Turkish Studies Social Sciences

Volume 14 Issue 5, 2019, p. 2325-2340
DOI: 10.29228/TurkishStudies.37856
ISSN: 2667-5617
Skopje/MACEDONIA-Ankara/TURKEY

INTERNATIONAL
BALKAN
UNIVERSITY

EXCELLENCE FOR THE FUTURE
IBU.EDU.MK

Research Article / Araştırma Makalesi

Article Info / Makale Bilgisi

✍ *Received/Geliş:* 28.09.2019

✓ *Accepted/Kabul:* 15.10.2019

✍ *Report Dates/Rapor Tarihleri:* Referee 1 (10.10.2019)-Referee 2 (11.10.2019)

This article was checked by iThenticate.

GLASS CEILING IN PAKISTAN: CRACKED BUT NOT YET BROKEN

Ummama MAHMOOD* - İlknur ÖZTÜRK** - Tooba MAHMOOD***

ABSTRACT

The research tends to explore and examines the concept and existence of 'Glass Ceiling in Pakistan'. It is the barrier that restricts women reaching the top-level management regardless of their capabilities, skills, qualifications, and experiences. The deprived are generally the minorities or most certainly the women of Pakistan. The role of women has been emerging at a rapid pace in Pakistan as more women are getting awareness and education about their rights. This perception leads to a contradiction of whether gender discrimination actually exists or is it just a perception leading in the minds. The primary data has been collected through several interviews from men and women at the senior level positions to get a greater idea about the concept, and thematic analysis was used to analyse the data. The concept mediates between gender stereotypes, discrimination, and misconceptions. This research is based on the Glass Ceiling in Pakistan. It is carried out in the different sectors of Pakistan through in-depth interviews. Due to time constraints, only eight interviews are conducted which includes seven females and a male respondent. Therefore, in future more male respondents would be added in the research to get a more precise picture of the scenario. The study suggests many practical implications on the issue such as implementing strict policies in organisations, providing women with equal opportunities, and women to prove themselves for the positions they deserve.

* Research Scholar, Shaheed Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Institute of Science and Technology (SZABIST), Karachi, Pakistan.
Email: ummama_94@hotmail.com

** Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, Cag University E-mail: ilknurozturk@cag.edu.tr

*** JS Bank, Pakistan. E-mail: toobamahmood1990@gmail.com

STRUCTURED ABSTRACT

The term Glass Ceiling defines an invisible barrier for the women in the corporate world where they cannot climb any further in rank or status. It can be said that it is a metaphor that describes barriers for women in the corporate world restricting their pay raise, promotions, growth, or further opportunities at work. Moreover, the term can also be used for the minorities that experience similar limitations and barriers, such as racial groups. It is named glass because it cannot be seen, and it is not visible to the eyes. Women may not see the barrier until they experience it themselves when their time comes.

The barriers on minorities and women prevail almost in every developing country, and Pakistan is one of them. We live in a society that is dominated by males and opportunities for women are already scarce. According to the observation, men in Pakistan cannot accept the fact that someone from the opposite sex-gender is supervising them, as men have always seen women at every platform dominated and ruled, let it be at home or outside. As time has passed and people are getting educated the more the awareness is created, the more the people realise the need for women to come forward and getting empowered.

To some extent opportunities for men and women have increased in all fields, but women are still not seen at top ranks and management in the organisations. Men and women both at some level face the barriers, but the obstacles faced by women are undoubted double (Khurram Shakir, 2014). As per literature, women are given more opportunities in the education sector over men. Another school of thought also states that it is not the racial discrimination against women that stop them from achieving higher ranks, but it is their qualifications, experiences, competencies and commitment. Women who are unable to reach the top blame barriers and show themselves as victims (Saleem, Rafiq & Yousaf, 2017).

Some people argue that there are several reasons why women stay stuck in the middle managerial level. Many women leave their jobs as soon as they get married. Much burden of responsibilities is onto them at home that their efficiency to work declines. Moreover, the breaks during their careers for several reasons make their education, skills and training outdated from time to time. All employers prefer to hire employees that have continuous work experience, so they are up-to-date with work. Moreover, women prefer to work part-time and work that requires fewer efforts. With all the reasons mentioned above and many more, they cause hindrance for women reaching the top managerial positions (Jabbar & Imran, 2013).

On the other hands, some arguments oppose the notion of blaming other factors as hurdles for women reaching the higher ranks in organisations. It is said that women as compared to men in Pakistan are given lesser opportunities that also do not have a scope of growth or less scope of promotions. Women are given jobs that require interpersonal skills more than jobs that require operational, technical and financial skills.

As looked upon Glass Ceiling in a more précised way, the metaphor is considered to be misleading. For one reason that the barriers are way high up in the Hierarchy where men and women face

similar challenges, and women fail to realise that the problems don't come when they reach to the top of the hierarchy but they exist at every level. The reason why there are only a few women at the fortune CEO list is that there are fewer women under that hierarchy than men. It is a progressive drop out at every level of the authority for many different reasons.

The research tends to explore and examines the concept and existence of 'Glass Ceiling in Pakistan'. It is the barrier that restricts women reaching the top-level management regardless of their capabilities, skills, qualifications, and experiences. The deprived are generally the minorities or most certainly the women of Pakistan. The role of women has been emerging at a rapid pace in Pakistan as more women are getting awareness and education about their rights. This perception leads to a contradiction of whether gender discrimination actually exists or is it just a perception leading in the minds. The primary data has been collected through several interviews from men and women at the senior level positions to get a greater idea about the concept, and thematic analysis was used to analyse the data. The concept mediates between gender stereotypes, discrimination, and misconceptions.

