western and our culture, and therefore many cultural references do not need to be adapted.

4.3 Comparison of amateur translations with those produced by professionals

The material to be compared with the official translations consists of one translated episode of each of the amateurs who were the subject of analysis in the previous part of the paper (Nt, ModestyMiss, Darby O'Gill). Their translations are compared with those of professional subtitlers (Milica Kiš, Lazar Gorenc). The comparative analysis will help us to look at amateur translations from this aspect as well, and in that way determine potential differences regarding tendencies in translating the culture-specific items. The first step will be to compare the translation pairs in amateur and official translations, as well as to comment on them, following which, we will deal with specific cultural references.

Table 2

Table (2) above shows the differences between the strategies used. The two types of translations do not differ greatly when it comes to the source-oriented strategies, and the situation is quite similar when it comes to the combined ones, so in the amateur translations we have 4 examples of combining, while in the official ones we have 3 examples. We see a noticeable difference in the target approach, where adaptive techniques are less used by the amateurs compared to the professionals. The omission technique was not encountered in any of the translations. As for specific translation strategies, retention, which is the most true to the source language, appears in the amateur translations 11 times, while 10 examples have been found in the official translations. Substitution, which is considered to be the technique closest to the target language, is used only 2 times by the amateurs and 3 times by the professionals. To this effect we can conclude that translations by amateurs Nt and Darby O'Gill are similar in terms of the strategies used with those applied in official translations. The exception is ModestyMiss, in whose translation significantly more source-oriented strategies appear than in the official one, while he/she uses no target-oriented strategies.

Despite the similarities in the choice of translation techniques, we must emphasize that there are noticeable differences between these two types of translations in terms of manner of their implementation. Therefore, in the following paragraphs, we will focus on individual translation solutions in order to point out the elements that deviate from the established translation norms, but also those that have been realized by means of the same translation technique.

First, the same translation technique is used in both the amateur and the official translations, the choice of a technique subcategory tends to differ. This deviation was observed in retention techniques, direct translation, and even combined techniques (retention + literal translation).

When it comes to the retention technique, we can notice that complete retention is mostly present in the amateur translations, unlike the official ones. This is obvious in the above presented Mary Poppins example. Furthermore, even in the cases of adjusted retention, punctuation marks are used in the official translations, while they tend to be omitted by amateurs. Also, we can notice that amateurs are not concerned with space saving constraints, so in many cases they apply longer translation formulations, as is the case with the diminutive translation of the lexical item *scones* - *kolačići*. It is obvious that the official subtitler minded the space saving rule, and hence used the non-diminutivized correspondent of *kolač*. On the contrary, in the Planters'

Tea example, the amateur makes no extra effort to expand the sentence as to clarify the context, but retains the original grammatical structure of the expression. This example required particular attention because the man who sells teas enters Grenville's store and simply utters *Planters' tea*. Since the man appears in this scene for the first time, the viewer cannot work out who it is based on the previously watched episodes. Also, it is not possible to conclude who the person is based on any other contextual cues, because neither visually nor in any other way is it indicated that the man is a tea seller. In the official translation, therefore, the addition of other lexical elements is a logical choice.

<u>Subtitle in English:</u>	<u>Amateur translation:</u>	<u>Official translation:</u>
They all make you look like <i>Mary Poppins</i> .	Svi izgledaju kao <i>Mary Poppins</i> .	Izgledaš kao <i>Meri Poppins</i> .
As of now she's with <i>Tesco's</i> .	A od sada, ona kupuje u <i>Tesku</i> .	Od sada kupuje u „ <i>Tesku</i> “.
Save me half a dozen <i>fruit scones</i> .	Sačuvajte mi pola tuceta <i>voćnih kolačića</i> .	Ostavi mi kilo <i>voćnih kolača</i> .
<i>Planters' Tea</i> .	<i>Planters' čaj</i> .	Prodavao sam <i>čajeve „Planters.“</i>