This research is based on the Glass Ceiling in Pakistan. It is carried out in the different sectors of Pakistan through in-depth interviews. Due to time constraints, only eight interviews are conducted which includes seven females and a male respondent. Therefore, in future more male respondents would be added in the research to get a more precise picture of the scenario. The study suggests many practical implications on the issue such as implementing strict policies in organisations, providing women with equal opportunities, and women to prove themselves for the positions they deserve.

Keywords: Glass ceiling, women, thematic analysis, gender stereotype, discrimination, misconception.

PAKİSTAN'DA CAM TAVAN: ÇATLAMIS FAKAT HENÜZ KIRILMAMIŞ

ÖZ

Bu çalışmanın amacı "Pakistan'daki Cam Tavan" kavramını ve varlığını incelemektir. Cam tavan yeteneklerinden, becerilerinden, niteliklerinden ve deneyimlerinden bağımsız olarak kadınların üst düzey yönetime erişmelerini kısıtlayan engel olarak tanımlanmaktadır. Ayrıca iş dünyasında yer alan kadınların ücret artışlarını, terfi etmelerini, büyümelerini veya daha fazla fırsatları yakalamalarını kısıtlayan engelleri tanımlayan bir metafor olduğu söylenebilir. Yoksunluk genellikle azınlıklar veya en çok da Pakistanlı kadınları kapsamaktadır. Pakistan'daki kadınların rolü, kadın hakları konusunda farkındalıkları ve eğitim düzeyleri artıkça, hızla artmaktadır. Bu algı, cinsiyet ayrımcılığının gerçekten var olup olmadığına ya da sadece zihinlerde öncülük eden bir algıya ve aykırılığa yol açmaktadır. Temel veriler, kavram hakkında daha iyi bir fikir edinmek için üst düzey pozisyonlardaki kadın ve erkeklerden

yapılan görüşmelerle toplanmış ve verileri analiz etmek için tematik analiz kullanılmıştır. Bu kavram cinsiyet klişeleri, ayrımcılık ve kavram yanlışları arasında aracılık eder. Bu araştırma Pakistan'daki Cam Tavan'a dayanıyor. Pakistan'ın farklı sektörlerinde derinlemesine görüşmeler yoluyla gerçekleştirilmektedir. Zaman kısıtlamaları nedeniyle, sadece yedi kadın ve bir erkek katılımcı içeren sekiz görüşme gerçekleştirilmiştir. Bu nedenle, gelecekte senaryonun daha net bir resmini elde etmek için araştırmaya daha fazla erkek katılımcı eklenmesi önerilmektedir. Çalışma, örgütlere katı politikalar uygulamak, kadınlara eşit fırsatlar sağlamak ve hak ettikleri pozisyonlar için kendilerini kanıtlamaları gibi konularda konuyla ilgili birçok pratik sonuç ortaya koyuyor.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Cam tavan, kadınlar, tematik analiz, cinsiyet klişeleri, ayrımcılık, yanlış anlama.

1. Introduction

The term Glass Ceiling defines an invisible barrier for the women in the corporate world where they cannot climb any further in rank or status. It can be said that it is a metaphor that describes barriers for women in the corporate world restricting their pay raise, promotions, growth, or further opportunities at work. Moreover, the term can also be used for the minorities that experience similar limitations and barriers, such as racial groups. It is named glass because it cannot be seen, and it is not visible to the eyes. Women may not see the barrier until they experience it themselves when their time comes. The glass or invisible factor of the terms makes the practice inexplicit for discriminating women, unlike actions that make it evident such as specific policies in an organisation, questionable attitudes, and unappreciated efforts (Powell, 2015).

1.1. History of Glass Ceiling Phenomena

The Wall Street Journal first used the term in 1986 by the two reporters Carol Hymowitz and Timothy Schellhard, who coined the phrase to describe the invisible barrier for women in reaching the top of an organisation in America. The metaphor has since been used to date, and the world is experiencing it for many years now. The phrase got popularity in the 1980s; it was mentioned then in a book called the workingwomen report by Gay Bryant. Hence, it is debatable on who used the term first (Lookwood, 2004).

The American government was concerned about the issue and established a Glass-Ceiling Commission in 1991, which consisted of 21 member bodies, appointed by the President. The focus of the commission was upon three areas: The first was enhancing the skills of female employees through different activities. The second focus was on filing the decision-making and management positions. Thirdly, it focused on the reward system of the organisation for women. The commission disbanded in 1996, but the problem still prevails (Carli & Eagli, 2016).

1.2. The Glass Ceiling phenomena in Pakistan

The barriers on minorities and women prevail almost in every developing country, and Pakistan is one of them. We live in a society that is dominated by males and opportunities for women are already scarce. According to the observation, men in Pakistan cannot accept the fact that someone from the opposite sex-gender is supervising them, as men have always seen women at every platform dominated and ruled, let it be at home or outside. As time has passed and people are getting educated the more the awareness is created, the more the people realise the need for women to come forward and getting empowered.

To some extent opportunities for men and women have increased in all fields, but women are still not seen at top ranks and management in the organisations. Men and women both at some level face the barriers, but the obstacles faced by women are undoubtedly double (Khurram Shakir, 2014).

As per literature, women are given more opportunities in the education sector over men. Another school of thought also states that it is not the racial discrimination against women that stop them from achieving higher ranks, but it is their qualifications, experiences, competencies and commitment. Women who are unable to reach the top blame barriers and show themselves as victims (Saleem, Rafiq & Yousaf, 2017).

Living in the 21st Century where people are presumed to be modern, well-educated and open-minded, but unfortunately, talking about the work environment and women's right to the pay, or career growth opportunity as compared to men, the mindset is archaic. As society's dynamics are changing, there are several reasons why women are more inclined towards working than staying home and looking after the household chores. Firstly, evidently in Pakistan people have started living in nuclear families; to lead a better life, and to fulfil the augmented necessities a family needs to have a dual income. Therefore, women are compelled to work to support her family. Secondly, women have started exploring themselves; giving importance to their own choices and preferences, which leads to their career seriousness.

There are efficacious women around the world endowed with talent, expressiveness and cooperativeness; they are a competent critical analyser, productive and better stress manager. Despite these qualities, women do not get what they deserve due to the organisational glass ceiling.

The word "Glass Ceiling" was invented by Schellhardt in 1986, which according to him means an unrecognised barrier to the growth in any profession, affecting the minorities, especially women. He also believed that women had made tremendous growth as fairer leaders than men in the workplace, and irrespective of what they are under-represented in the upper echelons of the business world.

Glass ceiling does not end at the organisational level but exceeds outside a corporate setting, and this concept is called the "Second Glass Ceiling", which hinders women entrepreneur's accessibility to the financial capital, essential to fuel the new or existing business growth.

Numerous scholars proposed that women on top level leave the organisation, frustrated, to start their own business due to the glass ceiling: gender biases (Mattis, 2004; Orhan & Scott, 2001).

This phenomenon is not limited to the large organisations; as women leaving the organisation to escape the gender bias mostly fail because they come across the different type of gender biases namely raising the financial capital, which hinders their growth as entrepreneurs as well (Patterson & Mavin, 2009).

Convincing pieces of evidence explained that woman entrepreneurs experience scanty availability of loan from banks even after fulfilling every requirement of the borrower and measuring the entrepreneurial ability and riskiness (Bellucci, Borisov, & Zazzaro, 2010). Furthermore, it is observed that firms managed by women have 5% chance to get the loan as compared to the firms succeeded by men (Muravyev, Talavera, & Schafer, 2009).

In Pakistan half of the population consists of women, and the second glass ceiling impedes them to reach their ultimate entrepreneurial ability; hence, the price of which is born by the whole economy. Pakistan has a higher proportion rate of women serving in the Pakistan Parliament compared to the countries in South Asia. Nonetheless, women in Pakistan face remarkable other issues in the country other than the glass ceiling. Women are unable to access the decision-making position at all levels: local, provincial or federal; as they are excluded from the crucial socio-economic and

political process. This practice had left a significant impact on the economy, health and education across the board; 19.99% women in Pakistan represent the legislature.

The total population estimated of Pakistan is around 207 million according to the recent census of 2017 of which men outnumbered women. The labour force is expected to be 57 million out of the total population. Female participation is lesser than the male, and the female participation rate is the lowest in Pakistan in the South Asian region. The issue of gender equality needs to be seriously discussed to be able to enjoy equal rights, as no country would prosper with this fact being ignored.

The global gender gap index 2017 had determined four critical dimensions of the gender inequality within the 136 countries around the world including economic participation/opportunities, political empowerment, education attainment and health & survival. The ranking for Pakistan was 132 in the year 2016 which dropped to 135 in 2017, which is the lowest in the Pacific region as well as Asia. The ranking shows the gender gap in Pakistan, which is one of the very crucial elements and cause of Glass Ceiling. This also presents Pakistan as one of the worst countries in terms of gender equality according to the World Economic Forum where Pakistan stands at the 143 out of 144 countries. The labour force participation ratio of women to men is 20:80 (The Global Gender Gap Report, 2018).

The majority of Pakistani women belong from the agricultural sector. They work in the fields and live hand-to-mouth, yet many times they are not given incomes for their work, regardless of the household responsibilities.

The others who do not work at the agricultural sector prefer to work home-based jobs at the minimum remuneration mainly because of the socio-cultural factors and pressures. The rest of the minority work at the organisational industry of Pakistan with a deficient percentage. Women working in different industries in Pakistan are shown in the Table 1.

Table 1: Employment Shares by Industry (%)

Major Industry Division	2008-09			2009-10			2010-11		
	*T	**M	***F	T	M	F	T	M	F
Total	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0
Agriculture /forestry /hunting and Fishing	45.1	37.3	74.0	45.0	36.6	74.9	45.1	36.2	75.4
Manufacturing	13.0	13.3	11.9	13.2	13.9	11.0	13.7	14.5	10.9
Construction	6.6	8.3	0.4	6.7	8.5	0.3	7.0	8.9	0.2
Wholesale and retail trade	16.5	20.5	1.6	16.3	20.2	2.1	16.2	20.4	1.6
Transport/ storage & communication	5.2	6.6	0.2	5.2	6.6	0.3	5.1	6.6	0.1
Community/ social & personal service	11.2	11.1	11.6	11.2	11.2	11.2	10.8	10.8	11.5
Others	2.4	2.9	0.3	2.4	3.0	0.2	2.1	2.6	0.3
*T=Total, **M=Males, ***F=Females									

Source: Pakistan Bureau of Statistics Labor Force Survey 2010-2011

In the present, women in Pakistan hold 5% of the leadership positions in Pakistan, which indeed is very low. However, the women's world ranking of classification in the National Parliament is 66.20.5%.