Table 3 Examples of amateur and professional translation solutions

When it comes to the retention technique, we can notice that complete retention is mostly present in the amateur translations, unlike the official ones. This is obvious in the above presented Mary Poppins example. Furthermore, even in the cases of adjusted retention, punctuation marks are used in the official translations, while they tend to be omitted by amateurs. Also, we can notice that amateurs are not concerned with space saving constraints, so in many cases they apply longer translation formulations, as is the case with the diminutive translation of the lexical item *scones* - *kolačići*. It is obvious that the official subtitler minded the space saving rule, and hence used the non-diminutivized correspondent of *kolač*. On the contrary, in the Planters' Tea example, the amateur makes no extra effort to expand the sentence as to clarify the context, but retains the original grammatical structure of the expression. This example required particular attention because the man who sells teas enters Grenville's store and simply utters *Planters' tea*. Since the man appears in this scene for the first time, the viewer cannot work out who it is based on the previously watched

episodes. Also, it is not possible to conclude who the person is based on any other contextual cues, because neither visually nor in any other way is it indicated that the man is a tea seller. In the official translation, therefore, the addition of other lexical elements is a logical choice.

In certain cases, the choice of the translation strategy is problematic and may indicate the clumsiness of translators. The following examples feature the realization of the specification technique.

<u>Subtitle in English:</u>	<u>Amateur translation:</u>	<u>Official translation:</u>
<i>A rickshaw?</i>	<i>Rikša (vozilo u Aziji)?</i>	<i>Rikša. Nisam znala da postoji sklonost ka azijskim stvarima.</i>
And I wish that wasn't your boyfriend following us in that 4x4.	I ja sam želio da to nije tvoj dečko u 4x4 (automobil).	Da nas tvoj dečko ne prati u <i>onom terencu</i> .

Table 4 Examples of amateur and professional translation solutions

Specification is by definition the strategy whereby the original lexeme is retained, often in an unaltered phonological and morphological form, but is then supplemented by an expression that provides clarification. In the first example (Table 4), we can see that the lexeme *rickshaw* is adapted to the target language (*rikša*), while the complementary expression differs in the amateur and official translations. The amateur translation very briefly explains the meaning of the foreign word, while in the official one the lexeme comes first, and the context-adjusted explanation is moved to the bottom line of the subtitle so that an adequate explanation of the expression can be given.

In the second example, the choice of the strategy by the amateur translator is illogical. Since the viewer can see the car moving across the screen at the moment when the person mentions 4x4, we could say that the translator's decision to use an explanation is not necessary, and it may be more acceptable to only say *in the car* or *SUV* as is the case with the official translation. It is important to emphasize that the use of this strategy, especially when the topic itself is not so specific and the audience can understand it, may seem offensive and underestimating to the viewer. (Pedersen)

What can be noticed is the tendency of the amateur translators to remain faithful to the source language, even in the cases where a free translation is possible. This means that, when translating, the amateurs

are heavily guided by the source language, and this is reflected in their translation solutions.

Subtitle in English:	Amateur translation:	Official translation:
Yeah, advertising me looking like <i>a muffin</i> .	reklamiram sebe obučenog u <i>pecivo</i> .	mene koji izgledam kao <i>seka persa</i> .
They just want the bits that first took thier mind off <i>Meccano</i> .	Oni samo žele prvu onu koja je skrenula komadić njihovog uma sa <i>Meccano igračaka</i> .	...skreću misli sa igračke „ <i>sastavi sam</i> “.

Table 5 Examples of amateur and professional translation solutions

In the first example, the influence of the source language is obvious, and in this case the amateur translator has a somewhat limited view of the token *muffin*. Although he/she uses the term *pecivo* (*pastry*) in his/her translation, which is superordinate term to the mentioned lexeme, the amateur translator fails to find a more appropriate term? So, the expression *obučenog u pecivo* (*dressed as a pastry*) sounds a bit unnatural, unlike the expression translated by the professional titler as *seka persa* (*sissy*). In the second case, we see that when translating the lexical unit *Meccano toy*, the amateur uses a specification strategy, but we notice the problem of accumulation of other lexical elements, which does seem stylistically awkward and does not read well. Also, although it is clarified what kind of object it is, by adding the expression *Igračka* (*toy*), the amateur does not specify what kind of toy it is, as is the case in the official translation.

Despite the numerous shortcomings of amateur translations that we have recognized so far, there are cases in which amateurs manage to recognize cultural references that might be unknown to the target audience. Such examples were realized by substitution and generalization strategies.

The previous examples are interesting because they can be considered monocultural. The only example which is realised in the same way both in the amateur and the official translations is the name of the tools- *Black and Deckers*, in the case of which the amateur used the generalization technique. However, perhaps the most unusual example is the use of the substitution technique (the Co-op lexeme). Namely, *Co-op* is a type of store, and in this case the term *crkvena zadruga* (*church cooperative*) represents a situational substitution, since the term used is adapted to the context. Therefore, the choice of

the technique in this case is not wrong, but it can suggest a mistake of the amateur translator in interpreting the meaning of the source word.

Subtitle in English:	Amateur translation:	Official translation:
I think he's born again <i>Co-op</i> .	Ne znam, možda u <i>crkvenoj zadrugi</i> .	Opet u <i>supermarket</i> , izgleda.
As a consequence, my road to romance is paved with <i>Black and Deckers</i> .	I zato je moj put do romantike popločan <i>električnim alatima</i> .	Moj put do ljubavi popločan <i>električnim alatom</i> .
Yeah, apparently they met at <i>Butlins</i> .	Da, priča se da su se upoznali u <i>ljetnjem kampu</i> .	Izgleda da su se upoznali u <i>Batlinsu</i> .

Table 6 Examples of amateur and professional translation solutions

The previous examples are interesting because they can be considered monocultural. The only example which is realised in the same way both in the amateur and the official translations is the name of the tools- *Black and Deckers*, in the case of which the amateur used the generalization technique. However, perhaps the most unusual example is the use of the substitution technique (the *Co-op* lexeme). Namely, *Co-op* is a type of store, and in this case the term *crkvena zadruga* (church cooperative) represents a situational substitution, since the term used is adapted to the context. Therefore, the choice of the technique in this case is not wrong, but it can suggest a mistake of the amateur translator in interpreting the meaning of the source word.

In a similar way, perhaps unexpectedly, the amateur's solution *ljetnji kamp* (summer camp) for the token *Butlin's* is well-fitted, especially if we have in mind that in the official translation the meaning of this token has in no way been adapted in order to be made clearer to the target audience. The mentioned name is the name of a summer resort chain and certainly a typical target culture spectator cannot be familiar with it. With that in mind, the question arises as to why this term has not been adapted in the official translation. We assume that the subtitler did not consider this term to be the central information in the given context. Certainly, the amateur solution (*ljetnji kamp*, i.e. summer camp) is very interesting and may indicate that the amateur was thinking about whether this cultural reference will be understandable to the viewers.

5. Conclusion

The analysis of translation strategies in this article was aimed at determining how amateur-translators deal with culturally-specific elements they encounter. By studying different contextual situations in which cultural words and expressions occur, we have drawn some conclusions and obtained the answers to the questions we posed at the very beginning of the research.

The quantitative data on amateur translation solutions show that the retention technique is most widely used when it comes to people's personal names, while the strategies which are closer to the target language and culture are used for brand names and other categories. Also, only one example of omission was found in the corpus. As in one part of the research we identified the similarities and differences in amateur translations, we concluded that in amateur translations the source-oriented approach is dominant, but that there are differences in the treatment or realization of strategies amongst the translation solutions. In addition, by comparing the amateur translations with the translations of professional translators, we have noticed that amateurs have little knowledge of subtitling rules and translation strategies.

In most cases, amateurs do very well when it comes to translating the elements of culture which are less known to the target audience. With this in mind, we can confirm that amateur translation does not represent a linguistic exchange from the source language to the target language (Orrego-Carmona et al., 2017). It is quite clear that amateurs know English very well and that they are familiar with various culturally-specific elements of the source language. However, although they do well when it comes to the mentioned units, this is not the case with less specific lexical units, because amateurs then fail to apply the generally accepted terms in the target language. Despite the fact that amateurs are well acquainted with the original culture and its realisations of humour, most cultural names have been retained in their translation. Therefore, the view that amateur translations do not always lean towards the language of the original culture (Orrego-Carmona et al., 2017) does not apply to this corpus. The greatest presence of retention techniques, followed by direct translation and specification unequivocally confirm that amateurs are driven by the original culture. However, this tendency may indicate the closeness of our culture to the culture of the West, because the corpus abounds in expressions and terms which are largely known to the target audience. The question is whether translation techniques would differ if it the source and target languages were reversed – i.e. if one were translating from our language into English. A research article dealing with the translation of Bosnian-

Herzegovinian cultural elements into English (Edina Špago-Ćumurija, Džemal Špago, Adi Maslo) indicates that in the selected film corpus the translation strategies oriented towards the target language were most often used. Thus, we may infer that approaches to translation may vary depending on the type of source-target language combination, and that translating from English into a less represented language tends to lean towards the source culture, while the specificities and localisms of a less represented culture tend to be adapted to the needs of the target culture audience.