Specific barriers prevent women in Pakistan from rising in the corporate world. The obstructions can be studied analysing the socio-economic and cultural situation of Pakistan. Pakistan has a dominating male culture; women are conventionally supposed to do the household chores on a daily basis and take care of the children, which is a typical mindset of people in the country that does not let women think outside the box. The majorities are out of the employment category, and the rest seek for opportunities that best suit their needs, time, daycare facilities and jobs which have the least responsibilities (Samo, Qazi & Burio, 2018).

Another conventional concept for men is that women are not fit for every sort of role, and they do not possess the capabilities, and abilities to perform many tasks. Hence, men are hesitant in giving women opportunities for higher-level positions or rise above a certain level in the hierarchy of the organisation. There had been cases of jealousy in the organisation from men if women have taken a position higher to them.

Government and non-government agencies are working in reducing the Glass Ceiling effects in Pakistan. Numerous steps have been taken by the government to improve the situation prevailing for the working women. There had been some awareness programs, training as well as sensitizations conducted by the government alone and with the collaboration of International agencies. Laws have also been made to support the working women, and discrimination against them, and the government had made some institutions to work for their wellbeing too. In addition to that, several non-government agencies have also worked for the same cause (Ranjan, 2015).

The purpose of the conceptual research is to identify the causes of barriers for women in Pakistan and understand the perspective of the working people. Women are unable to perform at their jobs at their best since lack of motivation to reach the top has resulted in inefficiency at work, and progress in the organisation. The research aims to propose theoretical explanations and solutions to deal with the problem in Pakistan and make the growth of women easy and attainable

Following questions will be answered from the study:

- 1) What are the major causes of the barriers for women in our society and how can it be solved?
- 2) What is the perspective of working men and women in Pakistan on Glass ceiling?
- 3) What are the effects of the glass ceiling in the development & growth of the economy of Pakistan?
- 4) What measures have been taken to eliminate the problem in Pakistan yet?

2. Literature Review and Theories on Glass-Ceiling

This section relates to the literature review of the topic under study and theories on glass-ceiling. It begins with an overview of essential terms and concepts related to the subject under investigation for understanding. It also provides an overview of the work and contribution made by different researchers available in the literature.

2.1. The concept of the Glass ceiling

Federal Glass Ceiling Commission of the US describes Glass Ceiling as “the unseen, yet unbreakable barrier that keeps minorities and women from rising to the upper rungs of the corporate ladder, regardless of their qualifications or achievements”. If there comes a time when a female employee hears “there is a limit for people like you” despite all the potential the woman has, she has

hit the reality of glass ceiling. This obstacle is the point when all the efforts and potential does not lead an employee to promotion because the next rank is the highest and the employee is a woman (Casademunt, 2016).

Women still feel the same barriers as they used to in the past, but this is not just limited to gender or race. Many times women face difficulty communicating their ideas at work or they are more introverts than men, and other times they are also less outgoing that becomes a barrier for them climbing the ladder.

The concept of the Glass ceiling is different in the minds of different people, both men and women. Some believe it is a metaphor of prejudice. Some people are unfair against women in leadership roles in various ways. 1 out of 10 women hold a senior position, and only 16% of the women are the CEO in the world. 60% of these women have faced unwanted sexual advances, 65% couldn't attend social events because they were women, and 84% of women are told that they are very aggressive. So it can be said that these women might be climbing a broken ladder (BBC, 2017).

The second glass ceiling is emerging around the world. World Bank in 2010 explored gender parity for entrepreneurs and workers which shows that women all over the world tend to start their business with slighter financial capital than men; barriers frustrate women entrepreneurs from exercising the equal rights as men in availing the bank loans and possible venture capitals, throughout European Union.

Same as in other regions, it's unlikely in Central Asia and Western Europe as well for women to obtain a loan for business than it is managed by men (World Bank, 2010). Proclaiming this issue the binding law was passed in 2004 by the European Parliament and the Council of the European Union which addresses the direct and indirect gender discrimination in both jobs, the supply and access to goods and services. This law might lay the first stone for the imminent female E.U. entrepreneur to sue the national bank or venture fund for gender discrimination (Panopoulos, 2010).

Additionally, most of the women around the globe are also unaware of the phenomenon "Second Glass Ceiling". Creating the awareness to both the women entrepreneur and managers handling the financial capital could eventually help in reversing the effects. Women entrepreneurs and business managers should try not to get affected by the second Glass Ceiling nor should they become a part in practising it.

Some people argue that there are several reasons why women stay stuck in the middle managerial level. Many women leave their jobs as soon as they get married. Much burden of responsibilities is onto them at home that their efficiency to work declines. Moreover, the breaks during their careers for several reasons make their education, skills and training outdated from time to time. All employers prefer to hire employees that have continuous work experience, so they are up-to-date with work. Moreover, women prefer to work part-time and work that requires fewer efforts. With all the reasons mentioned above and many more, they cause hindrance for women reaching the top managerial positions (Jabbar & Imran, 2013).