When it comes to the issue of how justified the amateurs' translation decisions are, we can conclude that in most cases the choice of the translation strategy does not interfere with the understanding of dialogue. On analysing the selected translations, we can say that while translating, the amateurs perform a certain kind of self-assessment as to which elements of culture should be translated and which should not. As a result, some cultural units in the corpus have been adapted, while others have not. In this sense, we cannot accept the claim that amateurs translate with no regard of the target audience (Cronin). The fact that amateurs detect the elements that need to be adapted, and choose to intervene in those cases, indicates that the text functionality factor is very important for these translators, which is particularly noticeable in the examples where elements of humour are to be translated.

Finally, we hope that our work will serve as a basis for new directions in this sort of research, and one of them could certainly be the study of elements of culture in amateur translations in a larger and more diverse corpus. As the domain of amateur translation has an increasingly important place within translational studies, we hope that this research will encourage more work in this area and contribute to a more thorough analysis of the amateur translation process.

Works Cited:

- Bartoll, Eduard. "Parametres for the Classification of Subtitles." *Topics in Audiovisual Translation*. Ed. Pilar Orrero. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2004. p. 58.
- Cronin, Michael. *Translation in the Digital Age. New perspectives in Translation Studies*. London and New York: Routledge, 2012. p. 100.
- Diaz-Cintas, Jorge and Pablo Munoz Sánchez, (2006). "Fansubs: Audiovisual Translation in an Amateur Environment." *The Journal of Specialised Translation*, 2006, 6, pp. 37-52.
https://www.jostrans.org/issue06/art_diaz_munoz.php 13 January 2021.

- Diaz-Cintas, Jorge and Aline Remael, eds. *Audiovisual Transaltion: Subtitling*. London and New York: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group, 2007. pp. 29-42.
- Panayota Georgakopoulou. "Subtitling for the DVD Industry." *Audiovisaul Translation. Language Transfer on Screen*. Ed. Jorge Diaz-Cintas and Gunilla Andreman. UK: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009. pp. 21-22.
- Ornella Lepre. "Cultural Reference in Fansubs: When Translating is a Job for Amateurs." *Subtitling Today: Shapes and Their Meanings (Studies in Language and Translation)*. Ed. Silvia Bruti and Elisa Perego. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholar Press, 2015.
- Nedergaard-Larsen, Brigit. "Culture-bound problems in subtitling," *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology* 1:2, 1993., pp. 207-240, <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/0907676X.1993.9961214> 15 December 2020.
- Nord, Cristiane. *Text Analysis in Transaltion. Theory, Methodology, and Didactic Application of a Model for Translation-Oriented Text Analysis, Second Edition*. Rodopi, 2005. pp. 132-143.
- Orrego-Carmona, David and & Yvonne Lee, Eds. *Non-Professional Subtitling*. Newcastle upon Tyne: Cambridge Scholars Publishing. 2017. pp. 5-6.
- Pedersen, Jan. "How is Culture Rendered in Subtitles." *MuTra - Challenges of Multidimensional Translation: Conference Proceedings. EU – High- Level Scientific Conference Series*, 2005. pp. 14-15.
- Pedersen, Jan. *Subtitling Norms for Television: An Exploration Focussing on Extralinguistic Cultural References*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing, 2011.
- Petit, Zoe. "The Audio-Visual Text: Subtitling and Dubbing Different Genres." *Erudit Volume 49, Numéro 1, (26-27) 2004*, <https://doi.org/10.7202/009017ar>, p. 25–38. 23 November 2020.
- Sanchez, Diana. "Subtitling Methods and Team Transaltion." *Topics in Audiovisual Translation*. Ed. Pilar Orrero. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2004. pp. 12-13.
- Sanderson, John D. "Strategies fo the Dubbing of Puns with One Visual Semantic Layer." *New Trends in Audiovisual Translation*. Ed. Jorge Diaz-Cintas. Bristol: Multilingual Matters, 2009. pp. 123-133.
- Špago-Ćumurija, Edina, Špago, Dž., Maslo, A. "Prevođenje bosanskohercegovačkih kulturno specifičnih elemenata na engleski jezik - primjer filma Ja sam iz Krajine, zemlje kestena." *DHS-Društvene i humanističke studije: časopis Filozofskog fakulteta u Tuzli*, 11, 2020, 147-164. <https://www.ceeol.com/search/journal-detail?id=1533>
- Veiga, Maira Jose. "The Translation of Audiovisual Humor in Just a Few Words." *New Trends in Audiovisual Translation*. Ed. Jorge Diaz Cintas. Bristol/Buffalo/Toronto: Multilingual Matters, 2009. pp. 158-176.