On the other hands, some arguments oppose the notion of blaming other factors as hurdles for women reaching the higher ranks in organisations. It is said that women as compared to men in Pakistan are given lesser opportunities that also do not have a scope of growth or less scope of promotions. Women are given jobs that require interpersonal skills more than jobs that require operational, technical and financial skills.

As looked upon Glass Ceiling in a more précised way, the metaphor is considered to be misleading. For one reason that the barriers are way high up in the Hierarchy where men and women face similar challenges, and women fail to realise that the problems don't come when they reach to the top of the hierarchy but they exist at every level. The reason why there are only a few women at the

fortune CEO list is that there are fewer women under that hierarchy than men. It is a progressive drop out at every level of the authority for many different reasons.

2.2 Theories on Glass-Ceiling

2.2.1. The time factor theory

The theory suggests the first class graduates haven't had time to work through the channels to reach the top-level management hierarchy yet. As it requires at least a master's degree and 25 years of work continuous experience to get a senior level post, and there were only a few women who had a law or MBA degrees back in the '90s than there are nowadays.

2.2.2. Motherhood theory

Women rear their children and stay home. Hence, the blame of Glass Ceiling laid on the door of motherhood for this reason. As it takes a lot to do to reach the top that also requires long hours of evening entertainments and gathering, corporate socializing, extended trips abroad and shown flexibility on the sudden change in plans, women are unable to undertake these tasks.

2.2.3. Lack of role models theory

The women at the managerial level are often more visible than men. Being the token females in the work environment they stand out from the rest. It makes their failures visible and emphasizes the difference between women and the culture of dominant males (Economist, 2009).

3. Scenario of Glass Ceiling in Pakistan

3.1. Women who have cracked Glass-Ceiling in Pakistan

There are some excellent examples in Pakistan that have said to break the glass-ceiling such as:

- Fatima Jinnah, a leading founder of the country
- Akram Khatoon, the first FWBL president
- Bilquis Edhi, EDHI foundation
- Benazir Bhutto, first woman prime minister of Pakistan
- Roshaneh Zafar, the social entrepreneur of Kashf foundation
- Asma Jahangir, Co-founder of the human rights commission of Pakistan
- Jahan Ara, the President of Pakistan Software House Association
- Kulsoom Lakhani, co-chairperson of Blended Profit & World Economic Forum
- Maria Umar, founder of Women's Digital League
- Sabeen Mahmud, founder of The Second Floor Karachi
- Rabia Garin, co-founder of Rasala publication
- Begum Raana Liaquat, first woman Governor of Pakistan
- Namira Saleem, first Pakistani woman to travel into space
- Shamshaad Akhtar, Governor of State bank of Pakistan & Vice President of World Bank for the Middle East & North Africa
- Naz Khan, Chief Financial Officer at Engro Corp, Maheen Rahman
- Chief Executive Officer (CEO) at IGI funds

– Fariyha Subhani, Director at Unilever Pvt. Ltd.

The names mentioned above give us evidence about women in Pakistan from the past till the present who have been able to successfully climb the ladder to the top which to an extent proves the fact that Glass-ceiling in Pakistan has cracked but not yet broken.

3.2. Reasons for the existence of Glass Ceiling

The Glass Ceiling in Pakistan is believed to exist for several different factors as mentioned below:

1. In a dominating male world, the leadership roles have always been dominated and attributed by the males, which has made the cooperate world patriarchal and masculine working environment. On the other hand, women lead the softer roles, and much different than men.

2. Gender role stereotyping is familiar. Men and women are different biologically, physically and even psychologically. It is a belief that women do not tend to take risks. They are risk-averse than men usually are, and business is mostly about taking risks, which became a barrier for them reaching to the top positions where they would be reluctant to accept the responsibilities and right decisions. Apart from the risk-taking ability, women are considered to be less efficient, and weaker in term of fulfilling the obligation of many roles that are measured more useful for men such as economists, mathematician, accountants and so forth. However, positions like doctors, receptionist, sales, and teachers, women are given priority (Shabir, Shakeel & Zubair, 2017).

3. Women in Pakistan do not work for a more extended period. It takes times for a person to grow until he reaches the top. However, unfortunately, the mindset of people in the society of Pakistan, and responsibilities put on women home, they are supposed to leave their jobs after they get married, or soon after they get pregnant. Many women go on maternal leaves and take a considerable gap coming back to work that causes a void to suffice for them to recover. The difference is unhealthy for their professional careers as their education and training go outdated. They also prefer to work part-time or at flexible hours (Hirani & Karmaliani, 2013).

4. The discrimination exists in the organisations — different standards set in evaluating the performances of men and women at work. There is a vast income gap between both the genders working at the same designation, with the same level of experience (Yousaf & Schmiede, 2016).

5. Majority of women have inferior education and experience than men. As men start to earn at an early age and tend to complete their studies as well, women find it difficult.

6. There is a lack of reporting mechanisms in this regard as it exists in other developed countries in the world.

7. The males do not appreciate the hold of a women leader who orders them in a dominating male society.

8. There is no leadership training for higher positions. Also, there are not any mentorship programs to support women.

4. Methodology

The research study is qualitative in nature; hence it includes the verbal data only. Since the topic has not been researched much in Pakistan before, therefore it has been studied in depth through interviews of working women from different industries to gather their data based on their experiences and perception on the existence of “Glass Ceiling in Pakistan”. The population of this research consists of working women of Pakistan who may have or may not have experienced specific invisible barriers in their workplace and how did they deal with such a situation? Another reason why to choose working women for the research is that the topic is targeting towards women facing hurdles in

reaching the top level hierarchy due to gender discrimination, hence women who have already reached the top may differ from the concept of Glass Ceiling too and vice versa. Secondly, the opinion of women at work who will change from this idea will also be highlighted to make the research unbiased.

The nature of the research is Qualitative; hence it restricts defining the sample or sample size. The interviews are conducted of around eight male workers and women experts from their field, from different organisations at different organisational levels that include the middle and higher levels. The reason for selecting a small sample size for an interview is due to the time availability of the interviewees and deadlines of submitting the research work. However, the study reached at the saturation point as well. A saturation point has defined by Glaser and Straus (1967) is the one where adding more participants to the research study does not result in providing additional information. The males are selected, so the research is not biased. The purposive sampling method has been used in the study.

Primary and secondary data has been collected for the research. The secondary data has been extracted to understand the concept of Glass Ceiling around the world along with a focus to Pakistan from different journals, websites, books, and newspapers. Along with the secondary data 8 interviews have also been conducted as primary data from women at the middle and top level positions who gave a clear idea through their knowledge and lived experiences. Experts validate the questions before conducting the interviews.

5. Findings and Discussions

This section discusses the thematic analysis used in the qualitative study “Glass Ceiling in Pakistan”. The themes are generated by exploring specific codes and patterns during the analysis phase after collecting the data through in-depth interviews from 8 respondents including men and women at different levels and organisations. To satisfy the research questions from one till four, a semi-structured questionnaire was developed for the interviews to be conducted. The questions in the questionnaire are thoroughly checked from the experts before conducting interviews. In total eight interviews were performed to collect the required data for analysis. It was assured that the interviews were conducted with men as well, to avoid biases in the study. The findings are taken from the semi-structured interviews with eight respondents, working in different organisations of Karachi. All these respondents are working at strategic and middle management positions from various sectors and organisations of Pakistan like USAID, Institute of Child Care & Teachers Trainings, Walmart, Telenor Bank, JS Bank, Ingram, Standard Chartered and Khaadi.

Themes and patterns identified in the research are through thematic analysis. The findings of the study identify and highlight the areas needs to be covered in the research questions provided in the introduction chapter. The results explored answers to many questions that were being raised while researching the role of women in organisations, the discrimination against women in the workplace, its causes and solutions, and the answers to solve the problem of Glass Ceiling in our country. The in-depth interviews conducted from 8 respondents, which consisted of 7 working women at senior level management and one working male.

After reviewing the codes and themes in the transcripts, following patterns and themes have been explored and discussed below one by one.

5.1. The unutilized workforce of Pakistan

The majority in the world consists of women as per the recent global statistics of 2018. There is a massive workforce in Pakistan that comprises of women as well. However, unfortunately, this part of the workforce is either underutilised or un-utilised by the organisations as discussed in the majority of the interviews. The unutilised workforce leads to many problems. When women are not playing the kind of role they should play, it affects the natural structure of the economy. Pakistan has so many

women who can contribute so well in the society, but they are not participating due to cultural barriers because of the country being a patriarchal society. It is profoundly affecting our economy and women psychologically because they feel they are under-utilised. They can otherwise contribute to the development of society. Lots of women are educated but sitting homes because they are not allowed to work, they get married, or the work environments are not providing them with the kind of facilities that they should. Pakistan is losing a competent workforce and their output. A human brain has so much capability, but it stays unutilized due to these factors. There should not be a concept of stereotyping that some roles should be designated to males and fewer to females. (Rashid & Abdullah, 2013).

There are 52% females and 48% males in Pakistan, and in all areas, women are above men, with a higher commitment level. Moreover, since women have always been a vulnerable part of society, making these women strong is a better idea to face the pressures of the society where the family plays a significant role in this regard.

5.2. Provision of facilities for working women by the organisations

Many of the problems that lead to Glass Ceiling are because there is precisely fewer women empowerment in Pakistan. The women empowerment comes from the homes and within the women themselves. As discussed in the interviews by the majority of the people the reason why women are given fewer opportunities are women themselves. They are unable to provide 100% of their time and effort into a task that leads to management in the organisations to provide more weight and emphasis on promoting men who would be able to give and take the hard times, workloads, and extra efforts into the tasks. As per the women, much of this can be resolved if organisations provide child-care facilities, flexible working hours, and paternal leaves. Much of this has to do with the other theme, which is creating awareness in destructing the cultural construct of male chauvinism.

Whenever there is an emergency at home, women have to take leaves; it is just conditioned that way as if it's just their responsibility. Moreover, if this is going to continue women should get daycare facilities at their workplace, paid maternity leaves, travel allowances and most importantly flexible working hours. Around the world, companies have started taking into consideration all of these factors; it's high time that companies in Pakistan start thinking to launch such facilities for women.

The liabilities for women are never few. If there is a need to take care of kids at home, the mother is supposed to take an off from work and stay with the kid; it's never a man doing so by taking an off instead of her. This mindset had yet not changed. So the management always keeps the factor under consideration that if there is ever a need of the female employee at any time out of office hours, late sittings, or outstation she would not be available every time. Moreover, it may be problematic for women. Specifically, when you work with the government sector, it is more where women find it odd at times than in the private sector where there is a lot more of flexibility.