Web sources:

- Icemaher, administrator. (17. Januar 2011). UPUTSTVO ZA PRAVLJENJE PREVODA SUBTITLE WORKSHOP! https://forum.titlovi.com/uputstvo-za-pravljenje-prevoda-subtitle-workshop_t38959.html 20 March 2020.

Ivarsson, J., & Carroll, M. (1998). The Code of Good Subtitling Practice. Subtitling. Simrishamn: TransEdit, <https://www.esist.org/resources/code-of-good-subtitling-practice/> 3 June 2020.

Artahasis. (2013) Titlovi.com. Rečnici, leksikoni i priručnici za prevodioce (nova), https://forum.titlovi.com/recnici-leksikoni-i-prirucnici-za-prevodioce-nova_t95512.html 25 April 2021.

Materijal preuzet sa:

Opensubtitles.org. Still Open All Hours. Titlovi na engleskom jeziku. <https://www.opensubtitles.org/en/search2/sublanguageid-eng/movienam-still+open+all+hours>, 18 April 2020.

Titlovi.com. Still Open All Hours. Titlovi na srpskom jeziku. <https://titlovi.com/titlovi/?prijevod=still+open+all+hours&sort=4>, 18 March 2020.

I dalje radimo non-stop (2020) Pink Family, 9 August 2020. 10.00 AM.

I dalje radimo non-stop (2020) Pink Family, 10 August 2020. 18.00 PM.

I dalje radimo non-stop (2020) Pink Family, 21. August 2020. 10.00 AM.

ANALIZA PREVODILAČKIH STRATEGIJA U AMATERSKOM PREVOĐENJU TITLOVA ZASNOVANA NA KULTURNO-SPECIFIČNIM ELEMENTIMA

Cilj ovog rada je da istraži prevodilačke strategije koje amateri-prevodioci koriste prilikom prevođenja kulturno-specifičnih riječi i izraza u okviru titlovanog prevođenja. Naše istraživanje se fokusira na ponalaženju najčešće zastupljenih strategija izvornog i ciljnog pristupa (Pedersen 2011) u popularnoj sitkom seriji „I dalje radimo non-stop“ (Still Open All Hours). Kako je amatersko prevođenje jedna od najzanimljivijih oblasti u audiovizuelnom prevođenju, i ujedno jedna od onih koje nijesu dovoljno istražene, predmet ovog istraživanja je i više nego pogodan za naš rad. Takođe, kulturološke reference jedna su od problematičnih mjesta sa kojima se prevodioci susreću tokom prevođenja (Nedergaard-Larsen, Pedersen), te će ispitivanje ovih aspekata doprinijeti boljem razumijevanju procesa prevođenja amatera. Analiza prevoda će biti sprovedena komparacijom amaterskih i profesionalnih prevoda imajući u vidu funkciju teksta (Nord 2005). Na kraju, nadamo se da ćemo doći do zaključaka o tome da li amateri prilikom prevođenja misle na ciljnu publiku ili je ovaj aspekt „eksternalnosti“ (Cronin 2012) odsutan. Na isti način, želimo da istražimo da li su amaterski prevodi samo „lingvistička zamjena“ (Orrego-Carmona 2017) i da li su prilagođeni kontekstu. Analizirajući korpus doći ćemo do rezultata o najviše korišćenoj strategiji i vidjeti da li postoje razlike između amaterskih i profesionalnih prevoda, kao i u kojoj mjeri engleski jezik ima uticaja na crnogorski.

Ključne riječi: amatersko prevođenje, kulturno-specifične riječi, profesionalno prevođenje