Most of the organisations prefer hiring men and giving promotions to male resources; this is due to a general presumption that men are more capable of dealing with official matters and facing work-related challenges. There are organisations which portray that they have policies related to the discrimination and they discourage such acts, they might give you the managerial position but when it comes to the benefits and growth that's where this discrimination comes. (Muravyev, Talavera, & Schäfer, 2009).

5.3. Awareness and Education

One of the primary cause and solution of Glass Ceiling existing in Pakistan is analysed because of the same problem that can solve it. Lack of awareness and education builds the social and cultural constraints the people of Pakistan are facing today. There is a need to educate people and

create awareness among these people. Their problems need to be addressed; social scientist should sit in front of them to answer their questions and teach them why it is so important to empower women. It is also required to make societies safe for women.

Lack of women empowerment is more of a cultural and social constructed thing in Pakistan. Women are not the breadwinners of the family. It is a male's job to earn. Even if a woman opts out and goes out on a job it is not regarded as financial secure it is still considered the responsibility of the males.

Furthermore, it is analysed in the research that as professionals Pakistani citizens need to think are they interested in the output or are they interested in the number of hours they give at the workplace? The two things do not go hand in hand. In the western world, man does get parental leave this should be true for men in Pakistan also. People need to think of supplementing such kinds of things in the workplace as it is critical. The peace of mind is crucial to a woman equally. In the context of Social setup, it is in the minds of people that women are lesser than men. Women don't bargain. The significant thing is women are made sure that if they are working that's their hobby as long as they want, then they never adopt it as their career. Their struggle, achievements and interests are not valued, the way it is appreciated for men. There are so many organisations even big organisations that do not give paid maternal leaves women. (Batool & Tahir, 2015)

5.4. Male chauvinism and dominance

Pakistan has a dominating male society. Some men agree to that and others deny. However, according to the research and interview, this is the dominant theme analysed that has led to the discrimination against women in organisations. It's difficult for women to avail the same opportunity as men; as in an organisation they limit the scope of work for women, considering women are less capable, they can't do late sittings or they can't out in the field. The discrimination is male chauvinism; men tend to dominate women generally in every aspect. There are organisations which portray that they have policies related to the discrimination and that they discourage such acts. They might give the managerial positions to women but when it comes to the benefits and growth that's where this discrimination comes in. Society and mindset play a significant role in this. The society of Pakistan is very close and conservative, where everyone feels that women always have a backhand. Other than the discrimination there is much harassment that women have to face wherever they go. That's one of the reasons women themselves hesitate to take a stand and fight, and those who hang back are always considered wrong.

6. Conclusion

The research reveals and depicts a real picture of the society in Pakistan. It shows how organisations work in Pakistan whether they're public sector, private sector companies, local or international which concludes that Glass Ceiling does exist in Pakistan. As more and more people are getting educated, and women are standing for themselves, more awareness is created from one woman to another and amongst men as well. Many aspects lead to this issue that needs to be taken under consideration. It can also be said that the problem roots from homes where women are restricted and bounded from working. The mindset needs to be changed where women are considered precious, but not treated as one. The multinational companies have guidelines, systems and principles in favour of women around the world, but the management in Pakistan is led by the same mentalities of people that are mostly males who do not implement the same policies in Pakistan. The other cause is that in the world a brutal force or power has always been through and through since the evolution of a man who has the final verdict, which is why the role of her leadership is being understated and lost.

On the other hand, it can be said, that women are given fewer opportunities because they are unable to prove themselves, those who do are successfully leading the higher positions. As far as the Glass Ceiling affecting the economy of the country and women are concerned, half the population is

women in Pakistan. The economy is compromising of what can be gotten from that massive chunk of the population. 50% or more of the population is affecting from the bias. As seen historically, prominent leaders have said: “if you create great mothers, I can give you great nations”. So, how can anyone sake the role a woman has and what part she can play in the total development of the economy, society or an organization?

As a result of this, yes there is a Glass Ceiling, which is very much still there. This Glass Ceiling is responsible when the pay raises, or the salary setting takes place in Pakistan where women experience it more than the rest of the world. It is a global issue that women are not paid the same as men for even the same level job, with similar duties, but in Pakistan, the difference is more significant. With all the reasons mentioned above and more, it can be said that Glass-Ceiling has been cracked but not yet broken.

There are ways to identify the critical competencies within an organisation of employees in the upper-level management that are tied closely to the organisation’s vision and mission. A culture of every organisation differs from one another, so it becomes essential to understand the culture and view of the organisation. Some organisation strive to become leaders and value the importance of innovation; such organisations look for individuals that are risk takers, independently strong, extroverts, and confident enough to say things ‘like it is’. Other times, the conservative companies would not take the risk while making a decision very carefully keeping the risk factor in front. It becomes crucial for employees to realise and understand what kind of organisations they work at, and what factors set their company and leaders apart. It will help in reaching the first step towards the position for the top leadership role in the organisation.

The female employees need to set their goals accordingly. It is required to be proactive and responsible for taking up the accountabilities of the allotted tasks to determine their own career goals. Enthusiasm is the key to break the ceiling. It becomes the responsibility of these women to let their bosses know how significantly they want to work towards a higher-level position. It always benefits to work on the mistakes, and areas that require improvement. Setting up a specific time to reach an absolute position can be discouraging if it does not happen. Time does not matter in that scenario. It is in the best interest of the employee to know the right people in the organisation that can help them with valuable information at different levels. To reach the top support of colleagues is equally essential. Instead of trying to make friends at a higher level, it is better to build a network and public relations with the higher-level network. It is not necessary to establish the web in the same organisation, but it can be constructed outside as well. There can be several opportunities for women at other organisations. Such organisations need recognition and appraisal.

Another powerful way of breaking the Glass Ceiling is having a mentor. A mentor can give excellent guidance, and share experiences that may help employees to learn. They can be a source of success and growth.

The way to move forward at the top is eventual and should be known and noticed. It is highly recommended that women in organisations make efforts to get them recognised for their potential, competency, knowledge, and skills. When an employee develops his/her network and is known for his/her potential, their name gets associated with the top level potential employees.

The discriminatory practices and behaviours are genuinely observed in companies. It is unfortunate for the organisation as well as women who face unfair practices in forms of gender biases and stereotypes. The failures and frustration should not be accepted the way it is. It will require patience, and confidence to step up for their rights under the local laws and company policies.

This research is based on the Glass Ceiling in Pakistan. It is carried out in the different sectors of Pakistan through in-depth interviews. Due to time constraints, only eight interviews are conducted

which includes seven females and a male respondent. Therefore, in future more male respondents would be added in the research to get a more precise picture of the scenario.

REFERENCES

- Bellucci, A., Borisov, A., & Zazzaro, A. (2010). Does gender matter in bank–firm relationships? Evidence from small business lending. *Journal of Banking & Finance*, 34(12), 2968-2984.
- Batool, S., & Tahir, M. (2015). Attitude towards Female Manager in Pakistan: Evidence from Banking, Education, and Telecom Sector. *Dialogue (Pakistan)*, 10(4), 1-10.
- Carli, L. L., & Eagly, A. H. (2016). Women face a labyrinth: An examination of metaphors for women leaders. *Gender in Management: An International Journal*, 31(8), 514-527.
- Casademunt, A. M. (2016). Strategic Labor Relations Manager in Modern Organizations. Spain. IGI Global Publications, USA.
- Hirani, S. A. A., & Karmaliani, R. (2013). The experiences of urban, professional women when combining breastfeeding with paid employment in Karachi, Pakistan: A qualitative study. *Women and Birth*, 26(2), 147-151.
- Jabbar, A., & Imran, A. (2013). Perception of Glass Ceiling in the Educational Institution: An Evidence from Pakistan. *World Applied Sciences Journal*, 23(5), 628-634.
- Khurram Shakir, S. S. (2014). Class Ceiling in Pakistan: a myth or reality? *European Journal of Business and Management*, 6(1), 1-8.
- Lockwood, N. (2004). The glass ceiling: Domestic and international perspectives (pp. 1-10). Alexandria, VA: Society for Human Resource Management.
- Muravyev, A., Talavera, O., & Schäfer, D. (2009). Entrepreneurs' gender and financial constraints: Evidence from international data. *Journal of Comparative Economics*, 37(2), 270-286.
- Mattis, M.C. (2004). Women entrepreneurs: Out from under the glass ceiling. *Women in Management Review*, 19(3), 154-163.
- Orhan, M. & Scott, D. (2001). Why women enter into entrepreneurship: An explanatory model. *Women in Management Review*, 16(5), 232-247.
- Panopoulos, A. (2010). Barriers to financing: Is European Union indirect discrimination law the answer for female entrepreneurs? *Cardozo Journal of Law & Gender*, 16, 549-572.
- Patterson, N., & Mavin, S. (2009). Women entrepreneurs: Jumping the corporate ship and gaining new wings. *International Small Business Journal*, 27(2), 173-192.
- Ranjan, A. (2015). Breaking the Glass Ceiling: A Dilemma in the Making of Foreign Policy in South Asia. *Pakistan Journal of Women's Studies= Alam-e-Niswan= Alam-i Nisvan*, 22(2), 91.
- Rashid, Y., & Abdullah, I. (2013). Women empowerment in the corporate sector of Pakistan. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research in Business*, 5(5), 518-523.
- Saleem, S., Rafiq, A., & Yusaf, S. (2017). Investigating the glass ceiling phenomenon: An empirical study of glass ceiling's effects on selection-promotion and female effectiveness. *South Asian Journal of Business Studies*, 6(3), 297-313.
- Shabir, H., Shakeel, M. A., & Zubair, R. A. (2017). Gender stereotype, glass ceiling and women's career advancement: an empirical study in service sector of Pakistan. *City University Research Journal*, 2017, 236-246

-
- Samo, A. H., Qazi, S. W., & Buriro, W. M. (2019). Labelling them is negating them: A phenomenological study of stereotypes and followers' experiences about women leadership in Pakistan. *Management Research Review*, 42(3), 391-411.
- The Global Gender Gap Report 2018. Washington: The World Economic Forum. (2018).
- The Economist. (2009, May 5th). The glass cieling. Retrieved from The Economist: www.economist.com/nodel/13604240
- Yousaf, R., & Schmiede, R. (2016). Underrepresentation of women at academic excellence and position of power: role of harassment and glass ceiling. *Open Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(2), 173-185.